



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF DELIBERATION

OF THE

ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

HANSARD

Royal Court House, Guernsey, Friday, 14th December 2012

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Guernsey website www.gov.gg*

Volume 1, No. 16

ISSN 2049-8284

*Published by Her Majesty's Greffier, The Royal Court House,
St Peter Port, GY1 2PB. © States of Guernsey, 2012*

Present:

Richard J. Collas, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer

Law Officers

H.E. Roberts Esq., Q.C. (H.M. Procureur)

People's Deputies

St. Peter Port South

Deputies P. A. Harwood, J. Kuttelwascher, B. L. Brehaut,
R. Domaille, A. H. Langlois, R. A. Jones

St. Peter Port North

Deputies M. K. Le Clerc, J. A. B. Gollop, P. A. Sherbourne,
R. Conder, M. J. Storey, E. G. Bebb, L. C. Queripel

St. Sampson

Deputies G. A. St Pier, K. A. Stewart, P. L. Gillson,
P. R. Le Pelley, L. S. Trott

The Vale

Deputies M. J. Fallaize, D. B. Jones, L. B. Queripel,
M. M. Lowe, A. R. Le Lièvre, A. Spruce, G. M. Collins

The Castel

Deputies D. J. Duquemin, C. J. Green, M. H. Dorey,
B. J. E. Paint, S. A. James, M.B.E., A. H. Adam

The West

Deputies R. A. Perrot, A. H. Brouard, A. M. Wilkie,
D. de G. De Lisle, Y. Burford, D. A. Inglis

The South-East

Deputies H. J. R. Soulsby, R. W. Sillars, P. A. Luxon,
M. G. O'Hara, F. W. Quin, M. P. J. Hadley

Representatives of the Island of Alderney

Alderney Representative E. P. Arditti

The Clerk to the States of Deliberation

D. J. Robilliard, Esq. (H.M. Deputy Greffier)

Absent at the Evocation

Miss M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller)

Deputy G. A. St Pier (*absent de l'Île*)

Deputy S. J. Ogier (*indisposé*)

Deputy J. P. Le Tocq (*relevé à 09h.58*)

Alderney Representative B. N. Kelly (*absent de l'Île*)

Business transacted

Evocation	965
Obituary: In memory of Roy Henry Videlo, former H M Greffier	965
Billet d'État XXVIII	
II. Health and Social Services Department – Authorised revenue expenditure – Increased budget for 2012 agreed	965
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.13 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 11.44 a.m.</i>	
Billet d'État XXVIII	
I. Health and Social Services Department – Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members – Debate adjourned	982
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.46 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 11.57 a.m.</i>	
Billet d'État XXVIII	
I. Health and Social Services Department – Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members – Debate resumed – Proposition 1 not proceeded with ...	983
I. Health and Social Services Department – Election of Minister – Deputy Dorey elected	983
Procedural	987
Tribute to Deputy Adam for his work as Minister	988
Procedural	988
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.27 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3.30 p.m.</i>	
Billet d'État XXVIII	
I. Health and Social Services Department – Election of four Members – Deputies E G Bebb, B L Brehaut, S A James, MBE, and M J Storey elected	988
Thanks to Deputy Adam for work as Minister of HSSD	989
Thanks to Alderney Representative Kelly for parliamentary service	989
Good wishes for Christmas and the New Year	990

The Assembly adjourned at 3.33 p.m.

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Deliberation

The States met at 9.30 a.m.

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Deputy Greffier

EVOCATION

The Bailiff: I have been advised that Alderney Representative Kelly is stuck in Alderney because of cross-winds. (*Laughter*)

5 **Deputy Luxon:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

OBITUARY

10 **In memory of Roy Henry Videlo,
former H M Greffier**

The Deputy Greffier: Debate continues on Billet d'État XXVIII, Article II, Health and Social Services Department, Increased Authorised Budget for 2012.

15 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, before we resume debate, it is my sad duty to inform you that Roy Henry Videlo has passed away.

Roy Videlo was Her Majesty's Greffier from 29th November 1958 until 31st July 1981, when he was succeeded by Ken Tough. Those who knew him will remember him with fondness and affection. He served both the Royal Court and, most particularly, the States of Deliberation as its Clerk, with diligence and hard work and all the duty that one would expect of a Greffier.

20 Sadly he passed away, I believe, in the last day or so. So we send our condolences to his widow and to his family and may I ask that you just stand in his memory.

25 *Members stood in silence.*

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

30

Billet d'État XXVIII

35

HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

**Authorised Revenue Expenditure
Increased budget for 2012, agreed**

The Bailiff: We will resume debate on the Report from the Health and Social Services

40 Department on their Increase in Authorised Budget for 2012.
Deputy Kuttelwascher.

Deputy Kuttelwascher: Sir, just a few words.

45 In spite of the fact that there have been several negative comments, not just about T & R or its
Minister and, indeed, some members of staff, I do not propose to answer those. I do not think it
would serve any useful purpose whatsoever at this time because, at the end of the day, this debate,
although one may have difficulty in remembering, is purely about sanctioning the £2½ million to
HSSD for their budget and the Treasury and Resources Department recommends, advises, that this
Assembly accept it.

50 Unfortunately, this seems to have turned into a Vote of Confidence debate, so I wonder if
Members could just remind themselves, we are here to vote purely on this one issue.
Thank you, sir.

55 **The Bailiff:** Deputy James, you indicated yesterday that you wished to speak.

Deputy James: Thank you, sir.

Mindful of Deputy Kuttelwascher's comments, I certainly intend to focus my comments on
that very issue that you have just highlighted.

60 Yesterday we heard quite a lot about peaks and troughs. Well, that is the nature of the business,
that is what it is about, and that is why you have very highly skilled, very highly qualified, ward
sisters and ward managers that organise duty rosters.

My primary focus in my comments this morning will be directed at the particular overspends
on agency nurses, vacancies and sickness. It is an area that, as you may imagine, I feel very
confident and competent to talk on.

65 If you do a quick tot up on some of these expenditures – for example, surgical services at the
PE, medical wards, elderly mentally ill – a quick tot up of those figures will show you there is an
approximate £1 million and it is for vacancies, sickness etc.

70 Why is there such a huge level of vacancies across our Health and Social Services? A number
of years ago, I was asked to project manage a new job evaluation scheme for nurses, midwives and
health visitors in Guernsey. I had great delight in accepting that. It was a two-year project and it
involved undertaking job evaluations of almost a thousand nurses and so every job was evaluated
– a very interesting and challenging experience. The whole of the NHS in the UK went through it.
As a result of that job evaluation scheme, one of the conditions attached to it, one of the issues that
were negotiated in the UK, was quite a significant increase in nurses' annual leave – much
75 deserved, I might add. But with that, not surprisingly, that left huge gaps at ward level and various
other departments that needed covering. Despite warnings at the time by nursing organisations, not
least the Royal College of Nursing, which said you would desperately need to increase your
establishment to cover the wards, the current situation is, at the moment – and many managers will
tell you – that at the end of the annual leave year, there is a hell of a scrabble to get everyone to get
80 their annual leave in. So that has not been addressed and that is a real, major problem. This is why
we are seeing numerous amounts of nursing vacancies.

Is it then so surprising that we see the levels of sickness that we do amongst nurses? They are
not a sick service, they are not a sick profession. I think what they are is they are sick of being
asked to do extra shifts, overtime and working time in lieu. That is the reality and I think the
85 Members of this Assembly have to understand that this particular situation is not necessarily at the
door of the current Board, but is a long-standing time bomb with a very long fuse.

We all knew that we would arrive at this situation sooner or later, so I would suggest that that
is a major area of focus, and I mention that, particularly, in view of what Deputy Fallaize said
yesterday. As another cliché: let us look at how we got there. This is one of the main reasons. This
90 overspend, a big proportion of it – just do your sums – is down to agency nurses.

That brings me on to vacancies. Deputy Brehaut, yesterday, did allude to the fact, why do we
have the level of vacancies that we do? He did suggest that there was a national shortage and, to a
certain extent, I would agree with Deputy Brehaut: there *is* a shortage of certain specialties.

95 Last September, I was invited as a guest speaker, a keynote speaker, at a conference in Paisley.
The invite came from a gentleman called Prof. Austyn Snowden, who used to be a nurse here in
Guernsey. He moved on, and he is now Professor of Mental Health at Paisley University. I have
met him over the years at various conferences and he had often said he would invite me. He
invited me to this end of degree celebratory conference, at which there were 200 mental health
nurses.

100 Prior to me going to Scotland, he asked me, he begged me, to take details of the nursing
vacancies that Guernsey had. He also asked me if I would contact Jersey, because *many* of those
newly qualified nurses, who had just undertaken a four-year degree, were desperate for jobs. So I
105 contacted our HR Department here and I was told that the HSSD had just funded a recruitment
drive to Scotland and they had recruited as many nurses as they could – and those ‘many nurses’
totalled six.

The reason that they could only employ six mental health nurses was because they did not have
sufficient registered nurses that were qualified mentors. Newly qualified nurses have to have an
appropriate qualified mentor and some of the agency nurses that the HSSD were employing were
110 those very mentors. So having got a quick fix, a quick money saver, they sent nurses back to the
UK. So that leaves us in an even bigger mess.

So from all those 200 newly qualified nurses, I could not give them details or entice them to
come to Guernsey. There is a national shortage on certain specialties, but we are not getting our
recruitment drives right.

115 Another thing on why we have so many vacancies – why do you think? Nurses are paid a
derisory amount for the amount of work they do. When you look at other comparable jobs in
Guernsey, I do not see vacancies at chief officer level, I do not see loads of vacancies at director
level. We need to address – and it is not just pay... One of the *big* issues for nurses in Guernsey is
accommodation. Long gone are the days where your average newly qualified nurse was a 21-year-
120 old single female – very easy to accommodate in Guernsey many years ago. That is very different
now, very different indeed.

The average age of a student nurse in the United Kingdom now is mid-30s, most of whom have
got families and it is *so* difficult to bring them over to Guernsey and get them relocated. If they
were on salaries of £50,000, £60,000, £70,000, so that they could purchase properties, then you
might have a standing chance.

125 There is no quick fix to this particular situation. I am just flagging up the reality that Guernsey
has got to get its head around, to deal with the level of vacancies because, otherwise, if we do not
tackle it, we will see this sort of over-expenditure year on year on year.

So I do suggest and I plead with Health and Social Services to undertake a robust, meaningful
and effective recruitment campaign. I went home last night and I logged on, went on to Google,
130 nursing vacancies in Guernsey. How many do you think I found, even on HSSD’s own website –
four vacancies advertised – national site, four vacancies. I do not feel that that is robustly tackling
this major problem.

