



**OFFICIAL REPORT**  
**OF THE**  
**STATES OF DELIBERATION**  
**OF THE**  
**ISLAND OF GUERNSEY**  
**HANSARD**

**Royal Court House, Guernsey, Tuesday, 8th May 2012**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Guernsey website [www.gov.gg](http://www.gov.gg)*

**Volume 1, No. 2**

**ISSN 2049-8284**

*Published by Her Majesty's Greffier, The Royal Court House,  
St Peter Port, GY1 2PB. © States of Guernsey, 2012*

**Present:**

**Richard J. Collas, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer**

**Law Officers**

H. E. Roberts, Esq., Q.C. (H. M. Procureur),  
Miss M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H. M. Comptroller)

**People's Deputies**

**St. Peter Port South**

Deputies P. A. Harwood, J. Kuttelwascher, B. L. Brehaut,  
R. Domaille, A. H. Langlois, R. A. Jones

**St. Peter Port North**

Deputies M. K. Le Clerc, J. A. B. Gollop, P. A. Sherbourne,  
R. Conder, M. J. Storey, E. G. Bebb, L. C. Queripel

**St. Sampson**

Deputies G. A. St Pier, K. A. Stewart, P. L. Gillson,  
P. R. Le Pelley, S. J. Ogier, L. S. Trott

**The Vale**

Deputies M. J. Fallaize, D. B. Jones, L. B. Queripel,  
M. M. Lowe, A. R. Le Lièvre, A. Spruce, G. M. Collins

**The Castel**

Deputies D. J. Duquemin, C. J. Green, M. H. Dorey,  
B. J. E. Paint, J. P. Le Tocq, S. A. James, A. H. Adam

**The West**

Deputies R. A. Perrot, A. H. Brouard, A. M. Wilkie,  
D. de G. De Lisle, Y. Burford, D. A. Inglis,

**The South-East**

Deputies H. J. R. Soulsby, R. W. Sillars, P. A. Luxon,  
M. G. O'Hara, F. W. Quin, M. P. J. Hadley

**Representatives of the Island of Alderney**

Alderney Representatives B. N. Kelly, P. Arditti

**The Clerk to the States of Deliberation**

D. J. Robilliard Esq. (H.M. Deputy Greffier)

**Business transacted**

Convocation .....	53
Tribute to William Joseph Hancock .....	53

Billet d'État IX: States Election of Ministers, Deputy Chief Minister and Committee Chairmen .....	54
--	----

Treasury and Resources Department, Election of Minister – Deputy St Pier elected .....	64
Social Security Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Langlois elected .....	65
Commerce and Employment Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Stewart elected .....	72
Home Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Le Tocq elected .....	78
Education Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Sillars elected .....	79
Public Services Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Luxon elected .....	80
Health and Social Services Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Adam elected .....	84
Environment Department, Election of Minister – nominations made .....	85

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.24 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.*

Environment Department, Election of Minister – Deputy Domaille elected .....	86
Housing Department, Election of Minister – Deputy David Jones elected .....	92
Culture and Leisure Department, Election of Minister – Deputy O'Hara elected .....	98
Deputy Chief Minister – Deputy Le Tocq elected .....	99
Legislation Select Committee, Election of Chairman – Deputy Robert Jones elected .....	102
States Assembly and Constitution Committee, Election of Chairman – Deputy Fallaize elected .....	106
Procedural .....	110
Scrutiny Committee, Election of Chairman – Alderney Representative Arditti elected .....	110
Public Accounts Committee, Election of Chairman – Deputy Soulsby elected .....	119

*The Assembly adjourned at 6.33 p.m.*

*PAGE LEFT INTENTIONALLY BLANK*

## States of Deliberation

*The States met at 9.30 a.m. in the presence of  
His Excellency Air Marshal Peter Walker, CB, CBE  
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

### PRAYERS

*The Deputy Greffier*

### EVOCATION

### CONVOCATION

**The Deputy Greffier:** To the Members of the States of the Island of Guernsey, I have the honour to inform you that a meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at the Royal Court House on Tuesday, 8th May 2012 at 9.30 a.m. to consider the items contained in Billet d'État IX.

### Tribute to William Joseph Hancock

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States of Deliberation, we begin this sitting by paying tribute to former Douzaine Representative William Joseph Hancock, and his long record of public and community service in this Island. He sadly passed away a week ago today.

Bill was evacuated to England prior to the German Occupation and, on arrival there, he commenced an apprenticeship with a firm of printers before enlisting with the Royal Navy. However, owing to colour blindness, he was transferred to the Army and, following a number of postings in the UK, he was sent to India with the Royal Signal Corps and then GHQ Eastern Command in Calcutta, where he was involved in coding and de-coding top-secret communications.

He returned to Guernsey in 1947 and, four years later, married Barbara Savident. He spent his working life in the printing industry, and at various times was involved, among other things, in the typesetting of Billets d'État and of the *Guernsey Press*. In fact, he was employed by the Guernsey Press Company Ltd for some 40 years and, in addition, he and his wife, like many people at the time, had two greenhouses where they grew flowers for export.

He commenced a long period of public service in 1966, where he served the Parish of Torteval, firstly as Procureur, then as Constable and Douzenier. He was a Member of the States, serving as Douzaine Representative for Torteval from 1st April 1991 until the end of December 1995. He was elected to a number of States Committees, including the Public Thoroughfares Committee, the Committee for Horticulture, the Sea Fisheries Committee, the Ecclesiastical Committee and the Torteval Parochial Outdoor Assistance Board, which he served as President for two years.

His service to the States and his parish ended prematurely as a result of his wife's disabilities following a series of strokes. He was devoted to her and never failed in his constant care for her until she died in 2008.

Beyond his States and parochial service, Bill was involved in the Scout movement for 25 years, serving at various times as treasurer, Scout Leader and chairman of the 4th Guernsey Air Scouts. He was also an active member of the West Show Committee. He was a regular attender at the parish church of Torteval, where he had been a churchwarden and sidesman and, with his

printing skills, he produced the church's news sheet for many years.

40 In all that he did, whether in the States, in the course of his trade or in his voluntary activities, Bill was not a seeker of the limelight. He was conscientious in all that he did, always displaying a good sense of humour, and he was well respected by all those with whom he worked. A close friend of his has said to me that Bill was always ready to put others before himself and that he will be greatly missed.

45 He leaves behind a son and a daughter, John and Nicola, to whom we extend our sincere condolences.

Will you please rise to honour the memory of William Joseph Hancock.

*Members stood in silence.*

50

## Billet d'État No. IX

55

### **Election of Ministers, Deputy Chief Minister and Committee Chairmen**

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article 1, Treasury and Resources Department Minister.

60 **The Bailiff:** We would normally start by opening a debate, but I think rather, perhaps, than going into the various nominations, it would be appropriate to deal, first, with the amendment, if Deputy Bebb wishes to lay that amendment.

Deputy Bebb, I invite you to speak in support of the amendment, and I believe this will be your maiden speech.

65

**Deputy Bebb:** Thank you, M. le Bailiff.

I am pleased that my maiden speech will be based on an amendment, as I am sure Her Majesty's Procureur is... Indeed, I can feel the joy from here!

I am delighted that my maiden speech is on the proposition of open government, something that was central to my election campaign:

70

*To insert between 'To' and 'elect':*

*'amend with immediate and general effect, Rule 20(2)(a) of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation by inserting at the end of the words in that sub-paragraph:*

75

*“, save that in elections for the offices of Deputy Chief Minister, Minister and Chairman the Greffier shall publish a list detailing the vote cast by each Member of the States, as soon as possible after the conclusion of the Meeting of the States convened for the election of Members of Departments and Committees during May 2012 and quadrennially thereafter in accordance with rule 7(1) of the Rules governing the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees; and thereafter to”.*

80

Given the other business that we have to deal with today, I will try to please all present by being brief.

85 Secret ballots were initially introduced in the UK as a result of the Chartist movement, who stood in opposition to elections held in public forum, and those that did not vote to the wishes of the landlords were evicted from their properties.

In France, the secret ballot was enshrined in the French Constitution of 1795, and when Napoleon attempted to abolish this in time for the 1851 plebiscite, he faced such strong opposition that even the *petit* despot was forced to change his mind.

90

Whilst the principle of a secret ballot is central to our system of democracy, and I would never advocate a system of election such as that which is still adhered to in Appenzell, Switzerland, where the electorate gather in a square to elect by an open show of hands, one could fairly ask the question of why I stand here with amendments that would make these actions open to public scrutiny.

95

The answer is accountability. None of us here, in this House, are in danger of being evicted for not supporting one candidate over the other. None of us are in danger of contradicting a despotic leader. I doubt that Deputy Harwood's vision of executive government extends to *that* amount of

control. These are not elections on the basis of *our* positions. These are elections on behalf of our electorate. When I cast my vote, I will be casting it on behalf of the electorate of St Peter Port North, not in my own personal vested interest; a very different situation to that of a General Election.

It is never easy or comfortable to be openly held to account for the decisions that we make, but discomfort is not a reason to deprive the electorate of the opportunity to scrutinise our decisions. These do not stop with policy decisions. They extend to all issues of government and the actions of Ministers will arguably have a far greater impact on the electorate than that of the Chief Minister.

The amendment that I propose is a natural extension of the open voting that we adopted for the Chief Minister nearly one week ago. Indeed, when canvassing on the other Deputies' opinions of this amendment, Deputy Perrot asked why I was not going further by proposing an *appel nominal* system. I firmly believe that we need to balance open government with human nature and that awful spectre of 'perception'. The amendment, as proposed, holds all of us to public scrutiny for our decisions, but equally ensures that all nominations by Ministers and chairmen for their respective boards and committees can only be done on the basis of what *they* believe to be the best set of Deputies to assist them in their four-year term. Whilst I firmly believe all of us in this Chamber to be of strong character, mind and will, that we would not be swayed by such matters as who voted for whom, the amendment as it stands ensures that the accusation can never be levied – something that the *appel nominal* system *could* be accused of.

Indeed, we are all here due to our strong opinions and our strong character. I somehow doubt that anyone could undergo an election campaign and be elected on the basis of being a shrinking violet. This strong character and conviction is one that I would expect all of us to subscribe to – and that the prospect of having our decisions made public would not deter someone from voting on what they believe to be the best decision for the Island, regardless of personal attachment. We are not here to vote for friends, and should we lack the character to advise our friends that we do not believe them to be the best man, or woman, for the job, what calibre of friend are we? I would equally hope that anyone stating that their vote might be different should it be by secret ballot would ensure that they also hold, by the courage of their convictions, to cast their vote according to whom they think is best suited for the future of the Island, not by tactical means or for the benefit of public adulation.

Many of us here have worked on boards and committees, having been elected onto them.

I have asked myself whether knowing who voted for me and who voted for another candidate would cause any difficulty for me in the execution of my duties. The firm conclusion that I came to is no, this would not cause any *additional* difficulty. Those that opposed my initiatives did so for their own reasons, regardless of whether they voted for me or for another candidate. Most realised that there was work to be done and that getting on with the job was the most important factor. Would those ballot papers be available to me, I do not believe that they would change the decisions that I made and there is always the option of not looking. If any potential *Minister* here feels that they would find the details uncomfortable, as they say on the news, look away now. The availability of information does not compel us to keep it – for some, ignorance is bliss – and, for the first time in my life, I would respect any Deputy that would take that stance. But to say that the electorate should be kept in the dark is, frankly, contemptible. The votes that we will cast today – assuming that we manage to discuss this amendment in one day – are on behalf of those that we represent, and it is only right that those decisions are held to public scrutiny.

Given our commitments in our manifestos to open and transparent government and the bold move made last week for an open election of Chief Minister, I would urge all present to accept this amendment.

Thank you. (*Applause*)

**The Bailiff:** Just before Deputy Ogier rises, I think... Deputy Trott, are you formally seconding the amendment?

**Deputy Trott:** Yes, sir, and reserve my right to speak later.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy Ogier.

**Deputy Ogier:** Sir, I would like to ascertain whether, in your view, this amendment goes further than the original proposition.

**The Bailiff:** It does.

160

Are you seeking to invoke Rule 13(6)?

**Deputy Ogier:** Yes, sir, I am.

165

**The Bailiff:** With a proposal that the amendment be not debated and no vote taken on it, or that debate be postponed to a future date?

**Deputy Ogier:** That debate be postponed to a future date.

170

**The Bailiff:** Debate be postponed to a future date. In that case, Members, if you have the Rules in front of you, it is Rule 13(6). It is a Rule that we referred to the other day.

The proposition is that debate on the amendment be postponed, and that will be effective if it is supported by not less than one-third of the Members voting on the motion. There are 47 of you present, so it requires 16 or more votes for that proposition to be effective. So it will be an *appel nominal*.

175

Deputy Greffier, I just remind Members that the proposition is that debate on the amendment be postponed to a future date.

Greffier.

**The Deputy Greffier:** Voting commences with Alderney.

180

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Excuse me, sir.

Could I ask for clarification, please? Are we voting *Pour* if we are against it being debated? Is that correct?

185

**The Bailiff:** The proposition is that debate be postponed, so if you vote *Pour* you are voting for a postponement. Yes.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

190

*There was a recorded vote.*

*Carried – Pour 5, Contre 42, Abstained 0, Not Present 0*

195

**POUR**

Alderney Rep. Kelly  
Deputy Gollop  
Deputy Ogier  
Deputy Wilkie  
Deputy Burford

**CONTRE**

Alderney Rep. Arditti  
Deputy Harwood  
Deputy Kuttelwascher  
Deputy Brehaut  
Deputy Domaille  
Deputy Langlois  
Deputy Robert Jones  
Deputy Le Clerc  
Deputy Sherbourne  
Deputy Conder  
Deputy Storey  
Deputy Bebb  
Deputy Lester Queripel  
Deputy St Pier  
Deputy Stewart  
Deputy Gillson  
Deputy Le Pelley  
Deputy Trott  
Deputy Fallaize  
Deputy David Jones  
Deputy Laurie Queripel  
Deputy Lowe  
Deputy Le Lièvre  
Deputy Spruce  
Deputy Collins  
Deputy Duquemin  
Deputy Green  
Deputy Dorey  
Deputy Paint  
Deputy Le Tocq  
Deputy James  
Deputy Adam  
Deputy Perrot

**ABSTAINED**

None

**NOT PRESENT**

None

200

205

210

215

220

225



230 Deputy Brouard  
Deputy De Lisle  
Deputy Inglis  
Deputy Soulsby  
Deputy Sillars  
Deputy Luxon  
Deputy O'Hara  
Deputy Quin  
235 Deputy Hadley

**The Bailiff:** I think the result of that is fairly clear.

240 When we move to the debate... I appreciate it is difficult for some people who do not have a microphone, but can I ask either that you change places with your neighbour so you have access to a microphone, or when you are speaking, there is a spare seat on the lefthand side here where the Chief Minister would have been sitting if he was not on the bench. It is important. Please do ensure you are close to a microphone when you do speak.

*There was a short pause while the results were collated.*

245 **The Bailiff:** The result on the vote on the Rule 13(6) proposition was 5 in favour, 42 against. It did not secure the required support, so the motion is lost and debate will proceed.  
Deputy Laurie Queripel.

250 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, a point of order.

**The Bailiff:** Sorry, yes.

255 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Adding those numbers up, it is a bit short of 47. There were more than five –

**The Bailiff:** Five and 42.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Oh, sorry, I thought it was 32.

260 **The Bailiff:** No, five and 42. *(Laughter)*  
Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

265 **A Member:** Ideal candidate for PAC!

270 **Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Mr Bailiff, Assembly colleagues, I am inclined to support this amendment. To me it represents our second step along the road to more open, frank and respectful government. To my mind, we took our first step last week. I can understand why some Members were reluctant to change from a secret ballot to a public vote for the Chief Minister's election; however, it now seems that those concerns were unfounded. Debate was conducted in a good spirit and votes were cast in a frank and respectful way. I would suggest this Assembly emerged with some credit and both candidates with enhanced reputations due to impeccable behaviour before, during and after that meeting.

275 If this amendment is passed, sir, I expect more of the same today. Whatever the outcome, I believe candidates will behave in a mature and gracious manner. We must remember that within this Assembly and this system of government, we are all decision makers. We are all policymakers, whatever position we find, or do not find, ourselves in. Whatever our personal ambitions, our first priority *must be* how can I, how can we, best serve this community, because  
280 we, sir, are part of a historic institution with an awesome responsibility – a responsibility we all share.

So, sir, to conclude, in a way this amendment represents part of a journey into brighter light. It may make us blink, but ultimately it is nothing to fear.

285 Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

Deputy Gollop, I wonder if you could, perhaps, make use of the Comptroller's microphone? I know it is a bit awkward.

290 **Deputy Gollop:** Pick it up? It's like a little snake.

I must admit I was one of the five who voted for deferring this to another day, and I was perhaps a bit surprised at the overwhelming enthusiasm to debate this issue, given the response to the topic just a few moments earlier.

295 I read an article yesterday in the *Guernsey Press* from a former Minister and Member of this House, Mr Roffey, about e-bullying. I thought perhaps he was overstating the case, but nevertheless there has been a perception that there has been a degree of frantic e-mails and controversial views expressed by strong personalities for or against particular candidates.

300 My perception would be that publicising the votes after this process is over would actually not help the situation because some Members may feel under pressure to vote for somebody who had brought some influence to bear with those arguments. I accept what Deputy Laurie Queripel said, but what we do not know is whether the vote for the Chief Minister would have been exactly the same with exactly the same people – it may well have been, but we cannot prove that – and my concern is that when all of us are aware that our votes will be publicly available at some point in the future there will be a natural tendency for the stronger personalities in the States, and maybe  
305 the people that the Chief Minister has proposed, to *possibly* get a few extra votes because the questions might be raised as to why the individual Member voted in a different way.

Another point I would make is, over the years, I have seen many examples of spoilt papers and blank papers being put in for presidential elections. I wonder if there will be any in the future on that line, because the Member surely may be asked questions by the media or their peer colleagues as to why, indeed, in a choice between Deputy *A* and Deputy *B* for the post of Minister of *C*, they chose to put in a blank paper, and what that signified. So I think there are a lot of undesirable consequences.  
310

I remember when Deputy Perrot was first time in the States, there was a whole new breed of new States' Members then and I used to be quite amused watching them from the public gallery, that perhaps in debates when the vote *appel nominal* was called on a contentious philosophical issue, they usually got between six and nine votes out of a Chamber that, in those days, had 57 Members, but when they were put up for committees of significance, the same candidates used to get maybe 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 votes. I could only take away from that the perception that there was a *secret* well of support for them that was not public. Some of the more conservative Members of the States who did not necessarily wish to be targeted as overt supporters were perhaps covert supporters. We will lose all of that with this change, and I think what it eventually would do is not only reinforce perhaps an establishment, but we will be setting ourselves dangers to come, because I am sure Deputy *A* today will happily vote for Deputy *B* to be a Minister, and within a year Deputy *C* will ask Deputy *A*, 'Well, why on earth did you support that Minister when you are now complaining so much about him?'  
320  
325

So, I have got a lot of reservations about this process. As I said three months ago, support the Chief Minister being open, because that is a process all of its own, but not to support this amendment today.

330 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Dorey.

**Deputy Dorey:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

335 In February, I voted against the proposals and I intend to vote against the amendment today. It is not because I am against openness and transparency; it is because I want to ensure that when Members vote, they vote for the candidate who they think is best and not be concerned about what other Members or candidates might think about the choice they have made.

I would like to illustrate my argument with a possible scenario. If there are two candidates for a post, subconsciously a Member will give a mark to each candidate in several different categories – let's say personality, ability and politics. Then the Member would give a weighting to each of those categories and add up the scores. Let's say it works out 48% for candidate *A* and 52% for candidate *B* – familiar numbers! If there was a secret ballot, the Member would vote for candidate *B*, as he or she had the higher score, but if a Member has been in the Assembly for a few years, worked with various other Members on Departments or Committees, a particular Member might have helped or supported you, or they may have become a friend. Now let's get back to voting. If  
340  
345 candidate *A* is someone that you are friends with and the voting can be published, in my example some will vote for their friend, even though they are not the best candidate, because there is little between them. That is human nature.

To illustrate how important one vote is, in the elections of Ministers four years ago, two candidates won by only one vote. I want Members to vote for who they *genuinely think* is the best

350 candidate, without any concerns about who would know how they voted.

I conclude by saying that I believe the only way to ensure we elect the best candidate is to reject the amendment and to keep the system of secret ballots. You would not be voting against openness and transparency; you would be voting for the best system – a secret ballot.

355 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Ogier.

**Deputy Ogier:** Thank you, sir.

360 Now what is the first thing a competent new manager does when they come into a new office, department or work environment? Do they- (a) immediately start changing all the rules, or do they (b) learn what is going on before changing all the rules? Now I have to advise that I think these hasty dismantling of Rules without proper consideration, debates in Committee, States' Reports, consultation, is not the way to go about things no matter how right it feels at the time and it smacks to me of 'seagull' management.

365 Deputy Bebb calls secret ballot central to our system of government, and, in my view it is, he informs us it was brought in to protect people from pressure to vote in a particular manner and he says few of us are likely to be thrown out if we vote a certain way – well, don't underestimate how much a single vote on a single matter can catch the electorate's attention, but that is not, of course, a reason to vote one way or another. Pressure comes from a variety of sources – not necessarily from a landlord but from a friend, colleague or simple loyalty, pity even – a host of different reasons. Knowing whether someone wants you to be a Minister or not does not really bring much except the possibility of friction and factionalism. I do not want to know the 28 Members who did not vote for me to go onto PSD in 2008 for example. Many are colleagues, many are friends, we work together as one team, one States' team of 47 Members. We have to get on. I am better off not knowing, even though I can tell you I did not feel that way at the time.

370 Deputy Bebb tells us we are not here because we are shrinking violets and he asks what sort of friend we are if we cannot tell people how we feel about their candidature. He tells us *he* is not afraid to tell people how he feels about their candidature, and nor am I, and many of you here today will have received my open and honest viewpoint – but not everyone is like that. Deputy Lowe in her support for open voting for the Chief Minister summed up the reason not to do this perfectly. She said she had been put forward for a position – 28 people said they would support her – but she got only 15 votes. Speaking to those 28 afterwards they all said they voted for her, and she wants open voting because of that. I say that is exactly the reason to continue with closed ballots.

385 Those who have spoken with me will know I tell you how I feel, and it will be the truth. I am not afraid of that, but some people – like some of the 28 supporters of Mary Lowe value friendships and inter-personal relationships above the truth and in Deputy Lowe's example what would happen now? 28 people would say they would vote for her, when it comes to the vote those 28 people would have to vote for her because they did not have the guts to tell her they were not voting for her in the first place – they certainly will not have the guts to tell her they will vote for her and then not vote for her. The result will be that 28 people will vote for Deputy Lowe out of friendship and loyalty even though secretly believing someone else could do a better job. (Laughter) You cannot force people to be strong. You cannot force people to be assertive. You cannot force people to shed loyalty and friendship and you might think that those 28, knowing the votes will be open, would then tell Deputy Lowe that they will not vote for her, but if they are prepared to lie to her twice to her face in order to protect a relationship, I suggest that it is not beyond possibility they will actually vote for her rather than take what is obviously a difficult personal approach and tell a valued friend and colleague they do not think she is up to the job.

400 You get a different result if people *cannot* vote with their conscience, and I was going to say that newer Members simply do not know the value of the closed ballot as they have not gone through elections and had to work with people afterwards, but that would not be true. We have just debated this in the last Assembly and we had a vote on this in February this year and even amongst the experienced politicians it was evenly balanced – 10 current Members voted in favour, 11 current Members voted against. 5 Members who voted for this in February lost their seat. 4  
405 Members who voted against lost their seat. So even amongst seasoned Members it was evenly divided.

I have looked up the measures involved in transparency and one of the suggestions was mandatory drug testing and reading some of the recent e-mails leaves me wondering whether that might be a good idea or not (Laughter) – there is a difference in changing how Government works  
410 to make it more open and transparent in its operation – to open up meetings to the media and the

public to be more approachable and open in Government's dealings with the public.

There is a difference between all that, all that good stuff, and removing one of the cornerstones of democracy, which is the freedom from external pressure when casting a vote and that can only be done in all cases where the voting details remain unknown, and I don't even think you get that much in return. A group of people voting in a way they would tell a colleague or friend that they would, instead of with their heart or conscience and you might think that is pretty far-fetched but in the main newer Members will not have the loyalty to each other that builds up over time and which can cloud issues and, sir, it is easy to change a rule when one is not affected by it, but Members will find their loyalties and friendships grow over time and, really, elections are better off without that sort of thing.

It is easy to come fresh into Government and say 'Right, let's have an open ballot because loyalty and friendships should not come into it' when you do not have any loyalty or friendships and if this Assembly is minded to look at this rule let us look at it by all means, but let us get a few years under our belts first and look at it in time for the next Ministerial elections, not this one – because, who knows – we might all feel differently after working with each other.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** I feel I have to rise to my feet for that one, sir.

Deputy Ogier is absolutely right, and I said it last week in the States but there is part of the picture that is missing there. This was 16 or 17 years ago and at the time I was a new Member in the States and I put my name forward quite early. On the day, or the day before, it became known another candidate was standing who had far more experience than myself and, indeed, I supported that Member, who I actually worked with later on. But I had made it known so, therefore, I had lots of promises from people, saying that they would support me, but I fully understood that if you have got somebody far more experienced, who came up on the day or the day before, then it is right and proper that, actually, that person had that position.

So there was no grudge – there was no uncomfortable feeling from my point of view: I recognised the experienced person should have that job. I think the lesson to be learnt – and I did actually suggest that to Members since then – is that if you are asked to support somebody, you add the words 'at this moment in time' and therefore you leave yourself in a position that you *can* change rather than feeling that you have committed yourself to a candidate.

Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Does anyone – yes, Deputy St Pier.

**Deputy St Pier:** Sir, you will recall last week that I opposed all the amendments that were tabled. I did say that I was not actually opposed to the change of the Rules in relation to the election process or the Chief Minister, although I was principally opposed to the change of the eligibility rules and so I felt compelled to oppose all changes as a result of seeking to change any Rules in what I regarded as mid-stream for the election process.

I feel rather more ambivalent about *this* change because it does not actually change anyone's eligibility to stand for a position so, therefore, I am very much open to be persuaded by Deputies Bebb, Trott and other proponents of this change. I can see the merit in having greater transparency but I think I *am* concerned about, yet again, the haste with which this is being done, which I think Deputy Ogier very articulately described. I am also concerned that we are, yet again, as a Chamber re-debating a point which has been debated again and again very recently and this is, of course, one of the criticisms which is frequently made of this Chamber by the public – that we are simply unable to stick to any decision. I am also aware of the points made in relation to the effect it could have on team building so I look forward to that being dealt with by those who argue for this change.

I believe it was Deputy Brouard who last week referred to the change as essentially being the thin end of the wedge, forgive me if I have attributed it incorrectly to him, but the question is where does this end? Are those in favour of this also suggesting that we should now extend this to the Committee elections and members of the Boards? And if not – why not?

And, finally, I would like to say, in the very short time that I and others have been in this House, I think one of my over-riding observations is the urgent need for electronic voting (**Several Members:** Hear, hear.) and I certainly hope that comes back to this House. If we are going to change our decision on one issue, surely it has to be that, and with great haste.

Thank you very much.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Lester Queripel and Deputy Brehaut and Deputy Quin.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

475 I cannot see any real reason why anyone would oppose this amendment because it would appear that we all walked the campaign trail advocating accountability and transparency. But it seems to me this issue is already becoming far too complex. Surely the question is do we really want accountability or not? Are we not in danger of playing immature games of ‘I voted for *you*, so why don’t you vote for *me*?’ That is unacceptable.

480 On the doorstep I pledged my support for accountability at all times and I will certainly be supporting this amendment.

Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

485

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you, sir.

It is a very brief speech – it was just that when we discuss issues such as this we tend to amalgamate openness, transparency and accountability as if they are one and the same thing, and they are not. I think they are very distinct things. You can have openness by opening committee meetings to the media, have meetings open to the public and some committees, Departments and sub-groups have done that. You can have open hearings and invite the public in, which gives people a sense of real transparency.

490

We could, of course, have real freedom of information legislation which assists and, actually, if we move to presumption to publish – where everything that you see within a committee – you are aware at some point that document with a presumption to publish will be public information. And also with accountability we have this view that accountability is thrust on you rather than accountability can be volunteered – that you can be accountable for your own actions and at the time do a thing that may be difficult but make a move that you have not been cajoled or pressured into taking.

495

But I think the problem we face is that, in having open voting, we believe we are given reasons, but I think sometimes what the public see are, potentially, motives and if you have a name pinned up at the Greffe or published online people will read across and say ‘oh, I get it, he voted for Minister *A* because he wanted *that* Ministerial role and he was rewarded because later on...’ it does not, it may not work that way but the perception is the very difficult thing to deal with.

500

On balance, I think I will support this amendment but I do hear very clearly, what Deputy Ogier is saying, that although it sounds on the face of it inappropriate, do we really secure relationships for the next four, 12, 16 years with just one little white lie or do we have everything recorded, open, and perhaps compromise relationships from the very beginning of a term?

505

Thank you.

510

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Quin.

**Deputy Quin:** Thank you, sir. I was always told there are two places you can be sure of confidentiality – one was the confession box and the other was the ballot box – well I have never been in a confessional but I think if I did I would be there for an awful long time! (*Laughter*)

515

**Deputy Brehaut:** It is called the ‘White Rock Café’, sir! (*Laughter*).

**Deputy Quin:** Well, I am in there a long time... Deputy Brehaut said his was a short speech. Well here from one Guernsey man to a Welsh man, this is a short speech, I back everything that Deputy Ogier says, this is far too hasty and I will not be supporting it.

520

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Does anyone else wish to speak?

525

Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Trott:** Yes, sir, very briefly.

530

Sir, those listening to this broadcast today will have heard Deputy Dorey say he is not against openness and transparency – well, he clearly is, sir, because a vote against this amendment is precisely that.

Others have articulated the reasons why, but I think if there is ever a test case as to why Members need not fear this amendment it is what happened in the Chief Minister’s election. In the

535 end it was a two horse race between two able candidates. One of the candidates – Deputy Le Tocq – is a lifelong personal friend of mine. I have known Deputy Le Tocq since we were 11 years old and regard him as such a good friend, sir, that he and his wife were recent guests at my wedding.

