



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF DELIBERATION

OF THE

ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

HANSARD

Royal Court House, Guernsey, Monday, 19th October 2020

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Guernsey website www.gov.gg*

Volume 9, No. 45

ISSN 2049-8284

Present:

R. J. McMahon, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer

Law Officers

M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Procureur)

People's Deputies

S. E. Aldwell	C. J. Le Tissier
C. P. A Blin	J. P. Le Tocq
A. H. Brouard	M. P. Leadbeater
Y. Burford	D. J. Mahoney
T. L. Bury	A. D. S. Matthews
A. Cameron	L. J. McKenna
D. de G. de Lisle	C. P. Meerveld
H. L. de Sausmarez	N. G. Moakes
A. C. Dudley-Owen	R. C. Murray
J. F. Dyke	V. S. Oliver
S. P. Fairclough	C. N. K. Parkinson
S. J. Falla	R. G. Prow
P. T. R. Ferbrache	L. C. Queripel
A. Gabriel	P. J. Roffey
J. A. B. Gollop	H. J. R. Soulsby
S. P. Haskins	G. A. St Pier
M. A. J. Helyar	A. W. Taylor
N. R. Inder	L. S. Trott
A. Kazantseva-Miller	S. P. J. Vermeulen

Representatives of the Island of Alderney

Alderney Representatives S. Roberts and E. A. J. Snowdon

The Clerk to the States of Deliberation

Ms C. Foster (H.M. Deputy Greffier)

Absent at the Evocation

R. M. Titterington, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller)

Business transacted

Evocation	5
Convocation.....	5
Billet d'État XXI	5
Procedural	5
I. Committee <i>for</i> Economic Development – Election of President commenced.....	6
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 10.37 a.m. and resumed it sitting at 10.45 a.m.</i>	<i>21</i>
Committee <i>for</i> Economic Development – Deputy Neil Inder elected President.....	21
II. Committee <i>for</i> Education Sport & Culture – Deputy Andrea Dudley-Owen elected President.....	21
III. Committee <i>for</i> Employment & Social Security – Deputy Peter Roffey elected President.....	25
IV. Committee <i>for</i> the Environment & Infrastructure – Election of President commenced.....	28
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.38 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 12.45 p.m.</i>	<i>50</i>
Committee <i>for</i> the Environment & Infrastructure – Deputy Lindsay de Sausmarez elected President.....	50
Procedural	50
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.55 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.</i>	<i>51</i>
V. Committee <i>for</i> Health & Social Care – Election of President commenced	51
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 3.35 p.m. and resumed it sitting at 3.40 p.m.</i>	<i>65</i>
Committee <i>for</i> Health & Social Care – Deputy Al Brouard elected President.....	65
VI. Committee <i>for</i> Home Affairs – Deputy Rob Prow elected President	65
VII. Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of President commenced.....	68
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m. and resumed it sitting at 4.34 p.m.</i>	<i>77</i>
Scrutiny Management Committee – Deputy Yvonne Burford elected President	77
VIII. Development & Planning Authority – Deputy Victoria Oliver elected President.....	77
IX. Election of a President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission – Struck from record and deferred	79
X. States' Assembly and Constitution Committee – Election of President commenced	82
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 5.44 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 5.51 p.m.</i>	<i>96</i>
States' Assembly and Constitution Committee – Deputy Carl Meerveld elected President.....	97
Deferral of remaining business to Wednesday, 21st October 2020 – Motion carried	97
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 5.56 p.m.</i>	<i>98</i>

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Deliberation

*The States met at 9.30 a.m. in the presence of
His Excellency Vice-Admiral Sir Ian Corder, K.B.E., C.B.
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

The Bailiff: Good morning your Excellency and welcome to this meeting of the States of Deliberation.

PRAYERS

The Deputy Greffier

EVOCATION

CONVOCATION

- 5 **The Deputy Greffier:** Billet d'État XX – to the Members of the States of the Island of Guernsey I hereby give notice that a meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at The Royal Court House on Monday 19th October 2020 at 9.30 a.m. to consider the items listed in this Billet d'État which have been submitted for debate.

Article I – Election of a President of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

Billet d'État XXI

Procedural

- 10 **The Bailiff:** Well, good morning, Members of the States.

Before I invite Members to propose any candidate for the position of President of the Committee *for* Economic Development perhaps we can do a little bit of housekeeping first. If the two Alderney Representatives would like to take the two vacant seats, rather than sitting on chairs at the back, then they are welcome to do so. So there is one next to Deputy Meerveld and there is one next to

- 15 Deputy Helyar.

- Although we have not got there yet, in the hope that we will do so quickly, perhaps I can ask you to look at the Proposition in respect of electing a President of the Scrutiny Management Committee which is P2020/163. The main reason is because this is the first deliberate error, or errors, because as you will see the Proposition is to elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the
- 20 Committee *for* Environment & Infrastructure. We do not need two Presidents of the Committee *for* Environment & Infrastructure; we only need the one and some might even question that. (*Laughter*)

So can I invite you simply to score through the words 'Committee *for* Environment & Infrastructure' and replace them with 'Scrutiny Management Committee'.

25 The helpful, or at least I hope they are helpful, *nota benes* on each of the Propositions has a small error at the end of that one, so if you turn over the page you will see that it says that 'pursuant to the mandate of the Scrutiny Management Committee a President of the Committee shall not be the President or a Member of the Policy & Resources Committee or the President or a Member of more than one of the six Principal Committees'. That is again an error. It is just 'or a Member of any of the six Principal Committees'. So my apologies for not clarifying that in writing but I have done
30 so now.

So effectively during the course of today the President and the four Members of the Policy & Resources Committee are ineligible to be elected to most of the presidencies, in fact all of the presidencies, and the presidencies of the six Principal Committees are limited in the way that it is described and then the presidencies of the other Committees are similarly somewhat limited.

I. Committee *for* Economic Development – Election of President commenced

Article I

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Economic Development to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

35 **The Bailiff:** So with that introduction we come back to who would like to propose a candidate for the position of the President of the Committee *for* Economic Development?
Deputy Ferbrache.

40 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I would like to propose Deputy Inder.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded?

Deputy Burford: Yes, sir.

45 **The Bailiff:** Thank you Deputy Burford.
Deputy Soulsby.

Deputy Soulsby: Sir, yes I would like to propose Deputy Parkinson.

50 **The Bailiff:** Is Deputy Parkinson's nomination seconded?

Deputy McKenna: Yes, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy McKenna, thank you.

55 Any further nominations for this presidency? No.

Well, Members of the States, in a contested election, as you know, the way of proceeding will be similar to last Friday morning. So I am going to invite Deputy Inder and Deputy Parkinson as the two candidates to leave their seats from the floor of the Assembly and come up here on to the Bench with them being in alphabetical order which means Deputy Inder nearest the window and
60 Deputy Parkinson nearest the door.

The one difference between Friday morning's election and the elections today is that I do not propose to invite Members who wish to question the candidates when we get to question time to write their names on a slip of paper which I will then draw out of my toque, this time we will do it by me choosing those who are standing and I will do my best to be as equally handed as I possibly can in that regard.

So the starting point is the proposer of Deputy Inder will speak for up to five minutes then Deputy Inder will speak for up to 10 minutes, the proposer of Deputy Parkinson will speak for up to five minutes and then Deputy Parkinson for up to 10 minutes following which there will be up to 30 minutes of questioning, where that questioning has to be on a matter of policy included within the mandate of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

So without further ado I will invite Deputy Ferbrache as the proposer of Deputy Inder to address the Assembly. Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: Thank you very much, sir.

Sir, if there was one word to describe Deputy Inder it would be gusto because he has that in abundance. When he came into the States early on in the last term after the sad death of Deputy Jones he hit the ground running, he was like action man, woman, everybody else all rolled into one. He got things done and when the States decided, the people of Guernsey decided, that they wanted Island-wide voting the previous President of SACC quite properly said look I am a committed politician but this is not for me so I am going to resign I think somebody else who believes in that should take it over, a very principled decision. Deputy Inder took it over, bear in mind he is still a relatively new States' Member and he led that Committee, I was a Member of it probably the most junior or least effective Member of it, he led that really with conviction and ability and purpose and he got the job done.

Now he can be frustrated and I can remember when we had virtual States' Meeting one States' Member actually uttered an expletive which went out all over Guernsey because he was a little chagrined by some of the comments made by Deputy Inder but never mind, that is the man. He takes you forward he gets things done. He believes in pragmatism over idealism. He is a doer, he believes in theory and vision with the same exemplar as I do, he wants to actually achieve things, he wants to get this practically done.

He has been in the IT industry, he had got considerable experience of that, he has been a Member of the Committee, he has experience with small businesses, he has empathy with people, and he is a respecter of reputations, but he is not a fearer of reputations; he just stands up and says what he thinks, but he can be considered.

Deputy Inder and I have had many conversations over many topics and we sit down and we have a least on his part we have sensible conversations, we have a sensible discourse and we come to a decision that I think we can both live with on many matters.

I was the President of that Committee for about 18 or 20 months in the last Assembly. I cannot think of anybody ... having worked on that Committee and having known of his efforts on that Committee and having known him and travelled round with him over the last three or four weeks or whatever it was, five or six weeks for the election campaign, sat down with him in halls, sat down with him in hustings, heard what he said, heard what people have asked him, I really cannot think with such a very important Committee that there is a better person to do it and I commend Deputy Inder to the States.

The Bailiff: I now invited Deputy Inder to address the Assembly. Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Members of the States, in the next 10 minutes I am going to run through where the Committee *for* Economic Development should take part in leading the Island out of the Covid and into Revive and Thrive and I will get the 'me' bit out of the way first.

At 25 I was a director of an advertising firm that employed 30 people. In 1998 I transferred into the digital space and ran one of the Island's first web development agencies. I sold that in 2015 put

myself forward as a candidate in the Vale election, I lost miserably but was successfully elected six month later in the by-election.

115 As the former President of SACC it fell to me and my team to deliver the Island's first ever Island-wide General Election. It was a busy Committee that delivered 11 policy letters just this year, and I also maintained a seat on the Committee *for* Economic Development.

I may be many things but no-one will ever say of me that I am workshy. I enjoy a challenge and I have delivered. But that is all very interesting stuff. I am less interested in what people did yesterday, I am more interested in what people have done today or will do today, or will be doing today and tomorrow.

I will start with transparency and inclusion. I am particularly keen to knock down Committee walls. The levers of the economy do not necessarily lie in the hands of the CfED; population management, property portfolio, education, environment, planning and Aurigny all lie elsewhere.

125 Time is of the essence and if we have to bypass the more formal processes of the Government that is exactly what we need to do. We cannot identify issues relating to ambitious policy developments, collaboration, agility and transparency and wait four weeks for either the next Committee meeting or two months for letters passed between Committees. We need action and we need to do it now.

130 We talk about Guernsey's ability to act with agility yet our processes always kill progress and this needs to end.

I envisage a much closer tie between Economic Development and the new Home department, the DPA, the Environment department and I will meet with Presidents regularly to affect any issues resolving our various mandates that will move us all forward, and importantly Members it is not just about us. Having worked with senior officers across the organisation I have been detecting for months a desire for them to assist in that. Our officers want action, the Island wants action. You as a political body want action. The only thing stopping any of us is normally us. So let's please all of us resolve to change that.

140 You will all have received an email overnight in respect of my identified Committee Members and if successful I will outline the reasons for those recommendations. But for the record they are Deputies Sasha Kazantseva-Miller, Falla, Vermeulen and Blin and a recent expression of interest was Deputy Moakes. The final decision being made before Wednesday.

145 The new Economic Development Committee will have expertise from across the economy those who I have mentioned bring expertise collectively from just about every sector of our economy, and as a Committee we will elicit input and expertise from those outside the States who are employers big and small and who are entrepreneurs.

150 I am not saying that as President I will know all things about all areas of our economy but what I will do is make sure I work with people who do from finance, from retail, from construction, from the visitor economy, from the creative sector. Further to that I will be seeking a non-States' member to support the Committee in its function in financial development.

Last week I met with Mr Tony Mancini of the GIBA who has warmed to the concept and encouraged the Committee offering to assist in identification of a suitable candidate, and I thank Mr Mancini for his time.

155 Importantly for you as Members of our elected body my leadership will be inclusive. No one small group of Deputies owns any part of the States' mandate, we do not own the economy nor the development.

Over the next couple of months, I will ask you all for your input by way of seminars and/or invites to Committee drop-ins. I have developed a three-year programme of activity, a new policy direction, and this is what the Committee will do.

160 Within the first six months invite all Members to a series of seminars, we need your input into the economy, deliver the plan for fibre and connectivity. This Government, all of you, will make our Island's connectivity world class enabling fibre to business premises and homes and be assured that a Committee led by me will maximise the investment in our local on-Island economy as part of that.

165 In fact the localisation of major work will be the Committee priority. We will work to ensure that the States' 2020 Procurement Policy is translated into re-investment into the local economy. Government money invested back into the Guernsey economy to Guernsey firms to support Guernsey employment.

170 Of Guernsey Finance we will work with Guernsey Finance to consider their three-year business plan for uplifting funding. We will look at the Guernsey Finance's feet on the ground and if they want offices in various geographical locations to support our finance industry, we will deliver that.

As a starting point the review will recognise that £2.4 million plus staff costs to Visit Guernsey is a disproportionate commitment compared to Guernsey Finance only £1.5 million. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) That needs rectifying in a real and meaningful way and that will be centre of our role as promoters of the sector.

175 We will also include and implement an agency review. This will have recommendations on Locate Guernsey, Visit Guernsey and Digital Guernsey offer including pooled funding, pooled resources and the potential rebranding of a consolidated agency. There is a known argument to move Visit Guernsey out of Government completely to the private sector and I am clearly warm to that. We will appoint a non-States' member. That is the first six months.

180 Within the first year we will develop a new action plan for the visitor economy and accommodation and will ensure that we enable change of use for hotels and self-catering where it supports our economy or they are not needed there anymore.

185 We will also dust off the PwC report on tourism and set out the plan to invest in our tourism products. There will be completion to the next stage of the red tape audit starting a business and other areas of legislative compliance with a focus and what the States is doing is simply... the States simply needs to do what it needs to do and what we do not need to do, we will stop that happening.

We must make this a place where it is easy to start a business and where the States is involved in business as little as possible.

190 We will restart the work after Easter of 2021 on the business case for extending the runway with a view to completing by the end of 2021 depending on Covid and/or the fallout of the airline industry. Working with other Committees we will work to conclude this matter as soon as possible during this term.

We will also review the Open Skies policy for the same reasons. Global aviation has changed we may need to change too.

195 We know from the wider Brexit negotiations that we will need population management to act to sorry population management to even more actively support the ability of our employers to bring in the skills that they need for their businesses and for as long as they need them.

200 We include work with the Home department on approaching relation to business and to consider whether the population management office's direction should come from a more economic perspective.

During the first year we will also need to bring an operating framework for ferry services to the States support the development of the Eastern Seaboard and develop a residential strategy to help people back living in Town therefore driving our local economy including retail.

205 There is much to do to support the economy and I am confident that as a Committee we can deliver this.

210 The Committee I hope to lead will be four things. Focused – we will do what we need to do to support the economy; collaborative – we will work with other Committees with employers and business groups and all officers to ensure we deliver; positive – Guernsey is a great place to do business, we have a cracking product, we are going to work hard to make it even better, and we are going to invest in more effective promotion of our fantastic Island; decisive – we will do things not simply review things.

Members of the Assembly, on 7th October this Island went back to a factory reset. Let's all forget the yesterdays, our differences either real or imagined and work towards all of our tomorrows and Members of the Assembly, I seek your support.

215 Thank you.

The Bailiff: Before I call Deputy Soulsby as the proposer of Deputy Parkinson can I just remind all Members of the States and those present that mobile telephones must be switched off or put to silent. If another mobile telephone goes then there will be naming and shaming at that point.

Deputy Soulsby please.

Deputy Soulsby: Thank you, sir.

Oh, it just decides to play up as I am trying to use it – I knew I should not use new technology right at the very beginning!

I am very pleased to nominate Deputy Parkinson to continue in his role as President of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

A Cambridge Law graduate, he is fellow chartered accountant and was called to the Bar in London. He established one of Guernsey's largest financial services business practices and led that business for 21 years before entering the States in 2004. Four years later he was elected Treasury & Resources Minister during which time he chaired the States' Strategic Plan Team and the Energy Policy Group.

He stood down at the 2012 General Election when I stood for the first time, although I do not think the two are related, and spent a couple of years writing and researching books on Guernsey's ancient and early medieval history. However, he decided to put the past behind him and took the earliest opportunity to return to politics, returning to the States in a bye-election at the end of 2015.

Last term he began as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board and then took over as President of the Committee *for* Economic Development in 2017. Indeed both he and Deputy Ferbrache swapped places which kind of made sense as there is quite a bit of overlap between the two.

He managed to get the Waste Transfer Station project through the States and which was the only major capital project that started and finished in the last four years. The Waste Transfer Station is the physical infrastructure needed to export the Island's solid waste a policy that he proposed in 2004. He got the Economic Development Strategy through the States and then began implementing it and would like to continue doing so this term.

Many of you in your manifestos put the economy at the top of the list of the States' priorities this term. As such it makes sense having someone like Deputy Parkinson as President of the Committee *for* Economic Development a clever and able man who has many years' experience in business and in politics and has held the post for the last four years. This is a view shared by former Deputy Joe Mooney who sat on the Committee *for* Economic Development under Deputy Parkinson and he says: 'As President of the Committee *for* Economic Development Charles ensured we worked to a clear common and shared vision which was set out in the Economic Development Strategy approved by the States in 2018. He worked collectively as a team to deliver that strategy. Charles recognises that our economy needs stability and certainty and the role of Government is to create the environment for growth and investment and to remove the barriers not to micromanage what business can or cannot do. Charles in my opinion is the best man to leads the Committee for the Island's future prosperity.'

So I ask Members to vote for Deputy Parkinson as President of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

The Bailiff: Now I invite Deputy Parkinson to speak to the Assembly. Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Sir, I firstly wish to thank Deputy Soulsby for proposing me and for her kind words and to Deputy McKenna for seconding me for this post.

Together I think we represent a broad cross-section of political opinion within the Assembly including a balance of old and new Members. As an independent Member of the Assembly and with substantial political experience I very much hope to play a part in bringing the new Assembly together.

If I am successful the team I will propose for Membership of the Committee will be similarly broadly based and diverse.

270 As Deputy Soulsby has described before the end of 2017 I was President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board so my period at the helm of Economic Development began in early 2018. The Committee was reconstituted following the resignation of two of its original Members but as soon as we got our feet under the table we began work on an Economic Development Strategy which we got through the States in July of 2018.

275 Briefly that strategy identified 20 work streams that we wished to prioritise and the list was further prioritised in October of 2018 into sort of higher medium and lower priority objectives.

Despite the fact we have had only two years to implement the strategy significant progress has been made, clear objectives and outcomes for an air sea links were put forward and approved by the States in late 2018; air transport was deregulated by the States in July 2018; nine new air routes were introduced and passenger numbers through Guernsey Airport increased for the first time in 20 years. Under instruction from the States we commissioned a cost benefit analysis for an extension of the Airport runway which was delivered on time and for about 50% of budget.

280 We have commenced negotiations with Jersey and with Condor on a new ramp licence agreement; we established a Guernsey retail group and agreed to fund a retail manager for the Island for the next three years; we reorganised support for entrepreneurs and business start-ups based on the Digital Greenhouse in co-operation with key private sector partners; we commissioned a red-tape audit led by industry and had begun to implement its recommendations; we have encouraged more co-operation between our promotional agencies Locate Guernsey, Guernsey Finance, Visit Guernsey and the Digital Greenhouse.

290 However, much of the Economic Development Strategy has been overtaken by the Covid-19 pandemic and our focus must now shift– it is clear that the economic impacts of Covid-19 will be with us long after the health crisis has passed. Whole industries have been severely damaged and may struggle to recover and other businesses have been forced to develop new ways of working which may become part of the new normal.

295 Today Mr Andrew Bailey, the Governor of the Bank of England, is reported as saying: 'The UK faces unprecedented economic uncertainty'. And for Guernsey too the future is clouded. The impact of Covid-19 will be further compounded by the end of the transition period for the UK's exit from the European Union. We will discover in the next few days what access we will have to the European market in goods from 1st January, what agreements are possible in respect of fisheries; what implications there are for our intellectual property regime etc. etc. Some of these changes may have significant impacts on us.

300 Furthermore these developments are accelerating trends that were already apparent before Covid-19. The consolidation in the financial services sector, the replacement of administrative jobs by artificial intelligence and the growing pressure on offshore finance centres from the major economies, not new developments but they will be compounded in the post-Covid world.

305 Economic Development is one of the three pillars of the Revive and Thrive strategy agreed by this Assembly and my Committee will be keen to play its part in leading the work on that pillar.

310 The key themes of our programme to build back better will be economic diversification, sustainability and rebranding Guernsey. These themes will inform a series of policy developments including a new telecoms strategy; a new tourism strategy; a new retail strategy – all these reflecting the impacts that we have experienced under Covid – increased support for financial services and a review of transport policy.

315 We will work with other Committees to ensure that our population management regime, the Island Development Plan, the mandate of the Guernsey Competition Regulatory Authority and the direction from the States to the Guernsey Financial Services Commission on the matter of risk appetite are fit for purpose.

Within these policy areas we will study a number of projects as possible candidates for inclusion in the Revive and Thrive programme. For example extension of the fibre optic network on the Island, promotion of digital industries generally, opportunities for Guernsey in health tech, publishing

320 researched by Oxentia, research which is almost complete on the feasibility of an international university on the Island; considering macro renewable energy projects; considering opportunities in the blue economy, taking into account the research being conducted by the STSB at the present time considering the Island's needs for a commercial port facilities.

325 We will bring to the States the Frontier Economics Report on the cost benefit analysis for a runway extension when they have reviewed that report in the light of the pandemic and the effect of the pandemic on the global aviation industry.

Work on some of these can commence immediately and others will develop over the coming years.

330 Fortunately the economic element of Revive and Thrive has already started because most of the elements of the programme were already in the Economic Development Strategy approved in July 2018. Revive and thrive is therefore essentially an accelerated programme supported by more resources. So we can hit the ground running.

335 Sir, I have a proven track record of delivering results, I work well in teams, and I have always co-operated with colleagues despite political differences, the testimony from former Deputy Joe Mooney is a vivid example of that. I am from the political centre and I will remain an independent so I believe that I am well placed to lead the economy recovery pillar of Revive and Thrive.

340 Delivery of the result of this programme depends on an element of continuity between the old Committee and the new we are essentially carrying forward an existing programme. It is already apparent from the elections that took place last week that all of the other Principal Committees of the States will have new presidents in this term but in economic policy as much as any other area continuity is important, industry wants Government to have clear and consistent purpose.

So I respectfully ask Members to ensure that at least one States' Committee the Economic Development Committee is able to continue on the path it has been forging for the last two years at this crucial moment in history when the health of our economy is more fragile than ever. I ask for your support to build back better.

345 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.

Well, Members of the States, we now go into up to 30 minutes of questions to the two candidates where the question posed will be answered by them alternately each time.

If you wish to ask a question will you stand in your place and I will then call you.

350 Deputy Dudley-Owen to be followed by Deputy Vermeulen.

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Thank you, sir, and apologies for my phone going off before.

Can the candidates please identify what the biggest single risk they see that Guernsey faces to its economy in the next four years that the States can influence?

355 Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

360 **Deputy Inder:** The risk to the economy is simply as stated is what is going to happen to the finance industry. Now we do not control absolutely everything but what we have a job under our mandate is to promote the finance industry. At the moment we spend £2.4 million plus costs on Visit Guernsey we invest £1.5 million in Guernsey Finance and what we need to do is work with them, reinvest in them, give them ability to work in geographic locations and for them to develop products. I will be throwing money immediately into Guernsey Finance because without that...
365 without the finance sector we are in an awful lot of trouble.

The Bailiff: Before I call Deputy Parkinson can I just remind all Members that they should stand up when they are addressing the Assembly.

Deputy Parkinson please.

Deputy Parkinson: Well the risk to Guernsey's economy is that we have rather a one legged stool. 43-44% of our GVA is provided by the finance sector the industry that I grew up in and which I know so well.

But we need to mitigate the risks because that sector is under threat from other jurisdictions and from technology. So my plan to mitigate that risk is to diversify the economy not only to broaden... to reduce our dependency on the finance sector but also to provide a wider range of jobs and help address the demographic issues which threaten our Island because young people many of them will not stay here. They do not want jobs in the finance industry and they cannot afford to buy houses here. We need to sort that out.

The Bailiff: Deputy Vermeulen.

Deputy Vermeulen: Sir, can I ask the candidates I notice recently that Jersey were listed as third fastest in the world for broadband speed behind Taiwan and Singapore, can I just ask you in two parts would you think... why that has not happened to us why there has been no investment in the last four years and what the next four years might look like for making us competitive with high speed broadband?

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Well the current telecoms strategy requires fibre to every business on the Island and 100-megabit broadband to every house. This was tested to destruction really during the lockdown period when children were working remotely and people were working remotely from their businesses. Clearly we found some weaknesses in the system and there is no doubt at all that more investment is needed. But it is not true to imply that Guernsey has no highspeed broadband or internet. Sure has 500 kilometres of fibre in the road, JT has its own network. Clearly more investment is needed I think this is something we can get on with straight away. Fibre to the household would be a very expensive policy to implement but I am sure we can make great progress in improving resilience and speeds.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: I cannot really add much more to that because I was on the same Committee as Deputy Parkinson but I agree with him. But to add to that what I would like to see and whatever policy comes out of this we start with the business sector.