I said that I would only focus on the nursing vacancies, but that accounts for a huge amount of
this overspend. So I *plead* with the Health and Social Services, please look about tackling nursing
135 vacancies. See what you can do to attract more because, whilst agency nurses are indeed useful
and helpful, they are *not* the solution. They are temporary staff, they do not necessarily have a
commitment in contributing to the future development of our Health Service.

I am proud, I am very proud, to have worked for the Health Services in this Island. It has given
me tremendous delight, it has given me tremendous satisfaction and, in all my travelling around
140 the world representing the RCN, I never failed to promote Guernsey and its healthcare services, so
it saddens me to be standing here saying this today, but I say it and I plead with, whatever
happens, whatever the composition of the Board is in the future, please address the nursing
vacancies seriously.

145 Just before I sit down, what I would like to say is I have been somewhat distressed at some of
the rudeness and the jibes directed towards me, since this whole debate came out into the open. I
would just plead with Members of the Assembly, my approach to being a politician is keeping it
political. Can I plead with you to take out the personal jibes, the personal insults. (**Several
Members:** Hear, hear.) It does not do any of us any good.

Thank you. (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Yes, thank you, sir.

155 In time-honoured fashion, I had not intended to speak today, but a sustained and ongoing
theme of the last debate has brought me to my feet – sorry, for the avoidance of doubt, I am on my
feet! (*Laughter*)

First of all, sir, I think we have no choice at all but to accept this sorry Report and to give T &
R the authority to move on. That should be what we are doing today.

Secondly, it follows, in my view, a somewhat sad set of actions that were announced in the

160 Minister's Statement last month and they fell into two categories. The first three are the ones that
have caused all the furore. We can argue about judgement – levels of judgement – and the wisdom
of doing certain things and not doing certain things: that is a decision that the Assembly will make
later today. The last three were a statement of what everybody knows should have been happening,
165 anyway, for at least five years. Indeed, during the last term T & R – as a member of T & R – we
were constantly assured that these actions *were* being taken and that there was movement. That is
hardly surprising, because cutting down on overtime, justifying new appointments and minimising
use of agency staff is surely just obvious management action. It is what should be happening
anyway. From here onwards, the HSSD Board *must* ensure that those objectives are being pursued
to the limit.

170 But, sir, the theme of the debate that has really bothered me is related to comments, many of
them very thinly veiled, if veiled at all, about our staff teams. The Chief Minister has now
undertaken to clarify, *yet again*, the reporting lines that have been formed to promote joined-up
government. That is why the clarification of the Chief Executive's position with regard to chief
officers and Boards has been moved and has been put in the way it has and it will be said far more
175 articulately than I am currently stumbling round, next month. It has brought us, and will bring us,
to move out of the silo Civil Service that was so evident in the past and I am not going to dwell on
that. We must refrain, in this Assembly, in my view, from undermining our own civil servants
irresponsibly by implying that they are *not* professional, simply in order to make political points. I
take one example; it has been said a number of times, so I am not pointing a finger at an individual
180 Member. For example, over the last couple of days we have heard the term 'bean counters' over
and over again and that is fine, bean counters, number crunchers, it sort of rolls off the tongue in a
speech, but it hardly shows a proper level of respect for professional civil servants...

We have a highly professional team working hard to deal with major change. It really is major
change that is going on and that change is not always understood or supported at a political level.
185 So, fellow Members, I beg you to use the reporting lines and powers you have through your
Boards to express any concerns you have about resources and to refrain from very public
comments that can, at best, be perceived as a criticism of our staff teams. It is not helpful and will
certainly *not* contribute to the solution of the pressing issues that we are facing here today and will
face for the rest of this term.

190

The Bailiff: Deputy Duquemin.

Deputy Duquemin: It is perhaps timely that I stand up after Deputy Kuttelwascher's speech
and also that of Deputy Langlois for reasons that will become clear shortly.

195 I think it is true that, yesterday in debate, arguably, there were a number of speeches, which
were maybe making the wrong speech in the wrong debate, perhaps thinking that the other debate
might not take place. But, to take issue with one of the things that Deputy Kuttelwascher did say
this morning, T & R *are* part of this picture, for very obvious reasons. They hold the purse strings,
they are in charge, their mandate is the public purse and I think, as Deputy Fallaize mentioned
200 yesterday, as part of this Report we have a three-page letter in front of us from Deputy St Pier
about this issue, so I think it is only right and proper that we do look at the role that has been
played by T & R in the matter.

I think it is also no coincidence, although it is a coincidence of sorts, that the word
'confidence' is very appropriate when we are looking at the letter from T & R, because at the
205 bottom of the first page the quote is:

'Therefore, the Treasury and Resources Department is not in a position to give the States an assurance that the
underlying reasons for expenditure being in excess of the budget allocation are as described by the HSSD.'

210 That, for me, is a fairly damning comment that, hopefully, we want to and we need to – for the
benefit of Islanders and the Health Service – get to the bottom of, because we need to be in a
position now... it may have been explained a little bit in the last paragraph, when it mentioned
that, through the Executive Leadership Team, they were going to initiate 'a review' etc but, for
me, it is a question of confidence.

215 The other pertinent thing in the Report – I'm sorry, in the letter from HSSD... sorry, from T &
R – is that it mentions the fact that the HSSD's budget limit, if it had been talking about just 2%
over budget, would have been £2.179 million. I am not very good at maths, but we are here today
talking about, in effect, a sum of £321,000 which, carrying on the maths that Deputy Adam used
for us, I think, yesterday, is less than one day's running costs for the Hospital. That is the margin

220 of error we are talking about.
Talking about making –

Deputy Luxon: Sir, excuse me, one week's expenditure, rather than one day's!

225 **Deputy Duquemin:** No, no. The point that I make, Deputy Luxon is –
Deputy Luxon, if you listen, I will explain again. (*Laughter and applause*)

Deputy Luxon: I apologise, Deputy Duquemin.

230 **Deputy Soulsby:** Sounds like we need more 'bean counters' in here! (*Laughter*)

Deputy Duquemin: I should not do this, because I will be embarrassing my Minister, but let me tell you that it is a bit of an in-joke in PSD meetings, that I am the one who is good at numbers! (**A Member:** That's true!) Anyway, just to repeat that point, then, for Deputy Luxon: the margin of error we are talking about is £321,000, *not* the £2.5 million, and that £321,000 is, of course, less than a day's running costs for the Hospital, so I think that should put it into perspective.

235 In terms of making the wrong speech in the wrong debate, I am also going to – and it is timely that I follow Deputy Langlois – refer back to the speech made yesterday by the Social Security Minister, when he gave... I thought I was back in my 'A' level economics class in the Grammar School with Mr Fletcher and hearing all about marginal costs, because I think that really is pretty pertinent to today's debate, in terms of marginal costs, because if we look at the Report that has been tabled by HSSD – and we are going to point 30 on page 2242 – and you look at the evidence that they have laid in front of us and you look at the year-to-date growth in, literally, all of the figures over three pages, there are figures of 13%, there are figures of 39%, there are figures of 28%... I am just randomly going through. There are figures of 21%, there are figures of 11%... These are all figures where we are talking very much about the marginal costs of supplying a service to more people that Deputy Langlois referred to yesterday. So, arguably, rather than criticising HSSD for the level of overspend, we should almost be congratulating them for limiting it to 2½% because, as we said, the number of people treated, the marginal costs have been, arguably, kept very well in check. I think that is the important point to stress.

240 I agree, today's debate is a *fait accompli* and we should, in any way... we will all be supporting the overspend, but my final point that I would like to make is that I agree with points made by, I think, Deputy Hadley yesterday and Deputy Lowe yesterday. My only concern, really, is that the Report was brought too late. It was brought at the eleventh hour and, written in the Report, there are hints that we were aware, or that HSSD were aware, of some of the problems earlier. I just think that we all need to act as one team and bring some of our problems to the collective team just that little bit earlier.

245 Thank you, sir.

250 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq, you wish to be relevé?
Thank you.

Deputy Kuttelwascher: Point of order, sir.

255 I think something Deputy Duquemin said at the beginning of his speech was misconstruing exactly what I said.

260 All I said was that I was not going to comment on negative feedback against civil servants, members of the Board and Deputy St Pier, in the speeches that were made yesterday. That is all. That is all I said. I did not say T & R were not in any way involved in the process that resulted in this Report.

The Bailiff: Thank you, Deputy Kuttelwascher.
Does anyone else wish to speak?
Deputy Sherbourne.

265 **Deputy Sherbourne:** Thank you, sir.

270 During this debate we have heard many excellent speeches that have vividly illustrated the tremendous difficulties faced by HSSD. I would like to congratulate, particularly, Deputy Wilkie, who made a very brave maiden speech yesterday. I am sure that he probably would not have

280 chosen that subject to have been a maiden speech.

We witnessed, also yesterday, a robust and passionate defence of the Board's actions and an indication of tensions that exist in a wider context between the political and the executive arms of our Government. These matters, in my opinion, should be resolved as quickly as possible. I rise to support this request from the Board, as I would have done, had they either brought this Report earlier, or if they had perhaps brazened it out to the end of the year. It is my considered opinion that they would have been well advised to trust their fellow Deputies, as most of us in different Boards are facing similar problems and are very much aware of their predicament. I agree with other speakers that this overspend is not wasted money and it has certainly been spent for the most honourable of reasons. There is no question that we must balance our books but the way that this is to be achieved still needs to be debated and I look forward to the forthcoming debate on the FTP. We have systemic problems that must be resolved as soon as possible. I do believe, however, that the Board made the wrong call regarding the introduction of the crisis measures, which have resulted in the call of a Vote of No Confidence. However, I *do not* believe that they are an incompetent Board and neither do I think that they, as individuals, are incompetent men. They, like the rest of us, are doing their best for this Island under difficult circumstances. They simply made a collective error of judgement and they will face *our* judgement on those actions. However, 'he who casts the first stone' immediately springs to mind.

The process leading up to today has been unseemly and it is not a good reflection of the work of this Assembly. My desired hope is that, once this request for support is put to the vote and passed, we can put this issue behind us and move on as quickly as possible, for we have much to do. The current Board has been put in an untenable position, having publicly lost the confidence of the Policy Council. They have defended themselves well in this House and, more than anything, I wish for all those Members to be able to leave this Assembly with dignity. Their integrity is still intact, in my mind. Individual animosities over this issue must not determine further actions or decisions and I agree totally with Deputy James and her comments about personal comments.

I hope, by the end of this debate, we will be able to move forward without another distasteful airing of the dirty washing that Deputy Lowe referred to yesterday.