540 However, having attended the hustings and having heard the proposers and the nominees and the speakers themselves, I decided that Deputy Harwood would make a better Chief Minister and voted accordingly. There is no way, sir, that that decision will affect my relationship with Deputy Le Tocq. In fact, I think he will make a very good Home Department Minister, sir, and look forward to casting my vote accordingly later.

545 So, Members of this Assembly *need not fear* openness and transparency. There was far too much of that in the last Assembly. It is a breath of fresh air. As I think I may have said when I proposed the amendment for the *appel nominal* in the Chief Minister’s election, nothing, sir, disinflects as effectively as sunlight. Let people see into this process – it will do us no harm at all.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Does anyone else wish to speak?–

No? Then I invite Deputy Bebb to reply to the debate.

550 **Deputy Bebb:** If I may, I think that what I am hearing, to a large extent, is that publishing... the question from Deputy Gollop as regards to publishing not being helpful and what the difference would be: would this be a *secret* ballot? As I said in my speech, I feel that the publishing is what opens us up to public scrutiny – something that the public are aware of. And if I may with regard to Deputy Ogier’s comment, what we are actually saying by stating that it must  
555 be secret and that it must actually go through a committee, and it must then go on to another process and another process, is that we somehow seem to want to delay a process, which is that of an open Government.

560 I stood on a very firm mandate, stating that these elections and this House needs to be far more open and with the difficult decisions that are going to be before many of us who will be on committees for the next four years, if those decisions are not made in an open and public forum, which are going to be far more difficult as to whether I support Deputy A over Deputy B, then I do fear for the integrity of some people in this House. Surely, we can actually stand on the convictions that we have stood and we can cast our vote accordingly. I do think that it comes back  
565 to the question of the courage of our convictions. I have yet to meet one person in this House who is not of strong opinion and strong enough mind to cast their vote in the way that *they* believe best. The fact that these would be open, merely means that we have to be *better friends* by stating publicly that we do not believe them to be the best candidate for that Ministerial position.

570 With regard to friction and with regard to the difficulty that this causes in all honesty, as is now public record – I did not vote for Deputy Harwood in the Chief Minister’s election. Does that mean that I wish Deputy Harwood ill in his time? No. It means that I will work as much as I possibly can to support him in order to assist those things that I believe are correct and within the Island’s best interest. The best interest of the Island would not be served by someone being divisive, difficult or in any other way prohibiting something that is for the best interests of the Island.

575 I will work as much as I possibly can in supporting Deputy Harwood and all Ministers that are going to be elected today in their work, which, in times of being quite difficult, will require public support. We *can* disagree. We disagree frequently. I have frequent discussions with many of you on things that I do not agree with. I do not think that will in any way prohibit us from being able to work together in a public forum and this is merely allowing the electorate to see *what* we are doing  
580 and surely we should stop being so introspective that we concern ourselves as to the characters and relationships that we have with each other and we should think far more about what the electorate are entitled to hear. What the electorate are entitled to question us about and the effect of Ministers on people’s lives is far greater than that of a Chief Minister, so surely we should be held accountable for those decisions and we can surely agree to the fact that, at a later point in time, we  
585 can also say ‘Sorry, I made a mistake in that vote and now, in hindsight, feel that it would have been different but, at the time, *that* is the person I felt to be the most able candidate for that particular role.’

Thank you.

590 **The Bailiff:** Members, then, we come to the vote on the –

**Deputy Fallaize:** Sir, can I just ask Deputy Bebb a question?

595 **The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** If Deputy Jones would move to the other chair... *(Laughter)* We are such good friends, sir, that we can do this!

600 Can I just ask him a question because I thought that he might refer to this when he summed up. Can you just explain exactly how this would work? Would we received printed ballot slips with our name at the top and then be able to vote for the candidates underneath or would we have to write our names in the top? Because I do not want to disparage any Member but I think the possibility for confusion –

605 **The Bailiff:** Perhaps I can help. The Greffier has prepared printed ballot papers with your name at the top and if this amendment is accepted I understand that there is an envelope of ballot papers that will be handed to each of you before we get to the next election. If that helps – is that correct, Greffier?

That is the way we see it, yes, thank you.

610 So it will be printed, otherwise there might be difficulty because the name might be unreadable: so they are *printed* ballot papers, *(Laughter)* and we have a request for a recorded vote?

615 **Alderney Representative Arditti:** I am sorry, sir, I wonder if you can just re-cap the exact proposition?

**The Bailiff:** Well, the amendment – I am sorry, I thought the amendments had been circulated. You should have it in front of you: it is the amendment proposed by Deputy Bebb, seconded by Deputy Trott:

620 To insert between ‘To’ and ‘elect’:

‘amend with immediate and general effect, Rule 20(2)(a) of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation by inserting at the end of the words in that sub-paragraph:

625 “, save that in elections for the offices of Deputy Chief Minister, Minister and Chairman the Greffier shall publish a list detailing the vote cast by each Member of the States, as soon as possible after the conclusion of the Meeting of the States convened for the election of Members of Departments and Committees during May 2012 and quadrennially thereafter in accordance with rule 7(1) of the Rules governing the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees; and thereafter to”’.

630 **Alderney Representative Arditti:** Thank you, sir. I am obliged.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

*There was a recorded vote.*

635 *Carried – Pour 30 , Contre 17 , Abstained 0, Not Present 0*

	<b>POUR</b>	<b>CONTRE</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>	<b>NOT PRESENT</b>
	Alderney Rep. Arditti	Alderney Rep. Kelly	None	None
	Deputy Harwood	Deputy Langlois		
640	Deputy Kuttelwascher	Deputy Gollop		
	Deputy Brehaut	Deputy Conder		
	Deputy Domaille	Deputy Storey		
	Deputy Jones	Deputy Gillson		
	Deputy Le Clerc	Deputy Le Pelley		
645	Deputy Sherbourne	Deputy Ogier		
	Deputy Bebb	Deputy Le Lièvre		
	Deputy L C Queripel	Deputy Spruce		
	Deputy St Pier	Deputy Duquemin		
	Deputy Stewart	Deputy Dorey		
650	Deputy Trott	Deputy Adam		
	Deputy Fallaize	Deputy Wilkie		
	Deputy Jones	Deputy Burford		
	Deputy L B Queripel	Deputy Quin		
	Deputy Lowe	Deputy Hadley		
655	Deputy Collins			
	Deputy Green			
	Deputy Paint			
	Deputy Le Tocq			
	Deputy James			
660	Deputy Perrot			
	Deputy Brouard			
	Deputy De Lisle			

Deputy Inglis  
Deputy Soulsby  
Deputy Sillars  
Deputy Luxon  
Deputy O'Hara

665

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the result of the vote on the amendment proposed by Deputy Bebb, seconded by Deputy Trott, was 30 votes in favour, 17 against. I declare the amendment carried.

670

Greffier, do you wish to hand out the envelopes now? Yes – the Sheriff will hand them round now, thank you.

Whilst those are being handed around, Members, I will just remind you that in a moment we will be dealing with the elections and the Ministers will be proposed and voted upon in the order that the Chief Minister has determined, save that, under the Rules, the Treasury and Resources Minister is taken first. After all the Ministers have been elected you will then be asked to elect a Deputy Chief Minister and I just remind you that only somebody who has been elected as a Minister is eligible to be proposed as Deputy Chief Minister, and then we move on to the Committee Chairman....

675

680

*There was a short pause as the voting slips were handed out.*

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, if I could just have your attention. The Greffier has just asked that you do not use the voting slips for casual notes – or we may run out of *(Laughter)* voting slips!

685

So, Greffier.

690

## TREASURY AND RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

### Election of Minister Deputy St Pier elected

695

*Article I.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Treasury and Resources Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

700

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article I. Treasury and Resources Department Minister.

**The Bailiff:** Members, under the Rules I first invite the Chief Minister to propose an eligible candidate, without speaking about the candidate at this stage.

705

Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister (Deputy Harwood):** Mr Bailiff, I have pleasure in proposing Deputy Gavin St Pier for the role of Minister of the Treasury and Resources Department.

710

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Yes, Deputy Le Tocq.

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Sir, I will second that nomination.

715

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

Does anybody else wish to propose any other Member to be Treasury and Resources Minister?

No? Well, the Rules prescribe that if only one candidate is proposed and seconded, the Presiding Officer shall put the election of that candidate to the vote without speeches – and that, I believe, is still the case.

720

Procureur, does the amendment affect this?

**The Procureur:** Not at all, sir. It only affects the clause which deals with voting when there are two or more candidates.



725 **The Bailiff:** Right, so we go straight to the vote.

**The Procureur:** Go straight to the vote. Anyone can call for an *appel nominal*.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

730 So the proposition, then, is that Deputy St Pier be elected as Minister of the Treasury and Resources Department.

Those in favour; those against.

735 *Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I declare him elected.

Deputy St Pier, if you wish to take your seat on the bench.

740 *Deputy St Pier was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

### SOCIAL SECURITY DEPARTMENT

745

#### Election of Minister Deputy Langlois elected

*Article X.*

*The States are asked:*

750 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Social Security Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

755 **The Deputy Greffier:** Article II. Commerce and Employment Department, election of a Minister.

**The Bailiff:** No, Greffier, I think the Chief Minister has determined that Social Security be taken next.

760 Article X, I think.

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article X, election of a Minister of the Social Security Department.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

765 **The Chief Minister:** Mr Bailiff, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Allister Langlois for the post of Minister of the Department of Social Security.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

770 Deputy Adam.

**Deputy Adam:** I second that.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.

775 Do we have any other nominations for the post of Social Security Minister?  
Yes, Deputy Le Tocq.

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Yes, I rise, sir, to propose Deputy Mark Dorey.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Mark Dorey.

780 Do we have a seconder for Deputy Mark Dorey?

**Deputy Conder:** Yes, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Conder. Thank you.

785 Do we have any other nominations for the post of Social Security Minister?

**Deputy Stewart:** Sir, I propose Deputy Mary Lowe.

790 **The Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Stewart.  
So, that is Deputy Lowe, proposed by Deputy Stewart.  
Do we have a seconder?

**Deputy De Lisle:** I second that, sir.

795 **The Bailiff:** Seconded by Deputy De Lisle. Thank you very much.  
Do we have any other nominations?

No? Well, then, we have three nominations: Deputy Allister Langlois, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Adam; Deputy Dorey, proposed by Deputy Le Tocq, seconded by Deputy Conder; and Deputy Lowe, proposed by Deputy Stewart, seconded by Deputy De Lisle.

800 So, under the Rules, then, each of the proposers and candidates may speak for not more than five minutes each, and the bell will again be in operation. *(Laughter)* I remind you there will be a tinkle after four minutes and a louder clang of the bell after five minutes, if anyone is still speaking.

805 Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** Thank you, sir.

I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Allister Langlois for this position as Minister of the Department of Social Security.

810 In nominating him and other Deputies for ministerial appointments, I have selected persons who can not only be effective in the discharge of their respective departmental duties, but who can, in my opinion, also make an equally important contribution as a member of the team that will make up the Policy Council – people who will, I believe, generally work through the Policy Council in the discharge of its mandate for the benefit of the Island, and not merely for the benefit of their own Departments.

815 Deputy Allister Langlois brings political experience, having already served one full term as a Deputy. He has served as a member of the Treasury Resources Department and, since 2009, as Chair of the Public Sector Remuneration Committee.

820 As a member of the Treasury Resources Department, he served on the Joint Working Group on Funding Long-Term Care. In that capacity, he worked alongside representatives of the Health and Social Services Department, the Social Security Department and the Housing Department. It is precisely this type of experience of working closely, and co-operatively, with other Departments of Government that I would hold out as a major qualification for the role of a member of the Policy Council.

825 He has also served for two separate terms as a member of the Policy Council Strategic Plan Group and currently he is Chair of the Project Board, the STSC and SAP efficiency project to centralise and improve the support and administrative services to the States – yet another example of his experience of working on an inter-departmental basis.

830 As Chair of the Public Sector Remuneration Committee, Deputy Langlois was instrumental in setting up the Public Sector Pensions Review Group under its independent chairmanship and with the participation of union representation. Through his involvement with that review group, as well as his more general role as Chair of the Public Sector Remuneration Committee, Deputy Langlois will bring to the role of Minister of Social Security an understanding of the complexities and issues in the provision of state pensions and, most particularly, the implications of the demographic changes that face all communities, not least this Island.

835 His career outside politics included 15 years as a lecturer in further and higher education. He is co-founder of Organisation Development Ltd, a broadly based organisational consultancy supporting strategic, structural and operational change projects with clients in all economic sectors, including the public sector, the United Kingdom and, before he entered the States in 2008, the public sector in Guernsey.

840 His experience and background would also fit him for a role as Treasury Resources Minister. On this occasion, and recognising the significance and the importance that I personally attach to the future of the States welfare system in this Island, Deputy Langlois has offered himself to be nominated as the Social Security Minister.

845 For this role, he brings with him a number of important credentials: firstly, his experience as working as a team member on inter-departmental projects; secondly, through his role at PSRC, an

awareness of the issues relating to the lower paid within our community; thirdly, through his role also at PSRC, an appreciation of the pension issues that face this community with the changes in the demographics and the population; and, fourthly, through his experience of Treasury and Resources, an appreciation of the importance of maintaining an effective working relationship between the Social Policy Group and the Fiscal and Economic Policy Group in the States' strategic planning process.

In proposing Deputy Langlois as Deputy Chief Minister – as I will be shortly – I recognise that his eligibility for that role will depend upon his first being appointed as a Minister.

Sir, I urge all Members of this House to support this nomination.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Sir, maintaining and, where appropriate, improving social benefits during probably a prolonged period of economic uncertainty is a key function of our Government. The Social Security Department is at the very centre of that Government duty and I want to ensure that the States can be proud of providing true Social Security wherever there is a real need.

In March, the Social Security Department presented their proposals for phase 1 of the modernisation of the supplementary benefits system. Those proposals fell for a number of reasons, but not least of all because they did not come here with the support of the Social Policy Group, the Policy Council or the Treasury Resources Department. Further development of those proposals *must* remain a priority so that changes can be made to make the reforms work.

Sir, this is not the time or place for policy invention on the hoof, but there are three key drivers of Social Security demand: demographics, the economy and organisational culture.

The demographic time bomb of the pensions puzzle is facing every developed country and we must avoid placing intolerable burdens on future generations. Tough decisions *will* be needed about how to sustain viable pay-as-you-go old-age pensions with an adequate buffer fund to ensure that obligations can be met in the short term without constantly nasty surprises for the public purse. There are strong parallels with the public sector occupational scheme that Deputy Harwood has already outlined my part in.

Moving on to the economy, there are clear and present signals that unemployment may become a significant uncontrollable cost to SSD, but let's keep some sense of proportion about this. Remember that uncontrollable costs were identified as a major economic threat by Prof. Wood in his October independent Fiscal Review. We are still on a very low base of unemployment, at a mere fraction of most European rates; however, sir, we must remember that, for every unemployed person, their personal unemployment rate is 100%.

SSD must work effectively, especially with Education and Commerce and Employment to reduce these numbers through various initiatives and to avoid any hint of developing a benefits culture. Surely, we can manage that in our small and caring community. In this area, it would be of great benefit investigating the possibilities for social impact bonds, systems which encourage private financing of personal development in return for work activities, rewarded on a payment-by-results basis. Once again, my broad background, especially drawn from experience of further education during a high unemployment era in the UK, tells me that joined-up working between Departments is essential.

With regard to organisational efficiency opportunities, as is the case with the Income Tax Office, further development of computer systems *must* be accompanied by real and rapid moves towards reducing duplication in cash-collection systems and data handling. Once again, my track record in this type of organisational development is extensive and, as SSD Minister, I would look to fully support IT reform and the SAP project, of which I have already chaired the project board while on T & R. Organisational change will also be necessary to develop the long-term care strategies and as, once again, Deputy Harwood mentioned, I was the Treasury and Resources representative on the recent working party.

But, sir, above all this, the Department is about providing the right level of benefits to those who are in need and ensuring that funds do not leak away, so close integration, ongoing with housing, HSSD, T & R, must be a high priority.

Any Government will surely be judged on the way it supports, (*Four-minute bell rang*) includes and encourages those least fortunate in the population, whilst also encouraging effort and enterprise. Most of all, we must not have an SSD board with impeccable social policy credentials and aims, who cannot carry with them the States as a whole for the implementation of those aims. We need to develop a Social Security structure that is cohesive, caring and consistent and rewards hard work.

I relish the challenge of balancing the social and fiscal needs of this crucial Department, and I

offer the Assembly a skills set that will meet that challenge.

I ask for the support of my fellow Members.

910 **The Bailiff:** Next, I call on Deputy Le Tocq to propose Deputy Dorey.

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Thank you, sir.

I have known Deputy Mark Dorey for at least a couple of decades, but I have come to appreciate him as both a dedicated politician and incisive adviser, especially over the last 10 years, since he has had a seat in this Assembly, firstly as a Douzaine Representative for two years, and then, subsequently, as a Deputy for the Castel.

915 As a States Member, Deputy Dorey has served diligently across a breadth of Government Departments and bodies, including on Social Security – one year as a Member and as the Minister for the last four years; on Housing – two years as a Member and four years as Deputy Minister; on T & R – for four years as Member and on the Board of industry for one year. On the Policy Council, Deputy Dorey has served as a member of the Strategic Land Planning Group, the Population Policy Group and the Social Policy Group, among others.

920 During his time in this Assembly, I have *never* heard anyone, friend or foe, criticise Deputy Dorey for not putting enough effort in. Rather, there has always been widespread agreement – sometimes accompanied by annoyance – that Deputy Dorey has researched any given issue at least as thoroughly as any other Member, often far more so. In fact, having sat next to Deputy Dorey for four long years at T & R, I am convinced that even if his briefcase does not resemble a tardis, his mind and memory certainly do.

925 Deputy Dorey is 53. He is married, with three children. He holds diploma qualifications in computer studies and worked in the software industry locally for 21 years, with 17 years in development management for a local company that developed and sold a large wealth management system to the finance industry.

930 Years before becoming a States Member, Deputy Dorey demonstrated a strong interest in politics. He was elected to a parish position way back in the 1980s, when he was still in his 20s. He was spokesperson for the Right to Vote movement in 1990-93 that campaigned for *conseillers* to be elected by the public.

935 Deputy Dorey stood in the recent election as the Minister of a Department that was portrayed, at least in the perception of some, as wanting to increase public expenditure. Despite this, the public fully supported Deputy Dorey by awarding him a consistent number of votes to that which he received in the two previous polls. Like it or not, Deputy Dorey represents a substantial section of our Island community that deserves to be heard.

940 His views on some matters are diametrically opposed to my own, and yet I have always appreciated the manner and sincerity in which he has shared those views. My own views have, indeed, been tempered and developed by such clear thinking and interrogation. It is only through the determination of politicians like Deputy Dorey that we can truly come to what we call consensus.

945 I am glad that Deputy Dorey has decided to concentrate his efforts again now on Social Security. His role at the helm of that key Department, both visibly and strategically, is now crucial to the workstreams already begun, and it is only right that he is given the means to lead them through to the next stage.

950 Sir, some have said – unfairly and misguidedly – that Deputy Dorey is not a team player. I would suggest it depends on what kind of team you are seeking to build. Deputy Dorey is certainly no yes-man, but equally he is not a Mr No-Can-Do. I have witnessed firsthand Deputy Dorey's willingness to accept due democratic process and decisions, even when he has been in a minority of one. Neither is he one to throw his toys out of the pram, so to speak, when he does not get his own way. In fact, I have always found him to be rather protective of his toys in a typical Guernsey sort of way. This endearing character means that Deputy Dorey, working with him round the table, you will be certain that no stone will be left unturned, every legitimate *ormer* will have been eked out, and whatever conclusion is drawn, it will be certain that thorough investigation has taken place. *That* is the kind of team dynamic we need now.

955 As a result of all this, I have absolutely no hesitation in recommending to this Assembly Deputy Mark Dorey (*Four-minute bell rang*) for the role of Social Security Minister.

Thank you, sir.

960 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Dorey.

**Deputy Dorey:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

I would like to also thank Deputy Le Tocq for his kind words and Deputy Conder for seconding me.

970 In the last four years, under my leadership, SSD has had many achievements. These include the pension puzzle review, appointing new investment advisers, diversifying the funds to reduce risk and achieving a three-year return of 14.7% per annum.

975 In our successful low-tax economy, many have benefited from the wealth that has been generated. In a fair and inclusive society, those who are genuinely disadvantaged through sickness, disability, unemployment, ability or age must benefit from that wealth by having an adequate income so they can participate in our community and not live in relative poverty.

980 The review of the failing outdated supplementary benefits system was long overdue. We worked closely with the relevant Departments. The principles and objective of our new income support system included work first, benefits second, and Social Security being responsible for all the means-tested benefits which were supported by those Departments concerned.

Our report was a bid for future funding, and we need to work together to secure that future funding. This can include a review of universal benefits. Sir, I have the knowledge, experience and passion to continue to lead the Department, to ensure that the States fulfils this essential area of social policy.

985 In 2008, when standing for this position, I said I wanted to work with T & R and the project to combine our computer systems for collection of Social Security and tax. SSD is even more eager to start this project, but has been disappointed with delays due to lack of resource at Income Tax. Use of an old IT system limits changes that can be made, and they are expensive.

990 I am proud of the Department's contribution in keeping our unemployment figures comparatively low. I want them to be as low as possible, which includes further working with Housing on short-term licences, and with Skills Guernsey to further develop our back-to-work schemes and, particularly, our getting to courses.

995 Following successful trials with recruitment agencies, I want to improve the Job Centre, including appropriate help for the disabled. I want to complete the pension puzzle. The States supported our proposed increase in pension age, an increase in upper earnings limit for individuals, but not the increase in the employers' contributions. SSD presented a balanced approach after extensive public consultation. The employer's contribution rate needs to be amended, as delay will only result in a larger increase in the future.

1000 Actuarial projections for the long-term care scheme concluded that existing contributions were not sufficient to provide the same level of care in the future. I want to work with HSSD to find the most cost-effective sustainable care model that has public support.

1005 Secondary healthcare: at joint meetings between HSSD and Social Security with MSG, I have robustly represented the Department to ensure that waiting times are within contract. I want to work with HSSD on the future model, particularly the balance between on- and off-Island treatment, and negotiate suitable contracts for 2017 onwards. The primary care grant of £12 needs reviewing so that we can target help to those on low incomes who are above supplementary benefit levels.

1010 Sickness benefits: building on the success to date of our trial of the primary mental health service with HSSD, I want to review how we can reduce long-term sickness claims. *(Four-minute bell rang)*

I would like to investigate the introduction of a tax-efficient retirement savings scheme to encourage people to save, so that they have income in addition to their old-age pension.

1015 At Policy Council, I want to improve our policy planning. The Policy Council needs to spend far more time on policy co-ordination and own and direct and have regular updates from the sub-groups. The strategic plan needs to set out specific goals relative to the objectives of the States and produce a four-year policy plan. It should set out how this will be achieved, in what time frame and how resources will be allocated, and annual policy updates to review progress.

Finally, I ask Members to vote for me so I can take this Department forward with my vision for the future.

1020 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Stewart will speak in favour of Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Stewart:** Thank you, sir.

1025 Bailiff, fellow States Members, I did not envy the Chief Minister's first task of proposing his ministerial preferences to sit with him around the Policy Council table. With so much talent and enthusiasm amongst both established and new States Members, the ministerial positions could be filled twice over.

1030 Difficult for us, too, in deciding who can bring that extra dimension to the role of Minister at SSD. We have some excellent candidates but, for me, Deputy Lowe is the one who has something special required for this important role.

I knew Deputy Lowe when she first entered the States of Deliberation 18 years ago. Back then, she was still a butterfly. Now, with a wealth of experience behind her, she has become our first ‘moth’ – Mother of the House! (*Laughter*)

1035 For the benefit of new Members, and to remind re-elected Members, let’s review how much experience and wisdom Deputy Lowe can bring to the role. She is a former Minister of Social Security; Chairman, Inheritance Law Review Committee; Chairman, States Members’ Induction Working Party; Chairman, Population Review Group; Vice-Chairman, States Assembly and Constitution Committee; Vice-Chairman, Joint Committees Good Governance Group; Vice-  
1040 Chairman, Recreation Committee; Vice-President, Guernsey Gambling Committee; Vice-President, Guernsey Telecoms; member of the Emergency Powers Authority; member of Health and Social Services Department; member of the Policy Council; member, Parochial Ecclesiastical Rates Review Committee – I wondered who was on that; member, Environment Department; member of the Scrutiny Committee; a member of the Children Board; a member of the  
1045 Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Executive Committee; and there are numerous sub- and working party groups.

It took me a while to read those out! Just imagine how many long hours in total Deputy Lowe has given to her work in Government, serving on those Committees and groups.

1050 Deputy Lowe is one of the most committed and persuasive people I know. Her dedication and hard work over so many years is an example to us all.

Deputy Lowe was on SSD for 10 years, three of which as Minister.

Deputy Lowe is an accomplished negotiator. During a visit to their fund managers in London to negotiate a reduction in fees, SSD’s independent London adviser stated a reduction would be unlikely. Well, after some pretty tough talking with the chairman of the investment bank, Deputy  
1055 Lowe succeeded in a minimum amount of £48,000 cash free fund annually linked to RPI. SSD’s London adviser was speechless.

During her time as Minister of Social Security Department, her aim was to reduce the increasing annual prescription drug bill down from over £14 million and, as a result of working  
1060 with doctors, pharmacists and the public, to use generic drugs instead of the more expensive brands. Over £1 million was saved in one year alone! Benefit payments were also reduced or, in some cases, stopped for those who made no effort to seek work: skills and initiatives befitting a Minister.

Deputy Lowe, in many ways, has been ahead of her time. She was raising issues about openness and transparency before it was fashionable. She is a woman of great courage, never  
1065 afraid to ask awkward or unpopular questions. In my view, the social conscience and political experience that Deputy Lowe can bring to both SSD and the Policy Council is without equal.

I wish I did not have to raise the gender issue in this day and age, but I feel it is important that I do. Government is a force for change, and Deputy Lowe, as both Minister and a member of the  
1070 Policy Council, would be part of that change for the *next* election. She would be an inspiration, as both Minister and ‘moth’ to women young and old to engage in politics and political life.

Of course, I do not agree with all of Deputy Lowe’s policies, but I will always respect her views, as I know she is a woman of integrity, (*Four-minute bell rang*) honesty, and, above all, is balanced and fair and never one to hold a grudge.

1075 This is my maiden speech. In a moment we will hear a maiden speak. (*Laughter*) I am both privileged and proud to propose Deputy Lowe as Minister for SSD.

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, can I just suggest that we reserve applause for when Members make their maiden speech in debate.

1080 I noticed that, last week, neither Deputy Harwood nor Deputy Le Tocq received any acclaim at the end of what would have been *their* maiden speeches, and if I may suggest –

**Deputy Le Tocq:** I have never been a maiden, and I don’t want *a speech*. (*Laughter*)

1085 **The Bailiff:** If I may suggest we reserve it for maiden speeches in debate, rather than having applause for individual candidates.

Deputy Stewart.

**Deputy Stewart:** I am happy with that, sir.

1090 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you, sir.

Mr President, Members of the States, may I, first of all, thank my proposer, Deputy Stewart, for his kind words, and Deputy De Lisle for seconding my nomination.

1095 So, what would I like to achieve, if successful, as Minister of Social Security and Member of the Policy Council? We all know I cannot achieve anything on my own, so one of the first jobs would be to establish a team, all working and pulling together, as little can happen without that commitment. That team would not only consist of Social Security Members. If I can quote my friend and former colleague, Deputy Guille, he often said he was in Government, but not part of it.

1100 This has to change. All 47 of us are in this together. I would be inviting Members to have regular presentations from Social Security, so you *will* all be involved.

I am fully aware many reviews will be taking place, including the fiscal policy. However, this time, the States *must* take into consideration social needs and policies. These cannot remain separated. One of the main priorities facing Social Security is solving the pension puzzle and how this work *must* tie in with Treasury and Resources, working closely together corporately to resolve a way forward in conjunction with the taxation policy. Social Security does need and want closer integration with T & R, such as looking to complete the next stage of the computer system, enabling some very sensible efficiencies. I said this four years ago, and still this work has not happened.

1110 Another priority that needs addressing is a review of the long-term care and finding a sustainable solution. Social Security needs to address and pick out ways to move forward on parts of the outdated supplementary benefit law, see what can be recovered from this Report lost a few months ago in the States. Can we find other ways to fund this? One option would be to review whether we continue paying Family Allowance to everyone. We need to think differently on how we can move this forward in some way.

1115 Social Security will work with HSSD to review the medical specialist group contract. Can we offer the service in a more cost-effective way? This will impact on the scope and cost of the multi-million-pound contracts. I have the experience at political level of being part of renegotiation of that contract.

1120 Social Security *must* be involved with the corporate team looking at the strategic framework for the older people's strategy.

All these reviews have ramifications on Social Security. That is why it is paramount working together will be the norm. Nearly half of Social Security's annual expenditure accounts for pensions. These are long-term entitlements which need to be met by having stable financial arrangements in reserves. Many people think of Social Security as just pensions and supplementary benefits, but there is far more to this complex and varied Department. Part of the job as Minister for Social Security involves meeting regularly with the pharmacists, doctors and the Medical Specialists' Group, some jointly with HSSD.

1130 There is a very strong financial component to the work of Social Security Department. The Social Security Members are, by law, responsible for the control and management of the Social Security Funds. Meetings take place regularly with independent fund managers to enable all Members on the board to make vital decisions to ensure pension and other funds continue to increase in this difficult market. The assets of those Funds are in excess of £700 million. This is a huge responsibility and, although there are advisers, I will set up training for the new Members for their responsibilities for the Funds, including training in the language and terms used by the fund managers and advisers. Social Security's track record of management of these Funds has been excellent. The management of the funds is a *major* responsibility.