We talk about the final mile it is not actually a final mile it is normally about the final 300 metres between the fibre in the road and the house. Personally for me where I am as someone who lives in probably the wrong end of the network I would not like to see millions and millions of pounds pent just to get fibre across my road to my house, so whatever the policy comes out it has got to be concentrated on where it is most important and I suspect it is round the business and main residential areas and the Inder's at the end of the road can probably wait a few more years because it is really expensive to get fibre across the road from my house to Rochelle Road.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

Can the candidates please give their views on whether the creative industries are an area that they see fit to invest in and support in this moment in time?

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: I am happy to answer that one because I have come straight out of creative industries. When I started a number of... the first company was KWFL Advertising and importantly Submarine which is 21 years old this year won the primary bits... one of the first contracts we had was Government money now Government money set us on... it was a small £40,000 job set us on a path to develop our business that has been running 21 years. The importance of spending local money from the Government into our economy cannot be understated, and when it comes to the creative industries I cannot for the life of me understand why visit Guernsey is currently using UK suppliers when all the talent is sitting on this Island. I have banged on that door for the last years and I have got absolutely nowhere. If you put me in position, I will kick that door down.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes I think creative industries are very important and particularly as an adjunct in the digital world because I think Guernsey has a potentially bright future in the digital industries, that includes obviously cyber security, data management, data storage and so on, but it also includes digital media. I actually think that having a creative industry component for example in the curriculum of a possible international university on Guernsey would be very constructive and conducive to the establishment of brilliant high value added industries on the Island.

The Bailiff: Deputy Leadbeater.

Deputy Leadbeater: Thank you, sir.

Both candidates have mentioned diversification of the economy during their pitches, Deputy Parkinson mentioned the blue economy. I would like to hear what kind of support each candidate would pledge to give to new industries such as the blue economy and also nascent CBD industry – I will declare an interest at this point sir – but I would like to hear from both Members how they would support emerging industries and new sectors such as the blue economy.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Well there are some things we can do in the blue economy very quickly and easily and we should just get on with them. Constructing a floating marina in the pool of the St Peter Port Harbour would not only allow us to accept more visiting yachts it would also act as a wave break and shelter the inner marinas of the Harbour and so it is an easy win and not all that expensive.

Beyond that there are other opportunities around Guernsey in the vast sea resources we have, obviously aquaculture, fisheries and so on, and some of those we will continue to operate and exploit now. But I think what we need to do is a marine spatial environment survey to discover actually what there is under the sea around us because I think without that it is difficult to actually decide what opportunities can be developed there.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Sir, Deputy Leadbeater CBD and that area of the business is an exciting area and you will know that I have worked quite hard to find ways to ensure that the applications for companies in that sector have been in some way made easier, and I think you will find now that they have been taken out of the political atmosphere and moved down to the administration level and that came as a direct response and direct effort from myself.

Looking at the blue economy and looking forward I think we have got one heck of an opportunity. In July last year we decided or what was enacted that we now own our territorial waters and there are complications relating to existing agreements, however, in terms of vision, I can see

us effectively owning our waters to the point where it becomes one of Europe's largest marine reserves. Now marine reservation does not mean you ban fishing from it –

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder I am afraid that is your –

Deputy Inder: Sorry, I beg your pardon.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

What changes if any would the candidates make to the current system of regulation of utilities?

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: The regulation of utilities. If we head down this route and there is a potential route of looking at some kind of privatisation of it, that worries me quite intensely. But in terms of the actual regulation it needs reviewing because there seems to be a point where we have only real got a lot of cost for not a lot of regulation. I genuinely think that needs some kind of immediate review. Because we get lots of messages particularly from Guernsey Electricity they wonder why they are regulated to such a point it becomes a massive administration burden where they might want to spend some of that money providing better services for their customer bases which are you and me.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes, in March this year Jersey gave us notice that they wanted to terminate the Channel Island Competition Regulatory Authority arrangement, and since the beginning of July we have been on our own. We re-established the Guernsey Competition Regulatory Authority and we know see this as an opportunity. The mandate of the old CICRA frankly was not very appropriate we were regulating things that really did not need to be regulated like the rate of charges for postal for letter post and trying to regulate Guernsey Electricity as a company when other things that are much more important to the Island were unregulated and we need to look and look urgently at what the mandate for the Guernsey Competition Regulatory Authority should be.

Should we be managing for example regulating the supply of freight routes to the Island, should we be managing in terms of electricity we should be managing the market –

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson I am afraid your minute is also up.
Deputy Kazantseva-Miller.

Deputy Kazantseva-Miller: Thank you, sir.

The climate action policy mandated the Committee for Economic Development to explore economic opportunities in mitigating climate change. What do the candidates think these opportunity could be?

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes, I see green issues as an economic opportunity for Guernsey generally. We have a world-wide and growing reputation for green finance and I think as long as we walk the walk as well as talk the talk Guernsey can become a paragon for the circular economy and sustainability. So I think in terms of the climate action plan we clearly need to look at our renewable energy opportunities, we have had a great success with the solid waste transfer system that we now

have an Island wide recycling rate of 73%, Jersey's is 30%. Guernsey is the green Island and we need to ram that message home to the outside world.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: I think I would start with what we can do and what we can do is communicate this with the DPA. I see a point where to be perfectly frank with you I do not see why there is any roof in Guernsey which does not have some kind of renewable energy attached to it, and it seems sometimes that there are elements within the planning that need to reflect on what they can do in terms of exemptions.

Looking past that in terms of the actual sustainability and green business we have invested an awful lot of... some money actually in Guernsey Finance, I think it was to the tune of £300,000. So if we cannot do it here we can certainly be seen to be helping elsewhere.

We do have limitations of what an Island can do but I will remind Members that over the past 30 years Guernsey has accidentally –

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder again I am afraid your minute is up.
Alderney Representative Roberts.

Alderney Representative Roberts: Thank you, sir.

Can the candidates give any assurance that the Committee will start working on a joint strategic plan with Alderney to improve our economy and explore the reasons of our decline?

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: I am glad the Alderney Representative has asked that question because I think there is a lot of talent in Guernsey there is actually a lot of talent in Alderney as well but sometimes I would certainly move to make efforts for a new Economic Development Committee to come up and work with Alderney in some way so we can work on some joint ideas.

Alderney is a great blank canvas and to answer your question I do not know why it has not better than it is because something is not quite right up there and I would like to get to the bottom of it and I will help Alderney.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes, sir, economic development is not one of the transferred services which are managed by the States of Guernsey for Alderney, but it is very much in the interests of the residents of Guernsey that Alderney should succeed and prosper. I believe we should continue to work well with our colleagues on the northern Island to develop economic initiatives which both Islands can benefit from.

So Alderney has its own Economic Development Strategy Guernsey has its Economic Development Strategy but they need to be symbiotic. We need to support each other and I am a big fan of Alderney, I lived there as a child, as a young child and I want to see the Island succeed.

The Bailiff: Deputy Falla.

Deputy Falla: Sir, do the candidates have any plans to increase the support available to Locate Guernsey?

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Locate Guernsey is reasonably well funded and we have increased the number of staff there. It has done a fantastic job over the last two years and increasingly successful in attracting high net worth individuals. I want the agency to focus more on attracting entrepreneurs not necessarily already at the top of their careers but people who are on the way up, and of course their work has been interrupted by Covid-19, they have not been able to do all the presentations and seminars they wanted to do, but it is an agency that I think has done incredibly well and they will continue to have my full support.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Sir, I think some of that falls in part of the agency review and if it needs more funding it needs more funding, but also there is something called digital nomads, and they are people that rove around the world developing products, developing applications and living in quite funky places. Well Guernsey is one of the funky places. But there is an opportunity there but I think it is related to the actual Law and that is all related to population management where you can actually live in Guernsey and work in Guernsey. So there are things that we again as I said in my speech that we just cannot do and it is that relationship with the Home department that we need to work with the Population Management to see if we can find opportunities for people to come to the Island and work. But in short yes I think they have done a great job but there is a lot more to do and quickly.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: Do the candidates agree with me that a permit system for the white van man needs to be introduced?

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: I think what I would start with is when I looked at the unemployment figures they are effectively, there was no-one with any trades that was unemployed at the moment, i.e. the electricians, the carpenters, the plumbers and all of that kind of thing, so quite clearly there is money in this Island wanting to be spent and there is a need for us to allow that money to be spent, but for a direct licensing system for white van man, I am not going to say anything just to get a vote Deputy Queripel but right now I do not think that is our priority.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes I defer to Deputy Inder's expertise on white van men. Basically in principle it would be nice to have some system of regulation and registration for people coming to this Island to do work, but it is very difficult in practice to stop somebody coming over here with his tools and doing a job.

So I think it is one of those issues that frankly we just have to learn to live with. Where people come here persistently and are working in the Island for many months or even years then I think we will have to find ways of bringing them within regulation and registration.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, with reference to yet another review the agency review could the candidates explain what actions they will actually take to ensure synergies from the various promotional agencies, Visit Guernsey, Locate Guernsey and Guernsey Finance?

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

630 **Deputy Parkinson:** Well in the two years I have been responsible for it the agencies are working much better together than they ever before.

Visit Guernsey sits slightly to one side and of course at the moment their work has been very badly disrupted, but Locate Guernsey works very well with the Digital Greenhouse and it increasingly works well with Guernsey Finance.

635 I have been commissioning this agency review, or trying to force this through since the beginning. There are areas like Guernsey Finance which to some extent is jealous of its territory because it is partly funded by industry and even there I think there are opportunities to share resources. You do not need two event management teams, you do not need two PR functions. So it is definitely on the work stream it is something we are doing. It is working much better together
640 than it ever did before but we can make improvements.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

645 **Deputy Inder:** I am committed to concluding that within the first six months. It has been going on for far too long. We need to effectively look at pooling resources between Locate Guernsey and the Digital Guernsey and as I said as part of my pitch whether Visit Guernsey plays a role in that I know not right now part of me believes and quite a strong part of me believes that needs to be out in the private sector. But Deputy St Pier I will commit to completing that within the next six months.

650 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Thank you, sir.

There is concern on the High Street and Island wide with respect to the future of the hospitality and retail industries with Covid and Brexit. Can I ask the candidates what support should be given
655 by Government to those industries going forward?

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

660 **Deputy Inder:** Anyone who has been in the States before will have heard me say we have got Aurigny on one side, tourism on the other, and we have got £2.4 million spend we had well it was £4 million it is now £9 million probably £20 million now. I do not understand why these two are not connected in some way. Next year for tourism we need to use Aurigny as a real economic enabler and there is no time to waste, but I find it almost impossible to get anywhere near it, so that is something that we need to do.

665 We also need to do an accommodation strategy there is far too much tertiary accommodation out there, and if it needs to leave the industry it needs to leave the industry. But to answer your question on retail. We have got a three year programme at the moment a lot of it is creating events and data capture. But Deputy de Lisle and to you, sir, we need a retail strategy, the best thing you can do about a Town is to get people living in the Town.

670 Deputy Le Tocq said something like 5,000 people we get people living in Town you have a thriving Town, and that is absolutely critical because we are letting that old lady effectively be surrounded by policies –

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder I am afraid that is your minute.
675 Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes, I said in my speech that the tourism strategy and retail strategies both need to be completely rewritten as a result of the Covid-19 epidemic.

Both industries have been very severely damaged and retail of course is affected by long term structural changes due to the internet and online shopping, tourism, who knows what the long term
680

impacts on the aviation industry will be, but we need urgently to reconsider the opportunities for those industries and to see what we can do to support them. We are already supporting retail with a three year programme and appointment of a retail manager that we are paying for and we need to repurpose I think our shopping areas to become more of an entertainment type of experience. Shopping needs to become a leisure activity.

The Bailiff: Deputy Gabriel.

Deputy Gabriel: Thank you, sir.

Would the candidates agree that the arts contribute to the economy how would they prioritise the arts and what encouragement would their Committee give?

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

Deputy Parkinson: Yes there are some sites within the Seafront Enhancement Area which have been identified as potentially sites for galleries and so on, one in particular is the Vivier Bunker on the Castle Emplacement which I think would make an excellent foundation for a gallery, it would involve constructing around it but it could certainly be a centre for living arts.

I am also very keen that we should build a Victor Hugo Centre because Victor Hugo is a massively underexploited asset of this Island. How many people outside Guernsey know that Les Misérables was written in Guernsey? I suspect not many and it is the world's most popular musical.

I am passionate about building around the arts and bringing arts into digital media and so on and so forth it has a massive contribution to make.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Just to support Deputy Parkinson's view of building a Victor Hugo centre, but this is all part of the 2017 report and we have seen nothing over the last two or three years. Now we need to dust off that PwC report and actually start getting some action.

Unfortunately tourism under the current regime again seems to be locked in a box and the Committee Members do not seem to be able to get anywhere near it. So we need to dust off that report very quickly, get it back to the Assembly, we do not need another two year review we can pick out and start working on action plans.

But your general point Deputy Gabriel I will say to you, sir, I am out of the creative industries, that is where I was born and that is probably where I will die in some sort of way, and it does worry me that we start worrying too much about things get lost in translation we worry about jobs and processes and it is always the case that I can never make the argument from a hospital bed against the –

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder once again that is your minute.

Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Yes, Deputy Dudley-Owen and others and many other people in the community have said one of Guernsey's strongest assets are its natural produce, farming, food, ice cream, chocolates, all kinds of things. How well would the two candidates work to promote our local self-sufficiency smallholding economy and also promote Guernsey better at gateways like Harbours and airports so that Guernsey has a brand for all the small cottage industries on the Island?

The Bailiff: Deputy Gollop that is the end of your question.

Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: That one is fairly easy, sir.

735 Last year I tried to make a pitch to our Committee we had thousands of liner passengers either coming into the Port or out of the Port and could I get anything out of the Committee then to get to a point where we could get the cheesemakers, the chocolate makers to effectively fleece the liner passengers for their last 20 quid out of the Island. I could get nothing it is always an impossibility and I cannot express my... the problem that we have got within Committee where tourism is and the lack of ability for us to actually talk to the Harbours and this process, we have got to break all those doors down. But as a general point Deputy Gollop I agree Guernsey has got some great
740 manufacturing products in the cottage industry and we need to find a way to promoting it. One of the things would be selling them to the liner passengers.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

745 **Deputy Parkinson:** Well I remember those discussions on Committee and as I recall the reason why we could not put stalls on the Albert Pier was because of traffic restrictions, it was nothing to do with our Committee. But yes we need to promote the Guernsey mark. We need people outside the Island to understand that produce from Guernsey is exceptionally high quality. Our butter is actually outstandingly good and is very popular in the Netherlands, especially for making ice-cream.
750 These things are assets that we can exploit. We can brand the whole lot if you like as Golden Guernsey and try and uplift the market for all of these products so we must work on that.

The Bailiff: Deputy Oliver.

755 **Deputy Oliver:** Thank you, sir.
At the moment with Brexit they seem to be using Sea Fisheries as a bargaining chip. How would the Committee actually help encourage fisheries?

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

760 **Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, there is no doubt that Fisheries is going to be the big issue in the discussions between the EU and the UK as far as they concern the Channel Islands, and those discussions are going on probably even as we speak, and I am afraid we are caught in the geopolitical game where the interests of the Channel Islands may well be neglected and where the
765 UK Government has already threatened to legislate for us if we will not implement the agreements that they arrive at.

So this is an immensely sensitive area I think we will do whatever we can to defend our fisheries, clearly the French boats have some of them have historic rights to fish in our waters they will have to have some access but we need to contain that access as much as possible and try and establish
770 as many conservation measures as we can around our waters to prevent them being fished out.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

775 **Deputy Inder:** One of the last things I did on the Committee was start a process of working with the Sea Fisheries on ensuring that we have effectively a whole regulated market when it comes to the sea foods. Sea Fisheries Law at the moment only works for the regulated market not the unregulated market. Previously I worked with Deputy Trott I think it was on the SMEF agreement. I think whatever we do we cannot get belligerent. It is true what Deputy Parkinson says we are a pawn in a geopolitical game, but what Guernsey cannot be is belligerent, and we have to find a way
780 of working with our French counterparts, and I think between us and I have got a good relationship with the local fishing fleet and I think I am starting to build on the French fishing fleet I think I am in a position to be able to assist in working across those three markets.

Now what the UK does it will probably do on its own, but my view is quite simple we leave our guns at the door and we try and work with our French counterparts and see if we can see some sense between Paris and, hopefully, the regional areas as well, such as Normandy and Brittany.

The Bailiff: Well, Members of the States, that is 30 minutes believe it or not, and therefore the question time to the two candidates is complete.

Can I suggest that we do as we did on Friday morning and show your appreciation for the way that they handled their speeches? *(Applause)*

So, Members of the States, we come to the vote for the office of President of Committee for Economic Development there are the two candidates: that is Deputy Inder who was proposed by Deputy Ferbrache seconded by Deputy Burford, and Deputy Parkinson who was proposed by Deputy Soulsby and seconded by Deputy McKenna.

I would ask you take your voting slip and simply write the name of the candidate that you would like to see elected to that office please and then hand it to the Sheriff and the Deputy Sheriff.

Are there any more voting slips to be handed in, Members of the States?

I think what we will do on this occasion, Members of the States, is to rise probably for no more than three or four maybe five minutes at a push so that you can stretch your legs and be back in the Chamber as quickly as possible for the result, otherwise you might miss the next bit of fun.

*The Assembly adjourned at 10.37 a.m.
and resumed it sitting at 10.45 a.m.*

Committee for Economic Development – Deputy Neil Inder elected President

The Bailiff: Well, Members of the States, the voting for the Presidency of the Committee for Economic Development is as follows: Deputy Inder 20 votes; Deputy Parkinson 18 votes, 1 spoiled paper and 1 blank paper. Therefore, I declare that Deputy Inder has been elected as the President of the Committee for Economic Development. *(Applause)*

Perhaps both of you can return to the seats that you were occupying before please and in future maybe the simplest solution is to do that before the result is announced.
Greffier.

II. Committee for Education Sport & Culture – Deputy Andrea Dudley-Owen elected President

Article II

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article II – Election of a President of the Committee for Education Sport & Culture.

The Bailiff: Members of the States, does anyone wish to propose another Member for this Presidency?

Deputy Ferbrache.

815 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I propose Deputy Dudley-Owen.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded?

Deputy St Pier: Delighted to second it, sir.

820

The Bailiff: Thank you very much Deputy St Pier.

Any other nominations for this Presidency?

Well what that means, Members of the States, is that we still have speeches but the vote will then be put to you *aux voix*. So I am going to invite the proposer of Deputy Dudley-Owen, Deputy

825

Ferbrache to speak for up to five minutes.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, when I first met Deputy Dudley-Owen four and a half years ago I thought she was quirky, now I have known her for four and a half years I know she is quirky, but she is also extremely able. She is a person who listens, she is a person who empathises with people. I cannot

830

think of anybody that does not like her. But she is a person with strong views; she is a principle person; she is a person that unites people; she is a person who gets things done.

She really is the person for the right job at the right time. I am very glad that she will be I am sure elected unopposed because I think she will bring much to the States both in this term and hopefully in terms to come.

835

The Bailiff: Deputy Dudley-Owen, you may address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Thank you, sir.

I have great thanks for my proposer and seconder for this Presidency.

840

During the last term I sat on two Committees concurrently – that of Economic Development and also Education, Sport & Culture. I ended my tenure on both as Vice-President. I spent just shy of two years on the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture. It was a steep learning curve and I learnt a huge amount about how our education system worked, our leisure centre, museums, archives and heritage buildings are managed the synergies and links with the mandates of all the

845

other States' Committees.

Amongst them the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture has the broadest and most diverse mandate and it is those synergies and links as well as inter-dependencies which makes it the most important of States' Committees.

Our quality of education and supporting creative endeavour through art and culture feeds into the overall mental and physical health and wellbeing of the community. The success of our economy is dependent on the education and skills level of our workforce and especially that of our young people and beyond.

850

It is upon this Committee that our future medium and long term success relies. The purpose of the Committee is to encourage human development by maximising opportunities for participation and excellence through education, learning, sport and culture at every stage of life.

855

Education often dominates the conversation around this Committee but please remember that the sports and culture, including the arts, language, heritage and archive, remit of the Committee are recognised as equally important because in their own right these areas add substance and relevance to our community but also greater access to education.

860

I am standing today for the role of the President of the Committee not because of challenge I presented to the outgoing Committee and the pause and review. I am standing because I can bring a broader view to the mandate, bringing it closer and realising the inter-dependencies with the policy areas of other Committees.

I believe I can bring people together and to ensure positive working towards common goals in all areas. This is no poisoned chalice, it never has been, and I will work hard to show this to be true this term. I am excited at the prospect of returning to the Committee and to lead it with a capable team alongside me. I have received keen expressions of interest to join me and I hope to nominate four of our colleagues on Wednesday.

I was one of the very few candidates at election to publish a CV and summary qualifications and I have relevant experience that stands me in good stead to lead this Committee. I have a background in governance and I am a natural communicator who listens effectively and learns from others. I am very enthusiastic and have a personal interest in all areas of the Committee. I spent the last four years chairing sub-committees in the States as well as leading and successfully delivering on assigned policy areas. I have previously set up and run my own businesses working with others at a senior level. I have set up and led a mental health charity locally delivering services. I have good knowledge of how processes work in the States not just here in the Chamber but also in terms of policy development, budgeting, public accounts and service delivery.

In addition to this experience I have qualifications which prove my knowledge base and most recent of these is the IOD Directors Certificate in Company Direction and Deputy Burford can attest to that finance module not being for the faint hearted. I completed that qualification in spring and I have a love of learning. I am constantly seeking to enhance my knowledge I understand the need for education to be lifelong, learning lifting from cradle to grave.

If elected I will embrace the 1,001 days critical agenda which many Members may have been introduced to for the first time by the fantastic Bright Beginnings Family Centre during the election campaign. I was privileged to attend the launch of this initiative when it was introduced to Guernsey by Rachel Copeland and Dr Adrian Dove in 2016 recognising that the start of a child's life is key to the success of that child early years and family support at this crucial time can make the positive difference in the life of every child in Guernsey.

There is an increased demand for services for families in crisis with young children and babies locally politically we need to look further into the future in terms of education and put support into the earliest of years, months and days of a child's life, realising the importance strong and positive parenting has on the success of that child in later life.

Early intervention costs less financially and very importantly on a human level it costs less emotionally reducing the likelihood of trauma and a troubled life. This approach is a win for the child, a win for the family, a win for education, a win for the economy and a win for our community.

Last term I took on a lot of responsibility for policy development and was successful in delivering and advancing action in areas especially on Economic Development where I sat for the full four years and was able to see through work in finance, digital skills and retail. I want to draw on the work that I have done and the connections I have in the industry to achieve closer working between education and business ensuring that our young adults in training are the best prepared that they can be for entering the world of work.

Cross-Committee working relationships need to be strengthened with Economic Development, Employment & Social Security and Home Affairs. Delivering one of the most highly skilled work forces globally might seem overly ambitious but I do not believe it is and through collaborative working we can achieve this.

The synergy between sports, arts and culture mandate of the Committee with that of the mandate of Health & Social Care and Economic Development are clear, continued work with both Committees is essential on shared policy areas.

I have mentioned the threads that run through from health and wellbeing and being active and participating in sports as well as the enrichment and social engagements that the arts bring to our everyday life, through to the community groups and social bonding our cultural heritage brings, but it is more than that, the sports, the arts, and our culture and heritage provide visitor attractions, they not only enrich our lives locally but also enrich our offering for the purposes of tourism, they are economic enablers, and this is where the Committee mandate again links with that of Economic Development. I will work to ensure that the relationship here is developed and economic

opportunities of sports, arts and culture tourism investment are recognised in the work we undertake.

Members and listeners, sir, will note that I have not mentioned yet the burning issue of the school model yet to be fulfilled. One of the first jobs of the Committee will be to look at the draft review that was circulated late last week by the outgoing Committee to understand the underlining assumptions, principles, facts and figures upon which it is based. I would like to work this up into a presentable format to deliver this informally to States' Members and communicate it widely to stakeholders, teachers, support staff, their unions, the students, parents and wider community as soon as possible.

We all need to pull together on this quickly in order to deliver a resolution that Guernsey has too long awaited.

I spent time liaising with senior officers and our Director of Education to understand work in progress. The transformation of education which deals with the delivery model is topical and very important, but it is just one of many work streams based on extant Resolutions that are being undertaken in Committee, amongst the Guernsey Institute, delivery of the Education Law, the digital roadmap, the review of special educational needs delivery, the Guernsey Language Commission, the Sports Strategy and more.

In closing I will mention one area that has not been addressed politically over successive terms that of the purpose for which we are educating our children. So I pose a question here and now to sow the seed and ask: why do we educate our children? My answer is this. We educate our children to make them valuable contributors to our community. I believe that it is from this defined purpose that we need to work backwards to identify the how and the what: the how we make them valuable contributors and the what we need to do to achieve this purpose. The Committee addressing this fundamental question will enable us to logically deal with much of the work in education. Not only the issue of the model. We must ensure that educational outcomes have a purpose and are never reliant solely on school buildings.

In addressing the purpose we will also be able to identify the best support we can deliver for our education staff to enable them to successfully teach and provide for them the most attractive and stable working conditions.

Having the most capable teachers and support staff with a high rate of retention means that we can create the best environment and opportunities for our children to learn.

It is, sir, after all upon this Committee that our medium and long term success relies.

I ask Members please to support me today in my bid to be Guernsey President for Education Sport & Culture.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Well, Members of the States, we will go to the vote on the office of President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture *aux voix*. Deputy Dudley-Owen is proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy St Pier. All those in favour; all those against.

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare Deputy Dudley-Owen duly elected without any dissention. (*Applause*)
Greffier.

**III. Committee for Employment & Social Security –
Deputy Peter Roffey elected President**

Article III

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Employment & Social Security to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Greffier: Article III – Election of a President of the Committee for Employment & Social Security.

960 **The Bailiff:** I invite any Member who wishes to propose another Member to stand in their place.
Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy le Tocq: Sir, it gives me great pleasure to nominate Deputy Peter Roffey.

965 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.

Is that nomination seconded? Deputy Parkinson thank you very much.

