

Date of Vote: 21st February 2012

Billet d'État: IV of 2012

Article: 7

Department/Committee: Public Services Department Subject: Revised Waste Strategy

Proposition: Pursuant to Rule 13(6)(2) of the

Rules of Procedure

Proposed by: Deputy S. J. Ogier

That the amendment [annexed hereto] be not debated and no vote be taken thereon.

LOST Pour: 7 Contre: 36 Abstained: 0 Not Present: 4

| St. Peter Port South | | Castel | | |
|-------------------------------|--------|---------------------------------------|---------|--------|
| Deputy Barry L. Brehaut | C | Deputy Mark H. Dorey | C | |
| Deputy Carla S. McNulty Bauer | C | Deputy A. Hunter Adam | C | |
| Deputy Jennifer M. Tasker | C | Deputy Thomas M. Le Pelley | C | |
| Deputy Roger Domaille | N | Deputy Sean J. McManus | C | |
| Deputy Allister H. Langlois | C | Deputy Barry J. E. Paint | C | |
| Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher | P | Deputy Bernard M. Flouquet | C | |
| | | Deputy Michael G. G. Garrett | C | |
| St. Peter Port North | | | | |
| Deputy John A. B. Gollop | C | West | | |
| Deputy R. Rhoderick Matthews | N | Deputy Alvord H. Brouard | C | |
| Deputy Carol A. Steere | C | Deputy David de G. De Lisle | P | |
| Deputy Martin J. Storey | C | Deputy Marc S. Lainé | C | |
| Deputy Jack Honeybill | C | Deputy Shane L. Langlois | C | |
| Deputy Leon R. Gallienne | C | Deputy Peter R. Sirett | C | |
| Deputy Michael W. Collins | C | Deputy Gloria P. Dudley-Owen | P | |
| | | | | |
| St. Sampson | | South-East | | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson | C | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson | C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald | C | Deputy Francis W. Quin | C | |
| Deputy Scott J. Ogier | P | Deputy Michael G. O'Hara | C | |
| Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | N | Deputy Robert W. Sillars | C | |
| Deputy Lyndon S. Trott | C | Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage | P | |
| Deputy T. Jane Stephens | С | Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley | C | |
| ¥71. | | A13 | | |
| Vale | C | Alderney | 17 - 11 | C |
| Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize | C C | Alderney Representative Boyd N. Kelly | | C C |
| Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy | C | Alderney Representative Paul Arditti | | C |
| Deputy Anthony Spruce | | | | |
| Deputy Mary M. Lowe | P | | | |
| Deputy Graham Guille | P | | | |
| Deputy David B. Jones | C | | | |
| Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre | N | | | |

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy A. Spruce Seconded by: Deputy S. L. Langlois

- 1. To delete Proposition 1 and to substitute therefor:
 - "1. To approve recycling targets as follows:
 - 50% by the end of 2013; and
 - 60% by the end of 2018.
 - 1A. To note the intention, through the application of the Waste Hierarchy's principles, to achieve a recycling rate of 70% by the end of 2025.
 - 1B. To direct the Public Services Department to consider the capital requirement and annual operational costs of introducing and thereafter providing:
 - (i) an island-wide kerbside collection service of food waste;
 - (ii) the processing of that waste and
 - (iii) the disposal of the residual material,

incorporating an evaluation of the apportionment, between domestic and commercial properties, of the funding for such a service and the value of the residual material and to report thereon to the States of Deliberation by no later than September 2013.".

- 2. To delete Proposition 3 and to substitute therefor:
 - "3. To direct the Treasury and Resources Department to consider and approve appropriate business cases from the Public Services Department to implement prevention, re-use and recycling initiatives (namely kerbside collection of dry recyclables and refurbishment of bring bank sites) at the earliest opportunity, with reference to indicative costs detailed in Appendix 15 of this report and for the capital costs of these schemes to be funded by a loan from States Treasury."
- 3. To delete Proposition 5 and to substitute therefor:

the States of Deliberation.".

- "5. To direct the Public Services Department to pursue simultaneously the options of:
 - (a) export of waste, including the possibility of buying into the Jersey plant; and
 - (b) an integrated on-Island waste management facility, based on a minimum recycling target of 60% by 2018, either including or excluding separated food waste processing, and to report back to the Policy Council no later than September 2013 with full costings, an assessment of the benefits to the local economy of each option over the other and an indication of the increase in annual domestic and commercial waste disposal costs, above those in 2011, to lay before



