

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

REQUÊTE

**SUSPENSION OF CARRYING OUT OF WORKS FURTHER TO PROPOSALS FOR THE PARTIAL
REMOVAL OF THE ANTI-TANK WALL IN THE EASTERN PART OF PEMBROKE BAY (L'ANCRESSE
EAST) AND THE MANAGED RE-ALIGNMENT OF THE COASTLINE IN THAT AREA AND
ESTABLISHMENT OF A MORATORIUM PERIOD OF 10 YEARS DURING WHICH TIME SUITABLE
MAINTENANCE IS UNDERTAKEN TO PROVIDE STABILITY TO THE WALL**

The States are asked to decide:-

Whether, after consideration of the Requête dated 27th November, 2019, they are of the opinion:-

1. To agree that the carrying out of any works to implement the managed re-alignment of the coastline at L'Ancrese East as set out in Section 7 of the Policy Letter of the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure dated 18th August 2017 and described in Section 6, Volume 1 of the report "Guernsey Coastal Defences" prepared by Royal Haskoning Dhv further to the Resolution of the States made at their meeting on 29th September 2017 be suspended.
2. To agree that the period of suspension shall be 10 years from the date of this Resolution or such shorter period as the States may at any future time by resolution determine.
3. To direct the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure to arrange for implementation of a maintenance schedule as proposed in Recital 6.
4. In the event of a failure of the wall, resulting in the ingress of the sea onto the common, to direct the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure to revert to the States with proposals for minimising any damage to the common, which may include a proposal for managed re-alignment in accordance with the Resolution of the States of 29th September 2017 referred to in Recital 1.

The above Propositions have been submitted to Her Majesty's Procureur for advice on any legal or constitutional implications in accordance with Rule 4(1) of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

REQUÊTE

SUSPENSION OF CARRYING OUT OF WORKS FURTHER TO PROPOSALS FOR THE PARTIAL REMOVAL OF THE ANTI-TANK WALL IN THE EASTERN PART OF PEMBROKE BAY (L'ANCRESSE EAST) AND THE MANAGED RE-ALIGNMENT OF THE COASTLINE IN THAT AREA AND ESTABLISHMENT OF A MORATORIUM PERIOD OF 10 YEARS DURING WHICH TIME SUITABLE MAINTENANCE IS UNDERTAKEN TO PROVIDE STABILITY TO THE WALL.

THE HUMBLE PETITION of the undersigned Members of the States of Deliberation SHEWETH THAT:

1. At their meeting on 29th September, 2017 the States of Deliberation resolved as follows –
 - "1. To endorse the proposal to implement the managed re-alignment ("Option 7b") of the coastline at L'Ancresse East as set out in Section 7 of this Policy Letter and described in Section 6, Volume 1 of the report "Guernsey Coastal Defences" prepared by Royal Haskoning Dhv."¹
2. The managed re-alignment ("Option 7b") referred to in the above recited Resolution involves the removal of 130 metres of anti-tank wall in the Eastern part of Pembroke Bay, construction of rock armour groynes and creation of a managed realignment of the beach head in the area at an estimated cost of £1,000,000.
3. On 6th November 2018 the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure submitted a planning application in connection with the works described in order that the scope of any required Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) could be determined. Advice on the required EIA is awaited and the works now appear unlikely to commence before the summer of 2020.
4. Your Petitioners recognise that the integrity of the section of wall that will be effected by the proposed works will gradually decline if no works are carried out. They further recognise that some maintenance should be carried out in order to ensure that it is kept safe. However they are of the view that the carrying out of the totality of the works comprised in "Option 7b" will, amongst other things, detract significantly from the attractiveness of the area. In particular your Petitioners believe that the construction of the rock armour groynes on what is a pristine beach area will not prove

¹ See item 11 on Billet d'État No. XVIII of 2017.

to be visually attractive, and there are substantial risks that the envisaged re-alignment of a bay within a bay may not occur.

5. In the current circumstances your Petitioners believe that there is merit in agreeing to suspend implementation of Option 7b for a period of at least 10 years, unless the States at any future time by resolution determine otherwise.
6. If suspension of implementation of Option 7b were agreed, your Petitioners believe that maintenance should be undertaken to provide stability to the wall to give the optimum chance of the wall remaining intact for the 10 year period referred to in Recital 5. This is envisaged to involve work, as undertaken at panels 4 and 5 in 2018, to fill the voids in the wall and provide reinforcement to the toe of the wall. There will be the requirement to spend in the short term in the region of £100,000 at panels 8 and 9 to undertake similar work as carried out at panels 4 and 5. In addition it would be prudent to add additional rock armour to the toe of panels 4 and 5 as the previous work was undertaken with a short design life. The only other panel of concern at the moment is panel 11 which may require a similar spend during the moratorium period. It would be prudent to have a maintenance budget of £200,000 set aside and taken from the Minor Capital Allocation for Coastal Repairs budget to cover the estimated cost of any maintenance programme. It should be remembered that the addition of further heavier rock armour to panels 4 and 5 and the new heavier rock armour to panels 8 and 9 will of course be available and is needed, for the managed re-alignment (Option 7b) if it does go ahead in the future.
7. The option to suspend implementation of Option 7b, do no maintenance and intervene only in the event of a health and safety issue arising or a significant failure in the wall causing damage to the common was considered by your Petitioners. Adopting such an option would involve the enhanced risks of a breach in the wall occurring and damage caused by the ingress of the sea onto and erosion of areas of the common. In addition, any failure in the wall in those circumstances would then make access and repair more difficult. Although not the Petitioners favoured solution as detailed in Recital 6, it would in the opinion of the Petitioners nonetheless be in preference to the managed re-alignment (Option 7b) described in Recital 1.
8. Your petitioners acknowledge that if there is a failure of the wall, resulting in damaging ingress of the sea onto the common, this issue should revert to the States to decide whether to revert to managed re-alignment (Option 7b) or another course of action.
9. Your petitioners confirm that the Propositions set out below have been submitted to Her Majesty's Procureur for advice on any legal or constitutional implications.

THESE PREMISES CONSIDERED, YOUR PETITIONERS humbly pray that the States may be pleased to resolve:

1. To agree that the carrying out of any works to implement the managed re-alignment of the coastline at L'Ancrese East as set out in Section 7 of the Policy Letter of the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure dated 18th August 2017 and described in Section 6, Volume 1 of the report "Guernsey Coastal Defences" prepared by Royal Haskoning Dhv further to the Resolution of the States made at their meeting on 29th September 2017 be suspended.
2. To agree that the period of suspension shall be 10 years from the date of this Resolution or such shorter period as the States may at any future time by resolution determine.
3. To direct the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure to arrange for implementation of a maintenance schedule as proposed in Recital 6.
4. In the event of a failure of the wall, resulting in the ingress of the sea onto the common, to direct the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure to revert to the States with proposals for minimising any damage to the common, which may include a proposal for managed re-alignment in accordance with the Resolution of the States of 29th September 2017 referred to in Recital 1.

AND YOUR PETITIONERS WILL EVER PRAY
GUERNSEY

This 27th day of November 2019

Deputy A.H. Brouard
Deputy T.J. Stephens
Deputy N.R. Inder
Deputy L.B. Queripel
Deputy P.T.R. Ferbrache
Deputy A.C. Dudley Owen
Deputy R.G. Prow

The original signed copy of this Requête is held at the Greffe
and is available to view on request.