1140 Sir, when I was Minister, I invited HSSD, Home Department, Education, Housing and Commerce and Employment political Members and the chief officers to work with Social Security. That was the start of joined-up government. I instigated a six-monthly HSSD and Social Security meeting, working together.

1145 The events of the last few weeks and months have shown that Ministers' responsibilities (*Four-minute bell rang*) as Members of the Policy Council are of equal importance to leading the individual Departments. If elected, I will take my full share of responsibility towards the rebuilding of the Policy Council into a cohesive team. My aim has always been, and will be, the preservation and improvement of Guernsey and Alderney for the residents of our Islands.

1150 With the approval of this Assembly, I look forward to the challenge and hard work ahead, and I hope having a woman's perspective *will* be an added dimension as part of that team. I have the ability and capability and the energy and enthusiasm. I ask Members to please support my nomination.

Thank you, sir.

1155 **The Bailiff:** Members, we now come to the vote. I remind you, there are three candidates: Deputy Langlois proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Adam; Deputy Dorey proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy Conder; and Deputy Lowe, proposed by Deputy Stewart and seconded by Deputy De Lisle.

1160 If there are any of you who do not have immediate access to desk space, if you wish to come up to the Greffier's table, or somewhere else to write your vote, then that is absolutely fine, but we do not want to have spoilt papers because your vote is unreadable.

If you would please use the first of the voting slips that have been handed to you, and then they will be collected up by the Sheriff and the usher.

*A ballot took place.*

1165 **The Bailiff:** The Greffier will now retire and count the votes.

Members are free to leave the Chamber if they wish, as I probably will be doing in a moment with His Excellency, but please do come back in promptly when you are called back in by the Sheriff.

1170 *There was a seven-minute recess to count the votes.*

**The Deputy Sheriff:** All rise.

1175 **The Bailiff:** Thank you, Greffier.

The Deputy Greffier has just handed me an envelope with the results of the election on the cover of it.

Deputy Langlois secured 24 votes, Deputy Dorey 18, and Deputy Lowe 5 votes, so I declare Deputy Langlois to have been elected as Minister. *(Applause)*

1180 As I was saying, I declare him elected as Minister of the Social Security Department, having secured more than half the votes. Deputy Langlois will now take his seat on the top bench.

*Deputy Langlois was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

1185

## COMMERCE AND EMPLOYMENT DEPARTMENT

### Election of Minister Deputy Stewart elected

1190

*Article II.*

*The States are asked:*

1195 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Commerce and Employment Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article II, Election of a Minister for Commerce and Employment Department.

1200 **The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** Sir, Members of the House, I nominate Deputy Roger Perrot for the role of Minister of Commerce and Employment.

1205 **The Bailiff:** Do we have a seconder? Yes, Deputy Sillars. Thank you.  
Do we have any other nominations? Yes, Deputy Dorey,

**Deputy Dorey:** Sir, I nominate Deputy Brouard.

1210 **Deputy Gillson:** I second, sir.



**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard, nominated by Deputy Dorey and seconded by Deputy Gillson. Thank you.

1215 And then Deputy Le Tocq was standing.

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Yes, sir, I rise to nominate Deputy Kevin Stewart, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Stewart, proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by?

1220 **Deputy St Pier:** Seconded by me, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier. Any other candidates?

1225 No? So we have three candidates, Deputy Perrot, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Sillars; Deputy Brouard, proposed by Deputy Dorey, seconded by Deputy Gillson; and Deputy Stewart, proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy St Pier. Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** Sir, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Roger Perrot for the position of Minister of the Department of Commerce and Employment.

1230 Deputy Perrot brings political experience to the role, having previously served as a States Deputy for two years, then at three years each, between 1982 and 1988. During that period he served as President of the Guernsey Post Office and subsequently – as President – of Guernsey Electricity Board. He served as a member of the States Telecommunications Board that first introduced digital technology into the Island. He also chaired the Conveyance Reform Committee which brought in the Reform Law in 1987 and provided, for the first time in the Island's history, 1235 the ability to convey freehold flats.

Deputy Perrot was born and educated in Guernsey and graduated through the Royal Military College of Science at Shrivenham as a Bachelor of Science. He subsequently moved into a career in law, being called to the English Bar, as a member of the Inner Temple in 1974 and, 1240 subsequently, to the Guernsey Bar in 1975.

As a Member of the Guernsey Bar, Deputy Perrot has had wide exposure to all aspects of the commercial world in Guernsey, not least to the financial services sector. Prior to his retirement as an advocate at the end of 2009, he had acted as legal adviser to a number of local banks and insurance companies and had also served as a non executive director on the boards of a number of 1245 banks, captive insurance managers, captive insurance companies and trust companies.

He will bring to the role of Minister of Commerce and Employment important knowledge and experience of the Island's principal economic sector, that of financial services. But his professional knowledge and experience is not limited to that of the financial services sector alone. Again, as a practising advocate, he was extensively involved in advising local businesses on 1250 regulatory employment and planning issues. He understands the local business community and its problems. He has sympathy with the concerns of local business across all sectors, relating to the burdens of regulation, whether relating to financial services, employment, Health and Safety or utility regulation. As a lawyer, he will be aware of the significant volume of legislation that emanates from the Department of Commerce and Employment and, as its Minister, he will be able to make informed decisions in the interests of avoiding excessive, and some may call it, 1255 unnecessary, legislation.

He has clearly demonstrated his ability to chair Departments of Government in the past. As if that was not of itself sufficient evidence of his leadership abilities, it should also be remembered that he acted as a managing partner and subsequently as senior partner in one of this Islands' 1260 leading law firms that included a wide range of egos amongst its partners, including at least one former States Deputy. In addition to his overwhelming qualifications for the role of Minister of the Commerce and Employment Department, Deputy Perrot will also bring to the Policy Council his extensive knowledge of, and interest in, constitutional matters.

Deputy Perrot will outline to you what he sees as the priorities that he would seek to address in the first 12 months or so of receiving office, if he was elected. He recognises, in particular, the important part that the Department of Commerce and Employment must play in the next four years 1265 in facilitating growth and diversity in the Island's economy.

Sir, through you, I strongly urge all Members to support this nomination.

1270 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Perrot.

**Deputy Perrot:** Mr Bailiff, I thank the Chief Minister for nominating me and for his kind words.

1275 I also apologise to him. I have not been sending out my CV over the weekend, nor have I been e-mailing or tweeting, so I realise that I am probably unelectable! (*Laughter*) What follows is what would have happened had I been elected Minister for Commerce and Employment – and, by the way, I served for two sessions, not for two years, in the 80s.

1280 Now, strategically, our economy is out of balance, with 39% of it in the Financial Services Sector. Because of that, and because of redundancies which are going to be caused in this Island as a result of the actions of both Europe and Westminster, we need to place the diversification of our economy at the forefront of our priorities and, as a template for action, we could do much worse than study in great detail the report of Oxford Economics.

1285 Although I am not at all a great proponent of expensive consultation, this Report is a humdinger and ought to be on everybody's desk. Commerce and Employment, over the next session, needs to do the following. Clearly, it needs to attract new business to the Island. How does it do that? Well, new businesses – or, because of Zero 10, rather their owners – will need to be incentivised with reasonable tax breaks over the early part of the lives of those businesses. We need to enhance greatly the States apprenticeships scheme, so that it is taken up. We need to bring light industry to Guernsey, by the release of much more light industrial land under the Island Development Plan, so there will need to be very considerable liaison with the Environment Department and there must be an effort to change the culture within that Department in respect of planning interpretation: we must stop taking a narrow interpretation if there can be a wider one.

1290 We also need to encourage the existing 'Fred in the sheds' in the Island, as well as to encourage new ones. There needs, therefore, to be a *great deal* of interplay between Commerce and Employment, Treasury and the Policy Council itself, and the Environment Department and the Policy Council, in particular, because it will be responsible, through its sub-committee, in relation to population management.

1300 We must not fall behind in respect of ICT. Indeed, we need to take up and develop the proposal of Senator Ozouf in Jersey in respect of funding an ICT body on similar lines to Guernsey Finance. Guernsey must be encouraged to develop ICT sub-sectors, for example, e-security and e-finance with fibre connectivity. We put the legislation in place in 2005. We put the Office in place in 2006. We must exploit to the full our intellectual property capability in Guernsey.

1305 We must proceed with the Guernsey Aircraft Registry. I know that some people have said there is danger in that because of risk of liability: that can be sorted out through the use of Guernsey's captive insurance industry.

The finance industry must continue to be nurtured. As the Oxford Economic Report says, it provides the Island's key economic strengths and underpins its affluent, skilled society. We must ensure that it is not overregulated and we must assist with the development of links with emerging economies, (*Four-minute bell rang*) particularly China.

1310 Tourism needs all the help that in can get in respect of marketing and brand awareness so as to encourage hotel development, film tourism, eco tourism and upmarket package breaks – possibly with Aurigny – and medical tourism.

1315 I have been asked about my attitude to marine energy. The technology is insufficiently developed but we do need to be ahead of the game and we need to encourage the big players, such as Rolls Royce and DCMS, to carry out research work in Guernsey.

Overall, we need to have a full economic development strategy. As to my qualities – I leave that to you to judge. I hope that I am able to listen, as well as to speak, and I hope that my training as a lawyer allows me to do just that.

1320 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Dorey.

**Deputy Dorey:** Mr Bailiff, it is a pleasure to propose Deputy Brouard for the post of Ministry of Commerce and Employment.

1325 Deputy Brouard is 55 and has always lived in Guernsey. After completing his A levels, he started work for Nat West Bank. He worked his way up from office junior to management. He qualified as an Associate of the Institute of Bankers and also holds a Chartered Insurance Institute Financial Planning Certificate. During his banking career, he undertook a variety of different management roles, from placing multi-million pound deals to branch management, from lending to responsibility for a managed bank. He has a detailed knowledge of finance and has gained broad experience of building successful relationships with clients from all around the world and locally.

1330 He has shown his entrepreneurial qualities by starting up, and running, a gardening business

for nine years which employed several staff while he was working for the bank.

1335 Deputy Brouard was first elected to the States in 2004. He was re-elected in 2008, topping the pole by a substantial majority and re-elected in 2012, polling second with a sizeable vote. After joining the States in 2004, he was elected onto the Public Services Department and Legislation Committee. In the last States he has been Deputy Minister for the Social Security Department, Chairman of the Public Sector Remuneration Committee from 2008-09 and a member of the Commerce and Employment Department since 2011.

1340 Deputy Brouard has been an excellent Deputy Minister at HSSD and I have full confidence in him to act as a Minister, if I was absent. I can only relate to my own experience and believe the following is ideal training to me as a Minister. Firstly, I served on the Department so I understood the current issues, the future plans and knew the staff. Secondly, I had served as Deputy Minister for four years, so I had a full understanding of the responsibilities of the role. Thirdly, I have been  
1345 a Deputy for a number of years so I have knowledge and understanding of all the processes of Government. Deputy Brouard has achieved all of the above, which will enable him to hit the ground running in a Department with a wide and important mandate.

Deputy Brouard, when faced with a problem, works to find a solution. For example, when he could not get education to help with pre-school for disadvantaged children, he worked with ex  
1350 colleagues to set up a charitable pre-school, originally set up with funds from ‘Help a Guernsey Child’ and now with corporate sponsorship. The pre-school only takes referrals from HSSD and it helps children and it helps children who have not had a great start in life.

It is important that a Minister is a good orator. Deputy Brouard has frequently spoken on a wide variety of subjects over the last eight years. His speeches are well presented and well  
1355 structured, which shows he has an organised mind. The position of Commerce and Employment Minister sometimes involves a certain amount of travel abroad with Guernsey Finance, as well as meeting representatives of the UK government. It is important that our political representatives in the international arena are able to portray Guernsey in the right way, so that Guernsey is perceived in the right light.

1360 Deputy Brouard is a very affable person who mixes freely; he has a good sense of humour, is hard working with common sense and is well respected. In dealing with international matters, he would use his people skills and thoroughness to ensure that he is fully briefed. His experience off-Island: he has attended a BIC meeting on poverty and a Commonwealth Parliamentary Conference in Malaysia.

1365 The role of senior Minister often involves meeting with various industry representatives, (*Four minute bell rang*) such as the Guernsey International Business Association (GIBA). At Social Security Deputy Brouard has always shown that he has an open mind, he is able to listen and take on board different views and analyse them and recommend a way forward. Deputy Brouard, as an existing Deputy, received an overwhelming endorsement in an election, where the public voted for  
1370 significant change. This is a testament to his hard work and dedication. He carries no fear or favour, only has a desire to succeed in his task and do what is best for Guernsey.

I conclude by asking Members to vote for Deputy Brouard to be the Commerce and Employment Minister.

1375 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

**Deputy Brouard:** Mr Bailiff, fellow Deputies, first of all, I would like to thank Deputy Dorey in proposing me. I really appreciated working with him in our team at Social Security. We do not  
1380 always agree but, by those discussions, we come to a better decision. My thanks to Deputy Gillson, a leading member of the finance industry when he entered the States. He recently served on Commerce and Employment, so it is particularly pleasing to have his endorsement to my nomination.

I am just one of *us* – 45 plus two. We joined last week when we were sworn in but, as  
1385 mentioned in the induction programme, we are joining a moving train. At the April election some boarded, some disembarked, not all voluntarily. The States has a direction of travel in the States Strategic Plan – it is not perfect but it is a living document and will be changed to reflect our consensus, that of the States of 2012.

Commerce and Employment is no exception. We already have a good idea of our direction of  
1390 travel. We have a comprehensive and demanding business plan and work streams already identified. Although I have my own ideas as to where Commerce and Employment should be heading, I see the role of Minister to help the new board understand where we are *already* going and, crucially, to see if the destination is still appropriate to the new board – that is my first job.

My second job, once we are decided on our direction of travel, is to use my experience to bring

1395 the team together and focus on how to get there. Then it is full steam ahead, which brings me to  
 my third job, which is to facilitate the team on that journey, choosing and achieving our goals  
 along the way. It is quite a different dynamic to a corporate structure. It is not about *my* vision, it is  
 about *our* vision. What I would want to do, if successful, is harness the ideas from old and new  
 1400 Members and especially the new board, mindful that we are on a moving train with various  
 workstreams at different positions, some on track, some leading a shunt and a finite level of  
 resources my three jobs will blur into one.

I just want to touch on some important issues. I feel we should be working closer with the UK,  
 undertaking sustainable business; the UK is our major trading partner in an 800 year relationship.  
 The driver in our economy is the finance industry. Diverse as it is, we need to continue to  
 1405 encourage industry to broaden its footprint and to look further afield to the emerging markets.  
 Communication is key on three levels: We have to get our message out there that we are open,  
 well regulated and a stable jurisdiction. Secondly, in respect of data and digital communication,  
 where we do have first class connectivity, we need to ensure it is used to its potential both as a  
 business and as an enabler. Thirdly, we need first class communication between ourselves and our  
 1410 Departments and our agents and the very centre industry, who are the ones who can make our  
 vision a reality. I want to be part of that communication.

Commerce and Employment does listen and react: in the last few months alone, introduction of  
 foundations, progression of a world's first with image rights and the setting up of an aircraft  
 registry. Our train is running.

I am also aware of the broader economy – fishing, agriculture and horticulture, visitor  
 1415 economy, retail, but one area where I would like the new board to assist is 'Fred in the shed'. I  
 would like to see if we can work with Treasury, who hold the States land bank, and Environment,  
 who hold the permissions, to see if we can be more inventive. We need to broaden local businesses  
 where we can with a shortage of land and western labour costs, we need clean, local industries  
 1420 who will add significant value which in turn provide well paid jobs and fuel the shops and trades  
 we rely on.

Tidal resources need to be used to best advantage, again working with our neighbours.  
 Commerce and Employment is heavily involved in employment, besides commerce, promoting  
 good employment practice, industrial relations, health and safety at work. We are at the forefront  
 1425 of the skills strategy. We need to be making better use of our own indigenous resources. We all, in  
 this House, have a significant role to ensure our youngsters fulfil their potential in the labour  
 market.

In five minutes I can only give you a flavour, but much of what I have said can be related to  
 working as part of the Policy Council team. I have the experience, I know the brief, I have those  
 1430 all important (*Four-minute bell rang*) communication skills and, finally, on the train analogy, I  
 have that proven track record.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Le Tocq will speak in favour of Deputy Stewart.

1435 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Sir, I for one, know what it is to be misrepresented and perhaps misjudged  
 by others due to a one-sided perspective.

I rise to propose a candidate for this post whose ability and dedication have risen meteorically  
 in my estimation over the last few months. I have been shocked and shamed at how I  
 1440 underestimated Deputy Kevin Stewart, in fact in all areas: breadth of experience, knowledge of  
 subjects, interests spanning over a wide cross section of areas, dedication to hard work, interaction  
 with a multiplicity of people from all walks of life, ability to network corporately, as well as  
 personally and, moreover, an existing network of strategic business contacts which have already  
 proven invaluable in helping us think outside the box.

In all these areas, at the very least we have witnessed, over the past few months, Deputy  
 1445 Stewart step out of the box some of us had placed him in and hit the ground running. In fact, in the  
 last couple of weeks, whilst some of us have focused on rule changes, personality issues and  
 media hype, Deputy Stewart chose to invest most of his time in doing what any decent Deputy in  
 the States of Guernsey *should* be doing, working for the good of Guernsey. He was meeting  
 1450 people, investigating business options, interrogating decisions being made, getting key leaders to  
 talk to each other, bringing out into the open issues which had seemingly be made in the dark and  
 generally creating a 'can do' atmosphere around the place. I admire that greatly.

Deputy Stewart's CV impressively demonstrates that he can do this job effectively with  
 empathy, determination, personal knowledge of risk and opportunity and, what is more, the ability  
 to communicate and relate to real people – employer and employee, facing what are currently huge

1455 economic challenges. For example, he assisted in the family business, developing new and  
 emerging markets in Asia, the Middle East and South America. The company, Tenza Ltd, was  
 subsequently awarded the Queen's Award for Export Achievement. In the 1980s he founded a  
 1460 manufacturing business which became the largest producer of computer mailing labels in Europe  
 within six years. He served on the Suffolk Consultative Council under the chairmanship of John  
 Gummer MP. He met regularly at the House of Commons, advising Government on the business  
 environment in East Anglia.

He was Managing Director of a large division of Associated Paper Industries plc, responsible  
 for approximately 400 employees and, of course, he founded Island FM, which was immediately  
 1465 profitable – one of the first stations with a digital play-out system, website and e-mail in the  
 British Isles. The business model and innovative working practices were copied by most stations  
 in the UK thereafter. He teamed up with Sir Ray Tindle in 1998 to build on the success of Island  
 FM and developed a group of 15 local commercial radio stations through acquisitions and  
 successful licence applications through the regulator, OFCOM.

1470 It seems to me, sir, that apart from the above widespread and exemplary professional  
 experience of Deputy Stewart, that the abilities of our effective spokesman, communicator and  
 networker are intrinsic to the role of Minister for Commerce and Employment. Deputy Stewart has  
 all of these in abundance, and much more. And so I exhort Members not to pigeonhole this already  
 diligent Deputy but to allow him the space to do what he does best, as Minister for Commerce and  
 Employment.

1475 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Stewart

1480 **Deputy Stewart:** Bailiff, fellow States Members, first of all, thank you to my proposer,  
 Deputy Le Tocq, and my seconder, Deputy St Pier.

Commerce and Employment needs to be the key driver of sustainable growth, a dynamic and  
 enterprising culture with a can-do mentality. We need leadership that will inspire entrepreneurial  
 thinking and enterprise, and take full advantage of the benefits of being a relatively small  
 1485 jurisdiction. Growth forecasts have been pared down to 1.9% which, in itself, is a challenge.

The key to growth will be developing new sectors, in particular ICT, but also encourage new  
 start ups generally. Regulation gives us significant challenges. In finance, we need to be in with  
 the pack – there is no need to be ahead of everyone else in regulation. I worked in a regulated  
 industry for 30 years, and experienced over-regulation and petty policing. Regulation is a fine  
 1490 balancing act, fit for purpose, but not so onerous that the cost of compliance in human and  
 financial resources reduces the ability to compete.

We must nurture our existing industries and ensure that we act as a facilitator and catalyst to  
 their future prosperity. OUR needs review. Millions has been spent by the Post Office and  
 Guernsey Electricity on regulation. With Telco's, though, it seems the regulation is ineffective.  
 Business broadband costs are sky high, compared to those in the UK. And on my first day as  
 1495 Deputy I responded to the consultation on 4G and the letter from Commerce and Employment that  
 accompanied it, where it states:

‘The purpose of this project is not to raise revenue.’

1500 Well, the managerising of Telco licensing is standard practice worldwide; revenues on today's  
 comparisons with similar jurisdictions could be in the region of £5 to 8 million a year. And old  
 chestnuts – ‘Fred in the shed’ – need to be resolved. At the moment the thinking is backwards: for  
 ‘Fred in the shed’ we should start from the premise that you *can* work from your shed, rather than  
 you cannot.

1505 Tourism is encouraging, the investment of individuals and corporations shows the high level of  
 confidence, but we could do more to improve the customer experience for cruise passengers on a  
 day trip, and present Guernsey as a living brochure. The dairy industry is somewhere where our  
 heart rules our head. However, C& E Has to be aware of the social and environmental impacts of  
 its decisions and, of course, the will of the people. The dairy industry is quintessentially Guernsey,  
 1510 and the Guernsey breed iconic. So let's develop the right conditions for start ups, premises, co-  
 ordination of angels, the involvement of grey hair as mentors and advisers, incentives such as  
 social insurance holidays, peppercorn rents on States owned properties... They should all be  
 considered.

1515 And, as highlighted by the Office of the Economic Report, we should grow our ICT sector, its  
 light footprint with high earnings per employee, *perfect* for Guernsey. The numbers in ICT are

mind boggling, the app market is difficult to quantify but some put the figure at US\$25 billion, by 2015. The UK spend alone on internet advertising is now £5 billion a year. And Tech City, the Silicon Roundabout in London, has grown from 30 companies in 2008 to over 700 today. We need to be a Silicon Island.

1520 I want to develop and incubate a start up community, a beacon of development to bring focus to our existing ICT and give guidance and support for new enterprises. I have written an ICT discussion document with proposals on short, medium and long term strategies, and I believe this should be taken forward by a new inter-departmental digital committee. Sustainable growth in our economy *can* be lead by C& E but needs buy in from all Departments. The role of Minister will be  
1525 *critical* in selling this strategy: the silo mentality needs to be put way behind us.

Deputy Perrot mocked our titles in the last States meeting, calling them ‘Ruritanian’, but titles *are* important. (*Four-minute bell rang*) As someone who was part of a small team that sold world-wide and received the Queen’s Award for Export Achievement, I have firsthand knowledge. Your title determines who you see, and is highly regarded, particularly in the Far East. And before you  
1530 panic, sir, I am quite happy with the title of Minister, although Divine Ruler of Commerce and Emperor of Employment does have a nice ring to it!

This is not the time to pull up the drawbridge and drop the portcullis. It is not the time for confrontation with *any* jurisdiction. This is the time for building bridges, both economic and culturally. It is the time for negotiation, it is the time to protect our existing industry, and it is the  
1535 time to develop new and *exciting* industries for the 21st Century. This is Guernsey’s time and it is my time to serve the Island, with my best endeavours, as Minister for Commerce and Employment.

Thank you, sir.

1540 **The Bailiff:** Well, Members of the States, we come to the vote on the election of a Minister for Commerce and Employment Department.

I remind you there are three candidates, Deputy Perrot, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Sillars; Deputy Brouard, proposed by Deputy Dorey, seconded by Deputy  
1545 Gillson; and Deputy Stewart proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy St Pier.

*A first ballot took place.*

**The Bailiff:** Members, the votes will be taken away and counted and we will rise.

1550 *There was a six-minute recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** The result of the vote for the election of a Minister for the Commerce and Employment Department is as follows: Deputy Stewart 18 votes, Deputy Perrot 17 votes, and  
1555 Deputy Brouard 12 votes.

So nobody has secured an overall majority. The candidate placed with the fewest votes – that is Deputy Brouard – is eliminated and there needs to be a second round of voting, in which there are two candidates, Deputy Stewart and Deputy Perrot. –

*A second ballot took place.*

1560 **The Bailiff:** Are there any more votes?

No, so the votes will be taken away to be counted. To save time, I am going to remain in the Chamber this time but people can leave if they wish to do so.

1565 *There was a further recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** Members, will you take your seats, please.

I now have the result of the second ballot for the election of a Minister for Commerce and Employment Department. Deputy Stewart had 28 votes and Deputy Perrot 19 votes.  
1570 I declare Deputy Stewart elected.

*Deputy Stewart was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

1575

HOME DEPARTMENT

**Election of Minister  
Deputy Le Tocq elected**

1580

*Article VII.*

*The States are asked:*

1585 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Home Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article VII, Election of a Minister of the Home Department.

1590

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister Harwood:** Sir, Members of the States, I have pleasure in proposing for election as Minister of the Home Department Deputy Jonathan Le Tocq.

1595

**The Bailiff:** Do we have a seconder?

**Deputy St Pier:** I second, sir.

1600

**The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier, thank you.

Do we have any other nominations? No?

In that case, we go straight to the vote on the proposition to elect as Minister of the Home Department Deputy Le Tocq, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy St Pier.

Those in favour: those against.

1605

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Le Tocq elected as the Minister of the Home Department.

*Deputy Le Tocq was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

1610

**EDUCATION DEPARTMENT**

**Election of Minister  
Deputy Sillars elected**

1615

*Article IV.*

*The States are asked:*

1620 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Education Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article IV, election of a Minister of the Home Department.

1625

**The Bailiff:** No. *(Laughter)*

**The Bailiff:** Article IV is correct.

1630

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article IV, election of the Minister of the *Education* Department.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

1635

**Chief Minister Harwood:** I propose Deputy Sillars for election as Minister of the Education Department.

**The Bailiff:** And do we have a seconder? Yes, Deputy Luxon.

Do we have any other nominations for Minister of the Education Department?

1640 No? In that case, we go straight to the vote on the election of a Minister for the Education Department. There is one candidate proposed, Deputy Sillars, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Luxon.

Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

1645 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Sillars elected.

*Deputy Sillars was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

1650

## PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT

### Election of Minister Deputy Luxon elected

1655

*Article IX.*

*The States are asked:*

1660 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Public Services Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article IX, election of the Minister of the Public Services Department.

1665 **The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** I propose Deputy Luxon for election for the Minister of the Public Services Department.

1670 **The Bailiff:** And do we have a seconder? Yes, Deputy Adam. Thank you.  
Do we have any other nominations?

**Deputy Le Lièvre:** I would like to nominate Deputy Kuttelwascher for Minister of Public Services.

1675 **The Bailiff:** Thank you. That is Deputy Kuttelwascher, proposed by Deputy Le Lièvre – and do we have a seconder?

**Deputy Le Clerc:** I second that nomination

1680 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc, thank you.

Do we have any other nominations?

No? Well, then, we have two candidates: Deputy Luxon proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Adam, and Deputy Kuttelwascher, proposed by Deputy Le Lièvre, seconded by Deputy Le Clerc.

1685 Chief Minister

**The Chief Minister:** Sir, it is with great pleasure that I nominate Deputy Paul Luxon for the position of Minister for Public Services.

1690 Deputy Luxon is, like me, a newcomer to the States. He may justly be regarded as part of that breadth of new experience, and hence of change, people of Guernsey voted for on April 18th. He has, however, experienced a number of links with Governments of the Island through his roles, firstly with the Chamber of Commerce, of which he was President between 2007 and 2010, through the local branch of the Institute of Directors – and I would ask that it should be note that he qualified as a Chartered Director in 2006, no mean feat – and through the Guernsey Sports Commission.

1695 Although Deputy Luxon may lack direct principle experience, he does, however, offer considerable experience in the world outside of politics that I believe to be highly relevant to the



1700 post of Minister of the Public Services Department. Deputy Luxon was educated and brought up in  
 Guernsey from an early age and, like many of us, sought a career outside of the Island before  
 returning to Guernsey in 1987. Since his return to Guernsey, Deputy Luxon has been extensively  
 involved in the management of local trading entities operating in a number of different  
 commercial spheres. Between 1994 and 2007 he was employed by the La Roche Group, to manage  
 a number of that group's trading subsidiaries, including G Orange and Co, and as Managing  
 1705 Director of La Roche Wholesale Division, CI Bakery, Warry's and LR Trading, which itself spans  
 a number of different operations.

Luckily, as part of the Sandpiper Group, he has acted as Managing Director of Semandis and  
 operating board member of Sandpiper CI. He has enjoyed – if that, indeed, is the correct term – the  
 process of managing significant changes in the structures and organisations with which he has  
 been associated, many of which have a pan-Channel Islands presence. In nominating Deputy  
 1710 Luxon for post of Minister for Public Services, I recognise, in particular, that part of the mandate  
 of that Department that requires the supervision of the management of what are, in effect, a  
 number of operating or trading entities, in particular the airports, the harbours, the waste and  
 drainage infrastructure and the public water supply.

1715 Deputy Luxon is one of the few members of the current States that can bring that particular and  
 important hands-on experience. The mandate for the Public Services Department, indeed, reads  
 not unlike the description of a holding company of a conglomerate structure with which Deputy  
 Luxon has been very familiar.

Whilst clearly Deputy Luxon's commercial background would, in my opinion, make him an  
 ideal candidate for *this* role, he also brings other attributes that I believe will further enhance his  
 1720 nomination. His experience of pan-Channel Islands operations will, I believe, be enormously  
 important as we move towards the next phase of developing the Island's waste strategy. His  
 negotiating skills will, I believe, also make a very important contribution to the ministerial role. I  
 can think of no-one better suited to this particular job, both at a departmental level but also,  
*equally importantly*, as a Member of the Policy Council Team.

1725 Sir, I invite all Members to wholeheartedly support this nomination.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
 Deputy Luxon.

1730 **Deputy Luxon:** Sir, I am honoured that Chief Minister Peter Harwood has nominated me for  
 the Public Services Department Minister position.

I was happy, last Thursday, to accept his request to offer my services in this role and would be  
 equally honoured if you, my fellow Deputies, are inclined to support my nomination today. I learnt  
 1735 a tremendous amount in the five weeks of the recent elections and, in fact, learnt more about  
 Guernsey, the people of Guernsey, and their expectations, than I could ever have imagined.  
 Understanding how this Government's actions impact on everyday lives of our Island residents  
 made me realise how vital the services we provide are to the people we represent.