Thank you, sir. (*Applause*)

310 **The Bailiff:** Alderney Representative Arditti.

Alderney Representative Arditti: Thank you, sir.
I am in difficulty. I want to use a cliché –

315 **A Member:** Go ahead. (*Laughter*)

Alderney Representative Arditti: – but there are none left! (*Laughter*) How can I make a credible speech in this debate without a cliché? (*Laughter*) I will, therefore, confine myself to two questions to the Minister, if I may.

320 Would the Minister confirm, in his reply, that the discount which HSSD has accepted from Southampton, in order to resume elective surgery for the remainder of this year, will not be recuperated or taken into account in any way by Southampton in next year's payments to that Hospital?

325 My second question is this: does the Minister consider that the cancellation today of the 20/20 vision presentation in Alderney, due to crosswinds at the Eastern Airfield, will *inevitably result* in an unwelcome waste of precious HSSD resources?

Thank you. (*Laughter*)

330 **The Bailiff:** Does anyone else wish to speak?

Sorry, yes, Deputy Collins. I believe this will be a maiden speech, as well.

Deputy Collins: Thank you, sir.

335 Excuse me, I am suffering from a bit of a chesty cough. It is amazing, sir, that here we are in December and I am speaking for the first time. In fact, I did actually prepare two speeches, but I voted to not debate Sunday trading and not to debate our pay, so I felt it was inappropriate for me to get up and start debating something I did not want to debate!

It is a very interesting Report and I do thank the staff and HSSD Board generally, because I do think for the last several years they have done a very good job. However – and I am saying, however – I have some big concerns. At the start of the Report they are looking at 2009 and 2010

340 and yet, when we start looking at tables, on page 2242, we are looking at last year and this year. That is great but, personally, I would love to have seen several years' worth of data of how the quarters add up, because 2011, as we know, was an underspend, so those could have been very lean years. Comparing those two years is perhaps not very good.

345 A lot of debate has gone on about what has happened at T & R and I agree with the Deputy Minister that I am not going to start talking about what happened at these meetings and what was said and what was not said. But one thing I did want to note was that the HSSD Board did actually meet in the morning and what was said, that they actually made those decisions before they even came to T & R. So before they even came to us to ask us for the additional money – and just going on from Deputy Duquemin's comment – it is like going to a restaurant and you get the bill and they say, 'Oh, we only want you to pay x amount of the bill'. The bill is the bill! It was £2.5 million: that is what they wanted. We could not give it to them, because we could only give them 350 £2.179 million and it was out of the question that we could sanction that. Our answer was that they should come as soon as possible to this Assembly with a Report and, in fact, as Deputy Lowe has said, they should have come back in September. Personally, I knew back in May that you were 355 going to have some huge overspends and yet this Assembly has never been requested that additional money.

360 Personally, one thing that really has got my goat up, is – hence the reason why I have risen to my feet to talk for the first time, which is incredible, as most of my friends would believe that I would be up here all the time talking – is that they are asking for £2.5 million. If you convince me that all these measures you put in place were going to be effective and efficient and all this pain and suffering that everyone has had to go through, why have you not come here, sir, and asked for £2.1 million? That is the end result and you said it yesterday, you are only going to spend £2 million, so why have you come here, if you are *confident* that everything that is going to happen – 365 and there are only two weeks to go – that these measures will be effective. The answer is that you just do not know. You do not know, even at this late stage, what the final bills will be and what the final management control is within HSSD.

370 As has been said from T & R – and I could be a rebel and say 'Please reject this Report because I do not think they should have an increased budget... and just let them spend and what their overspend is their overspend!' Whereas, you give them £2.5 million, technically speaking, they will have an underspend by the end of the year, according to the records, because if they are £500,000 under, the records would show they underspent by £500,000. I am not going to do that and I am going to recommend to this Assembly that you adopt this Report and we move on to the next business, sir.

375 Thank you very much. (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Thank you, sir.

380 I *was* going to stand up and talk about our public sector and say that, with only 17% of our employable workforce employed in the public sector, we have one of the lowest public sector workforces of any other jurisdiction. I *was* going to stand up and talk about why, with only 20% of our GDP being spent on public services, we have one of the lowest spends on public services of any comparable jurisdiction. I *was* going to stand up and talk about the big difference between waste and inefficiency. I *was* going to analyse whether, in reality, the HSS Department *have* 385 mismanaged States funds or, for that matter, after 30 years in medicine, whether it could be, I think, *reasonably* concluded that Deputy Adam does not defer patient care lightly. I *was*, last night, going to talk about the comparison between Health and Environment and give an example of Health finding themselves in a situation not dissimilar to that that Environment would find themselves in, if we issued an instruction to control traffic but, at the same time, insisted that the traffic lights only ever stayed on 'green'. That is the situation that Health find themselves in with regard to demand-led services.

390 Finally, sir – before I *am* going to say, (*Laughter and applause*) I *was* going to talk about the importance of having a proper, empowered executive Civil Service. Others have touched upon it and I suspect others might again in future. Instead, all the talk of acronyms yesterday – ITUs, HDUs, SCUBAs and such like – made me come up with my own acronym of Health. The six headings I have gone for are 'Health', 'Education', 'Action', 'Logic', 'Today' and 'Hope' (HEALTH) and I *am* going to leave, as is often the case in politics, 'Logic' and 'Hope' till last, focusing initially on 'History', 'Education', 'Action' and 'Today'.

Let us start with 'History', because the history in this States Report has ensured that we are

400 better informed about the journey to the decisions that culminated in Deputy Adam's statement to
 this Assembly in November. In terms of 'Education', we are better educated about the difficulties
 of a demand-led and third-party authorised medical service. In terms of 'Action', I think we all
 understand the difficulties facing HSSD and, in particular, the heartache they must have
 405 experienced, individually and collectively, in arriving at the decision they made. 'Today' we are
 advised by our *primary* custodians of the public purse – that is the Treasury and Resources
 Department – that we have no choice and that, indeed, we *should* approve the excess over budget
 allocation. You will notice I have used slightly different terminology than the word 'overspend'.

I want to finish with 'Logic' and 'Hope' and I pose a question to all Members of this Assembly
 with regard to logic. Where is the logic in a system of government, where the man we elect as
 410 Chief Minister cannot have the ultimate say in whether or not a short-term loan, or a short-term
 overspend, should have been authorised to give breathing time between the need to prepare a
 Report to come to this Assembly – for this Assembly to make the decision – and the cancellation
 of services that have brought so much misery to so many people in our community? It is *bonkers*.
 415 The Chief Minister *must* have that empowerment and my hope, finally, sir, is that out of what has
 been, quite frankly, an unedifying mess, the new Members of the States – not in particular – but
 the new Members of the States will have a much better grasp of the *utter inadequacies* of our
 system of government, that allows such a car crash to happen, with no mechanisms in place to
 ensure that it does not, other than going out on a limb – and there have been examples of that. I
 remember, when I had the difficult job of Chief Minister and we bought some tank ships. The
 420 alternative was, if we did not buy those tank ships, inevitably they were to be sold elsewhere and,
 as a result of that, the lights may well have gone out, not only at the Hospital but Island-wide. We
 made that decision. We were, technically speaking, *ultra vires*, but we did it in the best interest of
 this Assembly. The Chief Minister *must* be empowered to have the final say in issues of this type,
 to ensure that we *never* find ourselves in a situation like this again.

425 Thank you, sir. (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Deputy Lester Queripel.

430 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** Sir, I just need some clarification.

The Bailiff: Sorry, you have already spoken. Yes?

Deputy Lester Queripel: Yes, I asked a question in this debate and I wondered if that is
 435 considered as my speech, sir?

The Bailiff: Yes.

Deputy Lester Queripel: In that case, that is the shortest speech I have ever made, sir.
 440 (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Otherwise everybody would be popping up and down, asking questions, and there
 would be no end of it.

Deputy Bebb?

445 **Deputy Bebb:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

It is always difficult to follow Deputy Trott. It feels a little bit like a second fiddle after a
 consummate performance.

Certain things have been discussed today, which I am grateful for. I think that it is about time
 we had a far more open public debate about the needs of Health in the Island of Guernsey.
 450 Through this unseemly affair, and through what has been this difficult time, one measure that we
 can all be grateful for is the fact that there is far greater knowledge within the public arena now, as
 to the *cost* of healthcare, which frequently is misunderstood.

It is worth noting that the Department this year has seen what is effectively a 'perfect storm',
 that was bound to happen at one point or another. It is bizarre beyond belief to have triplets born.
 455 It is not a natural phenomenon, because it is a very rare occasion to have triplets. It is far more
 frequent to have quadruplets than triplets, but this year *two* women have had triplets in the Island
 and I wish them well and I congratulate them and hope that they have a very good and healthy life
 with their triplets. But let us consider that that cost is £¼ million. Nobody here would deny them
 that cost and I am not asking in any way for people to be denied that kind of treatment and care,

460 but I do think that we need to realise that that *is* the cost that comes with having children who are
born prematurely. Those triplets, as well, will not be delivered in Guernsey, because we do not
have appropriate facilities here in Guernsey. We ensure that those types of operations are
conducted in Southampton, which has far greater resources. Therefore, this is the point, that we hit
465 the question of demand meeting formula. Demand-led expenditure *has* been claimed to be not
quite as important – or important is not the correct word – but not put on a par with formula-led
expenditure.

Deputy Langlois yesterday made reference to additional pupils within the education system
wanting a catering class and that they might need to buy some more food. Well, for the first time
470 in my life, I will be making the comparison between a few meat and veg and a titanium hip.
Bizarre as that may sound, I do not think that we could truly consider the cost of the extra
resources that would be required within a catering course with a cost associated with a titanium
hip or a new knee. These costs are extreme, they are disproportionate in comparison and,
therefore, I think that Members are minded to understand that, when we are talking of demand, we
are talking about expenditure, which *is* extremely costly. As well as the actual incident of health,
475 such as a new knee or a new hip, I think it is also worth noting that the doctors, the nurses, the
carers, the whole of the staffing of the system, is at a far higher level of numbers that are
necessary, in order to ensure proper and good care for that patient than the case could be within
education, for one teacher within one class. There is a ratio that is necessary of caring, nursing
staff to the individual that is in need of that care. We must ensure that that ratio is maintained for
480 the proper clinical health of the Island and of those people.