I do not see anyone else rising to propose a candidate to oppose Deputy Roffey and therefore we will do as we have just done and that is I will invite the proposer of Deputy Roffey Deputy Le Tocq for up to five minutes. Deputy Le Tocq.

970

Deputy Le Tocq: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

Sir, I think the phrase hit the ground running may been used first by me in this new Assembly but I am certain we will hear it again and again, because most of us have felt both newcomers and old timers like me that the pressure is on with the compressed nature of the move from General
975 Election to the formation of the new Committees, the looming finalisation of the Budget, plus expectations are high in our community, anticipation of action not talk as promised by the new President of P&R and others. We cannot afford weeks and months of getting to learn the ropes and building relationships as perhaps past Assemblies did.

So there is a real need at ESS for continuity in a mandate which is hugely complex and currently
980 has several particularly complicated processes in train. This includes for example secondary pension scheme, anti-discrimination legislation, increasing the sustainability of the long term care Insurance Fund amongst others. These issues alone will require a tough skinned captain at the helm to navigate the choppy seas of unpopular decision making.

Peter certainly has such skin in the game not only as one of the few survivors of the previous
985 Committee but also one of the longest serving States' Members. In fact, sir, when I was here as a school boy in the early 1980's Deputy Roffey was also here as an elected Member in this Assembly. Now having said that I seem to have overtaken him in some, certainly in looks as far as that because we seem to be contemporaries now.

But nevertheless he was also a former long term Member of the States' Housing Authority and
990 was always credited by my friend the late great Deputy Dave Jones as being the man responsible for the creation of the Guernsey Housing Association. As Members will know housing is an intrinsic part of the mandate of ESS.

Deputy Roffey has had a keen interest in tackling poverty throughout his time in the States and led the Scrutiny Review into In-Work Poverty in the last Assembly.

995 Deputy Roffey considers welfare to be an important and not a Cinderella service. He is passionate about ensuring no family is unable to eat well or heat their homes or clothe their children.

Deputy Roffey has a track record of tackling complex political issues and fighting his corner for resources when required.

We have not always agreed, he and I, on issues but I have always respected the manner in which he fights his corner.

These attributes are going to be needed in spades at ESS, over the next few years. In the aftermath of the pandemic the services that ESS provides are going to be absolutely crucial to ensure resilience going forward.

Sir, this is not a job on which to cut your political teeth it is a job for someone proven to have both intellectual and political skills and the experience to deliver. Ideally it is a job for someone already familiar with the massive policy agenda faced by ESS luckily in Deputy Roffey we have someone who ticks all these boxes.

The Bailiff: I now invite Deputy Roffey to speak to the Assembly. Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

Why on earth do I want to head up the ESS? It is not just because I have got a masochistic streak and nor is it simply because I have got a desire to provide the degree of continuity at a department with one of the widest ranging and most complex mandates in Government.

For me it is far more about looking forward and driving the future agenda of the States' department which is most heavily involved in social policy. I am enormously motivated to do that at any time because I have always been passionate about social policy. But in the new very challenging world created by Covid-19 I am even more committed to tackling some of Guernsey's biggest social issues. Finding cost effective ways of tackling poverty, minimising unemployment, and perhaps most importantly of all providing affordable housing.

It is true as my proposer has pointed out that ESS is mid project on many complicated policy initiatives and I agree with him that having a new President at the helm who can hit the ground running on these issues is probably the only way to prevent months of damaging delay. But actually my vision goes far beyond just finishing off the stuff that the old Committee on which I sat had started.

So what else do I want to do? Let's start with the crucial policy area which sits within the mandate of ESS but strangely enough not within its title. I think Guernsey faces a quiet but significant housing crisis which threatens our community, our economy, our demographics and our prosperity. If young people cannot afford to establish their own households, and reasonably afford to establish their own households, in the Island of their birth then once the immediate effects of Covid-19 have passed we will see an exodus of human capital which Guernsey can ill afford. **(Several Members: Hear, hear.)**

So what is the answer? Well I think it has to be many answers, it is going to need to be multi-layered. I think we need just to give one example I think we need to be radical but pretty simple in this respect. As has already been mentioned, Housing Minister the late Deputy Dave Jones, one thing he did is he had the gumption to finally demolish the old Bouet Housing Estate and replace it with new fit for purpose social housing. Now actually, I hate to admit it, but there are many other tired old housing estates that we are responsible for where the homes are really no longer fit for the modern world. Not only are they poorly insulated, that could be retrofitted I know, but often they are simply the wrong size to meet current demands.

The proper redevelopment of these sites could not only produce much better homes but actually significantly more of them. Of course a key partner in developing such a transformational programme would have to be the Guernsey Housing Association which indeed I did lobby to get set up originally. Now using the GHA will not only leverage some private cash and therefore reduce the demands on the taxpayer but it will also crucially ensure that home ownership was not forgotten in this programme.

Very many young Islanders quite rightly aspire to home ownership as most of us did and we need to make that possible or we risk losing them. **(A Member: Hear, hear.)**

Such a transformation of Guernsey's aged and substandard social housing I think would be a massive contribution to Guernsey's Revive and Thrive agenda creating genuinely local employment and helping to tackle environmental issues by upgrading thermal insulation in hundreds of homes.

Another project I look forward to progressing is the equalities agenda. The last States in its dying days rightly insisted on accelerating the new Anti-Discrimination Legislation by including both the grounds of religion and sexual orientation in phase one of the Law. That is going to require a supplementary policy letter to be produced after proper consultation and laid before yourselves. I make this pledge today, if you elect me as the new ESS President, which is starting to look quite likely, the policy letter will be before you not in years but within a few months.

Another key role I see for the new ESS President is contributing to the much flaunted fiscal review due to be carried out over the next eight months if the original timetable is to be stuck to. This is going to be led by P&R obviously but no review of taxation or spending can be carried out in isolation without consideration of welfare and benefits.

I have got the ability to grasp complex issues quickly and I hope to make a significant contribution to that review. It is going to be fiendishly difficult I warn Deputy Ferbrache of that now, and the outcome will likely be less than popular but I believe that my experience and insights will add value to the exercise.

Of course one aspect of that review will be how to make all of the social security funds and in particular the long term Care Fund more sustainable because at the moment none of them are.

Particularly in relation to long term care none of the answers to that question are going to be either pleasant or popular, which makes it even more important to be inventive and to consider all of the options.

For example should those with relatively short contribution records get the same benefit under that scheme as those who have paid in right from the start? I am not convinced that they should. Now how much difference that will make to the Fund's sustainability I do not yet know the numbers have to be run, but it is the sort of creative idea I think that we need to explore.

Getting back to work in progress if elected I will fight very hard to complete the introduction of the Secondary Pension Scheme already approved in outline by the States. I have little doubt that there are going to be some siren voices here calling for a rethink and claiming that the years immediately ahead of us are no time to start taking more money out of the economy, but, sir, that would be very shallow short termism. In my long involvement in politics I have noticed that pensioners can be split in between those in relative poverty and those who are reasonably well-off. They can also be split between those who rely solely on the States' Pension and those whose income is supplemented by an occupational pension. While I do not claim the two divisions are absolutely identical there is a very significant correlation indeed between them.

Secondary pensions for all is by far the best way to significantly reduce pensioner poverty and by the way of doing so we would in the long term bring about a significant reduction in demands on income support. Progressive social policy and the aims of smaller government do not always have to be at loggerheads.

However, widespread occupational pension provision could never be an excuse to reduce the basic States' Pension. It is the bedrock of pensioner income and it is redistributive because everybody gets the same pension depending on their contribution records not on how much money they have paid in. So it should always be benchmarked not just against inflation but also against average earnings to limit the trend for pensioners to become relatively poorer compared with the rest of the community.

So much about the provision of benefits but what about cutting the cost of running the department to help pay for it. I am genuinely open to reducing ESS's head count by the effective use of digitisation and moving more services online. Indeed I am convinced there are significant savings to be made in this way hopefully coupled with an enhanced customer experience. But I do want to make one caveat clear. Not every benefit claimant is computer literate or has a smart phone in their pockets, nor can every human situation be reduced to a set of prompts on a web page or a set of FAQs, real life is far more complicated than that so face to face human contact between those

Islanders who may need help from time to time and an experienced and understanding officer of ESS must always remain an option. That is something I will indeed die in a ditch over; well not literally but politically I will die in a ditch over.

1105 In summary, sir, I hate poverty, I hate poor housing, I hate unemployment, I hate inequality. In other words I am passionate about the mandate of ESS. Please elect me today, as it looks likely, and I promise I will fulfil the role with both energy and commitment.

A Member: Hear, hear.

1110 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.

Well, Members of the States, I am now going to invite you to vote for the single candidate for the office of President of the Committee *for* Employment & Social Security that is Deputy Roffey who is proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy Parkinson. Those in favour; those against.

Members vote Pour.

1115 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Roffey duly elected, again without dissension. (*Applause*)
Greffier.

IV. Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure – Election of President commenced

Article IV

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article IV – Election of a President of the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure.

1120 **The Bailiff:** I invite any Member who wishes to propose another Member to stand in their places and do so.
Deputy Helyar.

1125 **Deputy Helyar:** Sir, with great pleasure I would like to nominate Deputy de Sausmarez.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.
Is that nomination seconded?

1130 **Deputy Gabriel:** Yes, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Gabriel thank you.
Deputy Ferbrache.

1135 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I nominate Deputy de Lisle.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Is Deputy de Lisle's nomination seconded?

The Bailiff: Deputy Prow, thank you very much.
Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Sir, I nominate Deputy Taylor.

The Bailiff: Deputy Haskins is going to second Deputy Taylor's nomination.

A fourth candidate? This is taking us into uncharted territories this term. We have got three candidates. I will just remind you who the candidates are as they are leaving their seats and arriving on the Bench and it will be Deputy de Lisle, please, between the window and me, he is proposed by Deputy Ferbrache seconded by Deputy Prow. Then Deputy de Sausmarez and Deputy Taylor. Deputy de Sausmarez is proposed by Deputy Helyar and seconded by Deputy Gabriel and Deputy Taylor is proposed by Deputy Inder and seconded by Deputy Haskins.

Once you are all sitting comfortably I will remind Members that it is first for the proposer of the candidate and then the candidate to speak for up to five and up to 10 minutes respectively and we do that in order of nomination and therefore I will invite Deputy Helyar to speak to his candidate, he has proposed Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy Helyar please.

Deputy Helyar: Thank you, sir.

Sir, Members of the Assembly, I am delighted to nominate Deputy de Sausmarez for the position of President of E&I. Returning Members and new Members alike will I am sure recognise Deputy de Sausmarez as a particularly prominent and pro-active Member of E&I during the last term.

She was closely involved in the development of the energy and climate change policies and has very detailed knowledge of them both. Continuity in this area is vital for Guernsey.

She has been a substantial supporter of the third sector in development of the Strategy for Nature and I am sure she will continue to help bridge the gap between the well-meaning words in this Assembly and the real world where the real work to protect and enhance the environment actually gets done.

Sir, the Environment & Infrastructure department has a paradox at its core, protecting the environment does not always sit well with the maintenance and development of infrastructure. The responsibilities of E&I are wide including all the obvious aspects and many less obvious aspects too. From spatial planning to waste water and store reserves, housing policy, maritime affairs, public parks and so much more.

Deputy de Sausmarez has an excellent working knowledge of these areas. She is committed to building a team which is passionate but will also include challenge, focus and which she is determined to facilitate discussion and robust rounded decision making.

I believe she understands that the Island needs just as much emphasis on the E as it does on the I. I have served with Deputy de Sausmarez during the last term when she was political representative on a group called Ageing Well in the Bailiwick which conglomerated a wide range of third sector organisations, specialising in elderly care in order to provide feedback on States' policy.

I can personally attest she is an excellent communicator and listener I believe her personal style will support and enhance a more collegiate style of working together which I am really pleased to say we all seem to be determined to deliver.

I commend Deputy de Sausmarez to the Assembly and ask you to give her your support for President of E&I.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

I now turn to Deputy de Sausmarez. Deputy de Sausmarez, please.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

1190 I would like to thank both Deputy Helyar and Deputy Gabriel for nominating and seconding me, I will try and get my laptop to play again. I would also like to thank actually Deputy Ferbrache for telling me that despite he had already offered his nomination to someone else I would make an excellent President of E&I, which I think I will take the opportunity to put on record now. *(Laughter)*

1195 Events have a habit of looking inevitable when viewed through the lens of hindsight, but looking back to four years ago the picture in my crystal ball did not reveal many of the achievements that actually eventuated.

Back then there was no clear prospect of a comprehensive energy policy and climate change was not even a policy area in its own right. There were considerable doubts over the likely effectiveness of the Waste Strategy, the bus service was not in a good place, and the Island's biodiversity strategy was still in a state of shock that it had attracted even the most meagre level of resources at all.

1200 In a term dominated by the twin forces of Brexit and Covid we developed an Energy Policy that was welcomed by industry, the community and the Assembly alike, a Climate Change Policy with near unanimous political support. The successful implementation of the Waste Strategy featuring one of the highest recycling rates in the world, record breaking bus passenger numbers, year on year – pre-Covid that is – topping two million passenger journeys in 2019 and a Strategy for Nature that for the first time will give our natural environment a value and a voice in decision making.

1205 There are plenty of other achievements along the way too, for example air pollution legislation, improved housing standards, and healthy uptick in active travel, the development of the Maritime Strategy, the establishment of the role of biodiversity officer, the EU driving licence situation sorted out and a switch to 100% renewable energy imported through the cable to name a random handful.

So even in the unusually challenging circumstances in which we found ourselves plenty of good work has come to fruition over the last four years.

1215 In the current economic climate both the environment and infrastructure have a vital role to play in Guernsey's Recovery Strategy. I do not think I need to explain that environmental and economic benefits are often mutually inclusive, areas such as green finance, eco-tourism, renewable energy, sustainable farming, the green and blue economies, and circular economy opportunities for example are exactly the areas we should be sharpening our focus on at this particular point in time.

1220 As I am sure every Member is aware investing in infrastructure during an economic downturn is broadly accepted as a useful stimulus aside from any direct economic benefits it creates it typical has a multiplier effect as well. In practical terms too it sits well with the concept running through Revive and Thrive to build back better, to put Guernsey in a stronger, more resilient and more sustainably productive position going forward.

1225 Infrastructure is an interesting part of the E&I mandate because sometimes the policy side of it sits elsewhere, a fibre optics roll out is one such example, it has been trending strongly in some manifestos recently, but as the question time for the position of President *for* Economic Development made clear it is not E&I's decision to make. The development of a telecoms strategy sits with Economic Development who as it happens, in response to my successful requête, have undertaken to return to the Assembly to debate it by the end of the year.

1230 Joined up working between Committees to deliver infrastructure commitments will of course be essential and if I am elected to the role of E&I President that will be a key aim for me.

When it comes to infrastructure such as electric vehicle charging points though or coastal defences both the policy and the implementation sit with E&I. These two examples are highly relevant to our Climate Change Policy of course and so will be addressed through that.

1235 The large scale transition to EVs over the next decade or so needs to be supported by a comprehensive network of public and domestic charging points, a programme that has to be properly planned and managed.

1240 Defences protecting against rising sea levels will be a central part of the climate change adaptation plan but the trickier question will be how other forms of coastal defence, like military infrastructure will be prioritised and funded.

Deputy Ferbrache said in his speech for the role of President of P&R that we do not want any more policies or strategies we want action and in the context of environmental policy I can assure him that if I have anything to do with it that will be the case.

1245 The Energy Policy the Climate Change Policy and the Strategy for Nature now need to move swiftly from paper to practical reality. The development of all three involved considerable stakeholder or community input and that needs to continue and indeed increase in the implementation phase. While the policies agree the destination, they do not prescribe the precise route to get there are there are many different routes. We need to take the community with us on that journey, and the community will help choose the route and set the pace.

1250 The net zero target is 2050 at the latest, in line with international standards of course, but it is important to stress that if a significantly quicker transition could be managed in a way that is acceptable to Islanders then we can and will hit that target much sooner.

1255 The Energy Policy and the Climate Change Policy are both large, complex and very necessary pieces of work, as I am sure everyone understands, but I would like to take a little bit of time to focus on the equally necessary flip-side of that coin the Strategy for Nature.

1260 David Attenborough is doing a commendable job at the moment raising awareness of the problem of biodiversity loss, but people still tend to see it in terms of losing something that is a bit of a nice to have. It is not, there is nothing fluffy about this issue, biodiversity underpins our economy, which is why biodiversity loss is ranked by the World Economic Forum as one of the most disruptive and most likely risks the global economy now faces. The good news is that local action to protect and conserve natural habitats and species is highly effective, and that is where our Strategy for Nature comes in.

1265 I am keen to explore whether this strategy could be delivered through a commission model similar to the Health Improvement Commission perhaps, that could help us access the expertise we need while providing greater latitude to raise private or corporate money and deliver greater cost efficiency with less bureaucracy, more agility and better governance. Essentially smaller and more efficient government with better real world outcomes. If the idea has legs there is further potential scope for the model to cover a broader cross-section of environmental policy implementation, an area which we have historically struggled to sufficiently resource in-house.

1270 E&I's mandate is of course far broader than energy, climate change, and sea defences. In fact its sheer scale and variety of remit is one of the things I love about the Committee. There is not time to go into every item on its mandate but I will turn briefly to a few of the most important issues. Various strands of the housing policy such as key worker accommodation and affordable housing are likely to be engaged by the Revive and Thrive action plans as Deputy Roffey has just explained in far more detail than I will go into.

1275 Transport efficiency both on and off-Island is another area that the action plans will undoubtedly want to improve. Brexit meanwhile will impact our maritime affairs and the security of supply of essential commodities. As a Member of the Committee and having been party to relevant conversations and briefings since 2016 I believe I am well enough briefed to take the E&I President seat on the CCA straight away.

1280 As the only current States' Member with experience on Environment & Infrastructure I have a bank of information and the detailed understanding to help the new Committee find its feet. I would like to stress though that while I would provide that useful continuity of knowledge I would not seek to continue in the same style as the previous Committee.

1285 There are several key things I would seek to do very differently. Chief among them is communication both internal and external. Internal communication is something I like others can see great scope to improve I am very keen to instigate more regular cross-Committee meetings especially where mandates overlap and in E&I's case that means with every single senior Committee and also the STSB the DPA and Overseas Aid.

1290 Coming from a communications background I have always been personally pro-active about getting out and about into the community to explain and explore different policies and listen to

community feedback. I have done a lot of work with young people in schools for example on subjects such as climate change, active travel and waste, and with some very positive outcomes.

1295 In the Energy Partnership and Citizens Assembly we have two good channels of community input but there is no reason why it should stop there, community engagement is crucial in bringing forward proposals with broad community support.

I believe I have the relevant knowledge and experience to enable the new Committee to find its feet quickly, the research and people skills to support good decision making, the communication skills to foster good cross-Committee working, and the energy and commitment to give absolutely 100% plus to this role.

I look forward to Members questions.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: I would like to now invite Deputy Ferbrache to move his nomination of Deputy de Lisle. Deputy Ferbrache please.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, the States is particularly fortunate in that it will have three able and different candidates to choose from in the Presidency of this particular Committee. But there are two elements it is environment and infrastructure and we have to look forward to see who is going to commend and blend both of those elements.

Deputy de Sausmarez rightly accurately quoted what I said to her but I think we have got as I say the three candidates and in relation to Deputy de Lisle we have got the person who in my submission if I was making a submission to a court I would be saying has the edge.

He has the edge because he has considerable experience, he has been in the States for 16 years he is a former Minister. He also has broad experience, he is deeply committed to the environment, he is deeply committed to the Island, and I sometime jokingly say that my lot have been here since Abraham his lot have been here since the universe was formed. They are steeped in the environment, and he is steeped in the wellbeing of Guernsey in relation to such matters, but he also has a commercial bent.

Now Deputy de Lisle also could be called Dr de Lisle, he has got a BSC from London University and he has got two educational attainments from leading Canadian educational establishments, an MMA and he is a PhD.

Now when he started when he left Guernsey as a young man to begin his career he taught for five years at an English comprehensive bigger than even the ones that have been projected in Guernsey. He then went to Canada and he then went to Canada as a teacher, a lecturer and he was a lecture at again very high quality educational establishments, and his career took him so that he ended up being in 1978 he having left his educational career in the narrow sense he began his career in the Civil Service as a policy adviser to the Deputy Minister's Office for Manitoba Agriculture. Five years later he entered private industry as a consultant and managed and carried out large economic substitution studies in Northern Ontario which was facing major labour unrest.

Now in 1979 this impressive man's impressive career continued because he was appointed as a Chief Economist for the Canadian Federal Government in Ottawa. In 1990 he switched again from government to private industry to provide consulting expertise and he reviewed methods to evaluate transportation infrastructure, a point that Deputy de Sausmarez has touched upon, provide systems integration and project management to modernise Canada's air traffic control system and also to conduct benefit cost analysis for Transport Canada.

He did all of those things in a practical bent and then he came back to Guernsey continued as a teacher, continued in doing other things. So he has walked the walk and he has talked the talk.

Now, anybody who has spoken to Deputy de Lisle knows that the core of his being is the environment of this Island. But he also has as I say this commercial bent. He knows that things have to be done practically and because I have read everybody's manifesto, well other than mine, and he said – this is under the heading 'Environment':

I have a strong interest in safeguarding our island from overdevelopment.

Bear in mind when we are looking at practicality:

I initiated the environmental strategy which was passed by the States to protect our biodiversity and countryside to balance economic growth and environmental sustainability and to provide a vision for future States to follow.

It talks about:

1345

The current planning system needs reform to direct future development onto brown field sites ...

He says also:

The States must repair and maintain the island's infrastructure and renew areas such as the Valette steps and Fermain wall using local providers and expertise.

So you have got the whole package with Deputy Dr de Lisle, you have got practical experience, you have got the experience of life, you have got somebody who has lived elsewhere, and you have got somebody who has brought that experience back in spades to this Island.

1350

I commend him to you.

The Bailiff: I now turn to Deputy de Lisle. Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Thank you, sir.

1355

This is a new States ladies and gentlemen the people have voted for a new vision and we must as Deputies rise to that challenge.

I have the experience internationally and here in Guernsey to lead Environment & Infrastructure and get the job done.

1360

We need to develop and enhance the Island infrastructure to meet the needs of the next generation. Let's work together to make the improvements that are long past due, we have the skill sets right here on Island. Let's talk of strategies and... let's not talk of strategies but let's talk of action.

1365

As a former Minister of Environment I led from the front and introduced an environmental policy to balance economic growth and environmental sustainability and to provide a vision for the future to follow.

I set in motion for Guernsey to become a signatory to the Biodiversity Convention and proposed further designation of RAMSAR sites in the Bailiwick to safeguard our natural environment.

1370

With the Waste Strategy I battled incineration and Suez to reduce particulate and chemical pollution on the Island and make reduce, recycle and re-use a reality for Guernsey, which is now recognised as a success story in the Island.

Guernsey's natural landscape has been long regarded as one of its most important assets and its protection is vital to the quality of life enjoyed by residents and its attractiveness as a tourist location. The richness and variety of wildlife and the habitats that comprise the Island's biodiversity measures of protection and conservation.

1375

Climate change is real and as part of the post Covid recovery we must prioritise climate action to embrace opportunities in all new technologies including renewable energies.

Solar, tidal and wind offer huge immediate potential for job growth, apprenticeship training, reduction in energy imports, and added security and independence.

1380

I would like to encourage wide-spread solar project developments and provide incentives to encourage expenditure on property insulation to reduce reliance on carbon fuels. I would also in the Committee's work make reference to the UN Sustainable Development Goals.

1385

As a Deputy I have highlighted the chemical and plastic pollution of our land and waters and over a decade have called on the States to adopt more stringent guidelines to provide a clean and healthy environment free of chemical pollutants that have been internationally condemned. We need to remain vigilant and ensure a clean and healthy environment for all of us to enjoy.

We need to ensure the traffic is free flowing during roadworks particularly there needs to be more coordination of utility works to minimise disruption and cost to business and the public purse. Bus routes need to be re-examined to ensure we get the best value and service.

1390 If our towns are to prosper we need ease of access and adequate parking adopting new evolving technologies in transport as they become available.

I do not want to see another sign saying Town closed. These are not positive images to either locals or visitors of a bustling Town and thriving Island economy.

1395 Action must be taken to maintain the Island's infrastructure and re-instate areas which were heavily used such as the Valette Steps, rebuild the Fermain Wall as well as repair other coastal defences including the Alderney Breakwater.

We need to preserve the cultural and historic fabric of our Island that records who and what we are.

The Committee has oversight over the Harbour and Airport, I have the background in aviation consulting and planning to contribute to discussions on future developments.

1400 I support the Housing Strategy to create new units of accommodation and affordable housing and the work of the Guernsey Housing Association to provide more social rented and partial ownership housing and to help local people enter the property market.

1405 I offer you my experience in land management, in agriculture, town and country planning. As a consultant with international firms I have negotiated contracts and contributed to national developments on housing and land planning. I own properties in Town and my wife operates two retail outlets, I have a comprehensive understanding of the issues effecting Town businesses. My family roots in the western parishes are deep I understand the perils of farming and can contribute to farm services including agriculture, animal health and welfare. I am proud to, with my family, offer the land to hold the Vintage Agriculture Show at Les Paysans, St Peter's which benefits local charities.

1410 I am well qualified to lead the Committee. I hold a University of London BSc Degree, a Master's Degree from the University of Toronto in Land Use and Planning and a PhD from McGill in Geography and Economics. I have worked in public service in private industry and varied educational environments. I have been appointed lecturer at the University of Ottawa, at Brock University and Carlton University in Land Use Planning and Regional Economics.