My learning curve will continue, but I can assure you that I learn quickly. I have a voracious  
 1740 appetite for new challenges and hard work and a reputation, throughout my business career, as  
 being somebody who can, and does, deliver. We all know that the four years ahead are going to be  
 challenging and, some would say, critically challenging. I wish to offer my skills and expertise in  
 serving this States of Deliberation and, consequently, the people of Guernsey by leading PSD in  
 support of this Assembly's expectations.

My first task, if elected, will be to nominate four fellow Deputies to the Department's board,  
 1745 consisting of both experienced Deputies, coupled with appropriate newly elected Members, whose  
 combined skills and competencies will complement each other. We need to ensure the board is  
 able to professionally discharge its responsibilities, providing strategic planning, policy formation  
 and leadership, whilst also directing the executive officers and ensuring accountability throughout  
 the Department will be vital. As a Chartered Director, I believe I have the skill set to lead this  
 1750 process.

PSD is, in reality, a cluster of quasi-business units managing key Island infrastructure  
 activities, covering areas such as airports, harbours, States works, Guernsey Water, plus waste  
 disposal, with over £1 billion of strategic assets. The board should, and will, create an environment  
 1755 of enablement for the executive team to optimise the efficient and effective management of these  
 activities, with value for money and excellent customer service levels being paramount.

Sir, my recent background as the Managing Director of a pan-Island, multi-business, operating  
 in the distribution, logistics and service provision sector, with over 500 staff members, provides  
 me with the experience both at operational and board level and it prepares me well for the complex

1760 commercial negotiations that lie ahead in several areas of the Department's activities.  
 I believe in a team ethic which generates superior outcomes in an organisation, whilst also enabling and motivating the executive team to outperform against their objectives. PSD has significant issues ahead, not least its requirement for a reduced budget in line with the FTP target of a £30 million reduction across the entire public sector expenditure spend. This will be challenging, but can and will be achieved by the board. Additionally, the Department has to successfully deliver the current major airport project, implement the critically important waste strategy, and must also progress the in-depth work stream of developing proposals for the airport and harbour water commercialisation, for this Assembly to consider. There is much to do.

1765  
 1770 Having recently served as the President of the Guernsey Chamber of Commerce, I gained an insightful perspective into the breadth of business and economic activities within our Island. And, as a strategist, I believe that I can contribute positively to Policy Council deliberations and I will commit to doing this with vigour on your behalf.

I want our system of government to be more effective and accountable and I will ensure, with the help of the other board Members, that PSD, too, will become more effective, efficient and accountable under the strategic policy framework, as directed by this Assembly.

1775 To misquote Deputy Le Tocq's excellent manifesto phrase, 'public service, not self service', for me I would say 'Public Services Department, not self service.'

If elected, I will ensure that PSD, the board and myself will always remember that we are here to serve in the best interests of Guernsey's long term future (*Four-minute bell rang*) and act accordingly, with an open collegiate approach to inter-departmental initiatives. We *must* work cleverly across the entire States of Guernsey organisation to best use our resources.

1780 Sir, I appreciate the confidence the Chief Minister has shown in choosing me as the PSD Minister nominee and I hope that you, too, my fellow Deputies, will also feel able to trust me, on your behalf, to lead the Public Services Department for the next four-year term.

1785 Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Next to speak is Deputy Le Lièvre, in support of Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1790 **Deputy Le Lièvre:** Mr Bailiff, Members of the Assembly, when Deputy Kuttelwascher approached me and asked me to propose him for Minister of the Public Services Department, I thought just my luck to be asked by someone whose very name represents a hurdle before I even got started on my nomination! (*Laughter*)

1795 Of course, it is not just his *name* that sets Deputy Kuttelwascher apart, it is also his unique way he presents in this Assembly. Those of you new to the Assembly will quickly come to recognise that Deputy K is from a mould of his very own. As one might expect from a man who has flown jumbo jets for a living, both in a commercial environment and in a training role, his confidence portrays itself in a very relaxed style of delivery. He is not easily phased by something unexpected coming out of the blue which, given his previous career, is probably just as well.

1800 From time to time, I have winced – or should I say admired – the casual but polite way he has gently conceded or, more commonly, not heeded the friendly advice offered by your predecessor, sir. And he has got away with it, not because he is full of flannel but because he combines stubbornness with a smile and a total and genuine lack of malice. Deputy K is an honest and open man, full of integrity. You get what you see. He is bold, but not arrogant, forceful but not a bully, argumentative but not disagreeable. He might best be described as reliably persistent.

1805 He is not a cautious man, neither is he incautious which, I might add, is a great deal more than can be said for his uncle. I refer to Karel Miloslav Kuttelwascher, known as 'Kut' or 'Old Kut', because his RAF chums found his name unpronounceable – and 'Kut' was, and always will be, Britain's most celebrated night fighter ace. He earned that auspicious title by hanging around continental airfields, not in an unsavoury manner, you understand, but in the air and in the dark, by himself, at low altitude and at low speed, waiting for enemy planes to land or take off, whereupon he shot them down. Not very British but very effective! (*Laughter*)

1810 And the reason I mention that is that 'Kut' Kuttelwascher is described, amongst other things, as essentially a complicated but modest man, with a trace of contradiction who could manage cool blood in the air with a trace of irritability on the ground. He is described as a uncompromising man, quite given to his job. Various reports go on to describe him as an absolute professional who loved nothing more than being in the air. He was not without fault, however, as his life excluded drinking, smoking, gambling and even partying – but only on those nights before an operational flight! (*Laughter*)

1815 I see many of these laudable qualities in Deputy Kuttelwascher – uncompromising, the absolute professional, a modest, cool man with a trace of irritability. I think it must be the Czech

1820 influence. Like his Uncle, Deputy Kuttelwascher's previous career will have taught him what is  
 achievable and what is well outside the accepted bounds of performance. He understands the limits  
 of where he can go, what he can do and, more importantly, perhaps, what is best avoided. He  
 would be willing to push the envelope but would desist from doing so long before the point of no  
 1825 return. His knowledge of matters aeronautical, of course, make him ideal material when dealing  
 with matters associated with La Villiaze but it is in his professional ability, gained from years of  
 experience in the air industry, to weigh up technical issues with a cool, analytical brain, that makes  
 him ideal for the post of Minister across all the different aspects of the Public Services  
 Department. You cannot phase him with figures, he is not perplexed by plans and he is certainly  
 not baffled by complex project issues. He *is* his own man. (*Four minute bell rang*)

1830 Deputy Kuttelwascher has already demonstrated his single-mindedness in relation to both the  
 recent airport debate and that in respect of mass incineration and most effectively at that! I would  
 say to you that, because of his technical background, and because of his long and successful  
 service in a highly stressed career, in conjunction with his personal qualities, Deputy  
 1835 Kuttelwascher will make an ideal Minister for the Public Services Department. In addition, he will  
 be a lively and unique addition to the Policy Council, that needs free-thinking individuals who  
 have a slightly different perspective on the world. He is respectful of the views of others but,  
 because of the qualities I have already identified, he will not agree to disagree. He will argue his  
 corner until he admits defeat or is persuaded to do otherwise. As I said of Deputy Sillars, when I  
 1840 proposed him for the position of Minister of Education, Deputy Kuttelwascher is likely to ensure  
 that disagreements remain private but, equally, is likely to speak in a forthright and, if necessary,  
 challenging manner around the Policy Council table.

Thank you, sir.

1845 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Thank you, sir.

I thank Deputy Le Lièvre and Deputy Le Clerc for their support.

1850 I have no doubt that the message delivered by the Election results was one of change for the  
 better. In 2008 I came sixth in St Peter Port South, with 45% of the vote. 2012 saw an  
 improvement to second place, with 54% of the vote. I interpret that result as a personal mandate to  
 help deliver beneficial change.

1855 The most effective way for *me* to deliver on that objective would be as Minister of the Public  
 Service Department. My energies have very much been focused on the work of the Public Service  
 Department, both from within and without. My involvement with the airport and waste projects  
 was as the result of successful political intervention.

1860 Since my unopposed election to the Public Service Department board in February, 2011, I have  
 participated in *all* of its business. I see one further potential saving in the current airport scheme,  
 which also would be of operational benefit. My attempt to progress this saving last Autumn was  
 unsuccessful, as I had no political support on the airport project board. Trying to lead from the rear  
 is far more difficult than from the front. It is like trying to fly a plane from the back seat. I would  
 make every effort to progress that initiative, leading from the front.

1865 I am very keen to see the waste strategy workstream implemented with urgency. Some of the  
 savings demanded by the financial transformation programme could be delivered by forming  
 trading companies for the airport, harbours and Guernsey Water. Following approval by the last  
 Assembly, acceptable commercialisation models are currently being developed.

Commercialisation does not equate to privatisation. The objectives are to minimise, or  
 eliminate, *any* reliance on the public purse, increase efficiency and deliver an outstanding service.  
 This workstream has my enthusiastic support.

1870 My fifteen years as a training captain focused in part on leadership training and development. I  
 used to conduct such leadership courses regularly. As an examiner, I would assess leadership  
 qualities in all aircrew.

Former Deputy Sean McManus asked me for a submission on leadership to help him inform a  
 paper he was preparing on the subject. I wrote the following:

1875 'Leadership is a multi-tasking process by which a person influences others to accomplish an objective and directs the  
 organisation in a way that makes it more cohesive and coherent. You need to instill enthusiasm, energy and passion.  
 You must be a good communicator and, therefore, a good listener. You must have analytical and evaluation skills. You  
 must be able to identify priorities. In depth knowledge is essential. Above all, you must be willing to *take*  
 1880 responsibility and *accept* responsibility for the consequences of your actions.'

In summary, I believe that I am the most suitable candidate for the post of PSD Minister, as I

1885 have the most relevant educational and professional qualifications, I am well versed with all current PSD business and I have successfully exercised a leadership role over a long period of time. My political skills are well honed, I am not encumbered by any other employment or business commitments. My skin is very thick and, if I were of the Hindu faith, I suspect that I might expect (*Four minute bell rings*) to be reincarnated as a leather-backed turtle. (*Laughter*) They are big and tough, believe me! I have seen one.

1890 Hopefully, my words and those of Deputy Le Lièvre have given a majority of Members the confidence to elect me as Minister for the Public Service Department.

I have finished the speech, but I would just like to comment on Deputy Le Lièvre's speech: I had no idea what he was going to say. How dangerous is that! (*Laughter*)

Thank you, sir.

1895 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, we come, then, to the vote on the election of a Minister for the Public Services Department.

I remind you there are two candidates: Deputy Luxon, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy Adam; and Deputy Kuttelwascher, proposed by Deputy Le Lièvre and seconded by Deputy Le Clerc.

1900 *A ballot took place and there was a short recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** Take your seats, please.

1905 Members of the States, I have the result of the vote for the Election of a Minister for the Public Services Department.

Deputy Luxon had 31 votes and Deputy Kuttelwascher 16 votes.

I declare Deputy Luxon elected.

*Deputy Luxon was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

1910

## HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

1915 **Election of Minister  
Deputy Adam elected**

*Article VI.*

*The States are asked:*

1920 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Health and Social Services Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

1925 **The Deputy Greffier:** Article VI. Election of Minister of Health and Social Services Department.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

1930 **Chief Minister:** I have great pleasure in nominating, for the post of Minister for Health and Social Services Department, Deputy Hunter Adam.

**Deputy Domaille:** I am pleased to second that nomination, sir.

1935 **The Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Domaille.  
Do we have any other nominations? - yes, Deputy Ogier?

**Deputy Ogier:** I would like to propose Deputy Brehaut.

1940 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut, proposed by Deputy Ogier and – (*Interjection*)  
Perhaps you are pleased, maybe he is not pleased to be nominated! (*Laughter*)

**Deputy Brehaut:** I will give most things a go at short notice, (*Laughter*) but, please- (*Interjections*).

It is the Environment Department, it is not this... (*Laughter*)

1945

**The Bailiff:** Members, Members.

Do we have any other nominations to be Minister of the Health and Social Services Department?

1950

**Deputy Brehaut:** Not me, sir. (*Laughter*)

**The Bailiff:** In that case, we have one candidate – Deputy Adam proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Domaille.

Those in favour; those against.

1955

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Adam elected as Minister for Health and Social Services.

1960

*Deputy Adam was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

### ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

1965

#### Election of Minister Nominations made

*Article V.*

*The States are asked:-*

1970

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Environment Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

1975

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article 5. Election of the Minister of the Environment Department.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

1980

**The Chief Minister:** I have pleasure in nominating Deputy Roger Domaille for the post of Minister of the Environment Department.

**The Bailiff:** Is there a seconder?

**The Chief Minister:** I believe Deputy Jones was going to second.

1985

**Deputy David Jones:** Oh, sorry, sir. (*Laughter*)  
I am happy to second that nomination.

1990

**The Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Jones. Do we have any other nominations (*Laughter*) for Minister of the Environment Department?  
Deputy Ogier.

1995

**Deputy Ogier:** Sorry about before, sir.  
Domaille was my trigger word and that was that. I heard you say Domaille and I was up.  
I would like to propose Deputy Barry Brehaut for the post of the Environment Minister.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy Brehaut proposed by Deputy Ogier and seconded by – Deputy Sherbourne thank you.  
Do we have any other nominations? Deputy Gollop.

2000

**Deputy Gollop:** Yes, sir, I would like to propose Deputy David De Lisle for the position.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle, proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by?

2005 **Deputy Stewart:** Deputy Stewart.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Stewart.

Thank you, Deputy Stewart.

2010 Well, Members of the States, it is now 12.23 p.m. I imagine to go through speeches in respect of three candidates is going to take us half an hour or so. We could continue but what I will put to you is that we adjourn now and resume at 2.30 p.m.

The proposition is to adjourn now. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

2015 **The Bailiff:** In that case, we will rise and return at 2.30 p.m.

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.24 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.*

2020

## ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

2025

### Election of Minister Deputy Domaille elected

*Article V.*

*The States are asked:*

2030 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Environment Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

2035 **The Deputy Greffier:** Article V: election of Minister of the Environment Department.

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, may I remind you that just before lunch we had three candidates proposed.

2040 There was Deputy Domaille, proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Jones – Deputy Dave Jones that is. Deputy Brehaut proposed by Deputy Ogier and seconded by Deputy Sherbourne and Deputy De Lisle proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Stewart. Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** Sir, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Roger Domaille for the position of Minister for the Environment Department.

2045 Deputy Domaille is no stranger to the States of Guernsey, having served as a Deputy since 2008 but, before that, having worked for the States for approximately 35 years. His combined experience, both as a Deputy and as a former employee, spans a period that is probably far longer than most, if not all, sitting Deputies.

2050 In the last term, Deputy Domaille served as a Member of the Treasury and Resources Department. He has also served on the Public Sector Remuneration Committee and as a Member of a number of different project boards, including projects for the Education Department, Public Services Department, Health and Social Services Department and the Commerce and Employment Department.

2055 Deputy Domaille was born and educated in Guernsey and attained a degree in Construction Economics and subsequently became an Associate Member of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors. During the period of his employment with the States, he acted as Chief Property Manager for the former Board of Administration, as Strategic Property Adviser for the former Advisory Planning Committee and, finally, as Chief Scrutiny Officer to the first Scrutiny Committee in the post 2004 era. In my submission, Deputy Domaille's background as a chartered surveyor and the experience that he gained from his involvement with property management and strategic property advisory role, ideally equip him for the role of Minister of the Environment Department, particularly in the discharge of its land use, planning and building control functions.

2060 As a Deputy for St Peter Port, Deputy Domaille is well aware of the vehicle and pollution issues that are faced by all those who live or work within the urban areas of this Island. As a keen

2065 cyclist himself, he will be conscious of the need to deliver an integrated transport policy within the  
mandate of the Environment Department. His experience as Chief Scrutiny Officer, in the early  
days of the establishment of that function for the States, exposed Deputy Domaille to many  
different facets of Government, and he was involved in carrying out a number of scrutiny reviews  
and investigations covering topics as diverse as milk retailers, complaints and appeals procedures,  
2070 the States' Business Plan and provisions for people with disabilities.

In my submission, this wide experience, especially of working with different Departments of  
the States, will also, I believe, enable him to make an important contribution as a Member of the  
Policy Council in the discharge of its mandate.

2075 Sir, through you, I urge all Members to fully support this nomination.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Domaille.

**Deputy Domaille:** Thank you, sir.

2080 I am grateful to the Chief Minister for proposing me for this important position, and for  
outlining my wide range of experience of working for the States.

I realise new Members may not know much about me, but I have spent almost 40 years  
working for the people of Guernsey in one role or another, and I understand how the States work.  
Importantly, with my extensive and unique property and project management experience across a  
wide range of property-related issues, I have seen, at first hand, the consequences of the States  
2085 approach to planning, traffic, environment and heritage issues, and the benefits and conflicts that  
can arise.

If I am successful, my overall approach will be one of balance and common sense. I will adopt  
an integrated pro-active approach to the work of the Department, be it in planning services, traffic  
and transport services, environmental protection or environmental services. In all cases, I would  
2090 wish to see a practical approach and one that benefits all of Guernsey.

I am a team player and will ensure the work of the Department complements the States  
Strategic Plan. As part of my corporate approach, I will make staff advice available to *all* States  
Members who wish to put forward amendments or Requêtees that aid them in formulating workable  
proposals. I will develop the open planning process further, for example, perhaps allowing  
2095 questions to be asked by the general public in open planning meetings. I will also build on work  
with outside groups and interests. At present groups including Saumarez Park, the Botanical Trust  
and the National Council of Plants and Gardens, all work with the Department, and their input is  
invaluable.

I will look to build on existing relationships and encourage other external groups to bring their  
2100 expertise to the party. By way of example, the Department is responsible for managing 28 parks  
and gardens. Why not have a council of stakeholders that would oversee the management of some,  
or all, of the areas, for instance Saumarez Park.

With regard to improving efficiency, I will encourage the active involvement of the  
2105 Department in the work of the Financial Transformation Team. There *is* scope within Department  
operations, not only to reduce costs and increase efficiency, but importantly to improve services  
offered to the public. While the day job of the Department must be paramount, I will prioritise four  
important strategy areas. The first must be the formulation of an integrated transport strategy. I  
intend to submit firm proposals to this Assembly as soon as is practicable and, in any event, within  
2110 12 months. I would hope to submit proposals much earlier, but I do not underestimate the amount  
of work involved and the complexity of the various issues. It is important that we do not have  
another false dawn or further delay and indecision.

My second priority will be the development of more pro-active detailed development plans, in  
accordance with the revised strategic Land Use Plan. Early work has begun on these plans and I  
would encourage the involvement of all States Members in the formulation of these important  
2115 plans. An early workstream will be to arrange a Members' induction programme, to encourage  
and facilitate the participation of *all* States Members in the development of the plans. In the  
interim, I would bring forward an extended exemptions Ordinance to the States to introduce a little  
more flexibility in the current planning process.

My third priority would be the development of a coastal defence strategy. This is an important  
2120 issue but has taken a back stage position while other important work has been developed. Given  
the impacts of climate change and the importance of proper coastal defence, there is no doubt  
significant resources will be required in the future, and a proper strategy is a prerequisite to ensure  
that we take appropriate, planned measures.

If coastal defence has taken back stage, my fourth priority has not even made it to the stage  
2125 door. At present we do not have a bio-diversity strategy. Our approach has been bottom up, (*Four-*

*minute bell rang*) whereby we protect and encourage bio-diversity on States-owned land but have no over-arching strategy to cover the whole Island. For instance, we have only limited powers to deal with invasive species, whether on land or in the water. I will submit an overall bio-diversity strategy to this Assembly as soon as is practical.

2130 While these priority areas are separate workstreams, they are all interlinked, and the meshing of the individual elements of, say, the bio-diversity strategy with the draft development plans is important.

2135 Finally, if elected, I would be fully committed to the task and I would adopt an open and inclusive approach. What you will not get from me is long speeches and, on that note, I will sit down. *(Laughter)*

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Ogier, who proposed Deputy Brehaut.

2140 **Deputy Ogier:** Thank you, sir.

Deputy Brehaut is a married family man with two children. He has been a St Peter Port Douzenier, a chair of Youth Concern, a board member of Guernsey Family Planning and is currently a director of the Guernsey Bereavement Service.

2145 Deputy Brehaut was first involved in Government in the year 2000, by serving as a non-States Member on Cadastre and Housing for four years, so he already had grounding when he entered the States of Deliberation as a Deputy in 2004. Joining Housing and Health, he was involved in the introduction of the very successful housing associations, along with the adopting of rent control, the corporate housing programme, as well as applying our now famous Housing Control Law, serving his apprenticeship, if you can call it that, in the crucible of fire which is a Deputy Jones' Board Meeting.

2150 On Health he was involved in the planning and completion of the clinical block, and the Policy Council of the time very nearly managed to bring Health's cheapest tenderer to the table. He was involved in a number of other high profile projects, such as the new facility at the Mignot Hospital in Alderney, the new MRI scanner, the Electronic Patient Care Record, as well as the new and much welcomed Mental Health legislation. Joining the Public Sector Remuneration Committee in 2006, he remained there until 2010, acting as a link member on behalf of Health, and bringing much needed insight to the PSRC from a major employing Department.

2155 On PSRC for four years, Deputy Brehaut negotiated with all pay groups, achieving a 98% record of settlements successfully negotiated, no strikes, no airport closures. He was asked to return in 2008 to continue his work, which he did, and he has an intimate working knowledge of staff pay and conditions. Deputy Brehaut joined the Scrutiny Committee in 2006 under Deputy Pritchard and was elected Chair of that Parliamentary Committee upon his return in 2008, successfully steering it through their population and migration review, milk review, strength and accountability report, governance review, school exclusions review and perhaps, most importantly  
2160 for the position he is seeking your support for today, the Guernsey Planning Service post-Shepley Review in 2011, followed up by the Guernsey Planning Service post-Shepley Review of February 2012 – something an Environment Minister will need to be very familiar with.

2165 Scrutiny have looked at public engagement and drawn up their own model, and when you think back over the past few years on the Environment Department, clearly the Environment could improve its public engagement, something the Environment Minister will need to do. Scrutiny's Vandalism Report dealt with issues such as designing vandalism and disruptive behaviour out of public spaces, and having an awareness through spatial planning, again more environmental issues. Now the post-Shepley Review of the Planning Service gave an insight into the internal dynamics of the Department, and gives an involvement in Environmental Department matters which will hold Deputy Brehaut in good stead.

2170 Whilst on Scrutiny, he pioneered, along with the Waste Disposal Authority, open meetings where the media could attend and report, and he worked closely with PAC and SACC to deliver the Joint Committee Governance Report. As well as leading the Parliamentary Committee of Scrutiny for the past four years, which is an excellent middle step between being a Department Member and a ministerial position, Deputy Brehaut also became Deputy Minister of Health in 2008 and, having served 12 years in Government now, four in non-States Member roles and eight as a deputy, chairman of Scrutiny and Deputy Minister, Deputy Brehaut is ready to take on a ministerial role. I have no doubt he will make a valuable, insightful and, at times, challenging contribution to the Policy Council.

2185 Having served his time as Chair of the Scrutiny and as Deputy Minister of Health, he has the political skill set required of a Minister. Having served on so many committees and Departments,



2190 *(Four minute bell rang)* he has a wide breadth of knowledge of States' business and a proven track record in the review of policy and the delivery of policy in leadership roles. He has an in-depth knowledge of the issues facing planning in the Environment Department, and a great knowledge of governance across the States.

Like Deputy Domaille, Deputy Brehaut knows how the States works, but he also knows how it does not work. Nothing teaches success like failure and, on Scrutiny, Deputy Brehaut has had to investigate a lot of failure. He has learnt the lessons which needed to be learnt, and he has brought those lessons to the Assembly so that others may learn them.

2195 All in all, he fits the bill for me. If anyone has the proven skills and political experience, and knowledge of the Department matters to step up to the Minister of the Environment Department, it is Deputy Brehaut. And I ask you to support my nomination.

2200 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you very much, Mr Bailiff.

I thank Deputy Ogier for his generic speech *(Laughter)* and I thank Deputy Sherbourne, for him seconding my nomination. Thank you very much.

2205 Sir, Members of this Assembly, when putting myself forward for this position, it occurred to me that, perhaps, the Department title is something of a misnomer, for the Environment Department is *not* the 'Department of the environment'. Many of you – us – in our manifestos, under the heading 'Environment', referred to work streams and policy initiatives that are not covered by the Environment Department mandate but they are, nevertheless, very real and important issues.

2210 The recent Energy Policy Plan, for example, which had clear environmental implications, was the work of a Policy Council sub-group. Now, historically for some, that may pose something of a problem but I believe it is not a weakness: in fact, it is a great opportunity – a very real opportunity to get strategic policy back on track by collective, meaningful engagement – dare I say ownership – round the Policy Council table. There are challenges and there can be no doubt about that, but let us not lose sight or perspective on the size of the problems we have. Let us realise we have the potential to resolve them, both at strategic level and inter-departmental level.

2215 It is frequently said that culture will eat strategy for breakfast and, in the past, culture has certainly impacted on strategy. We have seen a Department in this Assembly that was unable to agree on its own policies in this Chamber. The Department task was delivering a policy but decided, actually, it would rather not: a Road Transport Strategy that could not be delivered because of the bus element of the bus service. So, perhaps more than any other, the Environment Department has to go that extra mile on public engagement and that does not mean that you can take every member of the public with you but it also should not stop you from trying to, either.

2220 Also, the perception that the homeowner is disproportionately affected by our planning laws, the assertion that Deputy Guille's 'Fred's in our Sheds' are invisible to planners and the policymakers, the notion that big business will build what they are told to and where are all areas we will have to re-evaluate through consultation and review of the urban and rural area plans. And, by the way, they are not Environment's plans, they are *our* plans, they are *your* plans, and through very meaningful engagement they can be plans that deliver benefits to the entire community, who should not feel that planning is something that happens *to* them, rather it is something they help give shape and form.

2225 I do not bring any baggage with me to the Department. I have not taken part in any discussions or any public debate that would prevent me from being involved in decision-making of a quasi-judicial nature. Also, my time spent on Housing was extremely good preparation for making decisions, with an appreciation that they impact directly on people's lives and livelihoods. My membership of Health and Social Services Department also left me with an understanding of the inter-relationship between the Environment Department and Environmental Health and, as Deputy Ogier has said, Scrutiny's post-Shepley review of the planning service also gave me a greater insight into the dynamics of the Planning Department. But enough of yesterday – let us think about tomorrow and what do I want to do?

2230 Firstly, deliver a board that demonstrates cohesion and courage for those tough decisions. I will tirelessly promote the work of the Department, engage them in community, give them a sense of ownership, involve them in their Island Plan and their town planning, demonstrate through *real* public engagement that the people can and will inform decision making, and do all of those simple things; make it easier for people to cycle to work, to home; embrace initiatives that ensure children can walk to and from school in safety; *(Four-minute bell rang)* work with those in the Third Sector who share our aims; and, importantly, when members of the community put their own time and

environment into environmental issues and come knocking on our door, I want to assure you, and them, that it will remain open.

2250 In closing, sir, we have seen for some years now the defensive, protective, possibly introvert Environment Department struggling to get its message across. It does not need to be that way. It should not function that way and, under my guidance, it will not remain that way.

Like all of you, I love our Island, I care for our environment, I am passionate about these issues. I very much hope you can support me this afternoon.

2255 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Now, Deputy Gollop, on behalf of Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy Gollop:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

2260 Sir, Deputy De Lisle could almost be called Mr or Dr Environmentalist. In his recent and successful manifesto he put down as his primary point on the environment:

2265 ‘I have continued to strengthen environmental policy through amendment to the States Strategic Plan to provide the vision that consideration of the environment will be core to all future policy decisions and actions and that environmental policy will be *equal*, not subservient, to economic and social policy. The quality of our environment will be protected and enhanced and the Island will respond in an environmentally sustainable way to local issues and existing and emerging global challenges. This resolution is approved by the States, which means that all future development proposals are obligated to respect this vision and can be held to account.’

2270 Deputy De Lisle agrees with sympathetic development where there is a minimal impact but, nevertheless, wishes to see sustainable but flexible approach to development.

Somebody mentioned biodiversity. Well, Deputy De Lisle actually got biodiversity on to the Guernsey political agenda, amending the first Government Business Plan with an additional element, so I think that is another example of his vision and commitment.

2275 I remember Deputy Ogier in a debate once said that Deputy De Lisle looks ahead 50 years. He has got that kind of strong vision. He has many qualifications for the position, including four years as Member of the Environment Board, one year as Minister of the Department, experience in two other planning departments, namely five years in the Manitoba, Canada, Department of Agriculture Planning Secretariat and 12 years Urban and Economic Planning in the Planning Branch of the National Capital Commission, Federal Government in Ottawa, Canada. He is somebody who has succeeded internationally, as well as in Guernsey. As a consultant, he spent two years evaluating transportation projects and conducting benefit cost studies for Transport Canada. He obtained a Masters Degree, specialising in land use planning, from Toronto University.

2280  
2285 When he was Minister of the Environment – and that is, itself, a strength because he can hit the ground running – he achieved an internal review of a planning service in 2007, which was followed by the Shepley report, which he was later involved in partially scrutinising. He worked for the Department planners to bring in the Ordinances of the new planning law, which we saw on legislation, and proposals for the introduction of fees for planning and building control applications, introduced a draft environmental strategy plan, as I have said introduced Priority 15 to protect and enhance the environment biodiversity in the countryside to the Government Business Plan.