In a way, that leads me on to the other point and that is, are we not all glad that HSSD stand
here today, claiming that they have overspent by, what could be now, as a result of our measures,
in the region of around £2 million and, therefore, the inadequacies that we know within the
Department are financial? Isn't it wonderful that the inadequacies are known to be financial and
485 not clinical? The damning statement would be if HSSD were to come with a Report, stating that
their clinical ability has been negligent. It is well understood that the finance department of HSSD
is *not* adequately resourced, but the difficulties facing the Department, with regard to its finances,
do not lie *solely* with the inadequate resources.

There is *great* difficulty in collecting information so that the Department can properly forecast
its expenditure. Certain providers feel that there is commercial value to the information that they
have and are reluctant in sharing information with HSSD without recompense. I am *pleased* to
announce today that MSG and HSSD have been working very closely and have now agreed a post
that will be taken by MSG to ensure that this type of information will now be passed to the
495 Department in a far more timely manner, enabling it to take a further step towards the proper
financial management that is essential within the system. The Board has also made the decision on
Tuesday, in its Board meeting, to increase the finance department. It has now become evident that
the review called for in 2010, which did not take place, will now take place and there will be a
comprehensive rethink on the finances. *Whoever* stands as the Board next week will have the
comfort of knowing that there is a *fundamental review* that will be taken of the finances of the
500 Department.

The Board takes the measures of finances very, very seriously and I was slightly disheartened,
to say the least, at comments that were made in the *Press* recently by the Chief Minister about the
Department's concern on finances and the measures that we have taken. It is because of the
financial constraints in the Department and the great difficulty that it has found itself in that we, as
505 a Board, made the decisions that are now well documented. The reaction to those measures is also
well known. It was by no means an easy measure, an easy decision. None of the five members of
that Board joined HSSD with a relish and a passion for closing wards and actually causing an
extended period of disruption to people's lives. None of us were elected to the Board with that in
mind and I would ask Members to please be mindful of the fact that these were not measures that
510 were taken lightly, easily or comfortably. But the measures themselves *will* realise a saving in the
region of £½ million and, because of the financial constraints the Department is in, it was felt that
that could be reasonably considered.

I realise now that the reaction has not been that reasonable, but I would ask for some
perspective. Guernsey has a system of asking for eight weeks for people to wait for their
operations. Jersey, I believe, is 14 and the UK is 18. We made the calculation – and I will accept
515 that some people do not agree with the calculation – but we made the calculation, we made the
judgement, that we might like to ask the people of Guernsey to wait a little bit longer, in total 12
weeks – and I see Deputy Lowe shaking her head. I agree that it is a difficult and unpleasant
decision, but the intention was to ask for 12 weeks. The savings that would be realised have

520 actually been called into question, given the need now to see those operations conducted next year
 but, as Deputy Adam said in his opening statement, theatres are now running full lists. This means
 that the Department is running at a far greater rate of efficiency. It is unpleasant, but it is quite
 possible that, next year, whoever is within HSSD will need to revisit the question of theatres
 525 operating at an efficient capacity and, at that point in time, it is perfectly possible that this
 Assembly would be asked to consider a permanent move to 12 weeks to allow that type of
 efficiency to continue, but that decision will be for another day and for the Assembly. But savings
 could be realised with greater co-operation with the MSG and a means of... an effective means of
 rethinking the way that we fill theatres and the theatre list.

530 Finally, I would like to state that the Department itself was facing overspend for some time, but
 the nature of that overspend was never clear. Earlier in the year, the Department thought that it
 was going to overspend *quite spectacularly* in relation to children looked after. We have seen
extraordinary increases in children looked after – a 143% increase – and that, in itself, is a
 damning statement on the way that we have looked after the community and the fact that we
 535 continue to have these problems within our communities. It is extraordinary that the people
 running that particular part of the service have now managed to come in close to their budget,
 possibly I believe, at the last numbers, around £100,000. They have achieved that by considering
 less than perfect standards of care for those children that are now in their care. The nature,
 therefore, of *this* particular overspend was *not* as previously thought. The nature of the overspend
 540 is an ever-changing pattern and, at very short notice, as Members are now aware, HSSD were
 made aware of an *exceptional increase* in referrals for off-Island treatment. That exceptional
 increase was first made known when the bills started to roll in: a situation that, as I have said
 previously, will now, hopefully, be remedied, but that is why the overspend jumped overnight
 from a forecast £1.5 million, for which the Department undertook a budget challenge to try and
 545 reduce that overspend, to a budget forecast overspend of £2.5 million. Therefore, for all those
 Members who have asked why this Report did not come sooner, I hope that you now understand
 why. It is an ever-changing target. It is moving every single day and, therefore, to bring an honest
 Report to you about the nature of the overspend is simply not possible half way through the year,
 because it will change and the spectacle of this Department bringing forward Reports on a monthly
 550 basis, forecasting an overspend in a changing area, would only add to the perception of the
 difficulties and the inadequacies of the financial controls that it has available.

As a result of this Report, one of the truly saddening parts has been the letter of comment from
 Treasury and Resources. I have never before, and I hope never again to see a Department call into
 question the honesty and integrity of another Department, as I feel that this letter does. The
 statement read by Deputy Duquemin, calling into question whether or not the Department
 555 understands its overspend and whether... it beggars belief that Treasury and Resources could
 deem it fit to question the integrity of another Department in a States Report and I hope that we
 would never see that happen again.

Deputy St Pier has been very vocal in the media as to his criticism of the Department and, on
 Wednesday, Deputy St Pier presented to us the Budget. That was amended five times. In the last
 560 Assembly, I believe that the *former* Treasury and Resources Minister conceded *no* amendments
 and, previously, I believe that the *former* Treasury and Resources Minister conceded one.

I do not know whether this is true, but there is –

565 **Deputy Trott:** I think it is the other way round, sir. (*Laughter*)

Deputy Bebb: I do not know whether it is true, but the story is worth repeating. (*Laughter*)
 There is, apparently, within Treasury and Resources, a box that is fashioned in the same way as
 the budget box of the Chancellor of the Exchequer in the UK and, on that box, it bears the words,
 570 ‘Within this box are all the amendments that I have conceded in my time as Treasury and
 Resources Minister’ and it has been a source of great pride that the box has contained nothing but
 air!

Deputy St Pier has started his tenure with five amendments and, that evening, his first
 comment within the media was to, once again, to criticise HSSD’s financial management. People
 in glass houses should be mindful of throwing stones!

575 Members, I realise that this Report is more than likely to be accepted and I am *thankful* to you
 for that. When it comes to the vote, I do implore you to support it, because I think that it does
 show the Department has been very careful in the management of its money and that the demands
 that we have seen are now much better understood by this Assembly and by the Island as a whole.
 Therefore, through this, we can be thankful that that information is now much more part of the

580 debate.

I would also sincerely hope that certain measures are addressed: senior Members speaking loosely to the *Press*, rather than direct to the Department, ceases. I would also state that, as Deputy Langlois has mentioned, the question is within many Members' minds as to the appropriate means of having reporting lines within the Civil Service. On this occasion *again* that has been called into
585 question and I would call for the Policy Council to bring a Report to this Assembly, stating why they believe the measure, as it presently stands, is in their opinion the correct means of having that reporting line. I think that a debate is long called for and I would hope it is done in a measured means by States Report, other than by an unpleasant Requête which it may well face.

I think, finally, I would like to state that the Department themselves, the nurses, the staff within
590 the Social Services side, which are frequently overlooked because we are so focused within Health, they have been exceptional in what they have managed to do this year in delivering the services at the cost they have. This Board has made decisions in order to try and contain it, but the gratitude really goes to those staff members. When people speak of HSSD, please be mindful of the fact that you are talking of 2,000 members of staff who work diligently, in order to try and
595 contain their expenditure, but deliver excellent healthcare. Therefore, I would ask Members to be a little bit more mindful in future, when they complain about the Department.

I thank you for the good comments that have come. I wish the Board which will come, the best, but I personally will not put that Department through the unpleasant spectacle of a Vote of No Confidence. Therefore, if the Vote of No Confidence is placed, Members will be assured that
600 the first thing that I will do is tender my resignation, because I do not wish to see that kind of spectacle here. It would demean the Department and the hard working people within it. I would ask Members to be mindful of that.

Thank you. (*Applause*)

605 **The Bailiff:** Deputy David Jones and then Deputy Stewart.

Deputy David Jones: Thank you, Mr Bailiff, Members of States.

I am not going to repeat anything that everybody else has said. I think that this is clearly an overspend that we have to sanction.

I only have one question, and that is that I have heard a thread through this debate from lots of
610 people about the lack of communication between the MSG and the Health Department, in terms of knowing what is coming at them down the track. It is my understanding that we spent £10 million and a bit on a computer system that was supposed to tell HSSD all this information, not only from the Medical Specialist Group but also, I understand, from the GPs. I might have that wrong and I
615 am sure the Minister will correct me if I have. Clearly, that computer system was supposed to be the all-singing, bells-and-whistles system that was going to join up all these disparate groups that supply services to our Health Service, so that the Health Department had a much better picture of what it was needed to fund and, of course, all the operations that people needed would be flagged
620 up much earlier, so that they would be able to budget much better.

The other thing about that computer system, when it was sold to us at that time, was that its biggest selling point was that it would help with budgeting. Even right back in the days of Peter Roffey, and even before that, it has always been an issue for Health, simply because they have no knowledge about the numbers of people that are coming through their door at any given time – and I fully accept that during this debate.

625 So that is the only real question that I have for the Health Minister: what happened to that joined-up, all-singing, bells-and-whistles computer system that the States of Guernsey paid for at that time?

Thank you.

630 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Stewart, then Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Stewart: This is really about – and let us not forget it – taxpayers' money. This is the hard-earned money of the people of Guernsey that we collect as a Government to then redistribute and this is about budgeting and budgeting is about tracking it, expecting the unexpected... To me,
635 it seems strange – someone who has written so many business plans – how can we have a budget that does not include sickness, holiday, training at all in it? How can we have a budget that does not have, as Deputy Kuttelwascher asked, 'Do you have a contingency?' I have written so many business plans... one financial director said to me, 'What is this contingency in here?' and I said to him, 'Well, if I knew what it was, it would not be there in the first place!' That is why you have a

640 contingency, to try and smooth over your peaks and troughs.

What this Report raises – and, unfortunately, as Deputy Fallaize has said before in this Assembly, we have a gun to our head, because we have to approve this – is far more questions than answers. We are told by the Minister of HSSD that there was a Report back in 2010 that highlighted that there were ‘problems with accounting’ and other issues. What I have to ask myself, why has all this not been addressed? If you need more accountants, then sort it out. It is about political leadership, it is about the Board. We needed more resources in our Financial Sector Development Unit. The Commerce and Employment Board discussed how we might sort that out and we did it. We just moved money around and organised it and, if I had needed any more, I would have gone to T & R and tried to make a case for it. It is about a Board taking responsibility.