1415 Subsequent appointments were held in Government Planning and Management first in the Planning Secretariat as a monitor with the Department of Agriculture and subsequently as Chief Economist for the Federal Government in Ottawa at the National Capital Commission, diversifying the National Capital from a single industry town into high tech industry incorporating new museums and art galleries and into public activities and tourism to enrich the economic, cultural and social fabric of the Nation's capital. I later switched from Government to private industry with Thompson, Hickling Aviation and Lockheed Martin one of the largest global companies in aerospace defence security and advanced technologies to evaluate transportation infrastructure projects, to provide systems integration and project management to modernise Canada's air traffic control system and to conduct benefit cost analysis for Transport Canada and the International Civil Aviation Organisation with its headquarters in Montreal.

1420 On returning to Guernsey I set up and headed the Geography Department at St Sampson's High School and lectured at the College of Further Education before entering politics in 2004 as a Peoples' Deputy for the West serving first in the Environment Department and in 2007 was elected Minister of Environment. I now enter my fifth term, sir, after having served on Education, Scrutiny, Commerce & Employment, Legislation and Economic Development. The Committee for Environment & Infrastructure needs to embrace the opportunities inherent in green economic activity, to work sensitively to provide new jobs and new opportunities going forward.

1435 In light of my qualifications, skills and experience I believe that I am the best person for this position.

I thank my proposer Deputy Peter Ferbrache and my seconder Deputy Prow, and I call on Members to support my nomination for President of the Committee for Environment & Infrastructure.

Thank you, sir.

1440

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

I now turn to Deputy Inder who has proposed Deputy Taylor to speak to that nomination. Deputy Inder, please.

1445

Deputy Inder: Sir, Members.

Deputy Taylor has come to the States as one of the new crop of independent candidates, and hopefully at some point we will get beyond talking about whether people are independents or affiliated maybe this will be in a couple of weeks' time, but anyway.

1450

I had not actually paid much attention through the campaign period to him and that is not meant in any derogatory way; it is just as we all know the election campaign for incumbents like ourselves and as other candidates it was all about me.

1455

I actually met him whilst sitting in the audience at a couple of hustings and what struck me about him is that he exuded positivity about Guernsey the environment and was certainly not shy in coming forward. One of his memorable quotes was in answer to a question from one audience member who made some miserable remark about Guernsey's tourism offering and he rebuffed it with: 'What are you talking about? Guernsey has got a cracking product!'

1460

Now I would say that is fairly brave telling off a voter at a hustings because most people would tell you absolutely anything that they want to hear at hustings is my experience, so in that regard I liked him already. So I paid attention to him. I know he is the youngest Member of the Assembly I believe he is anyway, and he achieved a good result in the election. From what I understand he likes to get on and do things and a brief quote from his manifesto he is an architectural technologist he can read plans, visualise and understand the built environment, he has experience in getting government into action and says he has previous experience dealing with multiple States' departments to aid business growth, so that seems like a tick to me.

1465

In terms of character he says he is optimistic yet realistic, and he says he knows his skills and his weaknesses and when to seek advice, and I do like that self-deprecating character, we all need to know sometimes what we can and cannot do.

1470

He is different a little bit – he says he is different – he is a little bit out there in his way of thinking, but has a proven track work record in business and he has certainly strong support from the public.

So it is clear from his manifesto that he has an interest in the Island's basic infrastructure and although he is a cyclist, I will not hold that against him, I genuinely believe he is worth a shot at the title.

1475

He goes on to say from the Q&As on the website that he supports the charities delivering on bio-diversity, he does not subscribe to greenwashing, these are all his words, and seems to have a positive stance between the needs of the environment and business.

So, sir, Members this is a contested election and it is now up for him to persuade you that he is the Deputy for the job.

Thank you, sir.

1480

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Finally, I turn to Deputy Taylor to speak for up to 10 minutes. Deputy Taylor, please.

1485

Deputy Taylor: Sir, Members, I would like to start with a little thank you to Deputies Inder and Haskins for proposing and seconding. Those of you who fastidiously read all the candidates' responses on election2020.gg may have spotted that I did say I hate pre-written speeches, but I bottled it and I have written one for myself, so here we go.

It is an honour to be here amongst you all I have had the pleasure of speaking with many of you but as a new Deputy it is probably best if I start with a little bit of information about myself.

1490 By trade I am an architectural technologist with eight years of commercial experience, I decided against seeking chartered status instead taking the plunge into self-employment. In the past six years I have founded three successful businesses across hospitality and tourism, I had no formal qualifications in either of those, and no relevant industry experience. However, all three remain in my ownership and are trading today, though it must be said that 2020 has not been the best year.

1495 Through my business interests I have worked within remits of the environment, the Office of Environmental Health & Pollution driving vehicle licensing, as an architectural technologist I have a firm understanding of housing developments and the construction techniques.

So why am I standing here in my first political term seeking a role of Presidency? Honestly, and I am pleased to have this on record because no-one can give me a legitimate reason why something as simple as a slipway is allowed to fall into such a poor state of repair and subsequently fail.

1500 Now that might seem incredibly narrow given the wide ranging mandate for this Committee, a Committee with so many strategic responsibilities but somewhere down the line, however far in the future, strategy must become reality, and reality might not be what you planned for, but that is what you are faced with.

1505 When I took the lease for my first commercial premises all I really wanted was to be able to drink a good coffee without leaving the Island, it took several years plenty of vision, varied strategies but I did achieve success, along the way I had overcome many challenges though few of them were actually coffee related, you see the vision may well have been to serve the best coffee in Guernsey, but sometimes the reality was merely a blocked toilet, and I promise no matter how bold your vision or strategy and how good the end outcome may be the blocked toilet has to be the headline.

1510 But how does the slipway relate to this Committee well you see the Strategy for Nature goal A objective one, encourage everyone to get out into nature, and that is a great objective, it is one I 100% support, it is strategy but what is the reality.

1515 Well, a local sailing club has encouraged hundreds, nay thousands of young people on to the water in a low impact manner, teaching the power of nature, how to respect it and how to harness it. Learning respect for the sea from a young age leads to a lifetime of enjoyment. Rowing is another popular, low-impact, environmental pastime immersed in our natural environment. Both these activities go wider than the Strategy for Nature as they encourage increased activity and the long term health benefits that brings. But are these two activities encouraged? Well here's the slipway, Havelet slipway is hardly looking its best and directing all the above to launch their vessels into an already crowded Harbour can hardly be deemed encouragement.

1520 Now planning for the future is an incredible human ability but it does not escape the reality of the present. We are not judged in the future if you want someone beside you in the future you had better pay attention to her needs today.

1525 So a failed slipway has drawn me into E&I but if that is all I wanted to achieve I would simply pitched up with the boys and got to work fixing it. So what direction would I like to take given the opportunity? Well clearly, I would push for a solution on the aforementioned slipway with a concerted effort to ensure that we make meaningful work to our coastal or military defences, not simply applying reactive remedies. A lot of the requirements have already been identified in many previous reports so with the support of Members we have the chance to get work under way relatively quickly.

1530 This would offer the clear visual clues that work is underway, growing confidence in the public whilst simultaneously addressing the declining workforce within construction, allowing the industry to grow into infrastructure projects that may come to fruition further down the line.

1535 I will seek to break down the barrier between drivers and cyclists. I do not want to see a multi-story carpark in St Peter Port, I like to cycle but I do respect that many people rely on their motor vehicles. I believe that prevention is better than cure and that resources would be more effective directed to the young than trying to upheave everyone else. There is a saying about old dogs and new tricks.

As a very quick example of cross-Committee work I would seek to pursue in this area the use of e-bikes as a form of minor rehabilitation for certain injuries or conditions prescribed by medical health professionals, providing health benefits to the individual in the short term and hopefully encouraging more active travel in the long term.

But what of the environment itself? Well, it was abundantly clear during the election campaign that the third sector have identified many pressing environmental issues on a local scale. In many cases they have identified the solution but in virtually every case what they lack primarily is the funding. Working with the Committee for Economic Development I would like to explore the investments made in green finance, identifying the projects that are invested into elsewhere in the world simply copying them here where relevant we could create a link between land management and third sector, the private sector, and this foreign investment for the benefit of our local environment.

Through a certain small tour company I have already been working within the remit of this Strategy for Nature using a 20-year-old Land Rover many thousands of visitors and locals have been encouraged to join me exploring our network of country lanes crossing farmland taking in the hedgerows and wildlife, learning a little bit along the way, simple things so often unnoticed or unappreciated when travelling the Island by other means.

I am a generous human being but I must confess I did not do that out of the goodness of my heart. I made the connection between the economic and environmental values and I believe I am well positioned to encourage others to do so too.

As Deputy Inder mentioned, I do not subscribe to green washing, I have demonstrated within my own businesses that I can implement environmental and social policies well ahead of Government, and being the guy that took Nutella's pancakes off the streets of St Peter Port I can handle flack.

I can plan for the future Members, I have vision by the bucket load, but I live in the now.
Thank you.

The Bailiff: Well, Members of the States, we now have up to 45 minutes of questions; that is 15 times three. The first round of answers will be taken in the order in which the candidates were nominated and I am simply going to invite any Member who wishes to pose a question to stand in their place.

Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: With regard to sea defences could the candidates explain in relation to the L'Ancrese sea wall one of the last decisions of Policy & Resources was not actually to fund the proposals that was on the back of the requête, so in order to avoid a sticking plaster repair what will the new Presidents do in their Committee will they bring the matter back to the States of come up with another solution?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

That is a good question because it really has to be first and foremost the decision of the new Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure. To briefly try to summarise and I am aware of the time limits I might not manage, the previous Assembly made a decision about what outcome they wanted to see with the wall but that decision did not come with the funding attached so the new Committee will have to make a judgement about whether it wants to come to the States to seek that funding, but basically there are three options, they can do that, they can seek effectively to do nothing, or they can seek to propose an alternative, or indeed the States' Assembly could do any of those. It really has to be an informed decision by the Committee. I would not like to pre-empt what that would be because there is an awful lot of evidence that the new Committee will have to review,

1590 and indeed as and when it comes to the States, if it does, that the new Assembly will also, well certainly the new Deputies among the Assembly, will have to review as well.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1595 **Deputy de Lisle:** My view is that I would get on with it immediately. Get local stone masons to do the repairs that are required to fill in the gaps and to see that the structure is sound through the next number of years. It will require continual presumably maintenance, but the fact is we have to get on with it, not worry about major – this is not a major investment situation – this is something that we have got local people that can tackle the job, get on with it and get it done. It is a very
1600 useful barrier to the sea, it is a sea defence that we need to keep, and we need not be investing too much money in that particular –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute, I am afraid.
Deputy Taylor.

1605 **Deputy Taylor:** It does appear that a lot of research has been done into the wall, lots of solutions have been put forward. Using technical knowledge I would sit down address the information in front of me discuss that with the Committee to obviously see which way we would want to go forward, my own personal view is that I would like to see full repairs done to the wall because I am
1610 worried the precedent it sets if we allow it to fall into further state of disrepair.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: If we are to have any hope of getting more people on to buses we need to
1615 put in place a lot more bus shelters. In a previous Assembly I identified 27 prime sites to place bus shelters yet my suggestions were not taken on board. If elected can you give me an assurance that you will give sufficient focus to putting a lot more bus shelters in place and I am not talking about the flimsy totally impractical modern day shelters that have no sides or fronts to them I am talking about shelters that surround the people, sheltering in them and do the job they are supposed to
1620 do.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, I would certainly welcome that protection to the public which would in
1625 fact encourage perhaps more people to travel on the bus and perhaps allay some of the traffic on the roads, this would be a useful – we have examples of different structures at the moment and I think some innovative ways of providing these without perhaps causing environmental concern and also without causing problems with regard to dangers of the public on busy roadways. So yes let's provide more as long as we have got the money of course within the budget to provide those
1630 facilities.

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Yes, I would support more coverage while waiting for the buses and someone
1635 who lives out Rocqaine on the fringes of society my experience of trying to get the bus into Town means I have to stand not only looking at a damaged slipway but I have to watch the waves come crashing over the top of me. Now if it was not for our German friends who visited many years ago, I would have had no shelter, I had to seek cover from the rain from the waves in a tiny little German bunker. I do not think that is accessible and as 17-year-old lad I was quite happy to do that but as
1640 soon as I got my driving licence ... No. So that was a barrier for me and if it is a barrier for other people I would seek to address that.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez,

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

1645 I am pleased to inform Deputy Queripel that I have championed bus shelters over the last four years, very much so, especially at Hub, at interchange points, because those are the really critical bits where you do need shelter where you are expecting people to wait as well as many along the exposed West Coast. So there have been some new ones.

1650 I have to say that some of the barriers ... I mean it is mind boggling how long these processes take, but certainly I think we need to look at the planning processes around them, there are other challenges involved as well, some of which are the lack of any available pavement width but most of all the challenges are around private land ownership, and I have to say sometimes this extends to Douzaines as well and it can be incredibly difficult getting permission, so there is a lot of work that goes into it, but I think those barriers can be overcome. I would love to look at actually
1655 incorporating some good public arts into that process as well that is something that I have always championed too.

So I think that –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez, that is your minute I am afraid.

1660 Deputy Kazantseva-Miller.

Deputy Kazantseva-Miller: Thank you, sir.

Not all infrastructure projects actually fall under the mandate of the E&I such as the Havelet slipway which is under the Harbours mandate but I would like to ask what kind of infrastructure
1665 projects you would seek to prioritise in your mandate over the next four years?

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

1670 **Deputy Taylor:** I made it quite clear that coastal defences would be my main priority I would love to see and I would happily put pen to paper designing much larger infrastructure for more forward thinking projects. But I think we have to accept that the construction industry has been in decline for quite some years and I think we need to address and boost that gradually before we take on any big scale infrastructure projects.

1675 So starting small as we perfect the techniques and then we can do something big.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1680 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Yes I think as I outlined in my speech as well, coastal defences are increasingly important because obviously of the pressures of rising sea levels thanks to climate change, but I would say there is an important distinction to be made between sea defences and coastal defences. Coastal defences is a broader term which encompasses many more types of defence than just sea defences. So not all walls near the coast are actually designed to protect against flooding and in fact some of them actually exacerbate the problem rather than fix it, so it is
1685 important that you take a proper really thorough and rounded view and obviously there are all sorts of pragmatic factors such as cost and what infrastructure is being protected as well that have to be taken into account.

We do currently have a hierarchy which protects the most valuable infrastructure first so our Eastern Seaboard is absolutely top of the tree followed by our West Coast so that is roughly how it goes. Thank you.
1690

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1695 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes in terms of infrastructure of course I would like to look at the potential for
job growth within the Island's renewable industrial area and promote competition and choice in the
energy area and also waive some of the solar planning costs and perhaps scrap the standby charge
that is preventing a lot of industry getting into solar developments at the current time. So it is this
particular infrastructure for the future of electric vehicles and providing incentives to property
insulation to reduce the reliance on carbon fuels, I think that is where we have to be concentrating
1700 our new infrastructure and new resources for the public –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute one again please.
Deputy Fairclough.

1705 **Deputy Fairclough:** Thank you, sir.
What would the candidates do to ensure that the Strategy for Nature is adequately resourced?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1710 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Fight very hard to resource it is the answer to that. Obviously there will
be a budget submission that will be put before this Assembly very shortly and if I am elected
President of E&I I will be giving Members very fulsome, and probably very detailed, explanation of
why it should be resourced. But it is absolutely critical, not least because this is the gateway to... the
Strategy for Nature has got some really fantastic and very exciting things in it. It has got potential
1715 mechanisms for natural capital accounting for example and biodiversity net gain but these things
do need another layer of work in order to justify any future spend, so it is a really important decision
making tool for the Assembly to see what will and should go forward and what will not. But really
this is important seed funding, if I can put it like that, and I will if I have the opportunity to stand
before the Assembly as President I will give a very detailed explanation of why that is so important
1720 and why it should be funded.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1725 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, the convention – I suggested that we should have a biodiversity
convention in 2008 and that requires parties to develop national strategies, plans and programmes
for conservation and sustainable use of biological diversity. There is a lot of work to do there in
order to qualify for the convention and to adopt it from the UK. But the fact is that we have been
very slow, all this I put in in 2008 and there has been no action on it at all, we are just producing a
new strategy this year but the strategy was already in we could have got a lot done in the last
1730 number of terms, and nothing has been actually done in this area. So much has to be done as
quickly as possible to get the convention in place for Guernsey.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute.
Deputy Taylor please.

1735 **Deputy Taylor:** It is a funny one to answer on funding because I do not really get in a sense
what would be funded. The strategy has been put together in terms of implementation a lot of it is
going down to individual Committees putting in place whatever they are going to be doing and
they should be taking into account the strategy that is what I assume the requirement for it is. So
1740 to actually drill down to give what would be funded and how it would be funded I cannot honestly
answer you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

1745 **Deputy Roffey:** Thank you, sir.

Where do the candidates believe that Guernsey should dispose of its inert waste once the current site is full?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1750

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, sir, I just feel that the current site for inert waste has to be re-looked at because I think that the emphasis on the current site along the East Coast is one that is definitely going to have an environmental impact particularly from a geological point of view and I would prefer that another site is looked at into the future. So I think that also we are losing an opportunity of using some of that material for building on to the main Harbour in Guernsey and also St Sampson's Harbour. So we need new facilities, Harbour facilities, and we should be using the material for that.

1755

The Bailiff: Your minute is up.
Deputy Taylor please.

1760

Deputy Taylor: Well, I would like to see most of it that could be directed more towards the construction industry so instead of it being a waste product that we have to deal with it becomes a product that we can actually use to save costs elsewhere, ideally on capital infrastructure projects for the benefit of the Island. Failing that where we do have that waste that we cannot re-use going back to the strategy that has already been looked into and seeing the information that is already available on where the decisions are going and base the decision on that.

1765

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1770

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

Anyone who has read the policy letter on ... well, certainly the latest policy letter on the inert waste site and certainly the ones before that will know that these are very commonly expressed sentiments but sadly the reality is that we do need an inert waste site. We cannot recycle 100%, we cannot re-use that all in construction, actually we have done really well in getting those levels up already but we still need a site.

1775

I have been through – if anyone goes on to my Facebook page I have got a very long and detailed list of all the possible sites, the long list, many of them, and this is, sad though it is, the most pragmatic place to put it simply because I cannot even find another viable one, no-one has fought more than me to try to propose alternative sites and sadly they have been rejected even by those greatest critics. The Harbour is not the same as an inert waste site we cannot use it, they are mutually exclusive objectives, because you want to build a Harbour as quickly as possible and you want an inert waste site to last as long as possible.

1780

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez, that is your minute I am afraid.
Deputy Oliver.

1785

Deputy Oliver: Thank you.

There was a recent policy letter on third party appeals and it is due to be reviewed I would just like to know your thoughts on it?

1790

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Hands up, that is not something I am aware of and I cannot really give you an answer.

1795

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1800 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Yes, sorry.

I am in favour of third party appeals, I really am, because I think obviously I was involved in the development of that policy letter and it arose because of a feeling of unfairness. It really did feel as though the system was stacked against ordinary people, for want of a better way of putting it, in favour of developers. However, I am clear eyed about the challenges involved with third party

1805 appeals and I do not think there is any ideal system, because it does come with for example time costs, additional costs, it does complicate and extend the planning process. So it is certainly not an easy answer but it is something that I am keen to see if we can find a pragmatic solution for.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1810

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, I placed third party appeals on the environment agenda in 2008 and we have not got anywhere since with it, and I think it is very important that there is that opportunity for people to come back not just the proposers of a particular application through the environment but also that the people themselves can have that opportunity to place their concerns forward

1815 again, but at the moment, sir, there is no opportunity for the public and that is very important that that is put in as quickly as possible.

The Bailiff: Deputy Dyke.

1820 **Deputy Dyke:** Thank you, sir.

Could I ask the candidates how they will approach a runway extension from the point of view of the environment as opposed to the economics?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1825

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you.

It is an interesting question from Deputy Dyke because actually of course the environmental considerations are considerations that need to be taken into very careful account in conjunction with both economic and social considerations as well. I mean, obviously it is about how broad or how narrow you want to look at it, the standard method of assessing environmental impact is

1830 through an environmental impact assessment, but I do think that before you get to that stage there need to be a high level assessment of balancing those various costs.

Now the difficulty comes in they are in different metrics and actually this is why I am quite excited about the Strategy for Nature because it does give us mechanisms like natural capital accounting and biodiversity net gain, which will actually level the playing field a little bit in that respect to make it easier for us to compare apples with apples rather than apples with pears and oranges.

1835

The Bailiff: That is your minute, I am afraid, Deputy de Sausmarez.
Deputy de Lisle.

1840

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, I supported the runway extension within the perimeter of the Airport at the current time because I knew that we could use e-mass on both sides of the Airport in order to facilitate that. The DCA turned that down as a proposal but it would have certainly got us moving in this direction to extend the Airport runway both east and west, but we had of course already brought in another 120 metres of runway at the Airport and it is a matter of using that and we are

1845 not using it at the current time and we need to, and we could use it and we could actually provide all we need within the current boundaries at the moment without any environmental impact outside.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute as well.

1850 So Deputy Taylor please.

Deputy Taylor: Well, clearly the environment has to play a massive part in the decision and I would hope there is enough policy already in place to give that consideration.

1855 But if we are weighing up the actual value of we reach a decision where we decide we need to extend the runway for economic benefits and we need to do that we do have to kind of give precedence to that because at the end of the day that will fund a huge amount of growth.

1860 I would come and look at the runway yes if we are going to do an extension then we will talk about the environmental damage, but if we do not do a runway extension when it is proven we need to then we are still going to have a massive environmental impact in terms of planes coming out and we are not actually going to get the economic benefit from that and what is the point is keeping the standard runway.

The Bailiff: Deputy Vermeulen.

1865 **Deputy Vermeulen:** Thank you, sir.

A crumbling infrastructure might possibly not be the best way to get tourists coming back to Guernsey do the candidates fully appreciate the value of tourism as an industry for the Island?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1870 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes of course tourism is extremely important we found this year of course that we have lost our tourists and as a result the revenues derived in the hotel business and also in retail are down to about a third of what they were and less in many cases. So we have lost an awful lot by not having the tourists this summer. In fact, you will see the High Street is suffering as a result of the fact that we have not had tourists.

1875 We had a bit of a boost with regard to the connection with the Isle of Man we saw a few of those tourists in the retail and hospitality but certainly we need to be looking at tourism and certainly moving towards a vibrant tourist industry into the future.

1880 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Yes, I absolutely see the value in tourism, and I have first-hand experience to say that visitors that come to the Island and experience our natural environment whether that is walking on the beaches, going down quiet country lanes they absolutely value what we have here, as long as we can get them here in the first place they are going to see the value.

1885 To be able to actually show people far more of our Island we do need to have improvements in infrastructure. I can tell you right now that I put together a business case and was very close to signing on the line to buy a large motor boat to take people out and I know that would burn fuel but I want to take people out and down the South Coast cliffs and really show them parts of Guernsey that they are not seeing. Why did I not sign on the line? Because I could not get a mooring for it in the Harbour. So it is holding us back.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1895 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Thank you.

1900 Yes, this is actually something I submitted a paper to the Committee *for* Economic Development on last year. I have to say that there is so much potential, my main interest here is eco-tourism. I think that our natural environment really has to be one of our strongest assets but I would also say that we really want to focus on high value, and that does not necessarily mean high volume, so I would really like to see how we can exploit, it seems like a terrible word to use in this context, but really make the most of our amazing natural environment.

I would really like to see a flagship centre for research for the environment. Alderney has got a fantastic precedent in this in their bird observatory and people pay really good money to come over and take part in scientific endeavour and eco-tourism, when you look into it, it is really booming and I think that is going to become an even more obvious trend especially as –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez, that is your minute I am afraid.
Deputy Matthews – not Deputy Matthews, sorry, because he did not even stand up, so Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: My question is clearly Economic Development is interested in fisheries, but what are the candidates' views on how best you can ensure that the fishing industry continues to exist whilst we conserve our marine ecology on every level?

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Well, I suppose the best way to ensure continued success for the fisheries fleet is to continue to have people wanting to buy the fish, and if you can sell it directly into a restaurant you are going to make a lot more money as a fisherman than selling it off to a market or broker in the continent or the UK let alone then having to take into consideration all the different regulatory reasons that might make that more difficult. So not sure if it is strictly within the mandate of E&I but by encouraging more people into hospitality, tourism and having more visitors here we would increase the footfall into our restaurants which would by proxy give a boost to the sea fisheries.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: One of the things that we are working on in the early stages is a marine spatial plan which I think the name probably says it all, but to my mind I think the biggest threat is the scale. We have got 12 miles of territorial seas now, hurray, but I think we do need to work to protect it for the longevity for the sustainability of that industry so that today's fishermen or fisher people the next generation can also have the same options, the same livelihood available to them as well. Obviously it is an area fraught with geopolitical complexity but I think a marine park would actually probably maximise the best from all worlds in terms of the sustainability, the ecology, the marine ecology which is so important in terms of climate change as well and indeed it might even fit in with that eco-tourism that I have been selling to Deputy Vermeulen.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, we have to be able to land our fish in France and that is extremely important and with the Brexit negotiations going on at the current time we have to try and ensure that we have a sustainable fishery because without that market we will not have the fishery industry and the number of fishing boats that you see out there at the current time. So that is very important.

I think with the 12-mile limit of course that I have been pushing for since I was first elected in 2004 with the 12-mile limit now it gives us a greater opportunity for sustainability with regard to our own fishing waters which is important for the extension of the life of the industry but the main thing is Brexit now and maintaining that opportunity to land fish in France.

The Bailiff: Your minute is up Deputy de Lisle.
Deputy Haskins.

Deputy Haskins: Thank you, sir.

I would just like to ask the candidates what their most ambitious policy is that they would like to bring in this next term?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

1955

Deputy de Sausmarez: Fix climate change.