2290  
2295 He effectively worked with senior politicians in Jersey and the Isle of Man and visited both offshore communities. He joined up with the telecommunications company and OUR to develop a cohesive working plan to share infrastructure and reduce the number of telecom masts. A member of the Strategic Land Planning Group, Energy Policy Group, represented Guernsey at the British Irish Council Environmental Ministerial Group, worked with Commerce and Employment, which resulted in an amendment of development plans, rural and urban, and progressed work on urban redevelopment, including Leale’s Yard, the Fontaine site and the Salt Pans site. Apart from that, he has been involved with many other committees, including Education. *(Four-minute bell rang)*

2300  
2305 His work as a civil service policy adviser and economic studies in the past, a management consultant and, indeed, with the Canadian Civil Service shows what a good candidate he is at administrative levels. But I would also say that he combines political experience, environmental expertise, a history of delivery and a proactive vision which makes him an *extremely able* candidate for this role. Of all the people in the States today, he has the greatest qualifications, passion, zeal and understanding, too, of the countryside. He is a candidate who has achieved results, he was ahead of the game with looking at the PFOS pollution issue. He very much pioneered the work that has led to our current waste strategy and he is somebody who does not give in and sticks to his principles. He has the passion for the job. *(Five-minute bell rang)*

2310 *(Laughter)*

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2315 **Deputy De Lisle:** I thank Deputy Gollop for proposing me and Deputy Kevin Stewart for seconding my nomination.

I have strong qualifications and experience for the Minister of Environment position with, as Deputy Gollop has just indicated, many years – four years on the Environment Board, one as Minister and many years overseas, with international experience.

2320 As an economic development officer and a resource conservation planner in both rural and urban areas, I have played a leading role in economic diversification and industrial land development and in promoting the hi-tech industry and creation of the Silicon Valley North in Ottawa, which became home of Nortel, Mitel and Lumonics, also in planning urban regeneration projects – which is needed in St Peter Port.

2325 During my term as Minister of Environment, I was able to put in place new priorities and several successful initiatives, including instigating an internal review of the planning service and delivering the Ordinances of the new planning law and introducing fees, actually, for planning and building control applications, but also introducing a draft environmental strategy plan and also a priority for protection of biodiversity and the countryside, but also progressing work on Leales Yard and developing the Fontaine site for industrial use and delivering the planning brief for the Salt Pans key industrial area. I would like to continue this work, beginning with a report to the States to review the Ordinances to the new planning law and progress the Shepley recommendations.

2330 The Department must continue to make the planning process more open, efficient and accountable. The Department holds talented people who are very willing and able to move Guernsey into the 21st Century and, as Minister, I can give the Department that guidance, the policy and the vision.

2335 During my election campaign I came across those who were concerned about their livelihoods and the need for designated sites for low key industrial development, provision of builders' yard type areas on a permanent basis – we need to enact a plan and resolve this issue once and for all. The Environment Department can become a centre of expertise and provide advice and assistance to people and businesses interested in investing in renewable energy projects.

2340 We need to encourage the development of micro renewable energy sources for domestic and industrial purposes – it is the role of the Environment Department, by working with States Electricity, through feedback tariffs and private entrepreneurs, to make this happen. We must interact with the finance industry also who, with the private equity firms, can bring onshore the products and services related to clean technology and renewable energy at a reasonable cost. These activities will reduce Guernsey's total carbon footprint and emissions. The community must engage fully in consultation with the Island's Development Plan Review also, to ensure a balance with economic growth.

2350 Public transport must be improved if it is to provide a realistic alternative for commuters, with bus sizes, routings, frequency and evening services considered. I introduced free bus days, cycle paths along the town front and small car parking when Environment Minister. We need to apply creative suggestions to sort out the parking issues, using private sector funding also.

2355 Climate change is a real concern and we must be prepared. By working together with other Departments, we can strengthen our sea defences through engineering investigations and prioritising areas for improvement.

2360 I have the professional qualifications and work experience internationally in land planning, economic diversification and transportation policy. I can hit the ground running. I have a working relationship with the team in the Environment Department and with Ministers in related departments in Jersey and the Isle of Man. This synergy is important; it is something I began five years ago as I saw importance and necessity in working co-operatively.

I call on Members of the Assembly to support my nomination today for Minister of Environment.

2365 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, you will now vote on the election of a Minister of the Environment Department.

2370 I remind you there are three candidates; Deputy Domaille proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy David Jones; Deputy Brehaut, proposed by Deputy Ogier, seconded by Deputy Sherbourne; and Deputy De Lisle, proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Stewart.

*A first ballot took place.*

2375 **The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

*There was a six minute recess to count the votes.*

2380 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, I think we are ready to start again.  
I have the result of the vote for the election of the Minister for the Environment Department: Deputy Domaille, 21 votes, Deputy Brehaut 20 votes, and Deputy De Lisle 6 votes, so there will, therefore, need to be a second ballot.

Deputy De Lisle is eliminated and the second ballot will, therefore, be just between Deputy Domaille and Deputy Brehaut.

2385 *A second ballot took place.*

2390 **Deputy Brehaut:** Sir, may I raise a point, a very quick one: in Deputy Gollop's proposing speech he said that Deputy De Lisle took part in the Scrutiny Review. He could not, sir, because he was conflicted: he did take part in the initial review but not whilst on Scrutiny, to be clear, sir.  
Thank you.

*There was a four minute recess to count the votes.*

2395 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the result of the vote for the election of a Minister for the Environment Department is Deputy Domaille 24 votes and Deputy Brehaut 23 votes, so I declare Deputy Domaille elected.

*Deputy Domaille was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

2400

## HOUSING DEPARTMENT

2405 **Election of Minister**  
**Deputy David Jones elected**

*Article VIII.*

*The States are asked:-*

2410 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Housing Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article VIII, election of a Minister of the Housing Department.

2415 **The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

**Chief Minister:** Bailiff, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Jones as the Minister for Housing Department.

2420 **The Bailiff:** And is there a seconder?

**Deputy Le Lièvre:** I nominate Deputy Gollop, sir.

2425 **The Bailiff:** Thank you; we need a seconder first for Deputy Jones. Thank you, Deputy O'Hara.

Then we have Deputy Le Lièvre proposing Deputy Gollop – do we have a seconder for Deputy Gollop?

2430 **Deputy James:** I will second him, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you very much, Deputy James.

Right, we have two nominations, then.  
Yes, Deputy Dorey.

2435 **Deputy Dorey:** Sir, I wish to propose Deputy Brehaut for Housing.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut proposed by Deputy Dorey, and seconded by ?  
Do we have a seconder for Deputy Brehaut? Deputy Brouard, thank you.

2440 Do we have any other nominations? No, then we have three candidates. We have Deputy David Jones, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy O'Hara; Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy Le Lièvre and seconded by Deputy James; Deputy Brehaut, proposed by Deputy Dorey and seconded by Deputy Brouard.  
Chief Minister

2445 **Chief Minister:** Sir, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy David Jones for the position of Minister of Housing.

In doing so, I am very conscious of the fact that there are certain appointments here where continuity is vital and very important. Deputy Jones first joined the States in 2000 and, at the time he arrived in this Chamber, having already lodged a Requête with the Bailiff's Office on housing issues. That Requête also contained the names of Deputy Trott, Deputy Quin and many other Deputies, who were all deeply concerned at the state of social housing in the Island at that time.

2450 That Requête was heavily defeated on that day. However, the bones of the Requête now form a big part of the corporate housing programme, which was the start of a decade of dedicated work at Housing. Deputy Jones joined the Housing Board and Committee elections in the same month and, within two years, he had become Vice President of that Department.

2455 It was clear, by that time, that he had shown real commitment and drive in addressing the huge problems that were facing Housing at that time, and that he was already likely to be a future leader of the Department. In 2004, following the machinery of government changes, Deputy Jones was approached by the former Chief Minister, Laurie Morgan, to become the first Minister of Housing and then, after the collapse of the Policy Council over the clinical block affair, he was once again returned as Housing Minister, after being proposed by the new Chief Minister, Deputy Mike Torode and seconded by Deputy Stuart Falla. And then, in 2008, he was proposed, once again, by the Chief Minister of the day, Deputy Lyndon Trott, for the position of Minister of Housing.

2465 I may not have been a Member of the States before, but I know enough to recognise that Housing has been one of the real success stories for the States in the last few years. Clearly, the continuity it has had in leadership has given it the ability to see policies through across the difficulties of electoral changes, which has been proved to be no bad thing. Under Deputy Jones' leadership we have seen real sustained progress for provision of social housing in Guernsey and particularly the full development programme with the Guernsey Housing Authority, and there is still more to come.

2470 This nomination is not a leap of faith. Deputy Jones has a proven track record of producing results and of strong, decisive leadership. He has also shown, consistently, that he is a team player, that he has been very successful in driving through some of the more difficult housing policies, like the tenancy reviews that removed high earners from social housing.

2475 The Policy Council, in the next term, is going to need a balance between proven experience and new blood to reflect the wind of change the public have demanded. With the phasing out of the housing control law to a new population regime, Deputy Jones' extensive knowledge of these issues will be invaluable to myself and to the Policy Council as a whole.

2480 I urge you to support those nominations to the post of Deputy Jones for Housing Minister, again recognising that I believe *his* qualities will considerably add to the strength of the Policy Council team to take us through the next four years. I urge you all to support this nomination.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy David Jones.

2485 **Deputy David Jones:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff, Members of the States.

You will have heard from that speech that I have been asked to return to the Housing Department by the Chief Minister, in order to carry the Corporate Housing Programme through this term. I am honoured to be asked by our Chief Minister for two reasons: one is that it is a job I am passionate about and truly committed to; and, secondly, as I did not vote for him, I am indebted by the fact that he has not let that cloud his good judgement. (*Laughter*)

2490 I have been at Housing all my political life and, in those years, together with various fellow board Members, I have taken that Department, from 30 years of stagnation, to a Department that

has been proactive, focused and which has formed an extremely successful partnership with the Guernsey Housing Association to provide new eco-friendly homes and replace tired, old, run-down estates with modern houses fit for the next 60 years.

2495

We have an extensive building programme, the like of which has not been seen since the 1960s, a creative social housing agenda that is designed to relieve the taxpayer of any future maintenance costs for those homes, and a partial-ownership scheme that has allowed dozens of families to get their foot on the first rung of the property-ownership ladder, with many more homes under this scheme in the pipeline.

2500

I can tell you that, 10 years ago, housing was top of the election issue. It followed votes of no confidence in the then Housing Department, which was crippled by inertia and lack of direction. I was instrumental, at that time, together with Deputy Flouquet, in giving this Department firm objectives. I can tell all of you that housing has not been a major election issue in the last two General Elections. It does not mean that the job is finished; it just means that people are more confident that Housing is heading in the right direction and is focused on the needs of those it serves. We also recognise that we must do much more to help those in the private rental sector, which is why Housing supported the last SSD report that came before the States, parts of which address that very issue.

2510

I am a strong leader who knows how to get results. I do not subscribe to the notion that, as politicians, we must only formulate policy and leave the rest to others. You cannot drive a car from the back seat – unless, of course, you are Deputy St Pier, who has the legs for it! *(Laughter)* I have a proven track record of delivering the goods, and I have never lost a single Policy Report on the floor of this Assembly since taking charge of the Housing Department.

2515

You have my word that I will give the Housing portfolio 110%, just as I have always done since I first became its Minister a few years ago.

There is still much to be done and, with a new population management policy in the wings, we have to get the Department ready to hand over the housing control function to the new population office, once the States has given it the green light. I suspect it will be one of the new Policy Council's first jobs to get that report ready for you to debate. On top of that, we have the new extra care housing schemes recently signed off by Treasury, which will start to address many of the problems facing the demographic tsunami that is heading our way.

2520

By 2015, all of our existing States' houses will have been completely refurbished. We will be finishing where Jersey has just started, and they have said recently, on a visit to view what we have done, that they wish they were where we are today, as they have a multi-million-pound problem on their hands, with no dedicated housing fund to pay for it. Our position has been a result of 10 years of sensible planning and of recognising that there was a long-term programme that needed to be done in affordable phases.

2525

The other ongoing initiatives are the Older People Strategy, working with HSSD in the lead role, *(Four-minute bell rang)* helping to keep those who want to stay in their own homes for as long as they wish to, with care packages from the new extra care homes shortly to be constructed; the Key Worker Housing Strategy, which is of particular importance to HSSD and Education, and a possible use of Cour du Parc Park flats, which has been in the news lately. Also, the Housing Department is a significant contributor to the Disability Strategy and we are also working on improving the quality of accommodation, again with HSSD, in the private rental sector. There is the transfer of the Rent Rebate Scheme... So a stack of projects to see through to completion in this next term.

2530

I ask you to give me your support to go back to Housing Department so I can put together a lively new Housing Board and get on with the next phase of this important programme.

2540

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Lièvre now, to speak on behalf of Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Le Lièvre:** Mr Bailiff, Members of the Assembly, it gives me great pleasure to nominate Deputy John Gollop for the position of Minister of the Housing Department.

2545

I am not going to beat around the bush and pretend that Deputy Gollop does not have challenges and idiosyncrasies, and I intend to address these before I go any further.

Deputy Gollop is a person with Asperger's Syndrome, which itself is a condition within the autistic spectrum. It makes Deputy Gollop different from most of us – not less able, just different – the most obvious being his unique dress code, *(Laughter)* but also his ability, or hidden ability, or disability, to see every single tree in the wood at the same time, when the rest of us just see a wood. This does not make life easy for him. He is acutely aware of this and realises that, wherever he goes, he will always stand out as being different. This does not mean he can change, however.

2550

2555 He can change no more than a short person can simply wish themselves tall by the power of thought. Conditions are not something that can be wished away.

But we are not here today to consider Deputy Gollop's idiosyncrasies; we are here to decide whether he has the capacity to fulfil the demands of a Minister of a Department and, in addition, what qualities he would bring to the Policy Council.

2560 Deputy Gollop has already been a member of the Housing Department during the period 2004-08 States and, therefore, understands very clearly the work and process of the Department and its partners, the Guernsey Housing Association and Housing 21. He understands the need to provide a choice of affordable accommodation for those members of our community who cannot access the full-blown ownership market without assistance. Likewise, he understands the plight of those Islanders who simply cannot afford the private rented sector, or those who need sheltered housing or, indeed, extra care housing. He understands better than most the rigours of being a single man seeking good quality accommodation at a reasonable price.

2570 He is extremely socially minded and, I would suggest, puts the plight of others before his own, much to his own detriment. His generosity knows no bounds, as many of us are aware. He can speak better than most of us without a note before him, and his grasp of complicated issues is such that he has often addressed the problem in his own mind and moved on to the next issue when he speaks. It is perhaps not surprising that we struggle to keep up with him. It can give the impression of disjointed thinking and a chaotic brain. To some extent it undoubtedly is, but it is also the sign of extremely agile and advanced intellectual capacity that just needs a little channelling, and I would suggest that this channelling would be ably provided by the Chief Officer of Housing, Dr Stephen Langford, who knows Deputy Gollop well. Dr Langford is well placed to provide the guidance and support that Deputy Gollop needs to do an extremely effective job.

2575 It is these combinations of all these qualities – a hugely nimble brain, the ability to listen, his generosity, his care of others before himself, his vast experience of the States and his rather spooky ability to seemingly be in two places at the same time, especially if there is food (*Laughter*) – that have earned him the enviable reputation of the public at large as a man of the people for the people.

2580 Poll topper several times over, if it was popularity alone that qualified anybody to be Chief Minister, then I would suggest, Chief Minister, that Deputy Gollop would have sat in your seat several times over. If we had Island-wide voting, I very much suspect that Deputy Gollop could very rightly claim a ministership of an A- class Department. It is time to give this very humble and self-effacing man the opportunity to exercise his ability to the full. It is time to allow his intellectual capacity its full rein, to put him in a position to see what he can really do, given the guidance of a very supportive chief officer. That is, amongst other things, what chief officers are supposed to do. (*Four-minute bell rang*)

2590 Much of what I have just said is just as applicable when related to a seat on the Policy Council. Deputy Gollop has huge ability and experience, and I would suggest that if he succeeds in his bid to be Minister of the Housing Department, then his new colleagues, many of whom will be completely new to the States, let alone the Policy Council, will be very appreciative of his wise bones.

2595 Now I am going to be extremely blunt, and I will apologise to John in advance: when you vote today, cast out the vision of the very often dishevelled person, forget the rather overweight little man who is often the butt of our humour, put aside a desire to consign him to the back bench – and think of the good-natured person, the person who never takes a pop at anybody else, the person who cares passionately for his Island and passionately for its people, and the man with the largest and the most able intellectual brains amongst us – the man who needs our help to let him help us.

2600 Vote for Deputy Gollop. Thank you, sir. (*Applause*)

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

2605 **Deputy Gollop:** I thank Deputy Le Lièvre for his warm words, although I would point out that being overweight should qualify me to be a political *heavyweight*. (*Laughter*) I would also mention... Reference has been made to the Chief Officer. I did, in fact, go to school with the gentleman, and when I eventually move into the new flat, it might be not a stone's throw away.

2610 As a matter of fact, I will take a leaf out of Deputy Duquemin's successful manifesto idea and go for segmenting what I have got to say in the limited time into basically the personal story, the promise, the purpose, the policies, the problems, the personality and maybe, perhaps, the prejudice.

The personal story was that, on election night, the media has always asked what are you going for, and I said Housing, for two reasons. One is that I have experience of that and it is a big St

2615 Peter Port North issue, and so far we have yet to see a Minister from St Peter Port North. The other reason was I had every reason to think Deputy Jones was perhaps going to Public Services at the time and, of course, he would also make an ideal External Affairs Minister, so I am not in any sense standing against Deputy Jones, who we work well with.

2620 On the promise: the promise is to continue the good work of the last two housing boards and what Deputy Jones has set out to achieve, but with a difference, and the difference, I think, will be working together with all the Departments as much as possible and speeding up the good work because there is a danger that, should the Island return to unqualifying affluence, we will see a return of some of the housing issues.

2625 My policies are, broadly, the corporate housing policy, but certainly refocusing areas such as the extra care to ensure that it is a vision that is available to people of *all* means and property ownership, not just those in the tenancy sector, and also to look constructively not *just* at the brilliant work done in modernising States houses, but thinking more radically than that and thinking maybe it is time to sell off significant quantities from our older stock or to transfer them to housing associations and build new, purpose-built energy-efficient stock which would not only increase the housing stock available on the Island to young people and others, but would, of course, save the States money.

I also am a strong believer that Housing needs, as a vision, to encourage homeowners to have grants to improve the energy efficiency of their properties.

2635 I would also make a point that... This is perhaps a different kind of speech, but I am not here saying I want Housing to be a bigger Department. I think part of the role of the next Policy Council will be to consider *rationalising* the Departments, and Housing, brilliant work though it does, is a mixture of forms and functions that would be better off re-integrated into the rest of the departmental structure. For example, the estate management really belongs to Treasury and Resources. The rent rebate, that we got completely confused with in the last term, should be integrated with Social Security. Health and Social Services have a particular role in rehabilitating social issue families, people with criminal records and so on. That is where we should be heading, and we know that the housing licences really belong with the Policy Council, as we voted for, or even Commerce and Employment in a reconstitution. I think, too, that the housing licences really belong with the Policy Council, as we voted for, or even Commerce and Employment, in a reconstitution.

2640 I think too that many people envisage Housing as a social Department – and of course it does house some of the most socially needy and worthy members of our community – but I think it is also a *key* economic Department, (*Four-minute bell rang*) and that role has perhaps been not to the fore. Housing shapes how Education performs, how HSSD performs. The range of jobs that are available for commerce and employment and business... It very much... You need an approach that integrates housing with economic development and environmental policy to work.

I think, too, I have the personality and the range of skills to contribute significantly to the Policy Council. I am not a ‘yes man’, I will not be necessarily just a nodding dog, agreeing with everything that is said, and I think I am aware of the problems.

2655 The problems for me, in the previous States, were difficulties that Housing had in agreeing with Social Security on extra care and rebates – with HSSD there were issues over the children’s home and those kind of things. We definitely need a new style Social Policy Committee and I think the future of housing lies within a new Ministry of Social Policy (*Five-minute bell rang*) that would integrate all the Departments.

2660

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Dorey next to speak on behalf of Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Dorey:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

2665 It is quite a short speech, as Deputy Brehaut is a late entrant into this position. Following Deputy Brehaut’s strong support for the Ministry of Environment Department, which shows that he has extensive support in the Assembly, I wish to propose him for the Minister of Housing.

2670 Deputy Brehaut has been a member of Housing for seven years. He was a non-States member for four years from 2000 to 2004, and for three years from 2004 to 2007. I served with him for five of those years, so I know what important contribution he made to the Housing Department. He fully understands the Housing Department’s policies. He was a member of the Housing Department when the key policy changes in Housing were made, so he was there when they were developed and they were then debated in the House, but his establishment of the Corporate Housing Programme and the Housing Association... I think those are the crucial steps which made a difference for Housing. But it is also that a big part of Housing is in relation to the housing control law and deciding on applications which are not delegated to the staff.

2675



Having been there for that number of years, Deputy Brehaut has a full understanding of the housing control law. I always recall what an important part he played in the discussions on individual housing applications, because of his understanding he had of the law, and that is quite a complex law.

2680 So I think he has the leadership skills that he has shown as a Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee for four years. I think we are all impressed with what the Scrutiny have done over the last four years. He was the Deputy Minister on HSSD, so he understands the role of Minister, and I have full confidence that he has the knowledge and leadership skills to be the Housing Minister. But that is not all. I think it is absolutely crucial for this House, and going forward, that there is a balance of views on the Policy Council. We need people who are socially aware on the Policy Council and it is important that Deputy Brehaut *is* on the Policy Council because he has those views, so I think he would make an absolutely ideal Housing Department Minister, with the combination of his social views, his leadership skills that he has shown on Scrutiny, and his detailed knowledge of housing policies and the housing control law.

2690 I ask you to vote for him. Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you very much.

2695 So suddenly, I have not had enough time to allow Deputy Gollop to write a speech for me, (*Laughter*) and perhaps, as Deputy Jones himself may say, we have arrived once again at Government by ambush.

2700 Perhaps if I could just give you some background: before I got here today I was of the view that Deputy Jones was considering a move to PSD on the grounds that he had accomplished what he wanted to accomplish at Housing and he had put that on the record. I exchanged an e-mail with Deputy Jones, asking if that was his position because, if that was the case, I had two interests in this Assembly – as Housing Department Minister and Minister of the Environment, in that order. I did say to Deputy Jones if he was going for the Housing Department. I would be reluctant... and I used these words: I did not want to trip over his feet in the first couple of hours that we have our respective roles. So I decided, then, to put my energies into standing for the Environment Department.

2705 There is an argument for continuity for Housing made by the Chief Minister, but, respectfully, it is a weak one, because if we... You would imagine we could make a stronger argument for continuity with regard to PSD, and that argument has not been made today.

2710 I joined the Housing Department in 2000. I am more than familiar with housing associations and their operation and staircasing and ensuring that people progressively own more of the property and they do not sink money into rent and debt. I am familiar with... Housing originated the first partnering scheme, working with companies on the Island. That was not done before. It was a rather standard tendering process that evolved into something quite different. I am obviously familiar with the Corporate Housing Programme mechanism.

2715 It may surprise many of you, because it surprised me – and I think Deputy Fallaize asked a number of Questions recently – four months ago – of the Housing Department: there are as many people on the housing waiting list today as there were in early 2000. I am also horrified to think the Cour du Parc flats remain empty – 42 units of States-owned accommodation empty, paying no rent because we cannot fix the lift – and we have no emergency accommodation. We have no emergency accommodation, yet we have Cour du Parc flats empty!

2720 There remains very little protection for the private rental sector. I believe that we should have... and I said it in my manifesto that we need a third party to secure deposits, so when young people take on flats and find they are of a rather downbeat nature, they can get their deposit back, rather than the landlord keeping it. Again, there remains very little protection for private sector landlords. I believe there is scope to release more properties to a new housing association. Give them more critical mass to ensure we have the Guernsey Housing Association, the Housing Department and another housing association to ensure we definitely get value for money.

2730 If I can be frank and pick up on what Deputy Gollop said, housing is a waning star. Housing is a waning star! If you are looking for efficiency, we have to ask why the housing control law is still with the Housing Department – but that obviously will not remain the case for very long. As Deputy Gollop has said, the Rent Rebate Scheme belongs elsewhere and the property management of housing belongs elsewhere. So I am suggesting today that, if you vote for me, you give me a clear agenda for change to make those efficiencies and make me the last Housing Minister. Make me the *last* Housing Minister. Everyone has said there are probably two Departments too many. There is a review of Government coming up. Put your vote where your slip is and, perhaps, make

me the last Housing Minister.

2740 Before I sit down, I will apologise for the manner in which I have stood for this position. *(Four-minute bell rang)* I have always felt – excuse the pun – I would be most at home at Housing. I started the day on something of a compromise, but I believe, with an open mind and a strong heart, I can stand for the position of Housing Department Minister.

Thank you.

2745 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, you will vote now in the election of a Minister for the Housing Department. I remind you there are three candidates: Deputy David Jones, proposed by the Chief Minister, seconded by Deputy O’Hara; Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy Le Lièvre, seconded by Deputy James; and Deputy Brehaut, who was proposed by Deputy Dorey and seconded by Deputy Brouard.

2750 *A ballot took place.*

**The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

2755 *There was a five minute recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, I have the result of the vote for the election of a Minister of the Housing Department: Deputy Jones, 27 votes; Deputy Brehaut, 11 votes; and Deputy Gollop, 9 votes.

2760 I declare Deputy David Jones to be elected as the Minister of Housing. *(Applause)*

*Deputy David Jones was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

2765 **CULTURE AND LEISURE DEPARTMENT**

**Election of Minister  
Deputy O’Hara elected**

2770 *Article III.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as Minister for the Culture and Leisure Department to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

2775

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article III, election of a Minister of the Culture and Leisure Department.

2780 **The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister (Deputy Harwood):** Members, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Michael O’Hara for the appointment of Minister of the Culture and Leisure Department.

2785 **The Bailiff:** Do we have a seconder for Deputy O’Hara? Yes, Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Yes, I second.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.

Do we have any other nominations?

2790 No? In that case, we have only one candidate, Deputy O’Hara, proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Langlois for the post of Minister of the Culture and Leisure Department. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

2795

**The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy O’Hara elected. *(Applause)*  
If Members wish to remove their jackets, they may do so.

2800 *Deputy O'Hara was applauded as he took his seat on the bench.*

**DEPUTY CHIEF MINISTER**

2805 **Election of Deputy Chief Minister**  
**Deputy Le Tocq elected**

*Article XI.*

2810 *The States are asked:*  
*To elect a Minister of a Department as Deputy Chief Minister to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

2815 **The Deputy Greffier:** Article 11, election of a Deputy Chief Minister.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister.

2820 **The Chief Minister (Deputy Harwood):** Mr Bailiff, Members, I have pleasure in nominating Deputy Allister Langlois for the post of Deputy Chief Minister.

**The Bailiff:** Do we have a seconder? Yes, Deputy Adam.

**Deputy Adam:** I will second him, sir.

2825 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Do we have any other candidates proposed?  
Deputy Fallaize.

2830 **Deputy Fallaize:** I am proposing Deputy Jonathan Le Tocq.

**The Bailiff:** And do we have a seconder for Deputy Le Tocq?

**Deputy David Jones:** Yes, sir.

2835 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Jones, thank you.  
Any other candidates?

No? Then, we have two candidates for the post of Deputy Chief Minister: Deputy Langlois, proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Adam; and Deputy Le Tocq, proposed by Deputy Fallaize and seconded by Deputy David Jones.

2840 Thank you.  
Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:** Sir, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy Allister Langlois as my Deputy Chief Minister.

2845 I have already described Deputy Langlois' career and background, both political and professional, in presenting his nomination as Minister of the Department of Social Security. I will not repeat that information in this speech, save to remind all Members that, during his period as a States Deputy, he has been heavily involved with inter-departmental matters, working across departmental barriers and as part of a team. It is that aspect of his political career that perhaps is one of the principal qualifications for the role of the Deputy Chief Minister.

2850 May I first, however, describe *my* perception of the role of the Deputy Chief Minister. As with the role of the Chief Minister, there is no strict job description. Each Chief Minister has brought *his* own interpretation to the role of the Deputy Chief Minister. My intention will be to make the Deputy Chief Minister a positive role and not merely a title. The Deputy Chief Minister will not merely serve to deputise for the Chief Minister when I am off the Island.

2855 As I stated in my speech last week, I would wish the Policy Council to act in a more proactive manner than in the past, to recognise the Policy Council has its own mandate and is not merely

2860 there representative of the different Departments of Government. That mandate includes advising the States on matters relating to: firstly, the Island's constitutional position; international relations and matters relating to the parishes, and other islands of the Bailiwick; in the formulation and implementation of economic, fiscal, human, resource, environmental and social strategic and corporate policies to meet objectives agreed by the States; and, thirdly, the co-ordination of the work of the States.

2865 I would envisage the Deputy Chief Minister being actually involved in many of these functions. I would seek to share aspects of those functions with the Deputy Chief Minister. It follows, therefore, that whoever is appointed as Deputy Chief Minister must be able to, firstly, demonstrate a knowledge of the operation of the States; secondly, be able to commit time to the role, recognising the position of Deputy Chief Minister may, in the future, require a doubling-up of the time commitment of a departmental Minister; and above all, thirdly, loyalty to the Chief Minister, to be able to work *with*, and not in competition with, the Chief Minister.

2870 The Deputy Chief Minister should also be able to bring complementary skills to those enjoyed by the Chief Minister. In the case of Deputy Langlois, his understanding of organisational matters and group synergies is certainly such a complementary skill.

2875 Whilst I have no doubt that there will be areas of policy where he and I will not necessarily agree, I believe that we have known each other long enough to be able to treat any such differences with mutual respect.

I know, in particular, that I will be able to enjoy his complete loyalty, and that he will be able to dedicate sufficient time to the role of Deputy Chief Minister, as well as fulfilling his duties as Minister of the Social Security Department.

2880 I therefore have complete confidence in Deputy Langlois for the role of Deputy Chief Minister and I urge that all Members endorse my total confidence by voting for Deputy Allister Langlois as Deputy Chief Minister.

Thank you.

2885 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

2890 **Deputy Langlois:** Sir, I thank the Chief Minister for his kind words and for his confidence that I will fulfil the role that he sees for his Deputy Chief Minister. The finer details of how that role complements and shares the load with the Chief Minister must evolve early in that partnership. It is essential for that partnership to be complementary and not conflicting.