645
650 Deputy Bebb and other people have mentioned about SAP. If I felt that my Chief Officer, or any other officers, were being pulled away from the Department, that it was going to be of detriment to that Department, I would make a very strong case and I know the Board would back me, to make sure that that was stopped. Just recently, SAP wanted to do a change-over which we believe would have affected the delivery of a service significantly and we resolved, as a Board, that the Chief Officer would not be allowed to sign it off. As simple as that. If you take political leadership.

655
660 Deputy Bebb said that we just asked them to wait, I think. I do not remember you actually asking anyone anything. You actually told people that they were not having their operations and I have had several of those on the phone to me, quite distressed. You did not ask them to wait; you just told them. What I have heard from every single Board member of HSSD is blame. It is not us, it is T & R, it is something else happened, this happened... What I will ask the Minister is, do you accept, and your Board accept, full responsibility for this overspend that we now, reluctantly, have to approve?

665 T & R’s letter: I do not read it the same way that Deputy Bebb reads it. I think it actually just states their position quite clearly, and T & R are looking after taxpayers’ money. If we look at the bottom of page 2255:

670 [T & R] will, if necessary, use its delegated authority to increase revenue budgets by transfer from the Budget Reserve, as set out in the 2012 Budget Report in respect of, “*[and] any unanticipated / ‘emergency’ expenditure where there is a clear business case and the expenditure cannot be met by reprioritising existing budgets.*” No such requests have been received in 2012 from [the] HSSD.”

No such requests.

675 Over the page – and this is what worries me – it is about going forward. To quote the cliché, Alderney Representative Arditti, ‘we are where we are’, (*Laughter*) but it says

‘...TRD is concerned that the underlying expenditure level of HSSD appears to have increased to a level in excess of budget and there is a strong possibility that its Cash Limit could be overspent in 2013.’

680 I do not know whether, from everything that we see in this Report, £107 million is the right sort of budget. I do not know whether it should be more, I do not know whether it should be less and if there was ever a case for zero-based budgeting, here is one, perhaps that should be our first guinea pig, but if we read on,

685 ‘During the year...’,

– on page 2256 in T & R’s letter –

690 ‘...the level of potential budget shortfall forecast by HSSD has fluctuated, both in value and the reasons therefor.’

It seems to be every time I speak to a member of the HSSD Board, ‘Oh, it’s another excuse; it’s something else; it’s agency; it’s this; it’s more people!’ I do not seem to be able to get the *real* answers, which is the problem with the Report. I do not think the answers are there.

695 So, reluctantly, I will support this Report, but what I do not want is a repeat a year down the road.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

700 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

Like others, I reluctantly support this Report, but I want to echo the words of my friend, Deputy Trott, because what we have before us today is exactly an example of where our system of government in these cases illustrates where it does not operate efficiently, effectively and where we are in grave danger of then apportioning blame in a personalised way which is certainly not fair. I add to the comments of those who said we certainly should not be engaged in that here.

We have before us a situation which, I think, is illustrated by the fact that you could say this Assembly has a box of tools that are the tools of government. We have all the tools we need, because this Assembly *is* the Government of Guernsey. We choose then to delegate certain tasks to particular groups of people and Departments, but we only give them a few of the tools to do the job. We give a Department a hammer and a screwdriver and we expect them to deal with everything within their section with those two tools and then blame them when they cannot deal with that. That is a problem that we are having to face and I believe the States Review Committee will have to deal with those issues, because when things go wrong, we start blaming them for not dealing with those particular problems when, in fact, they should have come and asked for the tools. They can and that is where I think the problem is here. There could have been, earlier on, a recognition that they did not have all the tools necessary to do the job we were asking them to do.

That ought to certainly change in the future and there needs to be *proper* accountability because, had the Department of HSSD had all the tools, then I do not think we would be in this position that we are faced with now, which *is a fait accompli*, which is being asked to do something that we have no other alternative to do. Yesterday I was not able to be in this Assembly, but I believe that Deputy Le Lièvre suggested, or at least made an argument to the effect, that Health and Social Services' situation is not normal, when compared to other Departments' spending. He mentioned the Home Department and other Departments. Well, sir, I would take issue with that. There are certainly within my Department, Home, situations that occur, which are unplanned for that we have to respond to, be they policing situations or, for example, situations involving fires. You cannot, effectively, plan for that, so you have to put contingencies in place, and that does take time. It has to because it involves equipment and personnel: you have to look *way* in advance for those sorts of things to possibly occur and you can get criticised, as has happened, for being over-prepared or under-prepared. That is the political judgement that you make.

I am in the fortunate position of having taken on from predecessors, who I believe have prepared very well for those sorts of things. They have cut their cloth effectively, but we have contingencies in place. Were we to have, in our mandate as the Home Department, circumstances that were unusual or exceptional to occur, I believe we could respond appropriately. That is what Health and Social Services need to do and they need to do that *now*.

I shall be supporting this, but I think, sadly, it does illustrate where we do need to change our *modus operandi*.

The Bailiff: Yes. Deputy De Lisle.

Deputy De Lisle: Thank you sir.

I reluctantly find myself having to support this Report, because the money, basically, has already been spent and as the Treasury Department make very clear in their final paragraph, 2256, they see that there is no option but to advise the States to approve the recommendation to approve the Report. However, in terms of the longer-term plans that are discussed in the last two pages of the Report and the fact that the contingencies that were asked for in paragraphs 56 and 57 have not been awarded, can the Minister, in his summing up, give assurances with regard to the Department meeting its FTP targets for the years 2013 and 2014?

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Storey.

Deputy Storey: Thank you, sir.

I have been reading the letter from T & R appended to this Report and I am, in particular, looking at the same paragraph that Deputy Stewart read out earlier on in this debate. I do not really read it in exactly the same way.

The point, for me, is that HSSD has been flagging up a potential overspend that they could not see their way out of for some time. Yes, okay, maybe the reasons fluctuate, for the reasons that have been well explained by the HSSD Board members in their speeches, but the point for me is that it goes on to say that it led the Treasury and Resources Department

‘to conclude that [the] HSSD does not have an adequate financial monitoring and forecasting regime in place.’

765 From my point of view, we are *all* the Government of this Island and we should all be working
together to try to meet the corporate objectives. This, to me, just exemplifies the problem we have
with... I will use the usual catch phrase of ‘silo mentality’. The bit that I do not understand is why
HSSD have not been to T & R to explain their problems and, if T & R felt that they had not got the
right systems in place in order to control the situation, then where is the offer from T & R to assist
them in making sure that they *do have* appropriate financial controls in place?

770 To me, I echo some of the thoughts of some of the other speakers here about the system that
we operate in Government. If Departments spoke together more often and *shared* their problems,
instead of keeping them close to their chest in case somebody has an adverse criticism of where
they are, then I think we would all be in a much better place at the end of the day. So I am not
going soft on meeting the budgets. I am fundamentally in support of setting budgets and achieving
775 them, but it is no good casting a Department adrift, if they are floundering a bit. We should be
talking about these problems and coming together to try and find an adequate solution to the
problem, instead of leaving it until it gets to a situation that we are facing today.

If anything comes of this situation and of this debate we have had today, I do hope that
780 Members of this Assembly take to heart the facts that we really do need to talk to each other and
exchange our views and come up with joint solutions to problems, because I am quite convinced
that, in the years ahead, with the problems that we are facing, these problems are going to *have*
to be tackled by joint action throughout this Assembly, by all Members mucking in together. We are
all in this together and it is no good casting one group of people aside to let them get on with it and
make a hash of it, because that does not do the Assembly any good and it certainly does not do the
785 Island any good. So it is a plea from the heart for Departments to talk together and to thrash out
their problems in a sensible manner, so that we do not reach this sort of problem again.

The Bailiff: Does anyone else wish to speak?

790 No? In that case, Deputy Adam, are you ready to reply, or do you wish to exercise your right to
request an adjournment?

Deputy Adam will reply to the debate.

Deputy Adam: Sir, I will, first of all, try and highlight some of the comments that have been
made by various people.

795 To start off with Deputy James, she is quite correct. She did take a two-year evaluation and this
was called Agenda for Change and, quite rightly, there is an annual leave increase, pay scales
changed – and there is no extra money to HSSD at that time to cover the extra costs, but, as you
say, vacancies and sick leave etc, these things do happen and I accept that, sometimes, it may be
due to overwork, or stress, but *most* ward managers try and ensure that is not excessive.

800 Again, she was very correct in the format that it is very difficult for HSSD to employ newly
qualified nurses. We have 20 a year that we train ourselves. When they go on to wards, they must
have mentors to look after them and support them and, if we bring that grade of nurse from the UK
it causes problems.

805 Deputy Langlois had a fairly short speech, highlighting things that had been said before, for
example line management etc.

Deputy Duquemin pointed out that it is £300,000 a day was what he was coming from, not £2
million, the £2 million is a week and pointed out. Also that other point, if you are in business and
you had increased your business by 20% or thereabouts, but your costs are only going up 2½%
810 you would be *congratulated* – in other words you had contained your costs, yet increased your
business or your turnover.

Deputy Sherbourne accepted there are difficult issues.

815 Alderney Representative Arditti, the discount for Southampton: basically, what has happened
with our main provider is that our finance director has been speaking to them more and more, so
that we can find out how much we are due them, because normally what happens, if you have a
bill of £4 million for the year, if you expect to spend £4 million – it is actually more but it is easier
to do the sums this way – it is divided up into four quarters, so we pay routinely to Southampton,
for example, £1 million each quarter and then, at the end of that quarter, Southampton assesses the
patients that have come through their doors from us, sends that information to us and we have got
820 a certain time to ensure it is correct, that is then sent back to Southampton, telling them this is
what we agree to and that is the service you provided and the two sides have to agree to that. So in

actual fact you do not get finalisation of that first quarter for about four to six weeks. Southampton is quite a good hospital, because it actually sends the information quite quickly. There is one hospital we use, it takes them about two or three months *after* the quarter has closed to send us a bill – it affects cash flow. That is one aspect. 20/20 cancellations: sorry, I [*Inaudible*] so I cannot answer that question.

Deputy Collins asked why did we ask for £2.5 million? We were told by T & R to ask for what we would consider would be the maximum amount, so we asked for ‘*up to* £2.5 million’. As I said, final bills: well, you have to wait until January for all these.

Deputy Trott made an interesting comment namely ITU and SCUBA and CCU and, yes, he is quite right.