No seriously I think in terms of ambition simply by scale and impact if you look at our carbon footprint the single biggest source of emissions is transport and the single biggest part of that is on-Island transport. Actually our current system is not terribly inefficient but the problem is when you sort of tinker around with little bits it sort of frustrates everything it is very difficult it takes a very long time. So if I were to be ambitious and I am not saying I would insist on this myself it would obviously take an awful lot of consideration and feasibility studies, etc. but I think in terms of scale and then subsequent impact a very ambitious project, and a very worthwhile one to undertake, is to look at ... take a very broad view about the sustainability and efficiency of our road transport network in its own right, and I do not have time to go into detail, but I can bore anyone for hours about it if they are interested.

1965

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

1970

Deputy de Lisle: It is all a matter of creating jobs I think at the moment with Covid and with our needs to get the economy moving again. I think Environment has a stake in that and we have to look particularly I think at something like solar. We have got to provide the ability for the public to actually get into solar and that will create an awful lot of jobs particularly in the engineering area and through this means we need to waive some of the planning application costs to the public and also provide some sort of incentives for people to look at solar and place that on their properties.

1975

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: So I would love to see a specific policy whereby we could encourage far more small scale growing on allotments or schemes, possibly a policy that might cross over with HSS in terms of providing a work force that we can upskill to grow, we would be hopefully bringing down the running costs of a lot of the land that is owned by Government putting it to better use we would upskill people so instead of them being taught skills in gardening we would teach them skills in actually growing vegetables because most people who will be on one of the schemes are not likely to then have a garden that they will be able to tend to but if we can give them these to grow their own vegetables not only are we giving them a bit of a lifestyle we can actually bring down their cost of living, bring it with Economic Development I would then like to see that expand into some form of co-operative whereby we could create another small market on the Island in which to sell vegetables and create more employment opportunities.

1985

1990

The Bailiff: Deputy Leadbeater.

Deputy Leadbeater: Thank you, sir.

There is much talk about active travel and encouraging people out of their cars, but if we look at the cruise ships season, we welcome about 80 to 100 cruise ships in per season, some of those ships emit the same amount of particulates as 13 million cars. I think I worked it out that one cruise ship season is the same amount of particulates as about 40 years of the current use of cars in Guernsey. How would the candidates propose to square that circle?

1995

2000

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Well, I think certainly we need more parking in Town. This business – I sometimes feel that we have closed down the Town with regard to the opportunity for people to get in and shop and to have a very commercial environment. It seems to me that the indication is that we must allow more parking outside of Town to – and I am talking about The Bridge as well

2005

that is really hemmed in by not having parking facilities in order to expand their growth, because based ... the central business districts of any country are the drivers of economic growth in that country and it is very important that our two centres –

2010 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle, your minute is up.
Deputy Taylor please.

2015 **Deputy Taylor:** Yes you are absolutely right on the cruise ship side of things, it is shocking but it is a good business, so if we look at it in the short term and accept that there is that high level of pollution, there is no escaping that and we want to kind of bring those in. But what we really need to be doing is then selling ourselves to those people that do make it here, so actually long term we are not reliant on the cruise ship industry, they may come on a cruise day one but if they can come back for a week long holiday we would see a big benefit there, so I appreciate that is more on the Economic Development side but linked in with E&I.

2020 I think if we were to see some kind of relaxation in vehicle licensing for public service vehicles we could encourage more ingenious ways of getting people out into the countryside to really sell it to them as opposed to their sticking to the current system where we just stick them on a bus and send them to somewhere they probably do not want to go and then bring them back again, and we do not really actually get much economic benefit out of that anyway. So that is where I would see if we could make some kind of facility that we could really encourage people to come back next time they are not on the cruise ship and hopefully we can move away from that model.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

2030 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Deputy Leadbeater might be pleased to hear that actually this is something we are already dealing with in our climate change policy, it falls under the scope three emissions. So what means is that it will be monitored and accounted for and that as soon as we have got a mechanism to bring it down we will do exactly that.

2035 It is not a piece of work we have started yet, but obviously there are policy levers to do that, there are mechanisms to do that and that is about differential landing charges or effectively whatever we charge cruise ships to visit us.

2040 Now landside, Deputy Leadbeater might also be pleased to hear that as of March – I hope I am not breaking any confidences here; well it is about to become public – we will be having an e-bike share scheme, someone is bringing that into the Island. So I think that is going to fit in really well with the cruise ship offering.

But I think it goes back to this idea that actually I would really like to work with the Committee for Economic Development because I think there is a really great eco-tourism offer that we should be developing here.

2045 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Thank you.

2050 It is Deputy Fairclough's question some moments ago that has brought me to my feet. I think most of us attended the environmental speed husting, what struck me, going between the 1 to 10 tables, is that the volunteer network out there, the conservationists, actually wanted environmental protection. They did not want voluntary RAMSAR sites. They did not want signs asking people not to put their dogs on the east coast at Richmond. They wanted absolute protection, they did not want strategies. Now what could any of the candidates do to afford the protection that is so vitally –

2055 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Inder, your time is up I am afraid.

Deputy Inder: – needed for birds that land birds that feed.

Thank you.

2060 **The Bailiff:** Can you try and answer that question, Deputy Taylor, if there was a question.

2065 **Deputy Taylor:** You have kind of lost me. Was the question how would we provide more protection in those areas? Clearly I think more public engagement to actually make them aware of what is there. Whether that was coming from a different angle of we were to give a little bit of funding towards ... all I can think is the RSPB, if we were to give a bit of information and more funding towards charities, that might have an interest in the birds. They might take people out walking and show them what is actually there because whenever I see a sign that says there are wild birds nesting here, if I cannot see the birds I would probably just sneak through but if I actually had been shown and educated better what was there, that I think would have far more weight than just seeing a sign that I might want to sneak past.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

2075 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Thank you, sir.
Yes there is a tension at the moment obviously between people who like to take their dogs on the beach and people who are concerned about the birds, and I have to say the birds are losing this battle at the moment.

2080 Now, I am actually really glad that Deputy Inder has asked this question because it beautifully ties back to the question that Deputy Fairclough asked and it allows me to illustrate why the Strategy for Nature is so important. The Strategy for Nature is all about getting that evidence that we need. The problem is I think the reason we have got some dog free beaches and some are not is entirely arbitrary, I do not know how it was decided but it is just one of those Guernsey things. I would like to see an evidence-based approach to which beaches we need to protect and which are okay to allow dog owners to run their dogs on. But that is exactly why we need to fund the Strategy for Nature because it is all about getting that evidence, not just for that but across a whole range of issues where we need that data.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2090 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, the concern of people of that meeting of course was to try and safeguard the Island from over development and I think a lot of people were talking about the concerns in the North with all these developments that seem to be being approved and yet there is seemingly is too much of that. One of the aspects that I looked at in 2008 was to protect our biodiversity and our countryside and balance the economic growth factor with sustainable development. I think that is the way we have got to look at it very carefully. We want growth, we want to foster economic development but at the same time we have to look at our Island and protect actually the very valuable infrastructure that we have.

2100 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Blin.

Deputy Blin: Thank you, sir.

I would like to ask the candidates how high up on the agenda would be the rolling out of solar energy as renewable energy and also how they would go about doing it?

2105 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Very carefully.

It is one of those things that at the highest level it is super attractive and it makes sense so far down the line the only bear trap that we have to be very careful of is the social equity problem. So

2110 actually there was someone on the radio this morning that was talking about this but they had
longer than I do, so I will do my best. About 50% of our electricity bill at the moment has got
nothing to do with the cost of generating electricity, it is all to do with the resilience and the security
and the supply so the sort of infrastructure supplying it. Now what that means is if in large numbers
2115 we have people putting solar on their rooftops and there are some people who do not, the cost
burden because disproportionately large on the people who include those who can least afford it,
so it is a really important social equity issue. It is absolutely not insurmountable, there are really
great ways around this we absolutely can roll out solar, but we do need to do it in a way that is
socially responsible to mitigate against that very real risk. Obviously this –

2120 **The Bailiff:** Your minute is up now Deputy de Sausmarez.
Deputy de Lisle please.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes well, this would be part of my climate action to embrace wide-ranging
green recovery strategy, encompassing in fact opportunities in renewable energy. Solar certainly
2125 can be a major operator in job growth and apprenticeship training and it is a matter of actually
providing to people that opportunity, whether it is through grants or not. Not worrying about a
new connector to France when in fact we have got 85% now of our maximum that is provided by
the connector that we have got at the current time from France.

2130 So if we use that £100 million and divided it by our population and our residences we could
actually be in tune of about £4,000 per residential unit that we could be allocating –

The Bailiff: Your minute is also up, Deputy de Lisle.
Deputy Taylor please.

2135 **Deputy Taylor:** I place a quite high level of importance on it but I would not be seeking to
necessarily put Government funds towards something like that in a scheme straight away. I think
the best way forward would be working on conjunction with DPA to relax Planning Law so anyone
who wants to put photovoltaic cells on their roof and anyone who wants to pay for it themselves is
not prohibited from doing so. I appreciate that may give, it is a new term, environmental equity
2140 issues but I do not think we should prohibit people who can afford to do it from doing it in the
meantime whilst we look for a solution, and whether that is through instead of somebody who
cannot necessarily afford photovoltaic cells on their roof instead of subsidising them to do so if we
could instead put photovoltaic cells on to the roofs of Government buildings State buildings and
that could feed in instead to reduce energy costs across the board.

2145 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Gabriel.

Deputy Gabriel: Thank you, sir.

2150 I would like to ask the candidates what sort of experience they have got in running a team and
how they would manage potential disruption from outside influences that they described as their
businesses.

The Bailiff: All right. Deputy de Lisle.

2155 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, well, I have already been Minister of the Environment and run the team
there very successfully and made sure that in fact the political spectrum fed through the bureaucracy
basically and that is very important. If I become Minister I will be making the policy drives that the
department will go through, and it will be a pro-active approach to get things done and also to use
environment as a kick starter to greater jump growth in the Island and to foster new industry and a
2160 new way of thinking –

The Bailiff: That is your minute I am afraid, Deputy de Lisle.
Deputy Taylor, please.

2165 **Deputy Taylor:** In the commercial world, I have certainly seen quite a bit of conflict. I have
employed many chefs and anyone else who has employed a chef will know it is not easy business.
Whenever I have seen any conflicts within my own working environment, I always just seek to
address what the key drivers that we are looking for are, like what is our direction, what are you
2170 looking for, what am I looking for, and see where they cross over. We might have different end
goals but if they are in a similar direction then we can start to agree to work together. So that is
how I would address conflict.

In terms of actually working together, as I mentioned I entered into two industries that I had no
previous experience of so that absolutely depended upon the skills around me as much as I relied
on them. It was not a metaphorical toilet I referred to, I have unlocked many toilets myself, so I will
2175 get stuck in and pull my weight, but I will absolutely work and play off the best interests of the
people around me.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Sausmarez.

2180 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Thank you.

My professional background is a media producer and actually when I was out canvassing in the
election period someone chased me down and said you are a producer, aren't you? I think every
politician should have to have been a producer at some stage because it such transferable skills. It
really involves pulling threads together to get a practical outcome, but those threads are always
2185 very disparate because you are dealing with creative idealists on the one hand and practical financial
really sort of tangible considerations on the other. You have to find a workable way through it. I
would say I think the key is communication, it is about listening, it is about finding workable ways
through it, it is about taking people with you, and I would say the key to that is explaining. I am a
really big data geek, I love having the facts available, and I think as soon as people understand why
2190 something is happening everything becomes a lot easier.

I would also say if I have got time, I think it is about choosing a good team, I do not really agree
with group think –

The Bailiff: That is your minute, Deputy de Sausmarez.

2195

Deputy de Sausmarez: I will leave it at that.

The Bailiff: That now concludes the 45 minutes of question time.

Can I suggest that Members might wish to show their appreciation to the three candidates?
2200 *(Applause)*

Can I also just take this opportunity before reminding you of the three candidates to explain why
Deputy Queripel was not called to ask a question when he had leapt to his feet many times at that
point and that is because the second proviso to Rule 16(4)(b) is that no Member may ask more than
one question unless there is time available and that is why everyone else always got priority over
2205 him. It was not deliberate, I can assure you, Deputy Queripel; it was complying with the Rules.

So we are eating into lunchtime a little bit but, Members of the States, I hope you will bear with
me and we will go to the vote on the three candidates for the President of the Committee *for the*
Environment & Infrastructure and I remind you that you take your voting slip and write one of their
names on your voting slip which will then be collected.

2210 The three candidates are Deputy de Sausmarez proposed by Deputy Helyar and seconded by
Deputy Gabriel, Deputy de Lisle proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy Prow and
Deputy Taylor proposed by Deputy Inder and seconded by Deputy Haskins.

So when you have written a name on a slip of paper and it has been collected ...

Are there any voting slips still to be collected?

2215 If we have got all the voting slips collected then what I am minded to do is just to adjourn briefly so that you can stretch your legs the candidates can resume their seats if they wish to in the floor of the Assembly and we will return when a vote is available, probably about five minutes time.

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.38 p.m.
and resumed its sitting at 12.45 p.m.*

**Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure –
Deputy Lindsay de Sausmarez elected President**

2220 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for the office of President of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure is as follows: Deputy de Sausmarez has polled 20 votes, Deputy de Lisle has polled 13 votes, and Deputy Taylor has polled 7 votes. On the basis that no candidate has secured an overall majority, it means that we go to a second round of voting, but on this occasion Deputy Taylor is no longer eligible to be voted for and therefore it is a straightforward choice between Deputy de Sausmarez and Deputy de Lisle.

2225 So once again Members I would ask you to take your voting slips and write either de Sausmarez or de Lisle, or nothing if you prefer, and then hand it to the Sheriff and the Deputy Sheriff.

Are there any more voting slips to be handed in?

No. I tell you what we will do, we will just sit here this time I think, as it is now lunch time let's crack on with it.

Procedural

2230 **The Bailiff:** I tell you what, I will not do my knock-knock jokes, but I will at least fill a little bit of the time for you.

2235 The experience this morning is that candidates and in particular some questioners are not complying with the time limits. It will make my life a lot easier if those who are asking questions can keep an eye on the clock and make sure that the question is posed, there is no great need for any huge preamble to any question to be posed it is a direct question and it should be capable of being done within 30 seconds.

If there is going to be a further contested election during the course of this round of electing the presidents again if those candidates can keep an eye on the clock it does help rather than me having to interrupt them because it is starting to get a little but burdensome.

2240 I will also make one other comment for your benefit whilst I am filling some time and that is I probably, probably should have disallowed the last question that was posed by Deputy Gabriel because it was not a question relating to an area of policy included in the mandate of the Committee, but I missed that and I slipped up there, otherwise that question potentially would have been disallowed. It is not wholly dissimilar to what happened on Friday in relation to questions outside of the mandate of the Committee for which the President is standing, or the candidates are standing.

2245 So just a little reminder the candidates of course should explain to you all what their own qualities are, or their proposers will do so in any event, and therefore there ought not to be the need to pose such a question. But I just mention it for the future.

Anything else you would like to me help you with while I fill in some time?

2250 Feel free to talk amongst yourselves then.

I am just going to rise for a moment. I do not know what that means, but excuse me.

Members of the States, in the second ballot for the President of the Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* the voting was as follows: Deputy de Sausmarez secured 21 votes, Deputy de Lisle secured 16 votes, there were two blank papers. You will note those of you who are good at mental arithmetic that there were only 39 ballot papers submitted, and in those circumstances, I am going to declare that Deputy de Sausmarez is elected as the President of the Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* (*Applause*)

On that note the States will now stand adjourned until 2.30 p.m. this afternoon.

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.55 p.m.
and resumed its sitting at 2.30 p.m.*

V. Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of President commenced

Article V

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Health & Social Care to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article V – Election of a President of the Committee *for Health & Social Care*.

The Bailiff: Well, I look around the Chamber this afternoon and see who wants to propose a Member for that Presidency. Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: I wish to propose the name of Deputy David de Lisle, please, sir.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded?

Deputy Queripel: I am seconding that, sir, yes.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel, thank you very much.
Deputy Soulsby.

Deputy Soulsby: Sir, yes I would like to nominate Deputy Al Brouard.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Deputy Ferbrache: I second that, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much, Deputy Ferbrache.

I am just looking around to see if anyone else is leaping to their feet and they are not.

Therefore I will invite Deputy de Lisle and Deputy Brouard to leave their seats and come up to the Bench. This time it will be Deputy Brouard nearest the window and Deputy de Lisle gets a different seat nearer the door.

Gentlemen, once you are sitting comfortably, I will invite Deputy Gollop first as the proposer of Deputy de Lisle to move that nomination. Deputy Gollop, please.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you very much, sir.

2290 It is I suppose traditional that when you have an issue in health or public health to resolve, your first instinct is to call for the services of a doctor and Deputy David de Lisle is of course a doctor, albeit a PhD in Economic Geography, as we heard earlier. (*Laughter and interjection*)

He has done many things in his life as we have heard already from management consultancy and being a senior economist in Ottawa the capital to other fields in education. I think that broad basis is extremely useful for his candidature.

2295 He has a strong public mandate that demonstrates local support from the Guernsey population and 30 years of combined international and local experience in planning and management, public service and private practice, though that is not practice as a general practitioner, and he is pro-active and forward thinking and with experience of leadership and teamwork skills all relevant. Of course he served as a Minister on the old Policy Council in 2007 and 2008 for the Environment
2300 Department and at that time of course the Policy Council was a body that considered strategic policy across the board including health and social care.

He built up significant relationships through the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and represented Guernsey on the British-Irish Council and has regular contacts with States of Jersey and Alderney and indeed he is always very welcome as a member of the annual sports team because
2305 frequently he would do extremely well in bowling, ping-pong or cricket.

In fact sports and keeping active to a later age has been very much part of Deputy de Lisle's mentality, he does not see age as a barrier, or as a number, and as we are an ageing society that is one of his great credentials because he maintains a really strong work load, not just as a States' Member but in many other areas of the community from retail to parish life and he does not say at
2310 the age of 65 it is time to retire or 66 as he is now I think, he keeps on going and that is what we want to see from our population and why I think Deputy de Lisle has an enormous amount to contribute in terms of leading Health down the strategies, a Partnership of Purpose and wellness and longer working lives, and actually narrowing some of the cost worries that we have been fed in the past.

2315 Deputy de Lisle walks the talk more than that I think he is very keen on an active community on social prescription, and he has for many years pursued not just environmental strategy and minimising waste and he would look to control costs perhaps more than any other Member of this Assembly.

But he has long been a dedicated campaigner against pollution and against perhaps even some
2320 of the practices of Health & Social Care in the past with incineration and the dangers in our society from pollution whether it be in the North of the Island or the Town or anywhere else.

I think Deputy de Lisle would very much strengthen the environmental health monitoring side of Health and contribute enormously.

He also is a natural entrepreneur and he wished to see I think Health & Social Care are hopefully
2325 earning more money by being more creative in expanding what they do in terms of private provision and health tourism. Health tourism will be an increasingly important part of what we aim to achieve because Deputy de Lisle's strong background on Economic Development and Commerce & Employment would I think see greater synergies between what we do at Health and what we do in other areas of economy, and many times Deputy de Lisle has served on Education departments and
2330 I think he would ensure that all staff are educated locally and where possible we can get on with the excellent work of the Institute and ensure we employ local wherever possible in the health and social services field and really improve –

The Bailiff: Deputy Gollop, your five minutes are up I am afraid.

2335 So I am going to turn next to Deputy de Lisle to address the Assembly on his candidature.
Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Thank you, sir.

2340 I would like to make a major contribution actually in the health area. I have had many phone calls from the public wanting something done with respect to the Hospital here in Guernsey and also that in Alderney.

The fact is that we should be focusing on providing more skilled physicians at the Hospital to meet our many needs. We do not even have a radiologist for example there on a permanent basis and that is very important that we amend that particular area and the area of other specialisms.

2345 The fact is that we have only got one operating theatre under way we need more. We need to deal with that particular aspect and provide not only for the virus, if you like, but also for ongoing care where we need operations taking place and not being delayed for two years as I am being told now. It was 18 months now two years.

2350 I have people that find themselves actually isolated in their homes requiring knee and hip operations and being told that they cannot have that for 18 months to two years. I think something has to be done there very rapidly, and that is where I will be making a full rate charge to change things for the public of Guernsey.

2355 Also modern diagnostic equipment needs to be put in place in Guernsey that we do not have at the moment. For example the MRI scanner is out in the parking lot. What is it doing there? I had one relation of mine just last week or the week before who had to change in the A&E area of the Hospital and walk outside with this little gown to the MRI scanner. What is all that about? We have got to change things of that nature and that is what I am going to be very critically looking at and changing immediately.

2360 In terms of preventative care, preventative care I have been on to that for a long time in terms of perhaps closing the Hospital incinerator. What sense is there to have an incinerator in the middle of a hospital? In the United States they have got rid of them all, and that has been a major programme right through the United States because of the health effect of incinerators in hospital areas.

2365 Also I want to look at the risk of premature mortality which is a critical area as far as I am concerned where I have looked at pollution in great detail and seen how it is affecting the community here in Guernsey. We can prevent a lot of what is going on by dealing with the chemicals that we are spreading day by day across the Island and the effect that that is having with regard to health. I am asking for a clean and healthy environment free of chemical pollutants.

2370 As you know I tried to get rid of glyphosate recently in Roundup recognised as a carcinogen by WHO with links to cancer and I have been persistent in trying to remove PFOS from the airfield and other sites. I have also been persistent in trying to bring in a sewage treatment plant here in Guernsey to avoid this filthy way in which we are dealing with our sewage out to sea, spending £20 million on extending the pipe at Belle Grève Bay further into the Bay, rather than spending £15 million on a sewage plant to deal with that in a clean and respectful way like all other communities are doing.

2375 I want to control costs as well and put the budget squarely into areas of modern diagnostic equipment, additional opening the operating theatres and skilled physicians to meet our many needs.

2380 I am also concerned with mental health and the way it has been treated here. I think we have to look at that in great detail. I am finding people in Oberlands that should not be there, and I am having difficulty getting them out. When I was a boy I heard about this in Guernsey and how people were got rid of in certain ways but I never realised it was still going on in this Island, so I would like to look at that and see who is in there and who should not be in there. Also provide real progressive mental health care.

2385 I commend Nicola Brink for her guidance throughout the current pandemic and I would like to keep a tight rein on the pandemic and not become complacent. I think that is very important particularly with the secondary wave that is going on in the UK and also in France and Jersey. All our neighbours so I think we have to not run forward too quickly the programme that we have had in place which is moving from the 5B to the 5C and then on to 6. So let's be careful there because we do not want to lose more people than we have already lost.

2390

I would like to provide a Reciprocal Health Agreement too with the UK at least equal to that provided in Jersey and the Isle of Man and I think that is something that we have been waiting for and waiting for and waiting for, let's get on with it, let's get it done for the people of Guernsey and for those relatives that want to come over and the reciprocal situation. So it is both ways. Jersey have it the Isle of Man have it, why cannot Guernsey have that as well?

So there are many issues that I would like to address and I am going to be quite forceful and I will work hard for the people of Guernsey to address this awful two-year wait and being told that constantly from person after person, that has to be changed.

I will see that we get more skilled physicians to meet our many needs, additional new operating theatres opened so that we have got the facilities and I want modern diagnostic equipment to reduce the 18-month waiting times that we are going through at the current time.

HSC must continue to provide preventative health care to reduce the risk of premature mortality as well and I think we have to look very carefully at the problems that we have got. Not only in the past with all these chemicals that have been sprayed with the tomato industry and so on and so forth, but also now at the current time, there has been no let up at the Airport at all in terms of spraying and it is being done almost every day. The water is going in to the reservoirs. The reservoir recently was closed for two months, the reason being that the drinking water –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle

Deputy de Lisle: – the drinking water was contaminated.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, I am afraid your 10 minutes have now expired.

So I am going to turn to the proposer of Deputy Brouard Deputy Soulsby to move that nomination. Deputy Soulsby.

Deputy Soulsby: Thank you, sir.

Members have heard about Deputy Brouard's background experience and what makes him tick when he stood for a place on Policy & Resources on Saturday, so I will not repeat it all again.

However, I do think it is worth reminding Members that Deputy Brouard has already served on the predecessor to Health & Social Care the Health & Social Services Department Board, indeed this was at a time of turmoil at Health on all manner of different levels, so he has form.

He also knows the challenges directly, and he knows that we have several radiologists, several operating theatres, that we have a capital replacement programme that will finish at the end of the year and the reason why the MRI scanner is in the car park is because it is temporary as we put the new and last remaining piece of kit in the Hospital, and he probably knows that the reporting line for environmental health now is Environment & Infrastructure.

But he also knows that as a Member of P&R last term, as he saw me at a time when I used to come in Oliver Twist like with my begging bowl asking for more. Indeed, I think it is fair to say that Deputy Brouard was probably the one that gave the most grilling over that period of time; he certainly was no pushover and I think all other Members of the former Policy & Resources Committee will nod on that front.

The mandate for Health & Social Care is massive. It requires energy and drive to get things done, but if anyone can manage it, it is Deputy Brouard. In the 2012-2016 term I sat on the Commerce & Employment Board with him and can say he worked hard and diligently, he asked pertinent questions and helped develop solutions, all these are skills that will hold him in good stead.

So having spent six years on Health & Social Care it matters to me who takes over as President for Health & Social Care I really care about it and I want to leave it in safe hands. I believe Deputy Brouard is those safe pair of hand.

He is the ideal candidate to build on firm foundations set for the Partnership of Purpose, we have a plan there and it can be followed now and I really look forward to seeing Deputy Brouard being the one that can drive it and I will help support him in doing that.

2445 That will include the Hospital modernisation programme which is about to commence, and the restructuring of primary care and I am therefore very happy to nominate Deputy Brouard for the position of President of the Committee for Health & Social Care.

The Bailiff: Thank you.

Finally I turn to Deputy Brouard who has up to 10 minutes. Deputy Brouard.

2450 **Deputy Brouard:** Thank you, sir.

Members of the Assembly, I am going to give you a dilemma this afternoon. I am sorry about that. I am the reluctant safe pair of hands. Myself and the other candidate we are worlds apart, my opponent describes a world that I do not quite see.