2895 Sir, I am well versed in leadership sharing, having co-founded a business over 20 years ago and jointly leading that business throughout with the same person. Whatever balance of responsibilities emerges for a Chief Minister and Deputy Chief Minister, the *key* guideline must be to remember that the role is that of deputy and not *alternative* Chief Minister. I will expect to work in loyal support of the Chief Minister by sharing policies and strategies, not in an unquestioning way but in a way that once the decision has been taken, it will be supported fully. The role, as I see it most of all, would involve being a critical friend and a discussion partner.

2900 So, what particular support can I bring to our already chosen Chief Minister? Firstly, I have a unique breadth of experience of the States of Guernsey, across its many activities: early on, as a college lecturer, many years ago, supervising public sector student management projects; briefly, as a civil servant in a senior personnel planning role; and, subsequently, as an organisational organiser on strategic and operational projects for many States Departments before I moved into politics.

2905 I am therefore familiar with nearly all aspects of what the States does, in one way or another. This will enable me to advise on the political ramifications and implications of events and policy proposals, in order to avoid as many unintended consequences of leadership actions as possible.

2910 Secondly, my current political experience through PSRC and T & R in the last term has involved many cross-departmental interactions and co-operations and a close awareness of recent Policy Council thinking.

The Chief Minister must draw from as many political sources as possible, but *I* will undertake to be a trusted participant working for the public good and seeking to minimise public political conflict that can only do further damage to the States' somewhat tarnished image.

2915 Thirdly, in an ambassador role, I can devote sufficient time to sharing the load of promoting and defending Guernsey and its Government, both on and off this Island, presenting a pragmatic and realistic view of what the States seeks to achieve in order to build respect for our beloved Island.

Above all, sir, I seek this role because I believe. I believe in this Island of Guernsey, its people and its ability to maintain a fortunate and favourable position in a rapidly changing world. I

2920 believe in teamwork and loyalty that makes for efficient Government in a hard-to-operate  
 consensus system. And, most of all, I believe that we *must* present a consistent and clear image  
 inside and outside of the Island.

With your support, as Deputy Chief Minister, I will seek to live up to those beliefs.

2925 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize now, to speak on behalf of Deputy Le Tocq.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

Last week, Deputy Jonathan Le Tocq was just four votes away from being elected as our Chief  
 Minister. In obtaining 20 votes in that election, he demonstrated that he can reach across the  
 political spectrum and command the confidence of a broad cross-section of this Assembly.

2930 I must say that I have always resented the notion that the candidate who finishes second in the  
 vote for a Chief Minister is somehow automatically entitled to become the Deputy Chief Minister.  
 Equally, I feel that that should not work in reverse. A good candidate should not be precluded  
 from becoming Deputy Chief Minister simply because he or she contested the top job. The  
 enduring principle must always be the right candidate for the right role, and for many reasons that  
 2935 go beyond the result of last Tuesday's vote and which relate to the skills and experience of the  
 candidates, it is my strong conviction that, at this time and in these circumstances, Deputy Le Tocq  
 is, without question, the strongest, most rounded and most able candidate to serve as our Deputy  
 Chief Minister.

2940 The successful candidate will be *our* Deputy Chief Minister, the Deputy Chief Minister not of  
 the Chief Minister alone, or even of the Policy Council, but of the whole States. Deputy Harwood  
 as Chief Minister, and Deputy Le Tocq as Deputy Chief Minister, is the partnership most likely to  
 command the confidence and broad support of the whole Assembly, and publicly, and that can  
 only benefit the relationship between the Policy Council and the rest of the States.

2945 When electing a Deputy Chief Minister alongside a Chief Minister, there must be a strong case  
 not to elect one as a mini replica of the other, but to elect two Members from different  
 backgrounds with contrasting interests and, most of all, who have complementary skills. I said last  
 week that Deputy Harwood is a man of gravitas, a statesman. Deputy Le Tocq is dynamic and  
 charismatic. Deputy Harwood will lead with calm and quiet authority. Deputy Le Tocq is a people  
 person, he is affable and a good communicator. Deputy Harwood has vast knowledge of our  
 2950 financial services industry and a particular interest in fiscal policy. Deputy Le Tocq, who is in his  
 third term of public service, has actually served as the Deputy Minister of T & R but, significantly,  
 his policy experience is the broadest among the candidates. He has been a Member of Education  
 and the Social Policy Group and served a full four-year term as Chairman of PSRC. He also  
 played a key role in giving birth to the first Government Business Plan, and so has experience of  
 2955 inter-departmental policy planning. He has a proven record of passion and compassion in social  
 policy, both inside the States and outside, where he has been Chairman of the Guernsey  
 Bereavement Service and Guernsey Youth Association, and a Director of SHAPE, a charity  
 working with the effects of HIV AIDS in Africa. He has also represented the States away from  
 these shores as a past President of Overseas Aid.

2960 Of course, there are occasions when the Deputy Chief Minister will deputise for the  
 unavailable Chief Minister. The States can be confident in Deputy Le Tocq for such occasions. He  
 will lead Guernsey capably and respectfully. When speaking *for* Guernsey, he will do so with  
 confidence, composure and eloquence.

2965 Deputy Le Tocq is not yet 50, which I am told makes him still quite young. (*Laughter*) He is  
 married, with three children. His working life has rooted him in the youth of the Island and, as  
 Deputy Chief Minister, he will be able to communicate effectively with that constituency. He is an  
 intellectual, a man with 14 O' levels, four A' levels and graduate and postgraduate qualifications  
 from universities in the UK and France. (*Four-minute bell rang*) He is a bibliophile and multi-  
 lingual.

2970 He will bring to the role of Deputy Chief Minister a style which is neither patronising nor  
 manipulative and which values strong opinions, even when they are contrary to his own. He wants  
 to foster greater political engagement within the Policy Council and raise the standard of political  
 debate across Government.

2975 So the States needs a Deputy Chief Minister in whom it can place its respect, trust and  
 confidence. With that in mind, I commend Deputy Le Tocq as an outstanding candidate for the  
 office of Deputy Chief Minister.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq.

2980

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Thank you, sir.

I am going to be very brief: firstly because His Excellency has exhorted us recently to conciseness and focus; secondly, because of the fact, I believe, that Members have, without doubt, heard enough about and from me, at least to know what I stand for, in recent weeks; thirdly, because Deputy Fallaize has underlined all the issues that I would encourage the Assembly to consider in support of my ability and to complement the Chief Minister; fourthly, I am confident that, with the right team at the Home Department, I am ideally placed to fulfil the role of Deputy Chief Minister.

2985

Indeed, interestingly enough, Senator Ian Le Marquand, who is well known to me, is both the Home Affairs Minister in Jersey and the Deputy Chief Minister of Jersey. Finally, I am not the kind of person, sir, who believes in using two words where one will do. So, to Deputy Fallaize, to Deputy Jones and, indeed, to all Members of the House who have offered their support to me, I simply say thanks.

2990

**The Bailiff:** Members, we come to the vote on the election of a Deputy Chief Minister.

2995

There are two candidates, as you know: Deputy Langlois, proposed by the Chief Minister and seconded by Deputy Adam; and Deputy Le Tocq, proposed by Deputy Fallaize and seconded by Deputy David Jones.

3000

*A ballot took place.*

**The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

*There was a five minute recess to count the votes.*

3005

**The Bailiff:** Will you take your seats, please everyone.

Members of the States, the result of the vote for the election of a Deputy Chief Minister is Deputy Le Tocq, 30 votes; Deputy Langlois, 17 votes.

I declare Deputy Le Tocq elected as Deputy Chief Minister.

3010

*Deputy Le Tocq was applauded.*

3015

## LEGISLATION SELECT COMMITTEE

### Election of Chairman Deputy Robert Jones elected

3020

*Article XII.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

3025

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article XII, election of a Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Chief Minister, I understand that you are not exercising your right of first nomination for any of the chairmanships.

3030

Do we have any candidates for the Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee?

Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, Deputy John Gollop, sir.

3035

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle proposing Deputy Gollop. Is there a seconder?

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** I will second that, sir.

3040

**The Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Lester Queripel.  
Deputy Brouard.

**Deputy Brouard:** I would like to nominate Deputy Robert Jones.

3045 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Robert Jones, thank you.  
Do we have a seconder?

**Deputy Soulsby:** I will second that.

3050 **The Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Soulsby.  
Do we have any other candidates?

No? Then, we have two candidates for the chairmanship of the Legislation Select Committee: Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy De Lisle and seconded by Deputy Lester Queripel; and Deputy Robert Jones, proposed by Deputy Brouard and seconded by Deputy Soulsby.

3055 Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Sir, and Members of the House, it is a pleasure for me to recommend wholeheartedly Deputy John Gollop for Chairman of Legislation. He is a hard worker, he has an inquiring mind, he is well read, quick to research any area, with a ready body of information on a wide range of issues. He has an independent mind and brings a wealth of knowledge and understanding to any issue, and he is sharp and alert and well tuned into the issues and happenings of the day in these Islands and on the international stage.

3060 His 15 years of experience in Government as a St Peter Port Deputy since 1997, his high profile, consistent popularity, his years of working on 10 States of Guernsey Departments or Committees, show that he is a hardworking team player with a well rounded knowledge of the Departments of Government and how they function.

3065 Deputy Gollop holds a BA (Hons) in Law from Kent University. His law degree strengthens his role as legislative chairman, as will his follow-up trust and company management studies, but it is his gentle personality and his intellectual prowess, his agile mind, his encyclopaedic memory and his debating skills that will be a remarkable asset. Also, he is a full-time politician. He has eight years' experience on the Legislation Committee, with four years as Chairman of that Committee.

3070 Legislation needs continuity from a political and popular professional who is widely and high regarded as an expert on political trends and knowledge. He has a reputation for speedy delivery of legislation, corrected and on time, continuity and understanding. He understands the process of legislation.

3075 Members, I commend to you Deputy Gollop to the post of Legislation Chairman.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

3080 **Deputy Gollop:** Thank you, sir, to Deputy De Lisle for his kind words.

I would point out, on the speedy delivery point, when the Legislation Select Committee receives legislation, occasionally we send it back to the Department concerned. More often than not, we deal with it in our Committee meetings within two weeks during a two-hour meeting. If there are delays, it has come from the Departments instructing St James Chambers, in many instances.

3085 Talking of qualifications, in congratulation of Deputy Le Tocq for his success, the point was made about his credentials. I worked out I have done, or passed, at least 12 'A' levels or their equivalent, including geography twice – once taught by Deputy De Lisle in an economic format – accountancy, law, classical civilisation, English literature, use of English, psychology, theology, history, European history – at 'AO' – and business studies. I believe one of my lecturers for some courses was Deputy Allister Langlois, as well. So it is an interesting thing.

3090 I think one would know that, apart from my law degree and other courses that I have done in supervisory management, I do keep in touch very much with the Institute of Directors. I am a private member of the Chamber of Commerce. I have headed up the St Peter Port Traders and the self employed, so I very much have my ear to the business community and I think that is important in this particular role.

3095 I would also stress that, although mention has been made of my 'gentle personality', I think that the time has come to take a tougher line at Legislation. We certainly were impressed that Deputy Gavin St Pier, a member, did extremely well and Deputy Kuttelwascher, too, but we did, in fact, lose – by Housing and one or two other Committees – three of our Members at the election, the hard way, and there was a general view, perhaps, that the scrutinising committees

could do better.

3105 I very much would say that when I took over the Committee four years ago, I very much inherited a role that had been run by different advocates and Jurats and so on, and we ran it in a traditional way. I am very focused on the need for change and I welcome, indeed, the outcomes of the Mrs Belinda Crowe Report.

3110 I am not necessarily impressed by the way it was managed as a process, introduced during the election, and there are some factual points that I would question. For example, it makes no mention of the important role Legislation has in enacting Policy Council sanctions. Frequently, we have sanctions to enact against rogue nations or rogue individuals and we do that quickly, in an executive fashion. It also suggests that we spend a lot of time in pursuing part of our mandate – on page 32 of the book – to suggest to the Policy Council items which might require changes to Island legislation. We do *not* do that because we have not the resources to do that and, in my personal view, a law commission should be formed.

3115 I have seen many ways in which legislation could be improved, such as active consolidation of legislation, such as opening up the meetings to the public – which we actually agreed in Committee but did not get round to doing in the few weeks prior to the Election because the timetable changed – and I also would support the bringing in not just of *public sector* experts, as we have had presentations from the Director of Aviation, Income Tax, Social Security, but private sector experts in financial and other fields, and I believe, too, the Legislation Select Committee should be in a position to present to this Assembly, every month, (*Four-minute bell rang*) a summary of laws that we have had and how the changes are made.

3120 Another area that is very important is for Legislation to work closely with the other scrutinising committees to monitor where resolutions demanding legislation have occurred and have not been implemented, such as the referendum law and others.

3125 I am committed to moving the process forward. I think I have the experience, I have the parliamentary background and I think the evolving team at St James and the many changes in this particular Assembly will enable me to continue the work that I am doing and fulfil the change that I believe is essential for Legislation to really be a really focused parliamentary part of what we are doing. We are weak, as a legislature, we are strong on policy, (*Five-minute bell rang*) and I very much intend to make Legislation more important.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

3135 **Deputy Brouard:** Mr Bailiff, fellow Deputies, I am very pleased to propose Robert Jones as Chair of the Legislation Select Committee.

3140 We have the opportunity this afternoon to put in place a new, well qualified, fresh pair of professional eyes on a Committee that needs change. Deputy Jones is a qualified English solicitor and practised with two local firms from 2002 to 2008. In 2008, he took time off work, taking a sabbatical before entering the States. Having studied law at university and completed his solicitor's finals in 1994, he moved to Guernsey in 1995, making the Island his home.

3145 His career began when he took the role of trust and company administrator with Orbis Management Ltd, the fiduciary service arm of KPMG. By coincidence, Deputy Jones worked for four years with both Deputy St Pier and Deputy Soulsby, who were also elected Deputies in the last election, and Deputy Soulsby recalls he was a very good team player but he had much more hair then. (*Laughter*)

3150 Deputy Jones was finally able to complete his solicitor training with Wedlake Bell (Guernsey) between 1999 and 2002. At Wedlake Bell, his work covered all aspects of residential conveyancing and secured lending. He acted for individuals, both UK and international, trustees, companies and also advised on disposals and acquisition of freehold and leasehold properties in England and Wales. He also acted for major offshore lenders on secured lending in the UK.

3155 Moving to Carey Olsen in 2003, there Deputy Jones advised a variety of corporate and individual fiduciaries on all aspects of fiduciary law, in particular the creation of trust and similar structures, advising directors, trustees and administrators, advised in relation to the regulation of fiduciary business, advised in relation to charitable and non-charitable trusts. He was regularly instructed by high net worth individuals, global institutions and law firms to assist regarding Guernsey inheritance laws and creation of wills and administration of estates.

3160 During his sabbatical, he combined his role as supporting husband with study and completed an ICA Diploma in Compliance in 2010.

Deputy Jones now works part time with Hanois Management Ltd. Hanois is an independent, privately owned company providing fiduciary services to corporate high net worth individuals.

Deputy Jones is a member of the Guernsey International Legal Association and is currently



vice-president. He chairs the meetings in the absence of the president.

3165 We have the opportunity today to put one of those round pegs in a round hole. His legal background and commercial expertise could not be more suited to taking the Legislation Select Committee forward. He knows the role, he knows the law, he is used to working to very tight deadlines, and also working with quite complex issues, as relayed in his CV. I cannot think of anyone better than Deputy Jones, with his legal, his administrative and organisational skills. This is a once in a four-year opportunity and I urge the States Members to reflect on this very able and suitable candidate.

3170 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Robert Jones.

3175 **Deputy Robert Jones:** Thank you, sir.

I thank you, Deputy Brouard, and thank you, Deputy Soulsby, for your valued comments there.

3180 The independent review on the scrutiny committees by Belinda Crowe has given the States plenty to consider in terms of direction and effectiveness of those scrutiny committees over the coming years. The Legislation Committee is going to require a strong chairperson in order to ensure that that Committee operates more efficiently and demonstrates that the Committee adds genuine value to the Government. In particular, the Committee will be required to show that it is more than a proof-reading function and that legislation, as drafted, provides value-for-money outcomes for the benefit of the Island and its people.

3185 So how can the Committee satisfy States Members that draft legislation will deliver the outcomes it wants? It will require the Committee to take on board the need to develop a more strategic role, whereby it determines whether or not the legislation before it has due regard for the aspirations of the States Strategic Plan. It will need to shake off the perception that the legislative process lacks political ownership and oversight.

3190 As Chairman, I would seek to improve the reporting to States Members, especially when the States is provided with draft legislation to approve. This would include a marked up version of the draft legislation put before the States, showing the amendments proposed by the Committee during the scrutiny process; a clause-by-clause synopsis of the draft legislation – this, I believe is provided by the law officers at a later stage when the legislation is presented for approval to the Privy Council; we should also have more comprehensive minutes of the regular monthly meetings of the Committee. These small initiatives will enable the States Members to gain a better understanding of the impact and intentions of policies on legislation before them and to understand better the value added to the process by the Committee.

3200 Due to the wide range of draft legislation before the Committee, I would promote use of industry specialists during the scrutiny process. Their opinion would be invaluable and could only improve the effectiveness of scrutiny.

3205 Whilst there may be a call to improve the pace at which legislation moves through the current process, the Committee should be more robust and put legislation on hold when wanting more detailed explanation of the legislation before it. The Chairman should not be afraid to request further explanation on points he does not understand, before recommending draft legislation for the States' approval.

3210 So what is my experience and what skills would I bring to the role of Chairman? Gratefully, Deputy Brouard has covered most of this, but, in summary, I have worked in the Guernsey finance industry for over 17 years. I am a qualified UK solicitor, as you have heard, with Wedlake Bell and Carey Olsen. In order to maintain a work-life balance, my wife and I came to the decision that led me to becoming a supporting husband and, as you have heard, I have also qualified during that time with a diploma in compliance. I have the experience with sitting on the Guernsey International Legal Association, where I have chaired the meetings of that committee in the absence of the president.

3215 I make my decisions based on honesty and integrity, and this, together with my legal, administrative and organisational skills developed over these years, will benefit the role of Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee.

I hope I can rely on your support today.

3220 **The Bailiff:** Members, it is now for you to vote for a Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee.

I remind you there are two candidates: Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy De Lisle and seconded by Deputy Lester Queripel; and Deputy Robert Jones, proposed by Deputy Brouard and seconded by Deputy Soulsby.

3225

*A ballot took place.*

**The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

3230

*There was a five minute recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, I can announce the result of the vote for the Chairman of the Legislation Select Committee: Deputy Robert Jones, 26 votes; Deputy Gollop, 21.  
I declare Deputy Robert Jones elected. *(Applause)*

3235

## STATES ASSEMBLY AND CONSTITUTION COMMITTEE

3240

### Election of Chairman Deputy Fallaize elected

*Article XV.*

*The States are asked:-*

3245

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

3250

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article XV, election of a Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Hadley.

**Deputy Hadley:** I would like to nominate Deputy Lowe.

3255

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe proposed by Deputy Hadley and seconded by...  
Do we have a seconder? Deputy Brouard.

**Deputy Brouard:** Thank you, sir.

3260

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Do we have... Yes, Deputy Conder.

**Deputy Conder:** I propose Deputy Matt Fallaize.

3265

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize proposed by Deputy Conder and seconded by Deputy Le Lièvre.  
Thank you.

Do we have any other candidates for the post of Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee?

3270

No? Then there are two nominations: Deputy Lowe, proposed by Deputy Hadley, seconded by Deputy Brouard; and Deputy Fallaize, proposed by Deputy Conder, seconded by Deputy Le Lièvre.

Deputy Hadley.

3275

**Deputy Hadley:** Mr Bailiff, it gives me great pleasure to nominate Deputy Lowe, the Mother of the House and former Vice-Chairman of SACC, to nominate her to move her to take the chair of this important Committee.

3280

I will not repeat all of her qualities, which were so well enunciated by the Minister of Commerce and Employment when he nominated her as Minister of the Social Security Department. I think, however, that I will briefly remind Members that Deputy Lowe devised the recent successful induction programme, which is the first of her successes that you will have come across, and for many years advocated electronic voting and Island-wide voting. These two issues and the reform of Government will soon be important items presented by SACC.

With her long experience in this Assembly – longer than any other Member – Deputy Lowe

3285 has the experience and ability to lead the Committee when it presents its reports to the States.  
I urge you to vote for Deputy Lowe.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy Lowe.

3290 **Deputy Lowe:** Thank you, sir.  
I will thank Deputy Hadley and Deputy Brouard for proposing and seconding me.  
As has been said, really, sir, I think a lot was said this morning, so I am not going to bore  
Members by repeating all the background of myself here in the States.

3295 Yes, I have been the Vice-Chairman of SACC now for some time and have enjoyed myself on  
that Committee. It has been very rewarding being able to review the Rules of Procedure and the  
Constitution. There is some unfinished business to do and I would like to be able to complete that,  
if I was given that chance.

3300 But I am fully aware, as well, that we have the review of the machinery of government, which  
actually supported the Requête at the last term, and I would like to be part of that, as well, and  
bring that forward to the States for consideration. That will be a big report and a lot of people  
involved, because it is not just SACC, as the Chief Minister and, indeed, other Members from the  
Assembly as well will be part of that.

3305 I do believe, as well... I put on the hustings meetings for the Chief Minister. That is another  
initiative which I have now done twice. I would actually like to see that as part of the norm and  
part of the procedures which we could set through SACC for the States to consider.

3310 I also believe, sir, that the question-and-answer that was refused at the last States for Ministers,  
and indeed Chairmen, was rejected by the last States and I think today has been a prime example  
where some Members have actually said to me they wish that had not been refused by the old  
States because, actually, it would have been beneficial and we would have had up to 30 minutes to  
be able to question the Ministers, or the potential Ministers, before they were elected. So, again, I  
think that is something we could bring back.

3315 I know Deputy Fallaize is going to stand up, and I have worked very well with Deputy  
Fallaize, and he is going to be putting himself forward, but we have not always agreed. I am a  
great supporter of Island-wide voting; he did not support Island-wide voting. I am a huge  
supporter, as many will know, of simultaneous electronic voting and, indeed, Treasury and  
Resources backed it last time, but the majority of the States actually refused it. So, if I was given  
the job back as Chairman of SACC, those are two of the reports that would be back with you  
within certainly the next six months, or even before if I was able to do so.

3320 So there are some jobs I would like to carry on with and, indeed, implement some new ones –  
and indeed bring some reports back to you for your consideration. But I am also very conscious as  
well that perhaps not enough consultation was taken with States Members for some of the reports  
before we brought them, so I think the approach needs to be changed so that we will have more  
meetings with yourselves to see what *you* would like us to consider for amending rules and  
procedures, either adding or changing them in some way.

3325 I am a great believer in open government. I asked for open meetings at SACC and I was very  
pleased that we had open meetings at SACC and, indeed, the media were invited. I tried doing the  
same at Scrutiny and that was rejected at the time, but I think they do now have... the States report  
meetings, which the media can go to. I believe something like SACC and something like Scrutiny  
and some of these Department meetings, sub-groups, should be open to the public and it is a great  
3330 breath of fresh air to hear so many Members in here who want that accountability. They wanted  
the open voting for you all to see. It has already been mentioned today about... somebody said  
about simultaneous electronic voting. That was music to my ears. So I would like that opportunity  
to have the job of SACC to bring some of these reports back to you.

3335 I do not think I have actually got anything else that I wish to say, sir. I think my record goes  
before me. I leave it up to States Members. If they want to give me a job in this Assembly to do,  
that is one I would like to do, and I thank you for listening.

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy Conder to speak on behalf of Deputy Fallaize.

3340 **Deputy Conder:** Mr Bailiff, colleagues, I am delighted to propose Deputy Matt Fallaize for  
the chairmanship of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee.

I feel uniquely honoured to be making this nomination. Although I spoke against the proposals  
concerning the rule change which SACC brought to the Assembly last week, I also said, in that

3345 debate, that I knew that, as a member of SACC, Deputy Fallaize's actions were motivated by the  
 right reasons. I felt able to say that and still feel it now because I have got to know Deputy Fallaize  
 very well over the last four years and I really do believe that he is a man of integrity for whom  
 principle matters a great deal. Indeed, he is so committed to doing the right thing that this House  
 3350 might not today have had the opportunity to elect Deputy Fallaize to *any* senior position, simply  
 because he refused to canvass support for himself or even ask anyone to propose or second him for  
 any of the many high positions to which he could well be suited and upon which we vote today, or  
 have voted today. Instead, he has waited for others to approach *him*. This is a process about which  
 he has strong views. It says so much about his approach to public life.

3355 In considering Deputy Fallaize for the post of Chairman of the States Assembly and  
 Constitution Committee, we would all, I am sure, recognise that few, if any of us, have a greater  
 understanding of the workings of this Chamber. During his first four years in this House he has  
 assiduously developed a feel for the processing system of our government machinery and now  
 probably has a knowledge of the workings of this House that few others can match.

3360 During the previous States, he proposed or seconded more successful amendments and  
 Requête than any other Member, including motions which defeated the attempt to borrow £175  
 million externally and, instead, put into place a means of funding capital projects without  
 burdening future generations with debt. He safeguarded the principle of universal access to higher  
 education for local students and advanced the case of bowel cancer screening, which has now  
 successfully been introduced.

3365 However, it is his deep interest in, and understanding of, how our future machinery of  
 government could be developed that currently preoccupies Deputy Fallaize and for which he is  
 perhaps best known. In the last House, he was a Member of the States Assembly and Constitution  
 Committee, which pursued several reforms to strengthen openness and accountability in the  
 3370 decision-making of the States. During the last House, he was also Vice-Chairman of the Scrutiny  
 Committee and the need to improve scrutiny and, therefore, strengthen democratic accountability  
 is one of the main reasons that he became convinced that the Island needed to undertake another  
 major review of its machinery of government. During the last 12 months, the form of government  
 has become one of Deputy Fallaize's main areas of interest in politics. He led three parliamentary  
 committees in their work on good governance and presented 50 recommendations to improve the  
 3375 way the States operates.

But most germane to this House's deliberations was the Requête that Deputy Fallaize laid  
 before the final meeting of the last States, proposing that a fundamental review of the entire  
 machinery of government should commence immediately after the recent Election. The Requête,  
 which was endorsed by an overwhelming number of Deputies, was designed to strengthen the  
 3380 capacity for leadership and accountability in our system of government. Each was the catalyst for  
 establishing the States Review Committee which, later this year, will undertake the fundamental  
 review of our machinery of government, which so many of us in this House and outside so  
 urgently wish to see happen. Sir, the mere fact that this is now going to happen is, in no small  
 measure, due to Deputy Fallaize's enthusiasm, vision and sheer hard work, and if something truly  
 3385 positive (*Four-minute bell rang*) comes out of this review, we and future generations of Islanders  
 will be in his debt.

As Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee, Deputy Fallaize would have  
 a key role to play in the direction of the States Review Committee, and I can think of few people  
 better able to take such a lead.

3390 Sir, amongst the other things the mandate of SACC is to review and bring forward proposals  
 for the States of Deliberation to consider, including the constitution for the States of Deliberation  
 and the States of Election, the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, and the  
 constitution and operation of the States Departments and the States Committees.

3395 Sir, it is my privilege to propose Deputy Fallaize as Chairman of the States Assembly and  
 Constitution Committee. I can think of few of us better able to lead this important Committee over  
 the next four years.

Thank you.

3400 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

First of all, I thank Deputy Conder for his very generous words in proposing me, and Deputy  
 Le Lièvre for seconding me.

3405 I want to spend just a few minutes advising colleagues what, if elected, I would actually like to  
 do from the position of Chairman of the Committee.

3410 It is interesting that this new States, on its very first day in office, suddenly adopted two of SACC's proposals which the previous House had rejected: the rule regarding eligibility to stand for the office of Chief Minister; and open voting in the election of a Chief Minister. Today, at only its *second* sitting, the States has continued the pattern of turning the old SACC near misses into resounding hits by supporting the Bebb-Trott amendment and approving open voting in the election of all Ministers and Chairmen.

3415 So long as the next Committee is selective and does it wisely, I think there is scope to re-examine, perhaps, just one or two of the other proposals with which its predecessor Committee only just failed. I am thinking, in particular, of narrowly defeated recommendations to require Members to declare more of their outside interests and the equally narrowly defeated recommendations to provide Members with an opportunity, in the States, to ask questions of ministerial candidates in advance of having to vote for them. I agree with Deputy Lowe and think that the latter would have been very useful today and I would wish SACC to consider whether it might be able to propose a more palatable means of achieving that early in the life of this term.

3420 As Deputy Conder mentioned, I was chairman of a joint parliamentary committee's working party on governance. Our report, which was approved by the States almost in its entirety, contained around 20 recommendations for reform, which fall wholly or partly within the mandate of SACC. If elected Chairman, I would wish the Committee to pursue as many of them as our limited resources would allow. I am particularly committed to advancing proposals which would clarify the relationship between the different functions of the States as legislature and executive, strengthening the parliamentary role of the States, providing additional support and resources for Members, and improving the way in which the Assembly scrutinises departmental policy and legislation.

3430 Actually, I have to correct one thing that Deputy Lowe said when she spoke in support of her candidature, because I did vote in favour of a *form* of Island-wide voting, not complete Island-wide voting, but for – I think it was a third of – the States to be elected on an Island-wide mandate. However, I have to be honest and say that, if elected, I do *not* intend to propose to my Committee that it re-examines for the umpteenth time either Island-wide voting or electronic voting. However, I am fully aware of election pledges made by several successful candidates and, if directed by the States to re-open those debates, I would seek to ensure that the Committee did so objectively and with an open mind. I have to say, though, that my instinct is that, after so many years – decades, even – of seemingly unending debate, significant electoral reform might best be undertaken after a form of plebiscite.

3440 I do have a very keen interest in our machinery of government. It is my successful Requête which has set up the States Review Committee to review the roles and functions of the legislature and the executive, and it would be disingenuous of me to deny that I am seeking election as Chairman of SACC in part in order to sit on that Review Committee and contribute to leading meaningful reform of Government in this term of the States.

3445 Above all, I think the Chairman of SACC must defend and promote the parliamentary functions of the States. That is a significant task in our rather odd system, where the parliament and the executive are essentially one and the same thing and fused into the same body, the States of Deliberation, but it is a task to which I am committed and which I believe I can carry out.