Deputy Jones asked about a computer system, which was to track Health and it’s inter-systems. This computer system has helped us *immensely* to contain our budget for the last three years, because it is a computer system for the management of the workload in *Guernsey*. The PEH helps us with reporting. Also now there is a lot more case-history type information on it, but the final aim, which I do not think will be successful, is to make it paper free, but all your pathology reports are on the computer for the patients, all your *x-ray* reports are on the computer, easy access and it goes to all the wards and it goes to the MSG, so it is clinical information that is on the computer. As far as the general practices are concerned, they are coming on board now and working with us, because you can order an *x-ray* or blood test online and then the patient just goes up and has a blood test. It is much easier and the results come back online. So I hope that answers your question, Deputy Jones.

Deputy Stewart said, again, financial management... not accepted by T & R. I think I said that in my initial speech. The problem is if anyone has a business system there is a system of going upline management. If we want more accountants, we have to go the line management of accountants to ask them to sanction that and, as stated already, there is a report from Deloitte, there is a report sent to the Board in 2010 etc, we agreed to it and we were told that the FTP would be providing the information. The FTP, we have someone in the Department now from them, and they are telling us the same as we told *them*, we have the wrong financial management because there are not enough staff.

The other thing he said about the T & R letter, they were looking after taxpayers’ money. Does that include the £2.3 million that they lost? I sometimes wonder how we have different standards for things but, never mind, we are going to be over budget and will be able to explain where the money has been spent, but the fraud happened, unfortunately.

Deputy Le Tocq mentioned the system of government.

Deputy De Lisle asked about FTP targets. In the Report, it says long term things and it lists the areas which have been put forward to the Project Board for the FTP projects. They have been assessed and they will come back if they consider it is a reasonable way forward or not. They are areas of work which will generate the savings necessary. If the Assembly does not agree to them, then the answer to the question will be, no, we will not be able to meet the FTP targets. If we cannot bring in some of these issues, we will not be able to save the money, if you call it savings.

Again, Deputy Storey mentioned financial monitoring in place etc.

As far as yesterday’s debate was concerned, first to speak was Deputy Soulsby, suggesting PAC was going to do a review. So, then, we will have a review by the Chief Executive Officer, we will have a review by FTP, we will have a review by PAC and we have the information already and we have actually, as a Board, agreed to go ahead with changing the situation and having a business case to improve the number of staff within that Department.

Deputy Laurie Queripel was succinct — two main issues: budget constraints of one Department have to be dealt with by that Department and, as you say, there is a risk factor then of silo mentality. Deputy Storey mentioned that, as well, and that should not be there and a conflicting situation in relation to line management issues.

Deputy Fallaize: well, his was, as usual, a very detailed, precise speech, given in his usual precise manner and it was quite long. I am sure you will all remember it, as he drew attention to situations and budgets in Guernsey, Jersey, Isle of Man, but he did state we had made a wrong political judgement in cancelling operations.

Deputy Fallaize, I do not know... The problem was, none of you in this Assembly has informed us how else we could have assessed the situation. I know you say that is because you do not know the Department, you do not know the financial aspects of it and I accept that: sometimes we have to make difficult decisions. It is in the mandate of the Department to look after the budget and money – Deputy Stewart said that already. It is in the mandate of the Department and we should be making these decisions, even though they are difficult.

Deputy Lester Queripel, I think your question was answered by Deputy Kuttelwascher.

885 Deputy Hadley mentioned a number of issues: Children's Law, Deputy Hadley, and when it came into force, we got £500,000 to help to support the Children's Panel etc, and then I think, two years ago, we got further money to employ an extra three social workers because of their workload, unfortunately.

As far as deferring operations, it should save money because we are actively recruiting. I accept this may not be on the website, but that is going ahead at the present time.

890 Staff demoralised: well, Deputy Quin had an operation yesterday afternoon and he tells me not one of the staff – sorry, an eye operation – and he tells me all the staff were supportive of the Board. As far as putting staff into situations which they are not trained for, there is one orthopaedic trained nurse from de Sausmarez Ward who was not put to a medical ward; the other staff were what you call generic – that is not specialised in one specific area.

895 I accept it was very unfortunate for the de Sausmarez Ward, because it had just reopened in June this year because, prior to that, as you may remember, it was being used for the Hospice. When the Hospice was knocked down and rebuilt, we allowed them to use what is called the De Sausmarez Ward for that time, for that year, and they just paid for the utilities. That meant it had to be refurbished and was opened in June and it was felt they were just getting back together as a team. So, yes, there was some concern. As I say, Divette Ward is different.

900 Thank you to Deputy Gillson, who highlighted a lot of things in relation to HSSD, as its Deputy Minister.

905 Deputy Lowe said the Report should have been earlier, wrong date and there should not be a spat between T & R and HSSD. As I have said, this overspend varied during the year and it was, roughly speaking, late September when issues concerning agency nurses, etc came, were highlighted and, therefore, this sudden increase in the budget. Then, of course, we were trying to work to bring it down.

Deputy Le Lièvre, thank you for your comments.

910 Deputy Dorey mentioned the SAP project and Deputy Stewart mentioned the SAP project and he said his officer was not going to do that. The whole point about these cross-departmental projects is the Departments have to co-operate with each other. If one goes off on their own, there is no point bringing in all the changes with SAP. In actual fact, our Department was one of them that used SAP most and some of the changes that they brought about means it is not quite so efficient for the type of function we need in our Department, but we are working with it, because it should be beneficial and it is very important that these cross-departmental issues are successful, because about 40% of the FTP savings are for cross-departmental issues.

915 Members of HSSD: I am extremely grateful for their support throughout this whole unfortunate business. They have all spoken well; they have all shown support to the Department and to myself and to our staff; they all care. The three who joined HSSD in May are now becoming established, knowledgeable members of the Board: it takes some time to get up to speed. I personally could not ask for a better, cohesive, yet diverse enquiring group to be on the Board.

920 The senior management team of HSSD appreciate their support, their questions and the fact that the management are expected to answer difficult questions. There is an excellent interplay between the members and the management team. Why destroy this after such a short time? They were all voted on unopposed; they all wanted to serve HSSD. Give them longer to show that we know where we are going. We have progressed and, although it may be a difficult path, I simply say to you, gentlemen, thank you and I really appreciate it.

925 In summing up, I wish again to apologise to all who were affected by the Board's decision. We tried to contain expenditure in December to reduce the total year overspend to under 2% of the budget. It is unfair on you. I accept that and I apologise. Our problem is we have to get a balance between what we are spending, what we can afford and what services can maybe be deferred, although the contract says it is eight weeks and eight weeks.

930 I thank the Chief Officer and his senior management team; the staff of De Sausmarez and Divette for coping with the changes; and all the staff and managers for assisting HSSD in the budgeting problem. My Department is well run. High quality staff who care about their work: all staff have worked hard to try and contain the budget. This whole issue has caused *deep* concern across HSSD.

940 As far as the quality of the services is concerned, we go through a quality assessment examination and that looks across *all* areas – that is from cleaning, portering, nursing, wards, theatres, etc. The one good thing that has happened in the last three or four days is that we have had an initial report from what's called HAQU, which was, I forget... Sorry, Deputy Trott, that is

another abbreviation! It is Health and Quality... Users. (*Laughter*) I cannot even remember it myself... that is quite right. And the report –

945 **Deputy Trott:** I understand, Deputy Adam – and TGIF! (*Laughter*)

Deputy Adam: Their initial report shows we have 99% success in all areas of quality. High-quality services: that is what you are getting. It is more than last time – initially.

So this report comes to us. We are told, there is something like over a thousand areas they have looked at, so we have just got maybe 10 or 12 to address: excellent result.

950 Sir, I do not play politics. I believe in what I do; I care about what I do. I, and every member of the Board, take our responsibilities seriously, both in relation to HSSD and to the corporate objectives. We made the decision on closures with due consideration. Was it a right decision? I can only say that we believed it was the best decision we could make in the situation we found ourselves. In actual fact, it is a no-win, no-win situation, between a rock and a hard place.

955 Members, this States Report was prepared on advice from T & R. If the HSSD overspend had been at a level anticipated when the Budget was reported, it would have been met from the Budget Reserve. As we know, since the projected *potential* was £2.5 million, that could not be carried out.

960 So has this debate been pointless? Actually, I think this debate has been very good. I accept there have been some personalities etc but, on the whole, we have had some excellent speeches, aspects of things that have not been discussed in public before. It has highlighted many of the underlying difficulties, not just for HSSD, because financial management, as I have said, does affect other Departments – Education, Home – because there are not the issues in place.

965 These issues all need to be addressed. At all times, Departments must achieve a balance: we have no choice. If we had kept spending and spending, T & R would have come to us and said, ‘Sorry, you are not looking after your budget, you should have got it down.’ If we try and get it down, people say, ‘Sorry, you made the wrong decision because it affects some people.’ Yes, we did affect some people but, as I said yesterday, we had to look at this and see which areas *can* you reduce for a short time.

970 The crisis at HSSD may, in retrospect, be seen as an important catalyst within the process of the review of the structure and functions of the legislature and Government now being undertaken. That may be something positive that has come out of this unfortunate situation. I ask you to support the recommendation in the Report.

975 Also, sir, two of my Board have intimated that, if there is a Vote of No Confidence debate, we will resign prior to it, because we do not believe that a Vote of No Confidence debate will be of any credit to this Assembly.

I think we should vote on this and then, if you wish, vote on us resigning, but I ask you, sir, after the result of this vote, if we can have a recess, so I can discuss that issue with my Board. (*Applause*)

980 **The Bailiff:** Right, well, let us go to the vote.
Members of the States, there is a single proposition. It is on page 2257.
Those in favour.

985 *Members voted Pour*

Deputy Bebb: Sorry, I was going to ask for a recorded vote, but it does not matter. (*Interjections*) We have seen that it was unanimous and therefore I will not ask.

990 **The Bailiff:** Well, I will put it to you again.
Those in favour; those against.

Members voted Pour

995 **The Bailiff:** *Nem con.*

As a result of the request from the Minister, I propose that we adjourn for ten minutes or...? Ten minutes.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.13 a.m.
and resumed its sitting at 11.44 a.m.*

1000

HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

**Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members
Debate adjourned**

1005

Article I.

The States are asked to decide:

1010

Whether, after consideration of the Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department dated 7th December, 2012, signed by Deputy M.P.J. Hadley and seven other Members of the States, they are of the opinion:

1. That pursuant to Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure, the States of Deliberation have no confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department.

1015

The Deputy Greffier: Billet d'État XXVIII, Article I, Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department.