2455 I would like to have delivered to you a well-crafted speech this afternoon as a candidate but there has just not been time as Deputy Heidi Soulsby said you heard enough of me on Saturday.

All things being equal I would not be here but I noticed that there was an empty space at the table at St Pier Park on Sunday when we all met together and someone had to step up to the plate and I just could not leave Health & Social Care without anybody. So I am here.

2460 So I am not going to speak about Covid of which plagues us or the Mignot Hospital in Alderney or mental health or respite care or the third party sector or the safe family initiative.

We have been chosen by the electorate and someone has to step up to the plate and I am sure there are others better than me for this role but we cannot play chicken with health. So in the early hours I cobbled this speech together and it is not really a speech it is more conditions of service, because I cannot do this alone and I will not.

2465 If I have your backing today I will not be taking prisoners and I will explain in a moment. Our biggest Committee by a country mile, using Deputy Roffey's favourite expression, is Health: 1,000 nurses a further 1,000 staff from consultants to porters, a budget rising on £130 million a year. I could even be more accurate on the figures but again time just does not allow. It is one third basically of the States' Budget.

2470 The problem and no one stepped up to this plate earlier, and I know full well why, and I know full well from my colleagues who have been here for a while, from a political point it is a very difficult position to fill. We need to have a board that focuses on strategy and getting things done, but politically it is complex, it is really complex, it is hard to get around the connections. It is like playing 3D chess in a wind tunnel, the language is out of some sci-fi book with more ologies than you can throw a stick at, the acronyms take the place of real words, and everybody knows more than you. If that is not enough, everything *really matters*.

2480 Now in Economic Development, as mentioned earlier, if we say invested I do not know in the new hydro fibre communication channel fandango and it does not work or it did not go so well ED will write another report explaining why it is somebody else's fault and part of their budget spend has gone and maybe Scrutiny will do a report some years later when most of the players are long dead. That is just for illustrative purpose we are not actually doing that we do quite a lot of good work in ED: 2-REG, Digital Greenhouse, Locate Guernsey. But in Health it is real people, real families, and real lives. So it is very important that Health gets it right every hour of every single day.

2485 To be honest I had a spell on Health for nine months some years back and with so many moving parts and procedures and medical colleges and practice and local practice and things do go wrong, and they will, they will, something will go wrong between now and the next four years, something will go wrong. The skill is to bring this to an absolute minimum.

2490 But those phone calls that 'You are causing my loved one to die because xyz' are hard to take. You do not get that on ED or on Education. That needs to change, we need to rewrite the narrative so that politicians concentrate on the funding, the policies and the direction of travel. It is not fair on politicians or their family, and it is not fair on someone else who is waiting in silence on that list.

Onerous conversations from one who is concerned need to happen at the customer care level and of course the board needs to know of the concerns and how big the backlogs are and then the board needs to put in procedures and mechanisms in place to resolve them. But that is the route.

2495 I will do my absolute best for Health & Social Care but you will have to play a part as well. If it is policy, come to the board; if it is operational, guide your parishioners to the customer care; and before you advise a parishioner that you agree that mental health is underfunded, talk to the team who provide the service and then see maybe who can do it better, so tell us. Maybe see if the budget on your own Committee would be better spent in Health.

2500 There is just about no limit on the resources that Health can consume, so when you limit the resources whether it is building, staff, budget, expertise or the shortage of consultants anywhere around the world, you are making a decision on what service we have.

2505 There are consequences on the budget every single time, so please you cannot step away from it, it is absolutely fundamental, you cannot have it all, and some services will not be there. It is just the reality. If you want to live in a world where we drive everything off unicorn tears well that is great but unfortunately I have been there, it is the real world and it is tough.

2510 You are now the Government and you are not just a parliament, my problems will be your problems. My success will be your success. So please do not try the 'Oh well, that Health team are useless', as if you are not part of it; you are. That is what I referred to earlier about not taking prisoners. I cannot do this without you. I will need your support for budget, for working together, unlocking more joint working, more work on prevention, and I know full well you cannot remove a service or cease a service easily, and if you think you can do that and you think there is something that we are doing that we should not be please come to the board and I will gladly look at it.

2515 If you think there is waste then come and see us because it is in all our interests to be as efficient as possible but you need to be realistic.

2520 I am not pessimistic or reluctant to put my name forward although I would have been quite happy for a quiet seat on STSB, but I will gladly take on this challenge but I do need you to be aware of the mountain we all face in hell, ageing demographics, medical inflation, sub-optimal size of just about every facility we have, recruitment, space, new drugs, new technologies. You do not abrogate your responsibility by appointing me today.

We cannot have it all, and at times some services will be under strain, we have that now with knee operations and things like that, and some services we may not have, we cannot have it all unless you want to put the whole of the £400 million Budget to Health because it would take it all, we could then fly in consultants from America if you want that.

2525 But we have to be realistic, and we have to be realistic with our Islanders who we are providing the service for. We have a really good health service in really good shape and we need to keep it so and we need to meet these challenges whether finance or abilities, and we also need to ensure that finance or ability to pay is not a barrier for our Islanders for health care.

2530 So when I need help, like I did back in 2014 as a Members of HSSD – Health & Social Services, as I hate acronyms – with Deputy Dorey, I was able to look after the finances with the late Deputy Storey who was poorly by then, finance was among a myriad of other problems we had identified, please do not let the phone ring unanswered at Frossard House like you did then.

2535 Deputy Ferbrache and your team if I am stepping up to the plate I will ask others to join me and step up to the plate and so will you, you will have to step up to the plate. I will need dedicated support, not reports, studies or red tape, but people on the ground now, and I do not just mean politicians, and not a civil servant one day a week on the second Thursday of the month, but real people, real action, right now.

2540 One of the other problem I have got as well is – I am not selling myself yet, I fully understand that the fifth problem is Deputy Soulsby – Deputy Soulsby and her team will be such a hard act to follow, so I do thank her for all the work that her team has done both politically and the staff have done and Deputy Soulsby has very kindly offered to hold our collective hands until we are ready to walk alone.

2545 Do not think when my voice flutters or my eyes water that it is a sign of weakness; that is unfortunately the bloody body that I was given so that is the way it is, but behind me there is quite a steely character, I will go through quite a lot.

I will do my best endeavours and I will put together a team – with your help a really good team.

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard, I am afraid your 10 minutes are up and therefore that will conclude what you have to say at this stage.

2550 Members of the States, we now go into up to 30 minutes of questions to be posed to the two candidates who will – Deputy de Lisle knows this – answer first alternately.

Who wishes to pose a question? Deputy Queripel.

2555 **Deputy Queripel:** Off-Island placements cost the taxpayer several million pounds a year. If you are elected can you tell me what you will be doing to pursue bringing some of those Islanders back home to Guernsey in order for them to be closer to their families and reduce the cost of off-Island placements?

2560 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, this is where I feel that we need more skilled physicians in place to provide that service rather than working on the basis of agencies and agency assistance. I think we have got to get around that. The money spent on that is going up every year. I thought we a term ago had stated that we were going to reduce the amount and it seems to just spiral upward. So it is a matter of having the skills, having the modern diagnostic equipment as well here locally so we do not have to be sending people away or bringing in specialists continually to the Island. So we can do a lot more than we are doing and we certainly have to get around and work on this agency problem.

2570 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute, please.
Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

2575 This has been a concern for a while but we have to remember that there are some children who have very complex needs who need 24 hours supervision. Some of them when they are adults they could knock me down to the ground in about 10 seconds. So we have to use very specialist care in specialist places in the UK.

2580 Where we can possibly bring some of these children back who may be not so badly effected we do, and we have, and we have just recently built some accommodation, I think through the GHA where we have brought some of these children back but it is not ... it is good for them, don't get me wrong, and it is good for their families, but it is not a cheap issue. There is 24-hour supervision, there are night cameras into their rooms looking at them, so I absolutely agree but we also need to do what is best for those particular children who are going through some very traumatic times.

2585 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Leadbeater.

Deputy Leadbeater: Thank you, sir.

2590 On the area of mental health Deputy St Pier in his pitch on Friday I think said that he would deliver a crisis centre within 12 months. Can I get the same commitment from the two candidates please?

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you.

2595 I am almost in the position of the newbie up here from that point of view. I do not understand exactly what a crisis centre would do. I would certainly be very keen to have a look at it, anything that we can do to improve the mental health of the Island so much the better, but I am not in a position to say I will deliver that definitely in 12 months' time, if it can be done I will certainly give it a go.

2600 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, I will be working on that particular aspect, I think it is a crisis in there I think the support system needs to be certainly looked at and changed and my point about skilled physicians too is important certainly more funding needs to go into mental health and a crisis centre is something that I would support.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

2610 **Deputy Inder:** Sir, would either of the candidates consider working with Education or the Institute and looking seriously at turning our PEH and its ancillary properties into some form of nursing college?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2615 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, I always thought that one of the new buildings was having a whole floor which was for nursing training and so on, and I am not sure that that actually came to be but that is a very important area that we should be training on Island and getting the specialists in to provide that training so that we first of all have a lot more nurses, Island nurses, local people, going into it and we need to make nursing of course a lot more popular really amongst the population in terms of pay and so on. I think we have to move on that to provide the sort of remuneration that should be expected from care professionals who are committing their lives essentially and the lives of their families to people that are in care.

2625 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute, thank you.
Deputy Brouard, please.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you.

We do have the Institute and any work we can do that brings forward more local nurses absolutely the best.

2630 But of course, we will still also have a shortage and we also will need specialist nurses, so it is also very useful and very fundamental that we make provision that some of our nurses can go away for more training learn more skills and then come back to the Island, it is just as equally important, we rely on the skills of other people's universities for many of our skilled people over on the Island and I think that needs to continue. So anything we can do that makes our nursing offering here more attractive will certainly get my support.

2635 Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

2640 **Deputy St Pier:** Sir, the mandate of the Committee *for* Health & Social Care contains eight policy areas for development, adult social care, welfare and protection of children and young people, mental health, care of the elderly, health promotion, environmental health and public health, only the third items are prevention diagnosis and treatment of key chronic diseases that is primarily what we talk about in the context of health, could the candidates identify their other priorities and where they would seek to turn their attention in terms of problems within those other policy areas?

2645 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: An excellent question and I do not have the answer.

2650 I literally do not have the answer, and that is exactly where we would get together as our team
on Health and look at what the full details of our mandate are where the specialist people ... I mean
we are the politicians, we sit at that very top table, there are skilled people beneath, those are the
people I need to listen to to find out where the areas of difficulty are, where the recruitment
2655 those professionals and then with our team as a board decide where we would want to put our
resources, but I am not going to cherry pick to make it sound clever in front of you today.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2660 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, well, I wanted a reciprocal health agreement which would bring in some
resources from outside as well as resources inside to provide that added dimension, if you like,
which will support also the economy of the Island as well as Islanders as a whole.

But again I want to bring in change and this is an area that surely we should be focusing on new
skills bringing in physicians that we do not have paying the salary there rather than expending
2665 money in other areas that are perhaps not as fruitful in terms of providing the service that our
people desperately need in this Island and reducing these waiting times that people have in order
to get out of their homes and live their lives.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, your minute is up once again.

2670 Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Deputy Leadbeater's question about crisis in mental health I want to follow it
up because I have seen over the years perhaps a little bit of a 'Monday to Friday, nine to five'
mentality in some areas of mental health services. How far will the candidates be able to provide
2675 services when the customer or service user needs that?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2680 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes well, I want a more open system in mental health. I want a system where
family can actually easily work with the care professionals within the mental health facilities not to
be isolated, not to be withdrawn from the service itself, as is being reported to me happening
currently. So a more open support system where the family feel wanted as well and certainly more
funding, certainly more funding for the centre as a whole. So much has to be done in mental health
and I just want to make the point that I will be behind making major improvements.

2685

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, I am afraid your minute is up again.
Deputy Brouard please.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you.

2690 In my time on Social Security we could see that we had difficulty with people with mental health
issues and the ability to return to work and we set up the talking therapies through the doctors'
surgeries. There is always more we can do on mental health. We have taken great strides recently it
has now become something that people openly talk about which is really good, we have got the
new mental health facility at the Oberlands site and of course we are recruiting, or trying to recruit,
2695 more specialists in this area to work over here and it is not an easy thing to do. Trying to find the
specialists who will come here is a difficulty but we must continue to do so and I will do whatever I
can to ensure that we have the facilities that are available.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

2700

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

The cost of primary care appointments can be a major barrier for many Islanders accessing GPs, what if anything would the two candidates like to do to resolve that?

2705 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Well, I think there have been some moves afoot towards the end of the last term as we are looking at how we are going to fund the GPs for people using the funds which were ... I cannot remember the name – no, it is gone. We were going to be looking at the money
2710 that was going to be coming through from family allowance and using that to put across to people to help them with their doctors' bills. But this is what I was saying in my opening speech we need to be able to find that everyone has access to health and at the moment if you are on income support then of course you have free health care and we need to perhaps be expanding that to make sure that everybody can easily and well get to see your GP because that can prevent a lot of
2715 other conditions which if they are left unchecked can –

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard, that is your minute I am afraid.
So Deputy de Lisle, please.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes well, I am finding that many will not use primary care, they will not go to the doctors because of the expense due to the cost of a GP visit. Now we have a grant of £12 for the doctor, £6 grant for the nurse, but the fact is while everything has been going up and up and up, there has been no change to this subsidy. I think that that is something that should be done immediately just as we talk about pensions and so on going up 2.4% and that sort of thing, so
2720 should this grant go up so that people have a better understanding of the value of the service and also the fact that they can access the service, but too many people at the moment are not going to primary care because of the cost involved which is £51 to £52 a visit.
2725

The Bailiff: Deputy McKenna.

2730 **Deputy McKenna:** To Deputy Brouard and to Dr de Lisle – I do not use that lightly because as a PhD holder it comes with the *[inaudible]* ???15:15:33 Latin noun *[inaudible]* which means teacher.

I have heard what both gentlemen have said where you want to reduce doctors' fees; you want to increase nurses' pay; you want to get increased diagnostic equipment; you want specialists to
2735 use the diagnostic equipment; you want to open more operating theatres; you want more –

The Bailiff: Deputy McKenna, I am afraid your 30 seconds of posing a question has already expired.

Deputy Trott.

2740 **Deputy Trott:** Sir, I think the balance of the question was how would the candidates pay for it?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2745 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes, there is a cost involved in everything I agree, and I think that I do not feel that some of the resources are being placed in the right places to be quite honest.

It is extremely important to put the moneys in the right places and as I say skilled physicians and diagnostic equipment are the areas that I would be certainly targeting for resources.

We have though been increasing the budget to Health over the past little while and I think it is
2750 a matter of making sure that the money goes in the right places and I know it is one third of the total budget of the States at the moment going in to Health but I do not think the record –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, your minute is up.

Deputy Brouard please.

2755

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

Health is not a money maker, Health basically will consume funds. What Health can do is be efficient as possible and try and provide the services that you, and especially you here in this Chamber, wish and we will do that to the best of our ability. It comes down to the level of service that you want. If you want to have a five star service with whistles and bells you can start adding another £50 million to the bill.

2760

You also have to think about the service and the staff that you need to provide a better service as well because that will also take up resources. So we are going to be introducing the new NICE drugs that will all take a lot of money and also will take a lot of other services and extra people to be able to bring that forward. So I am sorry –

2765

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard, that is your minute as well.

Does any Member who has not asked a question yet of the candidates wish to pose a question to them? In that case, Deputy Queripel, if you wish to pose a second question, I will permit it.

2770

Deputy Queripel: Thank you, sir.

Sir, the arts plays a huge part in the wellbeing of our community so I am delighted to see the arts initiative taking place in our Hospital, but of course everything can be improved it does not always mean more money has to be pumped into initiatives such as these, sometimes it is simply a case of doing more with what you have got. If you are elected would you be looking at ways in which we can improve our offering in the Hospital, I am talking about the art that is on display in the Hospital itself, in the corridors and encouraging long-term patients to get involved in the arts for the sake of their wellbeing?

2775

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard.

2780

Deputy Brouard: I think a very good question and absolutely yes, anything that we can do in the Hospital that can make the residents' lives there more interesting and more inspiring and also more interesting for them. There are plenty of walls in the Hospitals that can have lots of paintings on and things of that sort and there is also the possibility for getting more and more use of crafts and things for some of the patients who are in there for many weeks at a time. So yes, absolutely art can play a fine part towards it.

2785

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2790

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, I am fully supportive of the arts exhibitions that have been illustrated throughout the corridors of the Hospital, and it seems to me though that more can be done. I think that there could be an opportunity to have lectures, talks and so on within the Hospital in order to provide something else, something additional to visiting hospital which can be quite a drab time for many people, but to have some educational opportunity also while in hospital would be an addition to the arts flavour that is being given at the current time as a result of the initiatives that have been drawn from some of the people actually in the Western parishes who have been very interested in –

2795

2800

The Bailiff: Your minute is up, I am afraid, Deputy de Lisle.
Deputy Soulsby.

Deputy Soulsby: Thank you, sir.

2805

Can the candidates explain their understanding of the Partnership of Purpose?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2810 **Deputy de Lisle:** This is something that I think a lot of people have difficulty with, partnership
and purpose, it is another strategy and to be quite honest with you this is where perhaps we start
falling apart because we commit so much of our resources to strategies, visions and all this sort of
thing instead of putting the money directly into what is important. What is important to me are the
lives of people in this Island and focusing on having the best of physicians, the best of operating
2815 facilities, the best of diagnostic equipment right here and there, and not worrying too much about
these type of visions and strategies that seem to be used in order to fend off from doing things. So
I think we have got to be far more active and less talk about partnerships and strategy –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute.
So Deputy Brouard, please.

2820

Deputy Brouard: Thank you.

The Partnership of Purpose is really all about taking all the different strands that we have in
Health and putting them together. It is working both publicly and privately so that we have a joined-
up service, so that people do not fall between the cracks between one service and the next. It is so
2825 that all the pieces are integrated so that we are efficient but you know that Mrs Le Page is moving
from there to there, and then she will need some rehabilitation, and then someone else will then
need to go into her home and help her to recover. It is joining the dots together, that is what it is
about and I think it is the way we have to go, because I do not think doing bits and pieces in
isolation ... we have tried that before, it is expensive and it does not work and you do not get the
2830 service.

A Member: Hear, hear.

The Bailiff: Deputy Gollop, second question.

2835

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, sir.

Despite the best efforts of Deputy Soulsby and her Committee, how will the candidates with the
new Committee try to persuade perhaps less wise people who are eating the chocolates and the
sweets and who might be suffering from diabetes or obesity to be more healthy and more pro-
2840 active?

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard.

2845 **Deputy Brouard:** That almost falls nicely from the previous question because it is all about
changing lifestyles, it is all about prevention, it is all about looking ahead, and it is literally more
carrot and less sticks of rock, (*Laughter*) but it is not ... I am not going to force people to do one
thing or another. What we have got to do is help to educate people, to show them the right path,
to show them how they can live healthier lives, and also we need to make sure that we have got a
welfare system that enables people to have the knowledge of what foods to buy and how to bring
2850 up their children with the best advantage for them. So it is a whole lifecycle linked in together for
everyone from cradle through to grave we need to ... I have given up smoking sometime back we
need to take other people on those sorts of journeys. It is a journey.

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2855

Deputy de Lisle: Yes, it is not only tackling smoking and obesity and those type of things. I think
it is a matter of having a department that is receptive, that is receptive to looking at chemicals and

what they are doing to our health. This is something that I have driven in to the States and to be quite honest I have not got the support of the current Health politicians when I put amendments and so on and requêtes into the States. So this is very important to stop a lot of the pollution that is going on currently in the Island that we can actually terminate and therefore improve the longevity of people in the Island.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I am sure the candidates during the election campaign will have similar contact as I did with members of the electorate who gave a sense of concern about mental health provision. Could the candidates speak a little bit about their understanding of what those concerns are or could be, and how they would seek to understand where to go next in relation to those concerns?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Yes I have had people addressing me, in fact breaking down at the doorstep with regard to the way that their loved ones are being treated within mental health, particularly in terms of the fact of not getting the support that they require with wives and family being within Oberlands for example. The need for more funding has been asked for, but it is just a matter of being to some extent excluded within Oberlands, one particular gentleman not being able to talk to his wife who was in Oberlands without having somebody listening in to the conversation that he was having with his own wife. We need to open up, I want to bring change –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, that is you minute once again, please.
Deputy Brouard next.

Deputy Brouard: I think there is always more work than we can do. Pathways I think need to be much clearer than they are, and I have not had many people on this particular election trail about mental health but on previous ones. It is making sure that people know where to go, that there is somebody available 24 hours a day to be able to give the support. We need to make sure that the bridge between the GP and our secondary service is made. But we do have some issues with regard to staffing and finding the resources. So please, if this is an area, I am sensing not only from this Assembly but from the previous Assembly, we want to put more work in. We will put more work in and we will be returning to you asking for more funding.

The Bailiff: Before I call Deputy Leadbeater, is there anyone who has not asked a question who wishes to do so? Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Sir, during the election campaign many of the electorate raised concerns regarding autism and with particular emphasis on the diagnosis or lack thereof. What are your views on this topic and how will you address it?

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Again I understand the question, I think somebody was mentioning that it was almost six years that they had been waiting for a diagnosis, it was certainly a very long period. We need to get better at that, but again it has been because of the availability of specialists who would be able to give that advice. If there is some way that I can unblock that particular issue with the board, I certainly would because it must be harrowing for the parents to have a child and they want to know what the best route is and they cannot get a proper diagnosis. So yes, absolutely.

Thank you.

2910

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2915

Deputy de Lisle: I have spoken about diagnosis, and autism is a real issue. We need to be building in that area as well as others and focusing on those needs directly. It is one thing to be building and building and building other buildings and that sort of thing but it is more important I think from what I hear in the community to have the skills, to have the theatres, to have the equipment the diagnostic equipment that we require, and that is where the money should be going from now on to assist the people of Guernsey.

2920

The Bailiff: Any other Member who has not asked a question yet, as I have got three Members standing who have?

I will call Deputy Leadbeater and that will probably be the final question.

2925

Deputy Leadbeater: Thank you, sir.

2930

I just want to touch on the transition issue that we have. We have children in our special schools and where for example they get excellent clinical psychological provision right the way through their schooling and when they transition out of education services into adult disability service they kind of effectively get pushed off a cliff because the provision of services is not there and it is massive problem. It was a problem before I came into the States in 2016, I experienced issues personally of this nature myself –

The Bailiff: Deputy Leadbeater, you have used up your 30 seconds already I am afraid. Anyone else? Deputy Taylor then.

2935

Deputy Taylor: Sir, I appreciate this might be a bit too operational but could the candidates describe quite how an operating theatre would help with autism?

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle.

2940

Deputy de Lisle: I did not quite catch the question but I think you are asking for operating theatres ...

The Bailiff: How would an operating theatre help with autism?

2945

Deputy de Lisle: With autism that is not the key area, it is diagnostic facilities really. With the theatres they have been basically closed while reparations are going on with different matters, particularly those of asbestos and so on and so forth. I appreciate that but I think with autism it is more a matter of having the skills to provide the diagnostics and the equipment to facilitate that particular issue.

2950

The Bailiff: Thank you, Deputy de Lisle, that is your minute. Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you.

2955

I think we have got two different things in play here, operating theatres are one thing and I do not think they are really actually connected with autism.

2960

I think for autism the main issue is diagnosing the person or the child who has got autism and then, but having a label does not necessarily cure everything, that is just one part of the journey because the next part is you still have the child whether they have got autism or not they still need to be looked after loved and we have to as a society get the absolute best and take them to their

best potential and make sure that they are in the right place with the right care facilities and the right people to help them.

There will be people with a range on the autistic spectrum and obviously we need people with the skills to be able to advise parents how best to look after their particular child.

2965 So two completely different issues.

The Bailiff: Well that concludes question time on the basis that we have had just over 30 minutes. Once again, Members of the States, perhaps you would like to show your appreciation for the two candidates. *(Applause)*

2970 I am going to invite you to take the voting slip in front of you and to either put the name of Deputy de Lisle who was proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Queripel or Deputy Brouard proposed by Deputy Soulsby and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache on it. When you have completed putting a name or no name on your slip please will you hand them to the Deputy Sheriffs.

Have all the voting slips been handed in, including by the candidates?

2975 Members of the States, whilst those votes are being counted, I am proposing to adjourn for a few minutes, so probably up to five minutes; we will be back at 20 to, if not before.

*The Assembly adjourned at 3.35 p.m.
and resumed it sitting at 3.40 p.m.*

Committee for Health & Social Care – Deputy Al Brouard elected President

The Bailiff: Members of the States, the voting in the election for the President of the Committee for Health & Social Care is as follows: Deputy de Lisle polled 7 votes, Deputy Brouard polled 29 votes, there were three blank papers and one spoilt paper, and therefore I declare that Deputy Brouard has been elected to that presidency. *(Applause)*

2980

Greffier.

VI. Committee for Home Affairs – Deputy Rob Prow elected President

Article VI

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Home Affairs to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article VI – Election of a President of the Committee for Home Affairs.

The Bailiff: Deputy Ferbrache.

2985

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, I nominate Deputy Prow.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Is that nomination of Deputy Prow's seconded?

2990

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Yes, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Dudley-Owen.

2995 Any other nominations? Very well, in that case I will invite Deputy Ferbrache as the proposer of Deputy Prow to speak to that nomination. Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, I can be very brief.

3000 Deputy Prow is a person who is steeped in these matters, not only has he been on the Committee he served over 40 years with what ended up being called the Border Agency, the last eight or nine as its distinguished head.

He emanates common sense, he is a reasonable man, he is the person for the job.

The Bailiff: Deputy Prow, you may speak for up to 10 minutes now on your candidature.

3005 **Deputy Prow:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

Sir, I must first thank Deputy Ferbrache for his words and for proposing me as a candidate for the position of President of the Committee for Home Affairs, and I also thank my seconder Deputy Dudley-Owen.