3450 I think SACC did some good things in the last States, but I also recognise that some of what it did, and how it did it and how it and its leadership was, on occasion, perceived, did not always inspire the confidence of the Assembly. (*Four-minute bell rang*)

3455 It is a small Committee with only one member of staff but, nevertheless, has an important role to play and I fully understand that its status and credibility need to be enhanced. In that respect, I believe that SACC would benefit from a period of strong, coherent and focused leadership and, respectfully, I believe there is a reasonable prospect that I can at least offer that, especially at a time when, as seems quite possible, the other Members could all be entirely new to the Committee.

I hope Members will give consideration to supporting me as a candidate in this election.

3460 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, you must now vote for the position of Chairman of the States of Assembly and Constitution Committee.

You have two candidates: Deputy Lowe, proposed by Deputy Hadley and seconded by Deputy Brouard; and Deputy Fallaize, proposed by Deputy Conder and seconded by Deputy Le Lièvre.

*A ballot took place.*

3465 **The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

*There was a five minute recess to count the votes.*

3470 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States. The votes cast for Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee are as follows:  
Deputy Fallaize 36 votes, Deputy Lowe 11 votes.  
I declare Deputy Fallaize elected. (*Applause*).

3475

**Procedural**

3480 **The Bailiff:** Just before we move on, I think a few people are wondering whether we will finish today, but I will be proposing, when we get to 5.30 p.m. that we continue, I will not be proposing it yet but I will be proposing that we continue at 5.30 p.m. if we have not finished by that time to see if we can finish this evening.  
Greffier-

3485

**SCRUTINY COMMITTEE  
Election of Chairman  
Alderney Representative Arditti elected**

3490 *Article XIV.  
The States are asked:  
To elect a sitting Member of the States as Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

3495

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article XIV. Election of a Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Dorey.

3500

**Deputy Dorey:** I wish to propose Deputy Hadley.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Hadley.  
Do we have a seconder for Deputy Hadley? Deputy Adam, thank you.  
Any other candidates?

3505

**Deputy Brehaut:** Yes, I am proposing Deputy Sandra James, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy James proposed by Deputy Brehaut and seconded by... Deputy Bebb.  
Thank you.  
3510 And, Deputy Kuttelwascher, who are you are you proposing?

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** I am proposing Deputy Lester Queripel.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel, and do we have a seconder for Deputy Lester... Deputy O'Hara, thank you.  
3515 Any other candidates?

**Deputy Fallaize:** Sir, I am proposing Alderney Representative Paul Arditti.

3520

**The Bailiff:** Thank you. Deputy Fallaize proposing Alderney Representative Arditti.  
Seconded?

**Deputy Domaille:** I will be seconding that, sir.

3525

**The Bailiff:** Seconded by Deputy Domaille.  
Anyone else?

**Deputy De Lisle:** Deputy John Gollop, sir.

3530 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle proposing Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Quin:** I will second him, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Seconded by Deputy Quin.

3535 Anyone else? No, well, we have five candidates then. Deputy Hadley proposed by Deputy Dorey, seconded by Deputy Adam; Deputy James proposed by Deputy Brehaut, seconded by Deputy Bebb; Deputy Lester Queripel proposed by Deputy Kuttelwascher seconded by Deputy O'Hara; Alderney representative Arditti, proposed by Deputy Fallaize, seconded by Deputy Domaille; and Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy De Lisle, seconded by Deputy Quin.

3540 I suggest we take them in that order.

So, Deputy Dorey, to speak on behalf of Deputy Hadley.

**Deputy Dorey:** Thank you Mr Bailiff.

It is a pleasure to propose Deputy Hadley for the post of Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee.

3545 Deputy Hadley graduated in Pharmacy from the University of Aston and worked for a year in the Birmingham General Hospital. He has an interesting, entrepreneurial CV. He was a retail pharmacist for many years. He has also worked for several other businesses and owned them. He has served on several different committees concerning pharmacy. He founded a computer company, which has developed a unique system for supplying patient information leaflets to thousands of pharmacies, including Tesco and United Co-op and others.

3550 Deputy Hadley has always had a strong interest in politics for many years and he was a town councillor, a district councillor, a mayor, a parliamentary candidate and a Member of the Health Authority and a Member of the West Midland Advisory Committee on Health Promotion. In the last Assembly he was a Member of the HSSD Board and the Scrutiny Committee. He served at 3555 two different periods on the HSSD Board.

I have not served on any Departments with Deputy Hadley so, in order to gain a better understanding of his skills, I have spoken to a number of Members who have served with him on Departments and Committees. These are some of the comments I received about him:

3560 'He is a man of integrity, he is knowledgeable, inquisitive, a man who will not be swayed by the crowd. He is not interested in a quick win, his desire to understand, to research and to evidence a decision is a key strength that ultimately leads to well-informed, balanced decision making'.

3565 He has immense tenacity, as Members of the last Assembly will recall, whether it was to do with the wheelchair strategy, the housing licence issue, the planning system, there is no doubt that his involvement has added value in the long-term. Members who were in the last Assembly will recall he frequently asked questions at Question Time.

3570 Arriving at a consensus in a committee of nine people can be difficult but Deputy Hadley's input was always valuable, concise, focused and, importantly – listened to. He has a toughened mind that investigates and follows through until he has an answer. He is like a terrier; he will seek out the appropriate person until he gets his question fully answered. He asks questions up front, not behind somebody's back. He is a good orator.

These are impressive skills which illustrate why, I believe, he is an ideal candidate for Scrutiny Chairman.

3575 As Deputy Hadley has been a Deputy for four years and a Member of Scrutiny for four years, he fully understands the Committee and he knows his way around Departments. He will definitely be able to hit the ground running.

I conclude by saying Deputy Hadley would make an *excellent* Chairman of Scrutiny Committee. The combination of his experience on the Committee, his business skills, his leadership skills from business, I think will make him that ideal candidate. So please vote for him.

3580 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy Hadley.

**Deputy Hadley:** Mr Bailiff, I would first like to thank Deputy Dorey and Deputy Adam for proposing me and seconding me for this post.

3585 Many will be aware that I was often seen as a thorn in the side of Deputy Adam when I was first a Member of the board of the Health and Social Services Department, so to have *his* endorsement is particularly appreciated.

3590 The electorate demanded change when it elected 20 new Members to this Assembly. The electorate were convinced that the Government wasted money, prevaricated in its decision making and to have changed its mind on some issues. Perhaps a different scrutiny process could have helped avoid some of these issues.

The current mandate of the Scrutiny Committee includes:

3595 ‘determining the effectiveness of the policies of... Departments and Committees, assessing the performance of Departments and Committees and identifying areas of policy or service delivery that might be inadequately or inappropriately addressed. Determining how well a new policy, service or project has been implemented, including the development process and whether the desired outcomes were achieved  
3600 and promoting changes in policies and services where the evidence persuades the Committee that these require amendment.’

Clearly, the Scrutiny Committee has failed to deliver its mandate.

3605 Belinda Crowe, a senior civil servant from the UK, reviewed the Scrutiny Committee last year. She describes scrutiny in Guernsey as ineffective. Serving as a Member of Scrutiny, I was concerned that it was too focused on producing evidence based reports and less on holding the Executive to account, as required by its mandate. It had been set up as a critical friend and was too concerned with being a ‘friend’.

3610 The report suggest that these shortcomings could be addressed by holding more public hearings so that the public feel properly engaged and so that Ministers have an opportunity to present their views and explain their performance. The report recommended that the Scrutiny Committee should have a clearly defined and timely process for routine review and monitoring of each Department. It said that each Department should be reviewed at least once in the lifetime of a Parliament and that we should start with the Departments that have the largest budgets.

3615 The report also made recommendations for a much more radical overhaul of the scrutiny process, bringing all three Scrutiny Committees together and bringing in expertise from outside the Assembly. I support this view and, if elected, would liaise with the Chairs of the other Committees to see if we can achieve a consensus to move forward and ask the Assembly to carry out the recommendations.

3620 As many of you know, I have not been afraid to put my head above the parapet. In the past four years I have challenged the authority of the Board of the Health and Social Services Department. I have identified inadequate use of existing housing law. I challenged the Department over patient safety. I have identified areas where money was wasted, notably on the wasteful provision of unused nursery places by the Health and Social Services Department. I have also identified, it said, an area where service delivery was *totally* inadequate – bringing a Requête to demand a dedicated wheelchair service – which was eventually implemented.

3625 In the Assembly I have asked questions of almost all Departments and, indeed, the Chief Minister as well, calling Ministers and the Chief Minister to explain for, and explain, their policies. One civil servant said that I was a natural scrutineer and I am the only candidate in this election with experience on the Committee.

3630 The last Scrutiny Committee was unanimous in the view that adequate resources were not provided for effective scrutiny of the States. So, Mr Bailiff, if elected to chair the Committee, (*Four-minute bell rang*) I would seek to achieve a real change in the way the Committee works by urging full implementation of the Belinda Crowe Report. I believe that if resources are increased, which *does* mean spending more money on scrutiny, the States will recover many times this in increased efficiency and cutting waste. This really would be spending to save. However, if this money is not forthcoming I would seek to improve the work of the Committee within existing resources and ask Members of the Assembly to vote for me.

3640 **The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Brehaut will speak on behalf of Deputy James.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you, sir.

3645 I am delighted to propose Deputy Sandra James MBE, I am assuming that means modest, balanced and exceptional, as the new Chair of the Scrutiny Committee. Obviously, as the outgoing Chairman, I care about the Committee, its future, its future progress, and, indeed, the scrutiny process itself. So I certainly would not be proposing anyone for that role unless I really felt that they could make a good fist of it.

For my part, I will certainly have less separation anxiety if the role was taken on by Deputy James. Maybe to some Members Deputy James may be a bit of a dark horse but her background is really very impressive. For many years she was a Senior Nurse taking on a diverse range of



3650 management roles within our Health and Social Care Services. In all of those roles she has quickly gained a reputation as a no nonsense, intelligent, innovative and practical team leader who delivers on objectives.

3655 Perhaps even more impressive has been her contribution to the UK's largest professional body of nurses, the Royal College of Nursing (RCN). Amazingly for someone from a tiny community like Guernsey, remote from the traditional centres of power, she was elected by her peers to chair that national governing body. This accolade gave huge kudos to Guernsey. She has had to guide the RCN through its responses to a range of radical health and social care reforms under successive governments. We are all familiar with that process and it cannot be easy for the people engaged in the nature of that process. Once again, in this role she has shown herself to be a strong and challenging individual, but tempered with the common sense not to oppose everything for the sake of opposition. She can work with other people, including those with a different point of view, to make sure that the best possible outcomes are achieved. Surely that is just what we want for the Chair of Scrutiny. We do not want a 'yes man or woman' who is worried about upsetting Ministers or the Policy Council, but nor do we want a disruptive personality determined to undermine Departments.

3660 Done well, scrutiny should be about constructive engagement, pointing out the potential weaknesses in policy and encouraging actions to make improvements. That is not only true of the day-to-day work of Scrutiny and its regular investigations but also in response to the proposed reform of the scrutiny process itself. I am sure that Deputy James would approach the exercise with an open mind, but also determined not to allow Scrutiny to be emasculated.

3670 What about the ability of the new States' Member to chair a Committee of nine Deputies effectively? Well, it can be problematic at times, believe me – heavy emphasis. But who better than someone who has chaired an organisation such as the RCN, who has engage with Ministers and other high level decision makers over issues which raise strong, very strong, emotions from time to time.

3675 The Scrutiny process is certainly not set in stone and we have heard from Deputy Hadley and others today that it will change. Deputy James would not be hindered by that prospect, rather she would embrace change in order to deliver the very best for the community. In fact, in her profession change and change management is a recurring theme. I believe Deputy James is ready to meet the challenges that change brings and also the challenges that the role will bring in Scrutiny itself.

3680 Finally, at the risk of being accused of being sexist, perhaps, I would point out that Deputy James is one of the few women Members. I certainly do not propose her for that reason alone, but because I think she is the best person for the job, but I do think that it would be a fortunate bonus (*Four-minute bell rang*) that by choosing the best person for the job we would be putting at least one, if not more women, in leadership roles.

Thank you Sir.

3690 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
Deputy James

**Deputy James:** Mr Bailiff, I would like to thank Deputy Brehaut and Deputy Bebb.

3695 One should always have some degree of trepidation when you are asked by Barry Brehaut to nominate you for anything, so thank you very much. (*Laughter*).

3700 As you have already heard, during my professional career I have been privileged to have tackled many diverse challenges. Initially, however, I would like to lay out before you why I believe I can take on this important role, make a difference and progress the work required. My 35 years as an accredited staff representative enabled me to gain and develop a range of investigative, analytical and representative skills. I believe these skills in particular are an *essential* requirement for effective functioning of the scrutiny process.

Sir, I am mindful of the American novelist Thomas Pynchon who said

'If they can get you asking the wrong questions, then you don't have to worry about the right answers.'

3705 This wise quote is a fundamental premise during any interview or investigative process. I see the position of chair requiring tact and diplomacy and high levels of honesty, integrity and the essential need for confidentiality. These traits I believe I have demonstrated in my dealings at senior organisational level.

3710 My four year period chairing the Royal College of Nursing Council taught me the need to hit the floor running. I discovered no time for hesitation or indecision, research and preparation is the

key. This experience very quickly honed and developed my chairing and leadership skills. It assisted me in developing my skill-set and ability in encouraging and ensuring I achieved full member engagement during committee discussions. I have chaired and participated in numerous conferences, workshops, study days and educational events – locally, nationally and internationally.

3715

I would now like to turn to my contribution and impact throughout my professional career here in Guernsey. I came to Guernsey to take up a Ward Sister's post in acute psychiatry, initially for one year and that was 35 years ago. After a number of years in that role I was asked to undertake additional training and qualifications in community psychiatry. At that time community psychiatry was, in fact, a revolutionary new concept for Guernsey. I was seconded to Manchester University and, on my return, set up Guernsey's first Community Psychiatric Nursing Service. This enabled me to introduce a number of revolutionary new services; the creation of medication outpatient clinics, social activities for people with chronic mental health conditions and progressing employment opportunities for service users and initiating direct referrals from family practitioners.

3720

3725

I was then appointed as Guernsey's first Alcohol and Drug Clinical Nurse Specialist. At that time the Insurance Corporation of the Channel Islands had launched their very first bursary. I applied and was successful. This bursary enabled me to research treatment centres both in the UK and the USA. I also launched a regular treatment programme and counselling sessions for (*Four-minute bell rang*) those in prison and introduced home detoxification programmes, thus reducing hospital admissions. A number of years later, after firmly established in that service, I was appointed as Acute Services Manager. The remit of this role was quite broad encompassing acute psychiatric in-patients, community homes, eight patient clinics and day services.

3730

During the final years of my career I was asked to undertake a number of projects, including community multi-disciplinary teams, reviewing nurses pay and conditions of employment, reviewing the homeless services in Guernsey and then, lastly delivering safeguarding vulnerable adults. I continue to lecture periodically on advocacy, equality, diversity and duty of care and safeguarding issues.

3735

Many of you on this Assembly stood on a ticket of openness and transparency. Scrutiny is the Committee to ensure we collectively progress that election promise.

3740

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher now to speak on behalf of Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Thank you, sir.

I have known Deputy Lester Queripel for some years and he has now achieved political recognition. He is a St Peter Port douzenier. He has done his political homework and has often been present in the public gallery of this Assembly. His letters often appeared in the *Guernsey Press*. I do not doubt his integrity and honesty and his genuine intent to serve the people of Guernsey.

3745

His wish to be elected as the Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee is a bold step, especially since there is such a strong field of candidates. He has great enthusiasm for the scrutiny process, a necessary prerequisite. He does ask questions. He does not ask them with a wagging finger or a raised voice or with a heads-must-roll type of approach because he knows how damaging that may be. He will ask questions that have a constructive element to them. He is not afraid to ask awkward questions and will persist until a satisfactory answer is forthcoming.

3750

He is very familiar with the mandate of the Scrutiny Committee and has a vision to not only scrutinise delivery of public services by all Departments but also to identify gaps or weaknesses in existing policy. This pro-active approach could identify and correct problems before they become major issues.

3755

In summary, his enthusiasm, questioning persistence and vision make him an ideal candidate for the Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee and Members could support him with confidence.

3760

Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Queripel:** Thank you Sir.

I would like to thank Deputy Kuttelwascher for proposing me and Deputy O'Hara for seconding the nomination.

3765

Knocking on doors on the campaign trail for the recent Election, it was made perfectly clear that the people of Guernsey are *demanding* accountability. They are *demanding* transparency, and they are *demanding* answers. They want to know who and they want to know why and, like many of you, I am right behind them on this one.

3770

3775 However, the bad news is that this Assembly will never attain real accountability or transparency under the current regime. Now, why do I say that? I say it because the Scrutiny Committee does not have the authority to open all the doors that the people of Guernsey are demanding be opened. Now that sets alarm bells ringing in *my* head. I find myself asking the *obvious* question – what is the point of setting up a Committee to investigate procedures and then putting limitations on their powers of investigation? It does not make sense.

The mandate of the Committee is as follows:

3780 ‘To examine whether policy development and ongoing delivery is appropriate and effective. Also, the Committee *must* ensure that Departments are accountable.

3785 I want to focus for a moment on the part that claims the ‘role of the Committee is to examine whether service delivery is effective’ because this clearly is not happening. If it was, we would not be reading statements such as the one found on page 12, section 3 of the Mulkerrin Report on Education. I will quote that statement just to remind you all what it actually said.

3790 ‘In Guernsey I consider that data is not used effectively. All too often it appears to be left in filing cabinets and not shared with staff.’

3795 Now that is a perfect example of a Department *not* delivering services effectively. If that was allowed to happen in Education, how do we know that it is not happening in other Departments? Well, the answer is we don’t. And whose job is it to establish whether or not it *is* happening? Well it is the job of the Scrutiny Committee, of course – but the trouble is they do not have the power to open all the doors and find out if it *is* actually happening. If they did, Mr Mulkerrin would not have found that data hidden away in filing cabinets in the first place.

3800 What was allowed to happen in Education must never be allowed to happen in any States Department ever again. Now you and I have the perfect opportunity (*Four-minute bell rang*) to lay the foundation stone for a new dawn in local politics. The people of Guernsey elected us in good faith. They put their trust in us. We have the opportunity to actually deliver the accountability and transparency that Guernsey people deserve.

3805 I would consider it a privilege to be the head of the team that finally delivers real accountability and real transparency to the good people of Guernsey, and I ask that you seriously consider giving me your vote.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize now to speak on behalf of Alderney Representative Arditti.

3810 **Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

My candidate, Mr Arditti, is an international lawyer, a gifted orator, a man of significant relevant experience and intellect and, in my view and his, a very natural and committed scrutineer.

3815 In a moment, I will expand upon his background and skills but, first, I want to confront the matter of Alderney. Alderney representatives are, of course, full Members of the States of Deliberation. They can, and do, sit on States Departments and Committees and I can ensure colleagues that Mr Arditti has the time and the enthusiasm for this role. I actually think that, irrespective of geographical considerations, Mr Arditti is an outstanding candidate for the Chairmanship of the Scrutiny Committee but, nonetheless, his status as an Alderney representative will be a huge additional advantage to scrutiny because it will allow him to remain slightly removed, and therefore more independent, from the day-to-day political events which invariably come to affect all Guernsey-based People’s Deputies.

3820 For 27 years Mr Arditti was a partner of a worldwide practice based in the City of London, with offices in seven other cities in Europe and the Far East. He was then a consultant locally to Collas Day until 2010. Today he is a Legal Adviser to the Chief Pleas of Sark, a role which one might reasonably suppose occasionally brings him into conflict with a couple of not all together co-operative neighbours: good preparation, perhaps, for leading a Committee charged with scrutinising and holding to account not always fully willing States’ Departments.

3825 Mr Arditti’s expertise is litigation and the avoidance of litigation. He has extensive experience of negotiation, the collection and assimilation of evidence, asking probing questions and good governance – all of which are central to the leadership of the Scrutiny Committee.

3830 If I was a Minister of a States’ Department and I was voting for a chairman of a committee whose purpose was to scrutinise my actions and decisions, and those of my Department, I can think of very few people I would wish to avoid voting for as much as Mr Arditti. I would know of his reputation for determined, forensic analysis and scrutiny. I would know of his persistence in

3835 holding to account those who have erred. I would know of his fierce intellect and independent  
mind and I would know of his experience cross-examining and searching for evidence. Would you  
fancy being called as a Minister to a public hearing of scrutiny, knowing that such a man would be  
3840 sitting on across the other side of the table chairing the meeting and the committee in front of  
which you were about to appear? And with respect to our newly elected Ministers, I want to make  
a particularly strong appeal for Members who are not Ministers to vote for Mr Arditti because I  
have a sneaking suspicion that his prospects at this election may largely be in your hands.

3845 Seriously though, Scrutiny is likely only to become more important in the States. The  
Committee needs a powerful, articulate advocate to develop and promote its status and credibility  
and my candidate will be an outstanding champion for Scrutiny. It is difficult to conceive of any  
candidate better suited to any role than Mr Arditti is to that of Chairman of the Scrutiny  
Committee.

3850 Finally, and on a lighter note, sir, I want to say something about money. It is said that a man  
may as well open an oyster without a knife as a lawyer's mouth without a fee. (*Laughter*).  
However, this is a rare, perhaps unique occasion because today I am able to commend the services  
of a lawyer on the grounds of actually saving money – a bizarre consequence of the new States'  
3855 Members Remuneration Scheme, agreed by the last Assembly, is that an Alderney representative  
elected to chair a committee is due the additional sum of around £4,000 per year but a Guernsey  
People's Deputy elected to chair a committee is due the additional sum of around £5,500 per year.  
(*Four-minute bell rang*) I should stress that it is a mere coincidence that this particular People's  
3860 Deputy makes that point, having himself only just been elected to chair a committee, but Members  
will, I am sure, wish to bear in mind that by electing Mr Arditti we can recruit for our Scrutiny  
Committee all of his drive, enthusiasm and intelligence, his immense skills and his vast experience  
and make a saving of £6,000 over a four year period! So I am delighted to put forward a quite  
exceptional candidate at truly bargain basement prices (*Laughter*) and I ask the States to place  
their confidence in Mr Arditti's outstanding background and skills and his vision for a robust,  
resilient, respected and reforming Scrutiny Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Alderney Representative Arditti.

3865 **Alderney Representative Arditti:** Thank you, sir.

I will start if I may by thanking Deputies Matt Fallaize and Roger Domaille for their  
nominations. They have served, respectively, as Vice Chairman and Chief Officer of the Scrutiny  
Committee and I am greatly encouraged that they, with their experience and insight of this  
Committee, thought to approach me about standing for the Chair.

3870 This is the job I hoped for, but I felt that it would not be appropriate to ask for it or to lobby  
fellow Members in any way. I believe that Scrutiny, being a Parliamentary Committee, its Chair  
must be parliamentarian first and politician second. He or she must earn the respect and trust of the  
Assembly across the *whole* political spectrum as being neutral – removed from any political  
infighting and not beholden to any group or faction. Therefore, it was important, in my view, to  
3875 wait to be asked. The 24 Deputies who have come to know me in this Assembly know that I am  
attracted to evidence-based argument, as my training dictates, and that this is the *only* basis on  
which they can count on my support.

3880 Inevitably, it is easier for me as an Alderney representative to avoid some of the pressures of  
political life in Guernsey. Living in Alderney helps me to remain detached from political loyalties  
and allegiances, although I value *highly* the warm friendship which I have enjoyed with *every*  
Member of *every* political creed in the last Assembly and I sincerely hope that I will earn the  
friendship of the new Members, too, during the life of this Assembly.

3885 In order to reinforce the political neutrality of the Chair of Scrutiny in the eyes of the  
Assembly and the public, I intend to forsake any other appointment. If elected, I shall not accept  
appointment to any political board. However, for the avoidance of doubt, I do *not* suggest that  
other Deputies who may consider sitting as Members of the Scrutiny Committee should adopt the  
same stance as the Chair. We need the *best* Deputies to sit on this Committee and I anticipate that  
they will want other jobs as well. Nor would I remain entirely celibate – that is, outside of my  
work on Scrutiny. If elected, I would, of course, continue to participate and vote in open debate  
and I would continue to argue the case for Alderney to the very best of my ability.

3890 I have said before that I see scrutiny as the *oxygen* of good governance, of accountability,  
transparency, due process. You suffered my speech on this topic last Tuesday and I shall not ask  
you to indulge me again. Suffice it to say that, in my view, Scrutiny is the means whereby the new  
Assembly can endeavour to deliver the good governance which the electorate is calling for. It is  
perhaps also worth repeating that good governance is something that I know something about. As

3895 a lawyer, good governance and the art of scrutiny has featured largely in my international law  
 practice in various guises and in various parts of the world over a period of some 40 years. It is  
 one of those subjects where you never stop learning. My interest in, and enthusiasm for, scrutiny  
 remains undiminished and I am keen to go on learning subtleties and exploring its intricacies in  
 the service of the Assembly. I confess that I have read Belinda Crowe's Report from cover to  
 3900 cover – twice.

I am not daunted by the prospect of chairing Scrutiny hearings in public and taking oral  
 evidence from Ministers, Chief Officers and other expert and factual witnesses. The Scrutiny  
 Committee, like any other parliamentary committee, is the creature of the Assembly. It is the  
 Assembly in committee working for, and on behalf of, the Assembly. *(Four-minute bell rang)*  
 3905 Scrutiny necessarily reflects, or should reflect, the will of the Assembly.

The next Chairman of Scrutiny has an important task to perform. The expectations of the  
 electorate are running high and it is my belief that it is time for the Assembly to take Scrutiny a  
 step forward with the benefit of the route map provided in the Crowe report. At the same time, I  
 3910 am a firm believer in finding the 'Guernsey solution', doing these things the Guernsey way,  
 because we are a unique jurisdiction and because we are ideally placed to pick and choose the best  
 when we import ideas from outside.

In short, I believe that the Chair of Scrutiny is a good job for a lawyer, a good job for someone  
 who is knowledgeable about scrutiny and enthusiastic to learn more – both the theory and the  
 practice and a good job at this time for someone from Alderney. For these reasons, if elected, I am  
 3915 ready to commit myself fully to the job, including bringing to the Assembly proposals for taking  
 scrutiny up a gear.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy De Lisle will propose Deputy Gollop.  
 Deputy De Lisle.

3920

**Deputy De Lisle:** Sir, it is a pleasure to recommend Deputy Gollop for Chairman of Scrutiny.

Scrutiny as a Chairman is very hard work: it requires a lot of enthusiasm and Deputy Gollop is  
 well versed, enthusiastic and a hard worker. He has an enquiring mind and he is well-read, and all  
 those are attributes for this particular position. He also always provides a very ready body of  
 3925 information, surrounding any policy area, and has a wealth of knowledge on many issues, areas  
 and trends. His years of working on ten States Committees and Departments will serve the  
 position very well.

Deputy Gollop has qualities also of communication and engagement, second-to-none, qualities  
 very pertinent for the Chairman of Scrutiny. He has the ability also to recognise critical areas for  
 3930 Scrutiny investigation and search out a way forward on a plethora of policy issues.

Members I commend Deputy Gollop to you for Chairman of Scrutiny.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

3935

**Deputy Gollop:** Thank you very much, sir, and to Deputy De Lisle, my proposer, and Deputy  
 Quin, my seconder.

Mentioning the experience that I have had in the States over 15 years – I am on the fifth term. I  
 have sat for many years on the Traffic, Heritage, Arts, Broadcasting, Overseas Aid, House –  
 3940 before it was known as SACC – States Strategic Planning Team, Housing, Culture and Leisure,  
 Legislation as both Chairman and Board Member, Vice-Chairman of PERRC and, indeed, on the  
 Youth Service Group, as well. It is a long list and, as I have said, I have sat on Scrutiny and I paid  
 a particular role in the public hearings relating to the Environment Planning Department, the  
 Shepley Report and Disruptive Children with Special Needs.

Let us go to the more interesting parts now. With the Scrutiny Committee mandate it makes it  
 clear that it is about determining the effectiveness of the policies and services provided by  
 Departments and Committees. We need to step up a gear on that and I would call for regular,  
 annual hearings with each Minister to be held in public. We need to assess the performance of  
 Departments and Committees in implementing policies and services, with a programme of regular  
 3945 reviews, both of the Departments generally and specific areas; identifying areas of policy or  
 service delivery that might be inadequately or inappropriately addressed; identifying new areas of  
 policy or service delivery that may require implementation – we achieved a bit of that with  
 Vandalism and working towards open planning meetings, but I believe there is a lot more Scrutiny  
 can do with an Assembly fully behind that; promoting changes in policies and services, where  
 evidence persuades the Committee that these require amendment – I believe that already we have  
 3955 the power to acquire most evidence we need and perhaps the Committee, collectively, has not been

asking the right questions; and holding reviews into such issues and matters of public importance that the Committee may determine from time to time. I think the Crowe Report and, indeed, the mood of the Chamber is that we should hold those meetings very regularly in public and in concert with Public Accounts.

3960 My policies will be to create a separate parliamentary office that would employ scrutinising staff; that we would integrate what we do with Public Accounts Committee and Legislation and perhaps SACC; that we would look at topics relating to the economy, taxation and environment, and not just social policies, where I think we have been overly focused on; and that the hearings will be very much about being a critical friend, holding collective Policy Council cross-

3965 departmental policies to account and have a public hearing.

Now, I mention that I have had eight years on the Committee and I served as Chairman of Legislation, but maybe I was a square peg in a round hole in one respect, because that particular role, which is legalistic, required somebody in a corner, almost, reading, reading and reading reams of legislation – maybe even 500 pages. I think I am more of a public person than that, I am

3970 more of an extrovert.

I listened carefully to the good remarks Deputy Andy Le Lièvre made earlier but I think I have overcome a lot of the disabilities that I may have. I may have bipolar, ADHD, all kinds of things as well as that, but who has the best attendance record, in the States – or one of the best? *Me*.