1020

The Bailiff: Members of the States, I can advise you that I am holding five letters, one from the Minister of the Health and Social Services Department, addressed to me, and then there are four letters, one from each of the Members of the Department addressed to the Minister. In each case, they are resigning from their post and I can confirm that none of them is requesting that their resignation be debated by the States.

1025

I was informed by Deputy Hadley that, if that was the position, that they were all resigning, it would still be the wish of all the *requérants* that the Motion of No Confidence should proceed.

Deputy Le Lièvre: That is not the case, sir, at all.

1030

The Bailiff: Sorry, Deputy Le Lièvre is one of the *requérants*: he is saying that is not the case. Sorry, that is what I thought Deputy Hadley had said to me, that if that –

Deputy Hadley: Sorry, sir, I thought that was the position, as well. I am sorry if I have misrepresented, obviously, a couple of people.

1035

The Bailiff: Well, perhaps we could establish then whether... because a Requête requires the support of seven Members.

Are there still seven *requérants* who support the Motion of No Confidence?

1040

Deputy Hadley: Under a point of order, sir, is it the case, then, if the *requérants* can withdraw their support right the second before the debate? (*Interjections*)

A Member: Yes.

The Bailiff: Mr Procureur.

1045

The Procureur: I think that must be the case.

The Rules say that if any seven or more Members place a Requête, then that is what happens. This is just a special form of Requête, so if you have not got seven or more, well, you have not got a Requête – on the first part of it, anyway.

1050

The Bailiff: Yes. Are there still seven who – ?

1055

Deputy Dorey: Sir, would it be possible... I know we just had an adjournment, but we were not aware of this information. If we can just have a five-minute adjournment for the signatories to meet?

Deputy James: Thank you. Thank you, Mark.

1060

The Bailiff: Yes, the signatories could then meet. Yes, I propose, then, we adjourn for five minutes to enable that to happen.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.46 a.m.
and resumed its sitting at 11.57 a.m.*

1065

HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

1070

**Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members
Debate resumed
Proposition 1 not proceeded with**

1075

The Bailiff: Deputy Hadley, as the lead signatory on the Motion of No Confidence, could you advise the States what the signatories wish to do?

Deputy Hadley: We do not wish to proceed with the Vote of No Confidence, sir.

1080

The Bailiff: Right, thank you very much.
So you do not wish to proceed. I take it you are referring to Proposition 1 on page 2232:

‘That pursuant to Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure, the States of Deliberation have no confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department.’

1085

You do not wish to proceed with that Proposition, but to leave in play the Proposition 2, which is to elect a new Minister, and a new Department. Is that correct?

Deputy Hadley: Yes, sir.

1090

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.
In that case I will put that to the States.

The Procureur: Put that to the States, yes.

1095

The Bailiff: Yes, because it is a decision for the States, as to whether they agree that Proposition 1 – and this is what I am putting to you – on page 2232 not be proceeded with. Those in favour; those against.

Members voted Pour

1100

The Bailiff: In that case, we will not proceed with Proposition 1.

1105

HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

**Election of Minister
Deputy Dorey elected**

1110

*Article I.
The States are asked:
2. To elect:*

1115

*(1) a sitting Member of the States as Minister of the Health and Social Services Department to complete the unexpired portion of the term of office of Deputy A.H Adam;
to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.*

1120

The Bailiff: Instead, we will go straight to Proposition 2, which is to elect, first of all, a sitting Member of the States as Minister of the Health and Social Services Department to complete the unexpired portion of the term of office of Deputy A H Adam.

It is for the Chief Minister to nominate, if he wishes to do so, somebody, before I call for

nominations from the floor.

Chief Minister.

1125 **The Chief Minister (Deputy Harwood):** Sir, I would wish to nominate Deputy David Jones for Health Minister.

The Bailiff: And do we have a seconder?

1130 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Yes, sir. (*Laughter and applause*)

The Bailiff: So Deputy David Jones is proposed by Deputy Harwood and seconded by Deputy Le Tocq.
Do we have any other nominations?

1135 **Deputy Fallaize:** Sir, I am nominating Deputy Dorey.

The Bailiff: Deputy Fallaize is nominating Deputy Dorey. Do we have a seconder for Deputy Dorey?

1140 **Deputy Spruce:** Sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Spruce, thank you.

Do we have any other nominations?

1145 No? In that case, we need to engage the procedure and I remind Members that the Chief Minister and the candidate may each speak for five minutes.

So, Chief Minister, then, to speak in favour of Deputy David Jones.

Deputy Harwood: Sir, Members, I have pleasure in proposing Deputy David Jones for the office of Health Minister.

1150 As will be well known to the Members of this Assembly, Deputy Jones has been a Member of the Assembly since the year 2000. He came to the States with a keen interest in housing and his principal object was to get on to the Housing Board, where he was keen to do all he could to improve the social housing sector and find a way to fund a massive rebuild and new-build programme for the future. He became Vice President of Housing and, in 2004, following the reform of the machinery of Government, he was appointed by the then Chief Minister as the first
1155 Housing Minister.

Deputy Morgan, the Chief Minister, knew that Housing was a very difficult job and it would need a very stubborn, hard-nosed individual to drive improvements in its performance forward.
(*Laughter*) I think those of you who know Deputy David Jones will recognise the characteristics.

1160 It is also recognised, I think, at that time, that the position of Housing Minister was a 'poisoned chalice'. It was a political ball that was never out of the news, it had already seen off one Vote of No Confidence before Deputy Jones took over and I think those of us who have followed politics and those of us who have been involved with anything in the community will recognise the huge improvements that he has achieved through his leadership in Guernsey's housing situation – in particular, the introduction of the Corporate Housing Programme, the association with the
1165 Guernsey Housing Association.

Deputy Jones has always said he could not have achieved these credits on his own and he has always valued, and he continues to value, the hard-working staff that he has enjoyed in the Housing Department, but also to the fellow members of his Board, both present and past.

1170 Nevertheless, it has been to him to give political direction and he has done what was required of him, which was to give direction and leadership. He has led that Department ever since and was elected to his third term as Housing Minister in May this year, with a convincing vote in this Assembly.

1175 It is for these reasons that I now have no hesitation in calling on him to take up the challenging position as Health and Social Services Minister. He is one of our most experienced Ministers and has a wealth of political experience, managing a difficult Department. As we have all identified in the debate that has taken place so far, we recognise that HSSD needs to be restructured in a way that delivers the healthcare the Island needs, without running away with the costs and that is undoubtedly a job for an experienced Minister who can give leadership.

1180 No one can doubt Deputy Jones' social credentials. I think we all realise that he is a Minister

who cares about the needs of the Islander. He puts the Islander first.

1185 Having spoken to Deputy Jones, he has absolutely no doubt about the difficulties that lie ahead, if he is to be elected as Health Minister, or Minister of the Health Department. I hope this Assembly will give him their support and, although he will be extremely sad to leave Housing, he recognises that the Island's Health Service is an important job and deserves all the energy that an experienced Minister and leader can bring to it.

I hope, therefore, that this Assembly will support my nomination of Deputy Jones as Health and Social Services Minister.

1190 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.
Deputy Jones.

1195 **Deputy David Jones:** I have not prepared a speech, because I did not think we would actually get to this. I am saddened, actually, that the Health Minister has decided not to re-enter this race, but I think that he has been through the wringer lately, and that is a decision that he and his family have taken together.

1200 For me, it is leaving a fairly comfortable job at Housing and entering a cave, which I do not know what is inside. I am almost completely unarmed, other than the skills that I have gained over the years in politics and in leading a Department, and I have no doubt whatsoever that there are challenges inside this cave, and bears to be wrestled with that will need to be done succinctly and with some skill.

1205 I know Mark Cooke, the Chief Officer, the Medical Officer of Health. We have worked together on some joint projects on the extra care housing and I think that Health is served with a very competent Chief Officer. I have to warn him now, as he is sitting in the Gallery, we probably will not always agree (*Laughter*) and I do not always take the advice of my Chief Officer at the moment, as Dr Langford will tell you, or civil servants, when I do not believe that what is being proposed is politically acceptable.

I have got no more to say. I will leave it to the States to decide.

1210 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.
Next, Deputy Fallaize will speak in respect of Deputy Dorey.

Deputy Fallaize: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

1215 When I heard that my friend and Vale colleague, Deputy Jones, was to be nominated for this role, I was horrified – and I was not alone. You see, sir, Deputy Jones has been, and remains, a quite superb Minister of Housing, who was re-elected to that office by a big majority just a few months ago. Fortunately, we do not need to lose his knowledge and experience from the leadership of Housing, because we can be confident that, in Deputy Dorey, we would have an extremely able and committed Minister of HSSD.

1220 The States needs a Minister who can understand quickly and thoroughly the extensive and complex brief of the Department. Deputy Dorey is an intelligent man with an analytical mind. Moreover, as Minister of Social Security, he worked closely with HSSD, for example on policies for prescribing medicine and most especially on the Committee which manages the States relationship with the Medical Specialist Group. He understands that contract thoroughly and, of course, its renegotiation is one of the main tasks facing HSSD.

1225 The States needs a Minister who has relevant experience. HSSD is a Department of social policy and Deputy Dorey's wide experience of social policy includes service as a Procureur, membership of the Social Policy Group and of the Housing Department and, most recently, as Minister of Social Security. Crucially, having been Minister of Social Security, he knows how to lead a Department like HSSD, whose expenditure is, at least to some extent, demand led.

1230 The States needs a Minister – because of HSSD's significant budget challenges – who can plan and negotiate with T & R and who has a very solid understanding of States budget processes. Deputy Dorey was a member of T & R between 2004 and 2008, and he is again now. If elected, he will leave that Department, but his years of experience at the heart of policy making within T & R will be a significant advantage for him to take to HSSD.

1235 The States needs a Minister who can take into this role a real sense of energy and stamina. There can be few harder-working and conscientious Members than Deputy Dorey. He knows that the role of HSSD Minister will be all-consuming and I know that he has the energy and the capacity to do it.

1240 The States needs a Minister – because of the importance of the 20/20 vision – who can drive

strategic policy development and, according to Members who served with Deputy Dorey on the Population Policy Group and the Strategic Land Planning Group in the last States, that is one of his strengths.

1245 We must also bear in mind the successful candidate will have a role on the Policy Council. The Council is strongest when it is well balanced politically and Deputy Dorey will represent a significant body of opinion within this House.

Sir, I can do little better than to quote our present Deputy Chief Minister, who said of Deputy Dorey, when proposing him for a role in May:

1250 ‘...Deputy Dorey, working with him round the table, you will be certain that no stone will be left unturned, every legitimate *ormer* will have been eked out, and whatever conclusion is drawn, it will be certain that thorough investigation has taken place. *That* is the kind of team dynamic we need now.’