3010 We have heard some truly excellent speeches from proposers and candidates during this election process. Some key themes have emerged and already leadership is being clearly demonstrated from the newly elected Policy & Resources team and the freshly elected presidents.

3015 It is abundantly clear that a very new States of Deliberation is emerging. These speeches and the questions from the floor have drawn out a necessity in these very challenging times to improve and develop cross-Committee working and dialogues. Using Deputy Soulsby's words by engaging with trust and respect.

But there is also a new demand for change, Deputy Helyar pointed out the new dynamic in the makeup of the States and that 50% are brand new Deputies. Few would argue that last term progress was slow in delivery and in some instances failed to deliver at all. This new States must without looking back with blame find ways to make our decision making more dynamic and timely.

3020 Deputy Soulsby summed up this point in her speech on Saturday, she noted that some had described the P&R role as the bridge on a ship but she suggested it also needed to be the engine room facilitating change and action rather than majoring on the treasury function and being a scrutineer.

3025 I am convinced this will happen with our new P&R President and his team elected by us who want actions not glossy vision statements.

This is all music to my ears and makes me excited for the future, even in the face of unprecedented challenges. These have already been identified, Covid, Brexit and the economy. This new way of working is exactly how I would wish to contribute should I be elected.

3030 In doing so I should outline where my personal motivation for this role has come from. It stems from the experience I have gained in this Assembly over the last term and crucially the learning and mentoring received under the presidency of Deputy Heidi Soulsby during my time on Health & Social Care. I am indebted to her for that experience.

3035 Sir, it might surprise some that the Health & Care partnership approach now drives me to engage in the development of a key work stream, to produce a justice policy letter to come before this Assembly as soon as practically possible. This piece is very similar in its make-up to the transformational HSC work already done.

3040 It is about, absolutely about, listening to the professionals, consulting with the public and service users and close working and commissioning the third sector. Furthermore it must achieve cross-Committee buy-in and support Home Affairs alone cannot reduce offending, develop restorative justice, better support and rehabilitate those who are convicted, tackle domestic abuse, identify and support what people with mental health, substance addiction or other identified issues and where

it is in the interest of society to divert them away from the criminal justice system. This all needs a kick start a lot more work and speedy resolution.

3045 But the justice policy is but one of other pressing issues this States must support the economy working with Economic Development and P&R, we must join up and streamline population management and immigration policy, and establish a one stop shop at the delivery end.

The review started by P&R last term must better identify what we are trying to achieve. This work needs to be completed and finished.

3050 As our Protocol 3 arrangements, which have served us so well over four decades, as that falls away we must continue to progress the Home Affairs Brexit transformational piece including Customs & Excise regulations and duties, cross border trade requirements, an area which poses a massive risk for our Bailiwick.

When it comes to negotiating with the EU the UK interests will not always coincide, in fact will sometimes conflict with ours, as demonstrated by the UK's stance on fishing.

3055 Our immigration law is applied by extending UK Acts. UK immigration policy is now appearing as though it will be far more restrictive than our population management system and our current immigration work permit regime. With the UK insisting upon entry clearances, visas, prior to entry for EU nationals coming to work.

3060 However, we do have the ability to make our own laws under Law and we must be prepared to plough a different furrow where it is necessary to support local industry.

Another area of identified risk for Law Enforcement is the need to upskill and develop our capability with regard to financial crime and money-laundering. We also need to do more in the pursuit of criminal asset confiscation both in the local and international theatres of operation.

3065 Sir, I understand we are due an IMF inspection in 2022 which we cannot afford to fail, again this is an outstanding matter raised within the Policy & Resource Plan and deemed to be of such a priority that £1.5 million was allocated but no resolution has yet been forthcoming.

In the words of Deputy Ferbrache we now need action.

3070 I have just raised the uncomfortable subject of money, well there is a fund that could be used to assist both Law Enforcement to develop our financial crime capability, our fledgling justice policy and third sector organisations involved in health harm reduction.

3075 Over the last term in every accounts debate, much to the amusement of the former Scrutiny Management President I challenged the lack of transparency in the accounting line entitled Charity and Other Deposit Balances. Which at the last submission in fact contains within it but fails to mention £13.8 million in the Seized Asset Fund. This is money taken from criminals following successful action by Law Enforcement and the Law Officers, once again a policy letter is still awaited, this money under the proper caveats could and should be allocated and put to use through our budget process. Jersey spent £9 million from their seized assets on building their new police station.

3080 Finally, sir, I have already spoken with a fair view Deputies who, like me, have expressed an interest in Home Affairs and justice policy, some have a business background and some have other impressive CVs we have new talent in this Assembly and we would be wise to utilise it.

3085 Our system of Government is a Committee system of five Members and we can also call upon and appoint non-voting States' members, not least to help us ensure good governance. Each Member including the President has one vote, it is consensus Government the President therefore must provide leadership only as a first amongst equals, the President must establish parties and facilitate good decision making by building a team both politically across the spectrum of the Committees and with the public service colleagues.

My star would be the servant leader model as eloquently outlined by Deputy Dudley-Owen in her speech on Friday. I will encourage the Committee to delegate and share strategic leadership roles within the Committee, very much matching the challenges and priorities I have outlined.

3090 I close this speech with again thanking Deputy Ferbrache for having the confidence in my ability and for proposing me for this highly important presidential position.

Sir, if elected I shall work tirelessly for this fantastic Bailiwick and discharge the Home Affairs mandate to the very best of my ability.

Thank you, sir.

3095

The Bailiff: Well, Members of the States, we go to the vote on the nomination of Deputy Prow as the President of the Committee for Home Affairs, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Dudley-Owen. All those in favour; those against.

Members voted Pour.

3100

The Bailiff: I declare Deputy Prow duly elected without dissension. *(Applause)*
Greffier.

VII. Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of President commenced

Article VII

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Scrutiny Management Committee to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article VII – Election of a President of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

3105

The Bailiff: I wait to see whether anyone is going to rise to propose a fellow Member to this office. Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: I am sure it will not be the only nomination, sir, I nominate Deputy Lester Queripel.

3110

The Bailiff: Is that nomination of Deputy Queripel seconded?

Deputy de Lisle: I second that, sir.

3115

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, thank you very much.
Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Sir, I am nominating Deputy Yvonne Burford.

3120

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.
Is Deputy Burford's nomination seconded?

Deputy Moakes: Yes, sir.

3125

The Bailiff: Thank you, Deputy Moakes.
Any other candidates to be proposed? No, on that basis I will invite the two candidates first to come up to the Bench. That will be Deputy Burford the window side, and Deputy Queripel on the door side.

Once both of them are settled I will then invite Deputy Ferbrache as the proposer of Deputy Queripel to move his nomination.

3130

Deputy Ferbrache: Sorry, I was trying to move into action quickly.

But in relation to this matter Deputy Queripel has been a Member of this Assembly and this is his third term and he is a person of the people.

3135 He is one of those candidates that said several months ago, and on several occasions, he was not going to stand changed his mind and the people of Guernsey were grateful for that and I am grateful for it.

3140 He describes himself, and I agree with that description, as a natural scrutineer. He is a person who asked more questions both in the debate in the States debates and via Rule 14 than probably any other Member in the last Assembly, and they were purposeful questions. I can remember having to deal with some of those of both types as President of the STSB and they were good questions and they thought provoked me into answers that we had to quite properly give.

Deputy Queripel is a thinker, poet, but he is a practical thinker too, he is pragmatic, he is realistic, he is sensible and he has got that core of steel. He is a bit like a dog with a bone, nobody is going to detract him from a course that he properly thinks is right.

3145 But he is a fair person, he will listen to the evidence, he will scrutinise fairly, and he will be like any intelligent person, which he obviously is, he will change his view if the evidence is there, and he will do things in a balanced pragmatic and realistic manner.

3150 He has done many things. Age Concern for three years, he has helped the Age Concern Fuel Fund for the Elderly People for six years, he ran that. He has done so many practical things, he is in touch with people. His only interest and his only concern is for the goodwill of the people of Guernsey; indeed the goodwill of the Bailiwick of Guernsey.

I regard him as a very sensible, balanced Guernseyman and I have no hesitation at all in commending him for this role.

3155 **The Bailiff:** I now invite Deputy Queripel to speak for up to 10 minutes to the Assembly. Deputy Queripel.

3160 **Deputy Queripel:** Sir, I will start by thanking the Chief Minister for proposing me and Deputy de Lisle for seconding my nomination. It means a lot to me that two such highly regarded and much respected politicians consider me to be worthy of the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

So why do I want to be President? Well, sir, the people of Guernsey are crying out for openness, honesty, transparency, and accountability and the SMC are the Committee who can make all four of those happen right across the States.

3165 They have been given new powers the SMC have got the mandate and the potential to become the most effective and the most influential Committee of all States' Committees. Even more influential than the Policy & Resources Committee. I say that because even P&R will be scrutinised by SMC from time to time.

3170 As we all know, sir, the mandate of the previous Scrutiny Committee was incredibly restricted, there were doors that the Committee were not even allowed to knock on let alone open. That has all changed now due to the Committee being given new powers I referred to a moment ago.

3175 Before I go any further, sir, I think it might be helpful if I explained what those new powers actually are for the benefit of colleagues who may not be aware of them. In a nutshell Article 201 empowers the Committee to facilitate effective scrutiny of the conduct, the policies, the use of resources, and the activities in general of any Committee, any person, or body whose functions include functions of a public nature and which is or has been in receipt of public funds. So I sincerely hope, sir, that helps my colleagues understand why I am placing so much emphasis on those new powers.

3180 It is because Scrutiny have been given those new powers that the right person is now needed at the helm. A person who has the ability and the desire to drive Scrutiny where the Committee needs

to go in order to attain the openness, honesty, transparency and accountability that the public are crying out for.

To misquote the mission statement from *Star Trek* all those years ago to bravely go where a Committee has never gone before. The person at the helm needs to have the same kind of qualities as Captain Kirk, they need to be able to stay calm under pressure; they need to be able to recognise their own strengths and weaknesses as well as the strengths and weaknesses of the Members of their team; they need to have confidence in their own abilities; and they need to have leadership qualities that are second to none. If you blend all of that with the inquisitive mind of the American detective Colombo who was indeed like a dog with a bone and never gave up until he was satisfied with all the answers to his questions; or perhaps a Miss Marple, who was my favourite sleuth of all time by the way, then you are getting somewhere need the kind of character who we need at the helm of Scrutiny.

I say getting somewhere near because they will need a lot more attributes than those I have just mentioned. They will need to be resilient; they will need to be able to understand that there is a time to be pragmatic and there is a time to be dogmatic; they will need to have the ability to rise above the situation in front of them and see the bigger picture; they will need to be respectful and professional at all times; they will need to be balanced and reasonable in their approach because accountability does not mean heads on sticks.

Scrutiny should not be about conducting a series of witch hunts, it should not be about Scrutiny being used as a weapon against Committees and departments whilst pursuing personal agendas. It is about ensuring the States of Guernsey is working effectively and efficiently on behalf of the people.

Of course Scrutiny now having new powers will act as a deterrent because nobody enjoys being embarrassed when their mistakes are pointed out to them.

Now if every member of staff is doing the job they have been employed to do responsibly and if every Member of this Assembly does the job they have been elected to do responsibly, then none of us will have anything to worry about, we will all be squeaky clean and will come up smelling of roses at the end of every review.

Sir, I want to spend a couple of minutes focusing on my leadership skills and why I think I am the right person for this role.

I think I am the right person for this role because I am a natural scrutineer, as the Chief Minister said when he spoke, I have probably asked more questions in this Chamber and more written questions than any other Deputy in the last eight and a half years. I have never been afraid to challenge a colleague or a Committee or a department should I feel that challenge is justified. Sir, I have even challenge your ruling on occasion in States' debates. I have always done that respectfully and I have always accepted your ruling when you have overruled my challenge, sir. *(Laughter)*

Moving on to my leadership skills, I was Chairman of Age Concern Guernsey for three years from 2013 to 2016 in that time I chaired 24 meetings of a 12 strong Committee and even though we discussed numerous contentious issues I never allowed proceedings to get out of hand, and working hand in hand with an extremely hard working Committee I am delighted to say we raised our profile considerably in those three years.

Single-handedly, I set up the Age Concern Fuel Fund and chaired that Committee for six years from 2013 until 2019, that fund was set up to help pensioners who struggle to pay their fuel bills in winter, and in those six years we paid out tens of thousands of pounds to hundreds of pensioners here in Guernsey who would otherwise have shivered throughout the whole of the winter period.

I am currently the President of the Guernsey Walking Football Club and I have been for the last two years. I was a founder member of the club five years ago now when six players turned out to our first session and we now have almost 70 players of all ages and all abilities both male and female on our books.

Now, before moving on to what I see as my mission at Scrutiny for the next four and a bit years should I be elected I think it is important, sir, to remind colleagues I was a Member of the Scrutiny Committee from 2012 until 2016 so I already know how the system works plus I also have an

excellent working relationship with every single member of staff in the office and I think that is a crucial point for my colleagues to bear in mind when they come to vote, sir.

3235 As I said earlier in my speech SMC have the potential to become the most influential and the most effective Committee of the States and if I am elected I would push for Scrutiny to undertake a whole series of reviews and investigations in order to identify any failings in the system and then come up with proposals to rectify them. Starting with a review of the public sector reform initiative where four years into that programme, which is costing the tax payer millions of pounds, but none
3240 of us in this Assembly knows where we are with that, none of us. So Scrutiny will find out and report back to you.

Then as long as the Committee supports the motion, I would like us to then move on to holding another review of Children's Services because it is five years since the last one and we need an update to find out where we are.

3245 I then would move on to establish why so much secrecy surrounded the recent appointment of a Head of Education (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) The public have a right to know.

So my campaign slogan in the recent election was the time is now, and the irony is I am running out of time, so all I can do is inform my colleagues I have a lot more reviews than that on the list and assure them that I am the right person for the job. I can do the job, I have what it takes to do
3250 the job, and I want the job.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: I now invite the proposer of Deputy Burford Deputy Inder to move that nomination.

3255 **Deputy Inder:** Sir, Members, if I can be perfectly honest with you I really had not given much thought to the presidency of Scrutiny Management Committee until Saturday when I was approached by Deputy Burford and asked if I would nominate her for the role. I did give it some thought for accepting not for any reason beyond the fact that nominations are easy asked of quickly given and often regretted. But I do not think that will happen in this case.

3260 If I look back at what has happened over the last few weeks, it is fairly clear to me that Islanders have asked for something different, and now we move down to the last few Committees in this election process I am obliged to give that some serious consideration.

Sir, we are all now members of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and amongst others its statement of purpose includes just and honest government, the rule of law, and the
3265 nurturing of good governance. Now, if we set aside for a moment the hubbub of Policy & Resources and Principal Committees elections we are now into the guts of what it means for us to be parliamentarians in a modern democracy, and as we are keepers of millions upon millions of pounds of public money, it is important that we have the right person for the lead on the Scrutiny Management Committee.

3270 So why Deputy Burford? Well a quick glance at her manifesto it is an impressive array of achievements and qualifications which is all very good on paper but that is just paper. What do we know about her? Why have I put my name to her nomination? Well, it is simply this.

I remember back in 2015 sitting on a wall at North Beach watching a demonstration on matters concerning transport. One Deputy, well all I can say, who had a warm crowd, stood in front of 1,000
3275 or so people and tore up the transport strategy, much to the applause of the attending demonstrators. Out of stage left much to my surprise came this slight woman, the then Deputy Burford, popped in on top of a low loader, was introduced like a lamb to the wolves calmly making her opposing case. Now sir, Members in the Assembly that takes some guts (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) she is a better woman than I will ever be. (*Laughter*) It shows character and purpose whether
3280 it was the right purpose that day is not the point. Anyone who gets up and stands their ground will always get my respect, and that is what will be needed as President and lead on the Scrutiny Management Committee.

It requires an independence, an ability to stand up to the politics of the Assembly and the lobby, and I did vote for all the members of Policy & Resources but it was not a free ride. What came with

3285 that as a parliamentarian in me that puts his duty to the democracy, the public purse and the roles of a scrutineer before all else. In my view the job of President will need and require a certain determination of purpose. I am sure Deputy Burford will despatch her duties with vigour.

Thank you.

3290 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.

I now turn to Deputy Burford to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes. Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you, sir.

3295 I would like to thank Deputy Inder and Deputy Moakes for proposing and seconding me. I would also like to thank former Deputy Advocate Chris Green for affording me considerable time at short notice last week to discuss his experiences as previous President of the Scrutiny Management Committee. Indeed it may be the first occasion that I have spent time in a lawyer's office without mentally counting off the minutes in £10 notes.

3300 I am also grateful to the Scrutiny Principal Officer Mark Huntington who welcomed me to Raymond Falla House and answered my very many questions.

So why am I seeking Members support as President of the Scrutiny Management Committee? It is quite simple. I see scrutiny as a fundamental lever in building and rebuilding trust between Government and the public.

3305 It is true to say that I was somewhat typecast in my last term as being all about the environment, but my interest and skills go much wider. My career began with a decade in local finance, culminating in several years spent as a foreign exchange dealer and international money markets trader.

I have also through voluntary work as a member of the Independent Monitoring Panel in the Prison and as a Director of Safer and the Women's Refuge been involved in issues of social policy.

3310 By way of recent relevant qualifications, I have a Master's Degree with distinction in Renewable Energy, the work needed to achieve this especially the dissertation required careful analysis and critical thinking as well as the ability to research and to evaluate evidence on all sides.

3315 Then earlier this year together with Deputy Dudley-Owen I completed the Institute of Directors Certificate in Company Direction, which covers subjects such as leadership, governance, finance, and strategy. I undertook this to enable me to better carry out my voluntary directorships. It has been a feature, a recurring feature of my life to delve deeply into books and study wide and varied topics that interest and inspire me.

3320 From being a landlubber to setting up a boat and sailing across the Atlantic two handed in the space of six months, to undertaking the written and flying exams for the commercial pilot's licence purely for the interest of it and without any intention at that time to fly for an airline.

3325 But back to the matter in hand, heading up any Committee in the States demands team work as well as leadership. Of course the major part of my career was as an airline pilot, if any job demands team work then it has been part of a flight crew, especially on the occasions that things do not go quite according to plan, and although on the face of it flying aeroplanes and heading up a Committee of the States might not seem to have a great deal in common the ability to work as part of a team to pull together and to react quickly and calmly to unexpected situations is a transferable skill.

3330 For new Members who may not be aware of the history of the Scrutiny Management Committee it was formed in 2016 out of the merger of the Legislation Select Committee, the Public Accounts Committee and the Scrutiny Committee itself, and all three of those functions are vital. The Scrutiny Management Committee draws on the skills and talents legal and otherwise of Members from across this Assembly by inviting them to be part of Task and Finish Panels, Scrutiny Panels and of course the Legislation Review Panel.

3335 Furthermore it draws heavily on the skills and expertise in our community as there are two permanent non-States' members on the Committee and to quote the duties and powers: 'any

number of additional occasional non-voting members as the Scrutiny Management Committee sees fit for purpose of reviewing any matter’.

In my manifesto I emphasised the need for Government to use the manifold skills and abilities that exist in our community and I would ensure that the Scrutiny Management Committee under my leadership would do just that.

How do I see the role of Scrutiny? Well perhaps it is much more important to start with how I do not see it. I do not see it as a vehicle designed to catch people out; I do not see it as a means for creating or widening divisions; and I do not see it as a way of advancing political capital or ideology for any group or indeed for settling scores.

Again in my manifesto I stressed the need for constructive Government, for working together and for a restoration of the proper functioning of the consensus system, and that extends to the manner in which scrutiny is conducted.

But equally it is the undoubted job of the Committee to investigate, interrogate and review, thoroughly and forensically without fear or favour.

As already mentioned, I see Scrutiny as the fundamental lever in building and rebuilding trust between the Government and the public.

It was evident to me from the election process that there are pockets of distrust in our community and I believe that Scrutiny has a significant opportunity to build bridges, particularly through the use of public hearings and this is a top priority for me. It would also be my intention to follow up on the freedom of information review.

Regarding populating the Committee, I know some Members are thinking of the role but may want to see how other cards fall first. So if I am elected I will invite anyone who is interested to contact me.

It is customary for a potential Committee President to set out an idea of what they would like to do during the term. Some of the work of the Scrutiny Committee is by nature reactive and therefore difficult to predict, but it is also the role of Scrutiny to address areas of policy that are not getting adequate attention or that have fallen through the cracks.

One area that I believe to be worth of investigation is housing, the Housing Department function was split between E&I and ESS in 2016 and seems to have been side-lined to a degree in both Committees. This issue also rubs shoulders with the States’ property portfolio and these two items could form the basis of a review to look at issues such as better use of States owned brownfield sites for example, which could also feed into the IDP review where social housing and housing generally is concerned.

Furthermore proper scrutiny of States’ assets, revenue and expenditure is essential, and is a core function of Scrutiny, and this is even more important post-Covid when we are entering a period of some borrowing.

I am aware that there is a feeling that not enough prominence has been given to this aspect of the Committee’s work and I would seek to remedy this.

Significantly in April of this year the States approved Legislation that allows Scrutiny to apply for a court order to compel a witness to appear before the Panel. Whilst as with much Legislation it would be envisaged that this is not used frequently its very existence will give the Committee the teeth that were lacking to enable it to reliably gather evidence and ask questions.

It is vital that the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee is not only impartial but is also seen to be impartial when dealing with Scrutiny related matters. With that in mind if Members elect me today I will step down from my membership of the Partnership of Independents. I am sure my colleagues in the Partnership and indeed anyone who knows me well would attest to the fact that I am the first to challenge, to be a devil’s advocate, and to counter a narrative when I think it is wrong but perception matters too.

Of course Scrutiny itself is also the responsibility of each and every Deputy in their roles as legislators and parliamentarians. As stated in the previous Scrutiny Report it is not appropriate or possible in our system of Government for the Scrutiny Management Committee to question constantly the work of every States’ Committee. That real time scrutiny is, or at least ought to be,

the role of individual Members of policy making Committees who under our system of Government are not bound by collective responsibility and who are empowered to robustly challenge decisions.

3390 That said the appropriate use of snap public hearings can and will help provide more timely scrutiny.

So in conclusion the Scrutiny Management Committee plays a vital role in ensuring value for money; in contributing to fulfilling States' objectives; in ensuring that funds and other resources are used to the best advantage; in supporting and participating in cross-Committee work; in making
3395 certain that legislation has its intended effect; and crucially in trust building with our Bailiwick community.

I am truly excited about the possibility of using my skills and experience, including that gained in Government as a Minister, to take the work of Scrutiny Management Committee to the next level and I ask for Members support to enable me to do just that.

3400

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Well, Members of the States, we now go into up to 30 minutes of questioning to the two candidates on questions relating to areas of policy included in the mandate of the Committee.

Who wishes to pose a question?

3405 Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: My question is, how far does either candidate wish to reintroduce or reintegrate a public accounts Committee, audit commission, and indeed maybe an auditor general as part of their mandate?

3410

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: Well yes, PAC of course falls under the mandate of Scrutiny. It is absolutely vital that public accounts continue to be scrutinised effectively and efficiently. Perhaps that has
3415 fallen a little bit by the wayside. I think it was a mistake to separate... to dispense with PAC and amalgamate all the responsibilities into the Scrutiny Committee. If elected I will be looking into whether or not there is any merit or any value in actually setting up a sub-Committee specifically to look at PAC issues.

3420 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you, sir.

I think the Scrutiny Management Committee as the umbrella of the Scrutiny Committees is a good model and I would not be seeking to make any changes to that, in fact I want to build on the
3425 work done by Deputy Green in the former Assembly.

There is already a Financial Scrutiny Panel as part of it and certainly, as I mentioned in my speech, I would like to see the financial aspect of Scrutiny the public accounts part strengthened under the umbrella of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

3430 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Dyke.

Deputy Dyke: Thank you.

Do the candidates see scope for the Scrutiny Committee to look at and scrutinise and review major States' contracts before they are signed with a view to thinking about value for money?

3435

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you.

3440 I certainly think that the fact that a lot of the work that Scrutiny does is reactive often means that the conclusions come too late to actually address what might need doing, so I think the suggestion that Deputy Dyke makes is certainly something that bears consideration. Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

3445 **Deputy Queripel:** Absolutely, that is real time scrutiny and I am all in favour of it.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Thank you, sir.

3450 Deputy Queripel mentioned just before the hiring of curriculum standards which was something that was brought before the States before, but rejected by the last Assembly. Do the candidates commit to bringing that back to the States for potentially a judicial review to go ahead because I believe it is still a matter of major public concern.

Thank you.

3455

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel:

Deputy Queripel: I would certainly propose that, certainly push it, and certainly support it all the way down the line.

3460

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you.

3465 I think it is a good question and certainly one that I am sure is on quite a few people's minds. However, a considerable amount of time and energy was invested in the last States into this matter culminating with a report in the States looking for a tribunal, that was rejected I think on a tied vote of 17 all. I think sufficient time in my view has been spent in that area and I think we need to move forward with the work of this Assembly.

3470 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Matthews.

Deputy Matthews: Yes, I would like to ask how helpful do they think the introduction of a Freedom of Information Law, rather than just a policy, might be to the scrutiny function and to open Government in general?

3475

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you.

3480 Well, the report has just been done the scrutiny recommendations are there and that needs to be continued in this term. But to answer your question directly I think that there is definitely an advantage in moving to more of a statutory basis for this particularly on an appeals panel basis but I think that it is really important that we do this in a proportionate Guernsey sense and do not just life complex legislation from elsewhere and keep it within the bounds of common sense.

Thank you.

3485

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: Yes, I think there needs to be a lot more clarity around the issue of Freedom of Information. At times of course you have got to be pragmatic because certain things do need to

3490 remain confidential, that is an issue and a whole area that I would be very interested in looking into if elected.

The Bailiff: Is there any Member who has not yet asked a question who wishes to do so?
Deputy Gollop then.