3975 Who has answered the most questions on the floor of this Chamber for Ministers? *Me*.

Who has the most generalistic knowledge of the 10 States Departments? *Me. (Four-minute bell rang)*

Who has effectively worked on legislation for eight years and on Scrutiny? *Myself*.

3980 Who has communicated very frequently with all media, not just radio, but television and the press? *Me*.

Who has had a political column in a newspaper for five years and, indeed was known as the Sarnia Sage on radio? *Me*.

Who has Facebook and Twitter sites – I know strictly it is a Facebook site – and is perhaps ahead of the game of electronic communication? *Me*.

3985 So, I think, when I looked at all the positions, although I had applied for other jobs, I am the best fit for Scrutiny, I am the parliamentarian with the longest experience, and I think I have the most knowledge for this particular role, and would also communicate effectively with the States and the public in presenting States' reports.

So I would urge you to vote for me on this occasion. *(Applause)*

3990 **The Bailiff:** Hon. Members, I remind you there are five candidates for the position of Chairman of the Scrutiny Committee.

There is Deputy Hadley, proposed by Deputy Dorey, seconded by Deputy Adam; there is Deputy James, proposed by Deputy Brehaut, seconded by Deputy Bebb; Deputy Lester Queripel, proposed by Deputy Kuttelwascher, seconded by Deputy O'Hara; Alderney Representative

3995 Arditti, proposed by Deputy Fallaize, seconded by Deputy Domaille; and Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy De Lisle, seconded by Deputy Quin.

*A ballot took place.*

4000 **The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

*There was a six minute recess to count the votes.*

4005 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the result of the vote for the election of a Chairman of Scrutiny Committee is as follows:

Alderney Representative Arditti, 27 votes; Deputy James, 9 votes; Deputy Hadley, 6 votes; Deputy Gollop, 3 votes; and Deputy Lester Queripel, 2 votes.

I declare Alderney Representative Arditti elected. *(Applause)*

4010

## PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE

4015 **Election of Chairman**  
**Deputy Soulsby elected**

*Article XIII.*

*The States are asked:-*

4020 *To elect a sitting Member of the States as Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

**The Deputy Greffier:** Article XIII, election of a Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee.

4025 **The Bailiff:** Do we have any nominations?

**Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I wish to nominate Deputy Soulsby, please.

4030 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby, proposed by Deputy St Pier and seconded by?

**Deputy O'Hara:** And I am very, very glad to second.

4035 **The Bailiff:** By Deputy O'Hara.  
Any other candidates?

**Deputy Gollop:** I want to propose Deputy Lester Queripel.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel is proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by?

4040 **Deputy De Lisle:** I will second that, sir – Deputy De Lisle.

**The Bailiff:** By Deputy De Lisle.  
Thank you, Deputy De Lisle.

4045 **Deputy Luxon:** I propose Deputy Martin Storey.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Storey proposed by Deputy Luxon and seconded by?

4050 **Deputy David Jones:** By Deputy Jones.

**The Bailiff:** By Deputy David Jones.

**Deputy Domaille:** I would like to propose Deputy Peter Gillson, sir.

4055 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Gillson proposed by Deputy Domaille and –

**Deputy Fallaize:** And seconded by Deputy Fallaize.

4060 **The Bailiff:** – seconded by Deputy Fallaize.  
Any other candidates?

Members of States, we have four candidates: Deputy Soulsby, proposed by Deputy St Pier, seconded by Deputy O'Hara; Deputy Lester Queripel, proposed by Deputy Gollop, seconded by Deputy De Lisle; Deputy Storey, proposed by Deputy Luxon, seconded by Deputy David Jones; and Deputy Gillson, proposed by Deputy Domaille and seconded by Deputy Fallaize.

4065 We have gone beyond 5.30 p.m. I can propose that the meeting continues beyond 5.30. I do so. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

4070 **The Bailiff:** We will continue.

I propose we take the nominations in the order in which I read them out, so Deputy St Pier to propose Deputy Soulsby.

4075 **Deputy St Pier:** Mr Bailiff, tenacity: if there is a single adjective to describe the skill set needed for the Public Accounts Committee to *properly* discharge its scrutiny mandate, 'tenacity' would be it. If there is a single adjective to describe Deputy Soulsby, 'tenacity' would be it.

I have known Deputy Soulsby for 22 years and have worked with her for about half that time.

4080 Having read Geography at King's College, London, she qualified as a chartered accountant with BDO. She then transferred to KPMG, where our paths first crossed. Like Deputy Jones – in fact, probably like both Deputy Joneses – I had more hair then!

At KPMG, she was responsible for developing a centralised accounting function and standard *pro forma* accounts. She became a director of KPMG's Trust Company in 1995.

4085 Sir, following the acquisition of KPMG's trust business in 2000 by Kleinwort Benson, Deputy Soulsby became head of operations for the combined fiduciary business, and she was then responsible for a team of 60 across Guernsey and Jersey, managing the business's IT, accounting and finance needs. She re-designed the functions to meet the needs of a different business model.

Our paths crossed again in 2004, when Deputy Soulsby joined Walbrook Group as project director, responsible for implementing a new practice management system, a project which she delivered on time and on budget.

4090 Deputy Soulsby then joined Carey Olsen as Chief Operating Officer, responsible for all support services across that firm's three locations in Guernsey, Jersey and London. During her tenure, she delivered significant operational efficiencies and cost savings through improved internal procedures and contract negotiations. Deputy Soulsby left Carey Olsen to help her husband grow their successful local retail business, Mondomundi.

4095 So you will see from Deputy Soulsby's business career to date that she has had considerable experience of delivering business change and improvement through rigorous focus on process. This makes her the ideal candidate, as poacher-turned-gamekeeper, to provide proper scrutiny, ensuring that States' bodies operate to the highest standards in the management of their affairs.

4100 Throughout her election campaign, Deputy Soulsby maintained a laser-like focus on accountability. It therefore came as no surprise to me whatsoever that she was so keen to ensure this role has the high profile it deserves and needs.

4105 Sir, having known her for so long, it is a considerable honour for me to be able to nominate her for this position. My only reticence in doing so is the knowledge that, if appointed, she will not be available to join and provide wise counsel to the Treasury and Resources Board. However, this is tempered by the knowledge that she will be in a position to hold my, and other Ministers' feet, to the fire of good scrutiny – and I may very well come to regret that statement.

4110 I mentioned Deputy Soulsby's attribute of tenacity at the outset. I know that anyone appearing before PAC will experience this if they fail to give clear, unequivocal responses and evidence, so I have no hesitation whatsoever in commending to the Assembly Deputy Soulsby's election as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, and I would very much encourage Members to vote for her.

Thank you.

4115 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby.

**Deputy Soulsby:** Thank you, sir.

I would like to thank Deputy St Pier for his eloquent speech and Deputy O'Hara for seconding me for this post.

4120 The Public Accounts Committee has long been considered a Cinderella role, and so, at this late hour, I will be brief to ensure we do not all turn into pumpkins.

On a more serious note, I feel honoured and privileged to be standing before you here today. That so many people put their trust in me is humbling, but it has also driven me to seek a position where I think I can make a positive difference.

4125 What I heard on the doorstep during my campaign mirrored the central theme of my manifesto: the need for more accountable and transparent government. Many of us here today heard the same and share the belief that now is the time to do something about it. How do we achieve this? As I said throughout my campaign, we need a stronger and more cohesive scrutiny function. The Public Accounts and Scrutiny Committees need to work together in a timely and efficient manner and add value through being a positive force for change. Indeed, if I am elected, I would want to see these Committees merged. If that means I lose my position, so be it. If I may be the second to use Deputy Le Tocq's phrase today, this is about public service, not self service.

4130 For too long, these Committees have been seen as an irritant, whereas they should be a cornerstone of good government. The Public Accounts Committee has a key role in ensuring that the public can be satisfied the taxes and charges they pay are collected efficiently and fairly and are spent wisely. These are going to be a difficult four years and we have to show we are getting value for money like never before.

4135 It has become clear to me – from speaking to previous Committee Members, from reading the recent independent reports on the Committee functions, and from listening to those who elected us



– that the current system is not fit for purpose.

4140 The Report into Financial Scrutiny by Jim Brooks Consulting, published earlier this year, says for scrutiny to be effective the following principles need to be adhered to: openness and honesty, integrity, sound processes and good practice. However, we can only adhere to these principles if Departments and Committees work together and not against each other, and that we do what is best for Guernsey as a whole and not us as individuals.

4145 As Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, I want it to be proactive, not reactive. The phrase ‘a critical friend’ has been used. To me, this means no finger-wagging exercise months after the event. As the saying goes, when a man points a finger at someone else, he should remember that four of his fingers are pointing at himself. Instead, like a good teacher, we should highlight good practice, as well as areas that can be improved and provide recommendations on what those improvements could be.

As Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, I want to see it reviewing progress towards the objectives set out in the States Strategic Plan, and ensuring resources to meet those objectives are allocated appropriately.

4155 As Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, I would not be commissioning three external reports a year at £70,000 a pop. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) That is not value for money. We should have skilled people within the team who can work with the Departments as and when required.

4160 As I said at the beginning, a strong scrutiny function produces good government that has the trust of the people. For us to get there, a major shake-up and strong leadership is required. You will see, from my CV, that I have tackled many challenging roles in the past. As Deputy St Pier says, I am tenacious, but I also listen and learn. I am a straight talker, but also a lateral thinker, (*Four-minute bell rings*) and I think all these skills will need to be employed in this role.

I hope you will vote for me as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee and allow me to help you bring the positive change that we all want.

4165 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.

Next, Deputy Gollop to propose Deputy Lester Queripel.

4170 **Deputy Gollop:** I think the Assembly already knows many of Deputy Lester Queripel’s interests in questioning and asking questions both how and why and who. But what perhaps we do not realise is that Deputy Lester Queripel has spent a lot of time, over quite a number of years, in acquainting himself with political knowledge. He not only was a candidate four years ago and a successful one now, but he has attended WEA courses on how the States works and, most significantly, has made a considerable contribution to the economic seminars that the WEA hold.

4175 For about nine weeks each winter, top business leaders from the Financial Services Commission, from States Departments, from banks and businesses put forward their views, and Deputy Queripel has questioned them quite significantly, even questioning the underlying assumptions behind their viewpoints.

4180 Deputy Queripel has had an interesting past, too. In the 1970s, Deputy Queripel was the manager of the largest record store in London, Our Price, employing 21 staff. He was not only responsible for the daily duties of the staff, but he was solely responsible for ordering the hundreds of thousands of records the store sold every year, and that was at a time when top pop records sold two million copies. He was under constant pressure to make a profit, and he delivered.

4185 Reel the tape forward now: for the last 28 years, he has been the proprietor and lead figure of a successful co-operative working in the construction industry with four partners. Once again, his role was not merely to balance the books, but to actually make a profit for the co-operative. As the proprietor, he is the one who meets clients and has to adhere to strict financial and time schedules, provide the estimates for contracts and carry out the book work upon completion of all the co-operative’s contracts. Indeed, he has developed a significant knowledge of book-keeping and those kinds of processes. If things should go wrong, he not only has answer to clients and be accountable, but also to his four partners. So, once again, it is a high-pressure position. He is used to working in the context of a team of nine members.

4195 Being a great believer in diversification, he also operates a popular sound equipment hire business which, indeed, has been a fact of Guernsey music life. He has worked as a complementary therapist and treats people all over the Island. He combines, therefore, social skills and economic skills and he has the management skills, people skills and financial skills to make a real contribution to the Public Accounts Committee, the ability to be a team player and to lead. He is, in fact, well known as a leader of the poetry section of Guernsey, has performed at the Guernsey Eisteddfod and has achieved a lot of plaudits for his published books.

His campaign slogan in the recent Election was ‘Let’s work together’ and I know him well

4200 enough to know he is sincere in that intention. Indeed, the mantra of moving the scrutiny process forward is about working together, about using our competitive advantages, and I ask that you give him your vote.

4205 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

I thank Deputy Gollop for his kind words and Deputy Le Lisle for seconding the nomination.

4210 The mandate of the Public Accounts Committee is to determine the economic efficiency and effectiveness of States' expenditure, revenue and assets. To carry out that mandate means that PAC have to constantly ask questions of all States' Departments and, in order for them to do their job properly, answers to those questions should *have* to be forthcoming. However, the bad news is Departments are *not obliged* to answer questions put to them by PAC, which is why, under the current system, we as a Government will never achieve the kind of value-for-money services the people of Guernsey deserve.

4215 Do I have any proof of that? Well, yes, I have, actually: I have a *Press* cutting. (*Laughter*) If it's in the *Press*, it's got to be true! (*Laughter*) (**A Deputy:** Not even the obituaries are!) (*Laughter*)

4220 All of you will come to realise, during the next four years, that I always do my homework. In this *Press* cutting, it is reported that Treasury and Resources failed to answer questions put to them by PAC regarding the financial transformation programme.:

'PAC stated that the problems they encountered were caused by the fact that the Committee don't have the right to access information that they need to complete their investigations.'

4225 So there we have the proof. This Assembly will *never* be able to achieve the value-for-money services that the people of Guernsey deserve because the very Committee that was set up to investigate value for money is handicapped by legislation. They cannot *possibly* carry out the job they have been mandated to do. If we are really going to attain value for money and not just pay lip service to the words, then surely some of this legislation has to be removed.

4230 In difficult economic times, taxpayers have a right to know where every penny of their money is going, and in the next four years the Public Accounts Committee is going to play a crucial role in ensuring that every Department is delivering value for money, but to be able to do that it is absolutely crucial that the Committee are allowed to ask probing and awkward questions. Yes, I accept that these questions might make certain Departments uncomfortable, but how else are we going to achieve the real value-for-money services that the people of Guernsey deserve?

4235 We do not have a God-given right to waste money. It is not ours. It belongs to the people. (*Four-minute bell rang*) So every Department *has* to place a new focus on efficiency savings from now on. I myself have identified several areas where efficiency savings can be made, and I suspect there are several more.

4240 The Public Accounts Committee could be a real lifesaver in years to come and I would consider it a privilege to be the Chairman of such an influential Committee. I ask that you would seriously consider giving me your vote.

Thank you.

4245 **The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Luxon to speak on behalf of Deputy Storey.

**Deputy Luxon:** Sir, I wish to propose Deputy Martin Storey as Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee. I believe he is a credible, competent and worthy candidate to represent this Assembly's interest in this important financial scrutiny function.

4250 On a personal basis, Deputy Storey is very well qualified to take on this position, having graduated as a Bachelor of Science with Honours, followed by appointments to numerous senior roles with a variety of national and international companies. He has years of appropriate experience. He is also a Fellow of the Association of Corporate Treasurers and was one of the first cohorts to successfully complete the IoD Diploma in Company Direction. Latterly, he has acted as a corporate consultant both in Guernsey and the UK. He has a very broad professional expertise, developed over many years, coupled with extensive senior board experience. He has had responsibility for long-term corporate planning, together with negotiating and monitoring achievement of budgets and furtherance of strategic plans.

4260 Sir, as Chairman of PAC, Deputy Storey would be very well placed to lead this parliamentary Committee in the scrutiny of States' assets. His previous corporate governance experience lends

4265 itself well to enable him to direct this nine-person Committee and to ensure it rigorously fulfils its mandate. His competencies will ensure that full accountability, integrity, transparency and rationality will be appropriately applied in oversight across all bodies within the States of Guernsey. His technical, Treasury and risk management knowledge has been acquired throughout his long and successful career.

4270 Deputy Storey's political experience is wide and varied, having served in the last term on both the Commerce and Employment Board and PAC itself, which already provides him with meaningful and direct experience of the Chairman role. During this time, he willingly took responsibility in the following areas: he chaired the Intellectual Property Steering Group; chaired the Air Route Licensing Panel; member of the Dairy Board; member of the OUR Audit and Risk Committee; co-author of the Good Governance Report; chaired the Risk Management Work Party; member of the MSG Review Work Party; and many others.

4275 Sir, I believe PAC has suffered over the last two terms from a lack of decisive leadership, as well as inadequate support and advice. However, I have no doubt Deputy Storey has the skills, experience and maturity to critically analyse and scrutinise the key data within our Government system, and also the relevant board experience to successfully chair the PAC Committee. He will act independently of all States' Departments and the Policy Council itself. I believe he is the right person to restore this Assembly's confidence in PAC and to ensure that PAC, in its role as critical friend, makes a significant contribution to the States' performance over this next term. I commend  
4280 his candidature for this important role.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Storey.

4285 **Deputy Storey:** Thank you, sir.

Fellow Deputies, firstly, may I thank my proposer, Deputy Paul Luxon, for his fine words, and my seconder, Deputy Dave Jones, for the confidence they have shown in me and for their encouragement.

4290 Sir, I have decided to stand for the post of Chairman of PAC because I believe that, with my knowledge and experience, gained both in business and in this Assembly, I can best serve the States and the Community in this particular role. I have no political affiliations or any potential conflicts of interest with respect to finance, administration or legal businesses on the Island.

4295 Deputy Luxon has given you some detail about my qualifications and experience. You might ask what is the difference between a Treasurer – what I used to be – and an accountant. I liken it to travelling in a car. The accountant looks out of the rear window, recording diligently what has happened, whereas the Treasurer is focused on what lies ahead in order to steer the car safely to its destination and ensure that it has adequate resources.

4300 As for my previous term in the States, it appears that I have gained somewhat of a reputation from my dealings with the former T & R board and amongst some civil servants for having a 'forensic brain', as it was put, and with Policy Council for playing hardball when necessary. But I am also prepared to speak positively when appropriate, as when I presented my report on investigations into the investment management of States' Funds – that is the States Pension Fund and the Social Security Funds. In Commerce and Employment, as Chairman of the Intellectual Property Steering Group, I pushed, as it felt to me, treacle uphill to produce legislation on image rights and brought the report to this House – evidence, I hope, of my determination to get things  
4305 done.

We have recently had two reports regarding scrutiny matters, one from Jim Brooks on financial scrutiny and one from Belinda Crowe on the overall structure of the States' scrutiny process, involving PAC, Scrutiny and Legislation Select Committees.

4310 I believe, sir, I am uniquely qualified to contribute towards achieving a workable new structure for overall scrutiny which will be cost effective and delivers what taxpayers want because I have been a member of PAC and Scrutiny Committees in the past and a member of a departmental board.

4315 Sir, there are ravenous economies out there which are casting envious eyes at us. It is vital that we get our house in order. We cannot afford political manoeuvring which just avoids the problems facing us. Proper financial scrutiny will assist in this process.

Now, sir, I would like to say a few things about what I want to do.

4320 *My agenda for PAC:* first of all, monitoring progress in delivering FTP savings, to ensure the SSP is adhered to and publishing periodic reports on progress.

Secondly, monitoring delivery of new services that have been agreed over the last three years as part of the States' Strategic Plan, to ensure outcomes are in line with the business plan, that

money granted has been spent on the services specified and that the taxpayer has had value for money: that is, the outcomes have achieved the KPIs.

4325 Thirdly, the budget for financial scrutiny will continue to be constrained. I believe the taxpayer will get more value for money by PAC undertaking a greater number of small investigations, rather than fewer in-depth projects. Previous projects have taken six to nine months for completion, with consequent loss of opportunity for savings.

4330 Fourthly, I would hope to be able to have public hearings (*Four-minute bell rang*) to increase public awareness of the work of both PAC and States' Departments.

Fifthly, I hope that PAC will be able to work closely with – and possibly together on some projects – with Internal Audit. Combining the resources of these two bodies would make a formidable investigative unit. We are already proposing to work together on the follow up to the recent PAC-sponsored report on risk management to produce a States'-wide policy and policy for risk management.

4335 Sixthly, I expect PAC to routinely monitor all Departments and States' bodies, to ensure cost-effective operation and compliance with the States' Strategic Plan.

4340 Accountability to the electorate is at the heart of democratic government. To achieve this accountability, it is imperative that communication with the electorate regarding scrutiny is from an independent and impartial source. In this regard, I believe the Chairman of PAC has a significant influence on the subjects chosen for investigation and thus, in my opinion, it is important that he is not a member of any departmental board. (*Five-minute bell rang*)

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Domaille, the proposer of Deputy Gillson.

4345 **Deputy Domaille:** Thank you, sir.

I am pleased to propose Deputy Peter Gillson as Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee.

4350 Peter is a Guernseyman and has spent his working life in finance, within public administration and the private sector. He has a thorough understanding of the importance of good governance... and he is the ideal candidate for this important post.

4355 Peter began his working life in 1978 at Barclays Bank and, between 1979 and 1990, he worked for the States of Guernsey in a variety of roles, culminating in his employment as finance manager to the then Board of Health. In 1990 he joined Guernsey International Fund Managers Ltd. As deputy manager, he helped to develop, manage and expand the private equity department, making it, by the time he left, the largest administrator of private equity funds in the Channel Islands. He was also responsible for corporate sectoral governance. In 1998 he co-founded International Private Equity Services Ltd., building the company from a start-up workforce of him and his business partner to a company employing 130 people, between three offices in Guernsey, Jersey and London. Prior to its sale in 2008, the total committed capital under administration amounted to some €30 billion! A key element of the company's success was ensuring good corporate governance.

4360 Peter is an active man and was Constable for St Sampson's between 2004 and 2008 and has been a Deputy since 2008. In his role as a Deputy, Peter was a member of Commerce and Employment and sat on several sub-groups, including Business Guernsey, the Finance Sector Group, the Lifelong Learning Committee, the Apprenticeship and Youth Employment Committee and the Construction Sector. He was also a member of the Environmental Policy Group, a member of the Strategic Land Planning Group, a non-voting member of the Waste Disposal Authority and a member of the Solid Waste Consultation Review Panel. He is Chairman of the Board of Governors of the Ladies College.

4370 In February 2011 he joined the Health and Social Services Department, where he was elected Deputy Minister and, as part of his duties, was made a member of the Health and Social Services Department's Site Development Project Board, the Funding of Long term Care Working Party and was elected Chairman of the Electronic Health and Social Care Record Board.

4375 Peter is an Associate of the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators. Incidentally, so is my daughter, so I am well aware of the high level of training and skills required to be a Chartered Secretary. I quote from the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators' website:

4380 'Chartered Secretaries are high-ranking professionals with a broad base of skills unique among the professions, trained in law, finance, accounting, strategy and governance. Chartered Secretaries provide a focal point for independent advice and guidance on the conduct of business, governance and compliance. They are key players, with the skills, vision and values to take their organisations and clients forward. Chartered Secretaries understand that good governance is fundamental to good business decision-making and organisational performance.'

4385 Through its influence with the Government and regulators and the work of its members, ICOSA leads in shaping the Government's agenda and promoting the best practice essential for organisational performance.

Mr Bailiff, Members of this Assembly, the Public Accounts Committee is all about *good* governance and how the States goes about its business. As a former Chief Officer of Scrutiny, I know that Deputy Peter Gillson's background, training and professional abilities make him the right man for the job. I ask for Members to vote for his election as Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee. *(Four-minute bell rang)*.

Thank you, sir.

4395 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Gillson.

**Deputy Gillson:** Sir, First, I would like to thank Deputies Domaille and Fallaize for their nomination and the kind words from Deputy Domaille, who outlined my varied experience – experience which I think is very relevant to the role of Chairman of PAC.

4400 Not wanting to repeat what he has said, I will concentrate on my view of PAC within our Government, and it is probably good to start by explaining what I think PAC is not. It is not about blame, it is not about pointing fingers or trying to catch Departments out. The phrase used over and over again is 'good governance'. To ensure that good governance is real, is effective, and that we are not just paying lip service, there has to be a review process to provide comfort and assurance where we *are* operating at a good standard and, where we are falling short, for those areas to be identified and corrective action taken. PAC provides this feedback, which is essential if Government is to learn, develop and improve.

4405 Reviewing how cost effective services are is only *part* of the role. Equally important is for PAC to ensure that Departments are working within the Strategic Plan. With the development of the Strategic Plan we have moved to a co-ordinated approach to policy and service development, where parameters and direction are agreed. The scrutiny process is an essential part of this process, both the Scrutiny Committee and PAC. PAC provides the financial review of what has been done, how effectively it has been done, how efficiently it has been done and how it fits into the strategic direction of the States.

4415 The importance of PAC is not just internal. The work of PAC should also provide comfort to the public, that there are areas – lots of areas – where Departments are performing efficiently. Throughout Europe we are seeing more and more scrutiny of government finances. Guernsey is an international finance centre. Part of our international reputation is based on having a well-managed and stable economy. Being able to demonstrate that our own finances are well managed is a key part of maintaining this reputation.

4420 So what of the future of PAC? This is not a criticism of the people who have been involved but it is unfortunate that the scrutiny process in the States is not held in high regard. I have had concerns about this for some time, which is why I have had a number of long conversations with Belinda Crowe. I agree with a lot of what is in her, and Jim Brooks', Reports: however, I do not have time now to detail them.

4425 PAC is an essential and central part of Government, not an add-on. It has to be for politicians to implement, it *has* to be the stimulus for improving performance.

4430 Its findings must be applied across the whole of the States, not just the area being reviewed and must be seen in a positive way by all Departments, so the results can be used to raise standards across all the States. This will be difficult because there are times when reports *will* be critical, sometimes very critical of Departments. Therefore, it is important that reports are produced in a timeframe where they can make a difference, that any criticism is fair, that they concentrate on adding value, that they include positive, constructive suggestions to improve performance, that they also focus on the bigger picture, the linked SSP. In short, PAC reports *can* be critical, but they *must* be constructive. As it is often said, a critical friend.

4435 In summary, sir, I think I have the experience to chair PAC, the business experience, organisational experience and political experience – and the professional training, which is needed in the role of Chairman of PAC. We have the opportunity to develop a positive, *(Four-minute bell rang)* constructive role for PAC and I have the time to devote to develop that role.

4440 If elected Chairman of PAC, the only other seat I intend to stand for is a place on Scrutiny. I will *not* stand for membership of any other Department. This will give me the time and, more importantly, the independence to fill the demands of the role.

I hope I can have Members' support.

Thank you.

4445 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States are reminded there are four candidates for the position of Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, Deputy Soulsby, proposed by Deputy St Pier, seconded by Deputy O'Hara; Deputy Lester Queripel, proposed by Deputy Gollop, seconded by Deputy de Lisle; Deputy Storey, proposed by Deputy Luxon, seconded by Deputy David Jones; and Deputy Gillson, proposed by Deputy Domaille and seconded by Deputy Fallaize.

4450

*A first ballot took place.*

**The Bailiff:** The votes will now be taken to be counted.

4455

*There was a six minute recess to count the votes.*

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the result of the vote for Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee is as follows: Deputy Soulsby, 20 votes; Deputy Gillson, 18 votes; Deputy Storey, 6 votes; and Deputy Lester Queripel 3 votes.

4460

There will, therefore, need to be a further round of voting, with three candidates, Deputy Soulsby, Deputy Gillson and Deputy Storey. Deputy Lester Queripel is eliminated.

*A second ballot took place.*

4465

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Greffier, I understand the two Alderney representatives had to leave. I do not know if they had a chance to vote in this round of voting.

Deputy Trott?

4470

**Deputy Trott:** No, sir, they were extremely reluctant to leave, but with the Airport being closed, the only mode of transport was a boat, which would wait no longer. So they did ask that we advise them of the result but, unfortunately, they will not be able to cast a vote in the second round.

4475

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
So there will only be 45 votes this time.

**Deputy Trott:** Yes, sir.

4480

**The Bailiff:** Thank you.  
The votes will now be taken to be counted.

*There was a five minute recess to count the votes.*

4485

**The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the result of the second ballot for the election of a Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee is: Deputy Soulsby, 25 votes; Deputy Gillson, 16 votes; Deputy Storey, 4 votes.

I declare Deputy Soulsby elected. *(Applause)*

Members of the States, that concludes the business for today.

Sorry – Deputy Fallaize?

4490

**Deputy Fallaize:** Yes, sir, I was going to suggest, sir – and I spoke to you about this earlier – that, rather than reconvening on Friday for the election of Members, that we reconvene on Monday, because there was a week between the nominations opening for Chief Minister and the election and also a week between the Chief Minister's election and the election of Ministers. We are going to have to elect 64 Members when we are next here and tomorrow is Liberation Day, so there will only be one working day for, effectively, all the Members on the floor of the Assembly to position themselves for whichever seats they wish to fill.

4495

So, I would be grateful, sir, if you would ask the States if they would be prepared to reconvene on Monday instead.

4500

**The Bailiff:** Mr Procureur, do you wish to comment?

**The Procureur:** Well, far be it from me to say that the Rules are the Rules – *(Laughter and applause) (Interjection)* so I will not!

4505

But the Rules are the servants of the Assembly and, if you were minded to put such a

proposition and the majority of Members agreed with it, it would seem democratic that, (**The Bailiff:** Yes.) despite the publications and everybody knows what is supposed to happen, that we do change it – so I would suggest that you might like to put it.

4510 Certainly, I would suggest we do not have any debate about it –

**The Bailiff:** Although, of course, there are two Members now absent, who –

4515 **Deputy Adam:** I should just like to point out now – because, as you say, Rules are Rules – the meeting is Friday. I am going to a funeral in Scotland on Saturday. I have booked my tickets because, obviously, the meetings were over and I will not be back until Tuesday, late Tuesday afternoon.

**The Bailiff:** Yes.  
4520 So Deputy O’Hara.

**Deputy O’Hara:** If we do not finish the business on Friday, is it possible that we can come in on Monday morning?

4525 **The Bailiff:** Monday morning is allocated as the spill-over day, if we do not conclude on Friday.

I think if everybody had been present, then perhaps we could have resolved not to sit on Friday but, with two people absent, there is no provision under the Rules to adjourn a meeting before it has been formally convened.

4530 **The Procureur:** And the other thing is once the meeting is convened on Friday, then it will, of course, be open for Members to adjourn any particular –

4535 **The Bailiff:** Yes, so it might be that we might be able to deal with some or all of the Departments, for example, unless some of the Committee chairmen are still trying to populate their Committees, then that could be adjourned, either to the following Monday or to the end of the month, which, I believe, is what happened –

**The Procureur:** It could, sir, yes.

4540 **The Bailiff:** – eight years ago. So I do not put it?  
Right, in that case, we will close this meeting and will resume with a fresh meeting on Friday.

4545 **THE GRACE**  
*The Deputy Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 6.33 p.m.*