Date of Vote: 22nd February 2012

Billet d'État: IV of 2012

Article: 7

Department/Committee: Public Services Department Subject: Revised Waste Strategy

Proposition: Amendment

Proposed by: Deputy A. Spruce Seconded by: Deputy S. L. Langlois

- 1. To delete Proposition 1 and to substitute therefor:
 - "1. To approve recycling targets as follows:
 - 50% by the end of 2013; and
 - 60% by the end of 2018.
 - 1A. To note the intention, through the application of the Waste Hierarchy's principles, to achieve a recycling rate of 70% by the end of 2025.
 - 1B. To direct the Public Services Department to consider the capital requirement and annual operational costs of introducing and thereafter providing:
 - (i) an island-wide kerbside collection service of food waste;
 - (ii) the processing of that waste and
 - (iii) the disposal of the residual material, incorporating an evaluation of the apportionment, between domestic and commercial properties, of the funding for such a service and the value of the residual material and to report thereon to the States of Deliberation by no later than September 2013.".
- 2. To delete Proposition 3 and to substitute therefor:
 - "3. To direct the Treasury and Resources Department to consider and approve appropriate business cases from the Public Services Department to implement prevention, re-use and recycling initiatives (namely kerbside collection of dry recyclables and refurbishment of bring bank sites) at the earliest opportunity, with reference to indicative costs detailed in Appendix 15 of this report and for the capital costs of these schemes to be funded by a loan from States Treasury."

LOST Pour: 16 Contre: 28 Abstained: 0 Not Present: 3

| St. Peter Port South | | Castel | | |
|---|--------------------------------------|---|-----------------------|--------|
| Deputy Barry L. Brehaut | С | Deputy Mark H. Dorey | C | |
| Deputy Carla S. McNulty Bauer | P | Deputy A. Hunter Adam | P | |
| Deputy Jennifer M. Tasker | C | Deputy Thomas M. Le Pelley | C | |
| Deputy Roger Domaille | N | Deputy Sean J. McManus | C | |
| Deputy Allister H. Langlois | P | Deputy Barry J. E. Paint | P | |
| Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher | C | Deputy Bernard M. Flouquet | C | |
| | | Deputy Michael G. G. Garrett | P | |
| St. Peter Port North | | | | |
| Deputy John A. B. Gollop | C | West | | |
| Deputy R. Rhoderick Matthews | C | Deputy Alvord H. Brouard | C | |
| Deputy Carol A. Steere | C | Deputy David de G. De Lisle | C | |
| Deputy Martin J. Storey | P | Deputy Marc S. Lainé | C | |
| Deputy Jack Honeybill | N | Deputy Shane L. Langlois | P | |
| Deputy Leon R. Gallienne | P | Deputy Peter R. Sirett | P | |
| Deputy Michael W. Collins | C | Deputy Gloria P. Dudley-Owen | C | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| St. Sampson | | South-East | | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson | P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson | C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald | P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin | C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier | P C | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara | C C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | P C N | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars | C C C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott | P C N P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage | C C C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | P C N | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars | C C C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens | P C N P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley | C C C | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale | P C N P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize | P C N P P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | C |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy | P C N P P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney | C C C C P | C C |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce | P C N P P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe | P C N P P C | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe Deputy Graham Guille | P C N P P C C C | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe | P C N P P C | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |



Date of Vote: 22nd February 2012

Billet d'État: IV of 2012

Article: 7

Department/Committee: Public Services Department Subject: Revised Waste Strategy

Proposition: Amendment

Proposed by: Deputy A. Spruce Seconded by: Deputy S. L. Langlois

3. To delete Proposition 5 and to substitute therefor:

"5. To direct the Public Services Department to pursue simultaneously the options of:

(a) export of waste, including the possibility of buying into the Jersey plant;

and

(b) an integrated on-Island waste management facility, based on a minimum recycling target of 60% by 2018, either including or excluding separated

food waste processing,

and to report back to the Policy Council no later than September 2013 with full costings, an assessment of the benefits to the local economy of each option over the other and an indication of the increase in annual domestic and commercial waste disposal costs, above those in 2011, to lay before the States of Deliberation."