1255 Deputy Dorey is also politically courageous. He was prepared to bring to the States, on the eve of the General Election, very controversial proposals for social welfare reform and, despite that, he secured a big vote of public support in the Castel. He will need to marshal – and he will – all of that political courage and public support in tackling the big challenges which now face HSSD.

1260 So my one regret in proposing Deputy Dorey is that, if elected, I know I will probably lose him as my Vice Chairman of the States Assembly and Constitution Committee. Nonetheless, I have absolutely no hesitation in commending Deputy Dorey to the States. He would be an energetic, experienced, well briefed, wholeheartedly committed and extremely able Minister of HSSD and I ask Members to cast their votes for Deputy Dorey.

1265 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.
Deputy Dorey.

Deputy Dorey: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.
I would also like to thank Deputy Fallaize for his kind words and Deputy Spruce for seconding me.

1270 Having listened to the last debate, we are all very aware of the pressures that HSSD have been facing and will continue to face now and in the future, not only in discharging their very broad and complex mandate, but also in terms of controlling costs. I believe that I have the knowledge and experience to lead the Department in dealing with the many challenges and pressures that it faces in delivering a health system and social services that are sustainable and affordable to the Islands.

1275 As the previous Minister of Social Security, I have been involved in many areas where HSSD and SSD work together. For example, I attended joint meetings with the MSG and physiotherapy group, where I robustly represented the States to ensure that the waiting times were kept within contract. Recently, I have been T & R’s representative on the HSSD’s Electronic Health and Social Care Records project. Over the years, I have attended almost all HSSD’s presentations. In fact, at one presentation by the Medical Officer of Health, I was the only States Member there who was not a Member of HSSD.

1280 The knowledge I have gained means that I will be able to fulfil the role of HSSD Minister more effectively from the start. I know there are many challenges facing HSSD and, of course, at the forefront of everyone’s minds is the importance of staying in budget and meeting the FTP targets, while delivering services in the most efficient, effective and economic manner.

1285 My first priority for the new Board will be to understand the current situation and to ensure the Department has the resources, which might include outside resources and systems to be able to control, monitor and forecast its expenditure accurately and budget for significant one-off costs, based on their risk.

1290 I will do my utmost to work with the staff and the new Board to maximise efficiency and to ensure that spending is kept under control, without affecting vital front-line services. If this cannot be achieved, I will aim, with the help of T & R staff and the Board, to bring a Report to this Assembly with a budgetary model that works for Health and Social Services.

1295 I have mentioned the 15-year contract with the Medical Specialist Group, which terminates at the end of 2017. I am very keen to work on the future model. There are major strategic issues to address, including the split between on-Island and visiting specialists and how these are financed. The States must have knowledgeable representatives, who will be strong in negotiating suitable contracts.

1300 Staff recruitment is an area which has attracted much criticism. The policies must be reviewed and improved, so that recruitment is done in a timely manner to minimise the use of locums and

agency staff and their associated costs.

I am aware of several HSSD Reports to be debated in the next three months. The new Board must have time to review them before they are presented to the States, but I do not wish to delay the development of the new Acute Mental Health and Wellbeing Centre.

1305 There are many more challenges facing the new Board, including 20/20 Vision Mental Health, to name just a few.

I believe that I would bring a fresh approach to the role, characterised by energy, openness and willingness to listen. I have the ability to understand complex policy matters and strong mathematical skills, and a full understanding of States accounts and budgets.

1310 I offer strong leadership and I want a Board that can work together, even if, initially, they have different views. When chairing meetings, I encourage members to put forward their point. Their opinions are valued and respected.

1315 These open and frank discussions will lead to policies that are fully thought through, in order to find consensus, though I fully accept the right of Board members, if they hold different views, to put them to the States in debates. I believe I have the skills, the ministerial experience, motivation and energy to carry out the role of HSSD Minister. I ask Members to give me the opportunity to serve the community in this capacity.

The Bailiff: Members, it is now for you to vote.

1320 You have two candidates: Deputy David Jones, proposed by Deputy Harwood and seconded by Deputy Le Tocq; and Deputy Mark Dorey, proposed by Deputy Fallaize and seconded by Deputy Spruce.

A ballot took place.

1325

The Bailiff: Are there any more votes to be handed up?

The Greffier will now be retiring to count the votes.

I propose, as there is no other business, apart from the election of Members, as and when a Minister has been elected, that we rise while the votes are counted.

1330

The Assembly adjourned for six minutes while the votes were counted.

The Bailiff: Members of the States, the result of the vote for the election of a Minister for the Health and Social Services Department is as follows: Dorey, Mark Hirzel, 27 votes; Jones, David Brian, 16 votes.

1335

There were no spoilt or blank papers and I declare Deputy Dorey elected as the Minister. *(Applause)*

1340

Procedural

The Bailiff: Deputy Dorey, are you in a position to go ahead today with your nominations for members of the Department, or do you wish to have time to prepare?

1345

Deputy Dorey: I would like a little bit of time.

Preferably, I would like the House to come back at four o'clock this afternoon, if that was agreeable to them, which will give me time to prepare some speeches. I think it is also important, if anybody else wants to stand, that they can also put their names forward.

1350

The Bailiff: It is a matter for the States.

As you say, there may be other people who wish to propose other candidates and it is important that they have time to reflect and prepare for that, but what I will put to Members is the proposition that we rise now and return at four o'clock.

1355

Alderney Representative Arditti.

Alderney Representative Arditti: I hope the Assembly does not think this impertinent in any way. Would the Minister be able to make that 3.30 p.m? *(Laughter)* This is not to do with crosswinds, but it is similar. *(Laughter)*

1360

The Bailiff: Deputy Dorey.

Deputy Dorey: Yes, I can.

1365 **The Bailiff:** I will put to you the Proposition, then, that we rise now and return at 3.30 p.m.

1370 **Tribute to Deputy Adam
for his work as Minister**

Deputy David Jones: Could I just say a few words?

1375 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Jones.

Deputy David Jones: I think it is incumbent on the House to thank Deputy Adam (**Members:** Hear, hear.) and it is very emotional for me because we are losing a Minister.

1380 He has not been an incompetent Minister, he has given all his life to medicine and the care of people and I think this House should stand and appreciate that. (*Applause*)

Deputy Adam: A simple thank you to the Members of this Assembly.
I enjoyed the job at HSSD, but it is time for me to move on, maybe into another job.
Thank you sir.

1385 **The Bailiff:** Thank you.

1390 **Procedural**

Deputy Trott: One final thing. Is the Presiding Officer willing to have a slightly more relaxed attitude towards dress code later on this afternoon, sir? (*Laughter and interjections*)

1395 **The Bailiff:** I do not know how you are proposing to dress, (*Laughter*) but I look forward to seeing you later!

Members, I put to you the proposition that we rise now and resume at 3.30 p.m.
Those in favour; those against.

1400 *Members voted Pour*

The Bailiff: We will resume at 3.30 p.m.
Thank you very much.

1405 *The Assembly adjourned at 12.27 p.m
and resumed its sitting at 3.30 p.m.*

1410 **HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT**

**Election of four Members
Deputies E G Bebb, B L Brehaut, S A James, MBE, and M J Storey elected**

1415 *Article I.
The States are asked:*

*2. To elect:
(2) four sitting Members of the States as members of Health and Social Services Department to complete the unexpired portions of the terms of office of Deputies B. L. Brehaut; E. G. Bebb; D. A. Inglis and A. M. Wilkie*

1420 *to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States
Departments and Committees.*

The Deputy Greffier: Billet d'État XXVIII, Article I, paragraph 2(2), to elect four sitting
1425 Members of the States as members of the Health and Social Services Department.

The Bailiff: Deputy Dorey, Minister for Health and Social Services Department, do you have
four candidates you wish to nominate?

Deputy Dorey: Yes, thank you.
1430 I wish to nominate Deputy Bebb, Deputy Brehaut, Deputy James and Deputy Storey.

The Bailiff: Deputy Bebb, Deputy Brehaut, Deputy James and Deputy Storey, all proposed by
Deputy Dorey.

1435 Do we have a seconder?

Deputy David Jones: I would be happy to second.

The Bailiff: Thank you, Deputy Jones.
Do we have any other nominations?

1440 No? In that case, we go straight to the vote.

I put to you the four candidates, Deputies Bebb, Brehaut, James and Storey, nominated by
Deputy Dorey and seconded by Deputy David Jones.

Those in favour; those against.

1445 *Members voted Pour*

The Bailiff: I declare them elected.

1450 That almost concludes the business. I would just like to mention... Sorry, Deputy Dorey –
(*Laughter*)

**Thanks to Deputy Adam
for work as Minister of HSSD**

1455

The Bailiff: Deputy Dorey, do you wish to make a statement?

Deputy Dorey: I would just like to echo the words of Deputy Jones from this morning in
1460 relation to Deputy Adam and thank him for all the work he has done over four and half years as a
Minister of HSSD.

I would also like to pass my thanks on to Deputy Inglis and Deputy Wilkie, who I did not
propose, but also have served on the Board for six months.

Thank you.

1465

**Thanks to Alderney Representative Kelly
for parliamentary service**

1470 **The Bailiff:** Before we rise, Members, I would just like to note, unfortunately Alderney
Representative Kelly has not been able to attend because of weather conditions in Alderney. I
understand the first flight he could have caught would have been at four o'clock, so he would have
missed this sitting. (*Laughter*)

1475 You will be aware, all of you, that the Alderney electorate have spoken and that he will not be
returning as Alderney Representative next year. He has served in that capacity for two years and I
would just ask you to note and show your appreciation for the contribution he has made.
(*Applause*)

1480

Good wishes for Christmas and the New Year

The Bailiff: Finally, Members, as we rise for the last time this year, I pass on to you and your families and your loved ones the Season's Greetings, wish you all the very best for Christmas and I hope you return refreshed and ready for what may, no doubt, be some challenging debates but, hopefully, full of clichés in the New Year! *(Laughter)*
Happy Christmas to you all.

Deputy Lowe: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.
On behalf of the Members of the States, may I wish you and your family and, indeed, if you would be kind enough to pass our good wishes to His Excellency and Mrs Walker a very Merry Christmas on behalf of the States Members and hope you enjoy the break away from us also and look forward to seeing you in the New Year.
Thank you very much.

1495

Members: Hear, hear. *(Applause)*

The Bailiff: Thank you, Deputy Lowe and Members.
I will convey your best wishes to His Excellency and Mrs Walker.
Thank you.

1500

THE GRACE
The Deputy Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 3.33 p.m.