LOST Pour: 21 Contre: 23 Abstained: 0 Not Present: 3

| St. Peter Port South | | Castel | | |
|---|--|--|-----------------------|--------|
| Deputy Barry L. Brehaut | P | Deputy Mark H. Dorey | C | |
| Deputy Carla S. McNulty Bauer | P | Deputy A. Hunter Adam | P | |
| Deputy Jennifer M. Tasker | P | Deputy Thomas M. Le Pelley | C | |
| Deputy Roger Domaille | N | Deputy Sean J. McManus | C | |
| Deputy Allister H. Langlois | P | Deputy Barry J. E. Paint | P | |
| Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher | C | Deputy Bernard M. Flouquet | C | |
| | | Deputy Michael G. G. Garrett | P | |
| St. Peter Port North | | 1 7 | | |
| Deputy John A. B. Gollop | C | West | | |
| Deputy R. Rhoderick Matthews | C | Deputy Alvord H. Brouard | C | |
| Deputy Carol A. Steere | P | Deputy David de G. De Lisle | C | |
| Deputy Martin J. Storey | P | Deputy Marc S. Lainé | P | |
| Deputy Jack Honeybill | N | Deputy Shane L. Langlois | P | |
| Deputy Leon R. Gallienne | P | Deputy Peter R. Sirett | P | |
| Deputy Michael W. Collins | C | Deputy Gloria P. Dudley-Owen | C | |
| | | | | |
| St. Sampson | | South-East | | |
| | | | | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson | P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson | C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald | P | Deputy Francis W. Quin | C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier | P C | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara | C C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | P | Deputy Francis W. Quin | C C C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott | P C N P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage | C C C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | P C N | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars | C C C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens | P C N P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley | C C C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale | P C N P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize | P C N P P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | C |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy | P C N P P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney | C C C C P | C C |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce | P C N P P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe | P C N P P P | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe Deputy Graham Guille | P C N P P P C C | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe Deputy Graham Guille Deputy David B. Jones | P C N P P P P C C C | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald Deputy Scott J. Ogier Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy Deputy Lyndon S. Trott Deputy T. Jane Stephens Vale Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy Deputy Anthony Spruce Deputy Mary M. Lowe Deputy Graham Guille | P C N P P P C C | Deputy Francis W. Quin Deputy Michael G. O'Hara Deputy Robert W. Sillars Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley Alderney Alderney Representative Boyd N. | C C C C P | |



Date of Vote: 22nd February 2012

Billet d'État: IV of 2012

Article: 7

Department/Committee: Public Services Department Subject: Revised Waste Strategy

Proposition: Amendment

Proposed by: Deputy P. L. Gillson Seconded by: Deputy J. M. Tasker

In Proposition 3:

(a) to insert the words "value for money and" immediately before "indicative costs", and

(b) to insert at the end the words ", except in any case where the costs in respect of any initiative are in excess of 110% of those detailed in this report, in which case that initiative shall be referred to the States of Deliberation for consideration and, if appropriate, approval".

LOST Pour: 11 Contre: 32 Abstained: 0 Not Present: 4

| St. Peter Port South | | Castel | | |
|-------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|---|
| Deputy Barry L. Brehaut | C | Deputy Mark H. Dorey | C | |
| Deputy Carla S. McNulty Bauer | P | Deputy A. Hunter Adam | P | |
| Deputy Jennifer M. Tasker | P | Deputy Thomas M. Le Pelley | C | |
| Deputy Roger Domaille | N | Deputy Sean J. McManus | P | |
| Deputy Allister H. Langlois | C | Deputy Barry J. E. Paint | C | |
| Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher | C | Deputy Bernard M. Flouquet | C | |
| | | Deputy Michael G. G. Garrett | C | |
| St. Peter Port North | | | | |
| Deputy John A. B. Gollop | C | West | | |
| Deputy R. Rhoderick Matthews | N | Deputy Alvord H. Brouard | C | |
| Deputy Carol A. Steere | C | Deputy David de G. De Lisle | C | |
| Deputy Martin J. Storey | C | Deputy Marc S. Lainé | C | |
| Deputy Jack Honeybill | N | Deputy Shane L. Langlois | P | |
| Deputy Leon R. Gallienne | P | Deputy Peter R. Sirett | C | |
| Deputy Michael W. Collins | C | Deputy Gloria P. Dudley-Owen | C | |
| | | | | |
| St. Sampson | | South-East | | |
| Deputy Peter L. Gillson | P | Deputy Charles N. K. Parkinson | C | |
| Deputy Samantha J. Maindonald | C | Deputy Francis W. Quin | P | |
| Deputy Scott J. Ogier | C | Deputy Michael G. O'Hara | C | |
| Deputy Ivan F. Rihoy | N | Deputy Robert W. Sillars | C | |
| Deputy Lyndon S. Trott | P | Deputy Janine M. Le Sauvage | C | |
| Deputy T. Jane Stephens | C | Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley | P | |
| | | • • | | |
| Vale | | Alderney | | |
| Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize | C | Alderney Representative Boyd N. Kelly | | C |
| Deputy Geoffrey H. Mahy | C | Alderney Representative Paul Arditti | | C |
| Deputy Anthony Spruce | P | | | |
| Deputy Mary M. Lowe | C | | | |
| Deputy Graham Guille | C | | | |
| Deputy David B. Jones | C | | | |
| Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre | C | | | |
| | | | | |