3495

Deputy Gollop: Sir, thank you.,

I have spent 16 years on the Legislation Scrutiny Panel and its predecessor which does a great job of reviewing Legislation how it fits with Resolutions and types, but how far would the candidates wish to strengthen that to look at the purpose of Legislation and its necessity, in other words a second reading?

3500

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: Yes indeed. Legislation it is absolutely vital that it is scrutinised.

3505

I would look into more emphasis being put on Legislation because sometimes it has concerned me in debates in this Chamber, sometimes it seems that we just nod things through and that really has concerned me in the past. I am an avid reader of Billets and reports I read them from cover to cover until I could almost recite them, but sometimes it seems to me that, I do not know, I get the impressions sometimes that maybe certain Members have not read the Legislation in depth, have not read reports in depth.

3510

So yes Legislation I would like to up the ante on that one.

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

3515

Deputy Burford: Thank you, sir.

In fact a Member said to me a couple of days ago that the job was possibly just checking that the commas and full stops were in the right place. I am sure it needs to be more than that.

However, before making a commitment to actually moving to a significant change, as Deputy Gollop is suggesting, I would certainly need to take a great deal of advice on that. I am not going to make such a sweeping commitment in a 30 second question time.

3520

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

3525

Deputy St Pier: Sir, following up Deputy Dyke's question the mandate does provide for scrutiny of any matter contained in a policy letter which has been referred to the Committee so of course it would be by Resolution so it would be for this Assembly to perhaps direct that subsequent contracts executed during this term of Government are actually referred to the Scrutiny Committee. Would you be in favour of that?

3530

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

Deputy Burford: Thank you, Deputy St Pier.

Yes I think that that sounds a very eminently sensible way forward, and of course it needs to be the decision of the Assembly.

3535

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

3540

Deputy Queripel: Yes, I would definitely be in favour of that, but of course as has been said many times we are all scrutineers, that is what we are elected to do, scrutinise. Do not rely on the

Scrutiny Committee to do everything you are supposed to be doing. The Scrutiny Committee will do everything it can but of course you are responsible too.

3545 **The Bailiff:** Well, if no Member has any further question to pose to the two candidates, we will draw questions to a close, comparatively brief this time, but once again if you want to show your appreciation of the two candidates please do so. *(Applause)*

3550 So, Members of the States, I ask you to use your voting slips once again and to vote for one of the two candidates or neither of them. The two candidates are Deputy Queripel proposed by Deputy Ferbrache seconded by Deputy de Lisle and Deputy Burford who is proposed by Deputy Inder and seconded by Deputy Moakes.

Once you have written a name on a voting slip if you can make it available to be handed in to the two Deputy Sheriffs.

3555 **Deputy Roffey:** Mr Bailiff, can I ask at this juncture, is it your intention to just keep going to whatever time we finish the presidential elections tonight, or are you minded to rise and continue tomorrow morning assuming we do not get it all done in the next hour of course?

3560 **The Bailiff:** When we get towards half past five, the Rules say that that is the time to adjourn but obviously if we are getting close to finishing, but only if we are getting close to finishing, then there might be a motion that we continue to sit. But if there are still some elections to go then we would adjourn overnight and resume at 9.30 a.m. tomorrow.

Has everyone handed in their voting slip? Any more?

In that case we will just adjourn for a few minutes while the votes are counted.

*The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m.
and resumed it sitting at 4.34 p.m.*

Scrutiny Management Committee – Deputy Yvonne Burford elected President

3565 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting in the election for the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee is as follows: Deputy Queripel has polled 15 votes, Deputy Burford has polled 24 votes, there were no blanks and no spoilt papers and therefore I declare that Deputy Burford has been elected to that presidency. *(Applause)*

VIII. Development & Planning Authority – Deputy Victoria Oliver elected President

Article VIII

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Development & Planning Authority to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

3570 **The States' Greffier:** Article VIII – Election of a President of the Development & Planning Authority.

The Bailiff: Once again, I look around to see who is going to propose a fellow Member for that presidency. Deputy Ferbrache.

3575 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I have great pleasure in nominating Deputy or proposing Deputy Oliver.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded?

Deputy St Pier: I would be delighted to second it, sir.

3580

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier, thank you.

This is obviously a good sign of communication at the moment, isn't it?

Are there any other nominations for the presidency of the Development & Planning Authority? No, in that case I will turn to Deputy Ferbrache to speak to his nomination if he wishes. Deputy Ferbrache.

3585

Deputy Ferbrache: Deputy Oliver has not only served on the Committee she has got experience in those kinds of matters. She is a qualified surveyor. She has shown herself in the last four and a half years or so as a brand new Member as she was originally of the Assembly as a person who listens, a person who is respectful, a person who can assimilate information, and a person who can make decisions.

3590

So I think in those circumstances what is a very difficult job and she will not underestimate the difficulties of that job because she will please absolutely nobody, she knows that, because the people who get planning permission or the fiscal policy decision it is what they should get anyway and if the decision is rejected it is all her fault. I wish her well.

3595

The Bailiff: I invite Deputy Oliver to speak to the Assembly on her candidature for up to 10 minutes. Deputy Oliver.

3600

Deputy Oliver: Thank you, sir.

Firstly I would like to thank Deputy Ferbrache for proposing me and Deputy St Pier for seconding me.

I have never been very good at talking about myself so I did find this quite hard in many respects. I am quite a normal Guernsey person but perhaps less stubborn, although my husband of nine years might say differently. I am very good at juggling family life, work, social commitments.

3605

I have had a very different childhood as my parents decided to sail around the world when I was younger. I think this is where I got the passion for all different types of property from mud huts to massive skyscrapers.

I received Honours in Business & Property at the University of Western England. Professionally, as Deputy Ferbrache said, I am a qualified Chartered Surveyor and a Member of the Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors. I became a senior surveyor at GVA where I acted for many major multi-national companies as their lead retail property contract and negotiator specialising in lease consultancy and asset management.

3610

I have experience of managing properties both large and small companies both in private and public sector. I delivered advice and negotiated on commercial property contract leases for multi-million pound deals on time within client's expectations.

3615

It is a role that demands attention to every detail. It demands both strategic, implementation, leadership and teamwork. My job for my clients with large portfolios or shopping centres focuses on how to add value, reduce costs in the long term while absolutely thinking about the bigger picture.

3620

Looking at how portfolios evolve in order to get the best for our client, reducing costs and expenditure are consequences of this, but not necessarily the main focus, as the real goal is to

unlock the hidden gems of the value in property interest even if there is an initial increase for costs, the stake is always thought the greater in the long term.

3625 These relevant skills are essential of course, but alone they are not equipped for the President of DPA Planning Authority. I have been Vice-President of the Development & Planning and I would say that Development & Planning is more like the Cinderella of Committees but in fact it is generally just forgotten about when this should be at the heart of a lot more subjects.

3630 I want this Authority to become a facilitator rather than seen as an obstacle to overcome. I would like the Development & Planning Authority to communicate with much more than just other Committees.

But why does any of this matter? If we can communicate with Economic Development, Social and Environment these are the three pillars of sustainable development and they are all heavily interrelated, which in turn will develop balanced developments.

3635 The DPA's main purpose is to advise the States on land use policy and develop and implement land use policies through development plans and other related instruments to determine developments applications of all kinds including, planning, building control, protected buildings and protected sites. This is my comfort zone.

3640 With the Revive and Thrive as an Authority we need to review the IDP, there is also a review of the planning exemptions which will help fast track enhancement programmes. This in turn with the digitalisation of the planning and building control application process should reduce waiting times making it a more efficient process for the public and in my opinion a better service.

As a Committee we have development frameworks, local planning briefs, which all need communication with other Committees such as STSB and the Seafront Enhancement Area.

3645 I ask for your support for my nomination and elect me as President of the Development & Planning Authority.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you.

3650 Well, Members of the States, we will go to the vote on the office of President of the Development & Planning Authority. Deputy Oliver is the candidate, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy St Pier, and I will put that to you *aux voix*. Those in favour; those against.

Members vote Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare Deputy Oliver duly elected again without any dissension. (*Applause*)

IX. Election of a President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission – Struck from record and deferred

Article IX

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

3655 **The States' Greffier:** Article IX – Election of a President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission.

The Bailiff: Now, Members of the States, this is an unusual one because the mandate of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission requires that the President of it is elected on the

nomination of the Policy & Resources Committee. So I turn to the President Deputy Ferbrache to move any nomination he has.

Deputy Ferbrache: Yes, sir, I nominate Deputy Blin.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded? Deputy Prow.

Deputy Ferbrache, would you wish to speak in support of Deputy Blin's nomination?

Deputy Ferbrache: Yes, sir, I would indeed.

I have known Deputy Blin for a number of years and I have liked him and I have respected him, and my view in relation to him was when I saw this I wrote down some word because I do not generally write down things when I make a speech, sadly people notice that.

But he is good, he is compassionate, he is thoughtful and he is pragmatic and those are all the qualities that you need for this very important position, because it is a very important position. Because we are a caring society and Overseas Aid is important and will continue to be important. A lot of people say not important in this day and age we should look after our own. Of course we should look after our own but we should also be thankful of where we are and recognise that others are not so unfortunate. He does.

We are also influenced by our childhood experiences, what Deputy Blin tells me when his parents moved here he started to work as a lawyer in St James' Chamber so that was obviously a very paid job and his mother is a teacher, and after a few years his father decided to set off with young Mr Blin and his two siblings and they travelled round the world and that included three years in South Africa, predominantly in Peru where he witnessed at an early age poverty stricken areas where thousands of people lived in confined, polluted and disease ridden slums.

That influenced him, he carried that decency throughout all of his life a man of considerable business experienced a multi-linguist he is a clever man but he is also a decent and good man, well perhaps the two are sometime synonymous, but he is a good man I unreservedly commend him and ask the States to approve this nomination.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. I now invite Deputy Blin to speak for up to 10 minutes on his candidature. Deputy Blin.

Deputy Blin. Sir, I am just a little bit confused I thought there was someone else also standing but I am not one to challenge. Am I mistaken?

Deputy Le Tocq: I was going to nominate Deputy Kazantseva-Miller.

The Bailiff: Oh, I do apologise.

Mr Comptroller, is that permissible?

The Comptroller: Sir, under the mandate, the copy I have got, under the constitution the Overseas Aid & Development Commission consists of a President who shall be a Member of the States and six members who need not be Members of the States all elected on the nomination of the Policy & Resources Committee.

The Bailiff: So on that basis –

Deputy Le Tocq: The Committee has not met yet.

The Bailiff: Well if the Committee has not met then there probably should not be any nomination at all, even of Deputy Blin.

3710 We will put this matter back, Members of the States. I do apologise, I just assumed when turning to Deputy Ferbrache that this was a Committee nomination.

So Members of the States, we will just strike all of that from the record, particularly Deputy Ferbrache's comments, and we will start again with that one on another occasion when the Committee has met. Thank you, Deputy Le Tocq and Deputy Blin, for drawing that to our attention.

3715 Moving swiftly on.

**X. States' Assembly and Constitution Committee –
Election of President commenced**

Article X

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the States' Assembly and Constitution Committee to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article X – Election of a President of the States' Assembly and Constitution Committee.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: Sir, I rise to propose Deputy Lyndon Trott.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.
Is Deputy Trott's nomination seconded?

Deputy Inder: I will second Deputy Trott.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.
Deputy Ferbrache is rising.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, I nominate Deputy Meerveld.

The Bailiff: Is Deputy Meerveld's nomination seconded? Deputy Helyar.
Are there any other candidates for the office of President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee?

In that case what we will do now Members in the trusted fashion is invite the two candidates to come up to the Bench, Deputy Meerveld window side, Deputy Trott door side.

Once both gentlemen are settled, I will invite Deputy Le Tocq to speak about Deputy Trott who he is proposing. So Deputy Le Tocq please.

Deputy Le Tocq: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

Sir, it is a great privilege to nominate Deputy Trott for the presidency of SACC. I know particularly as a Member of the Committee most recently and the Committee that was responsible for managing the Island-wide election that has taken place that Deputy Trott is the right person to take the lead in what is effectively our key parliamentary procedures and privileges Committee.

Moreover his seconder is Deputy Neil Inder who was the previous President and that should offer ultimate validation that Deputy Trott is the right person for this job and the job that needs to be done now.

Sir, this Committee was very busy in the last couple of years of the States and it will continue to be so because of the need there will be ultimately to review the Island-wide voting system to take into consideration the report that will be done by the independent panel and to bring any recommendations for any changes that need to take place.

Sir, I have known Deputy Trott since school days and he is a very affable character. In fact, sir, one of my early memories is when my father, who was a grower near bankruptcy at the time and who had bought a very much clapped-out Renault 12 in a horrible Kermit-green colour, was picking up Deputy Trott to give him a lift to school and in getting into the car Deputy Trott said in his imitable fashion, 'Wonderful vehicle you have got there, Mr Le Tocq.' My father – I was sitting in the

front – gave me a little smirk, and then he proceeded to say, ‘You wouldn’t be able to give me a lift back home as well later today?’ He had that gift of the gab in those days and he still has retained that.

If at least one was at school from what I remember at Elizabeth College he did not really give himself to academic research, or indeed research of many descriptions at all, such was the case that when we were elected together in 2000 that quite clearly he had given much time to put right that interest in research and in education and given himself quite fiercely it would seem in the intervening times to a successful business career and to active public service which I think is a key ingredient necessary for this role.

As I said, Deputy Trott was first elected in 2000 so he has a long experience with the States and he has been subsequently elected every time since then. He has had experience with the States and Assembly with numerous Committees and obviously with the various changes that have occurred over the years in parliamentary procedures and processes for good or for ill.

He has served, sir, under at least six different Presiding Officers and Deputy Presiding Officers, as a Committee member, as a Minister or President, as Chief Minister, as Deputy Chief Minister in the last term, and also before all this as a non-States’ member and so he knows full well the different aspects of our structures and our procedures, where the weaknesses lie, and where the strength lie.

He has a wide experience of pluses and minuses and the myriad rules of and changes that have occurred in that time over the past two decades.

He has also and I think this is important too, sir, experience in respect externally in terms of corporate governance for example in the IOD and in international long standing respect through the CPA in his work there, he is currently the Chairman of the local branch and involved as a Trustee of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Pension Fund.

He is of course well known across the Crown Dependencies with Guernsey Finance as well and City UK. He has a wide network of resources, again something that I think it important when dealing with the best way our Parliament should function.

So he is indeed a perfect fit to – and I use that phrase again – hit the ground running on major pieces of work for example the review of Island-wide voting I mentioned before –

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq, I am afraid that is your five minutes.

Deputy Le Tocq: Oh sorry, sir, I thought I had 10, I am terribly sorry. Well, vote for Deputy Trott please.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott has 10 minutes and *[Inaudible]* ... will know what you are going to say about him. So Deputy Trott to address the Assembly.

Deputy Trott: Well, thank you, sir.

My thanks to Deputy Le Tocq and indeed to Deputy Inder.

Sir, I am going to start by talking a little bit about the States’ Assembly and Constitution Committee and in particular describe its mandate. Then I am going to attempt to persuade you that my experience and skill set align with that mandate. So let’s start with the mandate.

The mandate is to advise the States on and develop and implement policies in relation to the constitutions of both the States of Deliberation and the States of Election. The procedures and practices of the States and its practical functioning, the induction, ongoing support and provision of facilities and equipment for States’ Members, elections and the broadcasting proceedings of the States, and matters concerning the propriety and conduct of States’ Members.

Now, sir, this Committee is our Committee it is the Committee that concerns itself with our interests and our rights. The holder of this post always used to be, and I believe should be again, the champion of our Assembly. Under my leadership it will be.

Sir, as Deputy Le Tocq mentioned with three years’ experience as a non-States’ member back in the 1990’s prior to seeking a seat in this Assembly, and now having participated successfully in six

consecutive elections for People's Deputy, I find myself having accumulated over 23½ years of elected public service.

This service has included serving on numerous Committees and departments of the States ranging in diversity from the Sea Fisheries Committee to the Constitution Investigation Committee and includes, as Deputy Le Tocq reminded us, full and separate terms as Treasury Minister, Deputy Chief Minister and Chief Minister. This has meant that I have worked in three different machinery of Government models, invaluable experience when considering amendments to existing arrangements.

Sir, when I first entered the States SACC's predecessor the House Committee was the place that Members went for political advice, and political guidance, and sometimes to seek to understand the political history. If I am elected to this position my metaphorical door will always be open should anyone need any help and in any regard. A key focus for me this term will be assisting, advising and encouraging others, especially new Members.

Sir, for the last few years I have been in the main the Chairman of our Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and until last week following the completion of my term held office on the British Islands and Mediterranean Region CPA Committee. The CPA is the organisation which has observed our General Election, albeit virtually, and will be submitting a report in this regard shortly. Elections are a key component of this Committee's work including those undertaken in the States of Election.

Now, sir, I am told that with regard the States of Election certainly in the Post War years no-one has successfully proposed more Jurats than I, and that includes notably the Deputy Helyar's mother and also the senior Jurat Stephen Jones for that matter such is my longevity. All unique and enjoyable experiences.

Sir, in late August, as you are aware, I was honoured and privileged to be elected from a membership of 17,000 parliamentarians to the role of Independent Trustee of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Trust Funds, this role involves working alongside the Secretary General of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and provides further valuable and ongoing insight into the constitution and development of Rules and Procedures and Parliamentary support in other Parliamentary Assemblies.

Sir, during my time in this Assembly I have been subject to three separate Code of Conduct complaints roughly one every seven years. Now these were all entirely baseless in fact and immediately rejected by those entrusted with such matters, however, I think it can be said that I know what acceptable conduct for States' Members around decency and respectability should look like, and I have first-hand practical experience of how issues surrounding Code of Conduct complaints can be weaponised against Members in certain cases to the detriment of good order. I will do all I can to ensure that does not happen as any new system is developed and implemented.

Sir, I am a supporter of mid-term elections for States' Committee positions (**A Member:** Hear, hear.) and I always have been.

On numerous occasions I have seen Members elected on to Committees during this frantic period which starts on Wednesday only for the newly elected Deputy to find that the functions mandate or direction of their chosen Committee is not how they imagined and with no easy mechanism to procure a rethink or a reshuffle, some feel they are committed sometimes unhappily for the full term, when they would often be better suited elsewhere. Some though know precisely where their interests rest and where their abilities direct.

We often hear in this Assembly of the need to have round pegs in round holes. I genuinely believe that I am naturally fit for this position in terms of the requisite skill set.

Now, sir, I wish to throw myself into this important role not least as the old saying goes because the devil finds work for idle hands.

So, sir, I ask this Assembly, I ask for this Assembly's support to become this Assembly's champion.

Thank you, sir.

3860 **The Bailiff:** I now turn to Deputy Ferbrache who is going to propose Deputy Meerveld. Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, I have got to know Deputy Meerveld over the last four and a half years and he is an action man, he is a person who takes a task on and achieves it.

3865 There has been mention by Deputy Le Tocq about his candidate's academic prowess and otherwise, and in relation to that I remember Deputy Meerveld openly saying to this Assembly in an education debate, look I was written off at school, I was written off, I was made to go and dig the garden and all that kind of stuff that people did in those days at secondary schools when they thought somebody was not able. What did that man do? He went out and he fashioned a truly
3870 successful business career in the Far East, a truly successful career, because that is the quality of this particular man.

Thirty-eight of us are here today because of Island-wide voting, which proved to be an unreserved success of undoubted success.

Deputy Inder is the Chairman of SACC, I was a member of SACC for the last period of time, serving under him and serving with Deputy Le Tocq, and it is a vitally important Committee.

3875 There were three Deputies – there were other people in the side – who led the drive for Island-wide voting, three of us, Deputy Mooney who retired from the States, and is a great loss to the States, myself and I was the vocal point of it, I made the speeches, but the action man that did all the work, all the hard graft was Deputy Meerveld. He was the man that brought Island-wide voting
3880 by a country mile, to use a phrase that one of my colleagues often uses, to the people of Guernsey. To the 24,800 odd people who voted in the election, 79 point whatever it was percent.

Now experience of course is considerable Deputy Meerveld has experience. Now we know that he likes wearing hats that is his fashion, but this is a hat, the presidency of this is a hat that would suit him ideally. He has the skill, the drive, the perspicacity, the energy to take what is a very
3885 important body of the States, Committee of the States forward.

He would do it with fresh ideas, he would do it unencumbered with prejudice and unencumbered with anything other than the best interests of this Assembly forward.

It is a pleasure to have worked with him on so many things because he is not the kind of person that makes lots of addresses without doing his homework. He always does the homework. He is the
3890 person that could make the Rules function in a practical and pragmatic way and I commend his nomination to you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

I turn to Deputy Meerveld who has up to 10 minutes to speak in support of his candidature.

3895 **Deputy Meerveld:** Thank you, sir.

Just to give you a little bit of background about myself for those who do not know me. I worked, as Deputy Ferbrache said, for nearly 30 years in the finance industry, predominantly running investment research companies out in Asia. I also worked for two years in New York running an
3900 operation there and also in Singapore as well as predominantly out of Hong Kong.

I have started and built my own businesses from scratch and built them up and developed them and then sold them on. I have also worked in senior management in at least one company that has more employees than the entire population of Guernsey.

I am very analytical; I also consider myself a good strategic thinker; I like solving problems; I like finding practical solutions for problems and making things work. I believe these are all skills I can
3905 bring to this position at SACC. Which as Deputy Trott said is incredibly important.

But I would say one thing I would disagree with Deputy Trott that this is our Committee, it belongs to this Assembly, no it does not, it belongs to the electorate, it is part of our mechanism of Government a very important part. If it is done properly it should be looking at ways to practically
3910 make this Assembly function more effectively and also look at the relationship between this

Assembly and the Civil Service to make sure this Government is the efficient effective body that our community deserves and needs.

So I do not look at it as belonging to this Assembly, I look at it as a key role in actually making this a better States for everybody going forwards. Not just for us sitting here but also in the results it helps the States deliver to the public.

Deputy Trott described the duties of SACC accurately. It goes beyond just helping Members and being an open door. We also SACC has a responsibility to help for instance induct new Members. I know from my time four years ago when I first stood what a bewildering time the first weeks of a new Assembly are, how you get sucked in, newly elected and your life changes all of a sudden you are getting bombarded with invitations here, you are getting asked out for a lunch, or a breakfast, or a coffee by different people who are petitioning for their support or asking you to move on Committees. I think again SACC can take very much a leading role, has a responsibility in trying to help new people join the States introduce Members to each other, try and develop a cohesive whole.

Now, to give an example when I was elected we had a two-week process from electing the President of P&R to electing Committee members most importantly we had a one week honeymoon period between electing the presidents of Committees and the Committee members, what this enabled was individuals to go and talk the newly elected presidents about their portfolio what they were intending to do, their ambitions, and to get to know each other and decide where they wanted to be. In this election we are doing all of this with one day in between presidential elections and the elections of Members.

This is where actually the meeting that was attended yesterday so well by about 34 Members was conceived of and implemented at very short notice. It came from a WhatsApp conversation between myself Deputy Ferbrache and Deputy Helyar and a few others who were mentioning these issues being presented by Members and it was at 7.51 p.m. at night on Saturday that the idea was raised of we should have a meeting and try and get people in room.

I volunteered to help organise it but very much with the support of Deputy Helyar and Deputy Ferbrache, and Deputy Helyar very kindly paid for it. I had to phone up the St Pier Park organise tables and everything else and for the first time ever, as far as I know, before the presidential elections presidents candidates were asked to sit in one room at a table of the Committee they want to aim for and allow all the Members to come up and talk to them about those positions, to get an idea of who they were, what they were standing for, discuss the mandate and have a general discussion about whether they wanted to vote for that person, whether they wanted to serve on that Committee with them.

This kind of thing is the kind of thing I want to change in the future, to change the way we bring Members in, look at another aspect of being elected a States' Member. You will get elected and the States of Guernsey says welcome here is your notebook, now you are self-employed go away and in four years bring your notebook back. In the meantime we are not going to give you any resources any support other than the support you get on a specific Committee you sit on. You are basically left to your own devices, you are presented with a Billet which sometimes can be 20 or 30 cm thick and told to go away and do independent research without any support.

The kinds of things I would like to do is look at whether or not there can be some resources within the States to help Deputies and Members with that research who are not sitting on a specific Committee and they want to look into an issue and make an informed decision.

There are a lot of things that can be done and they are quite dynamic things again putting my business hat on, how do I make it work; how do I make it function better; how can I support Members.

I cannot compete with my colleague's 23 years of public service, but one would have to question if there were significant changes to the way the States function why he has not done it in the last 23 years.

What I am hoping to bring to this is a new perspective where you say look here is what we have got, and as everybody is aware I have been very vocal in my criticism of the dysfunctionality of the

States at various levels. What is wrong with it? Why is it not working properly? What can we do to facilitate it?

3965 Now, that does not mean that I am making any decisions whatsoever on what this States on how it should work no I would be working with a group of people on a Committee and that group would then look at these issues and would bring it back to this Assembly to decide on what it wanted to do. But what I would hope to do is bring that analytical mind of looking at here is the objective, here are the potential roadblocks, here is the potential solution, and bring that back to this Assembly.

3970 I would look at being, I suppose, more dynamic in the approach and more outward looking as a Committee some people think SACC is boring, it is just the Rules, certainly that is the public impression. That is not mine. I see it as an absolutely crucial Committee in changing the way this Assembly functions and the relationship with the Civil Service and making it better, and trying to improve it, trying to facilitate it.

3975 Island-wide voting, again that has to come up for review and I would look to I think as Deputy Ferbrache said it has been a resounding success on any objective criteria, but there are a lot of things that could have been done better and could be done better next time to make it work more efficiently and give people even more engagement in the process.

3980 There are things simultaneous electronic voting in this Assembly that is an extant Resolution and was supposed to be delivered in June of this year of the SACC Committee. I want to see three buttons in front of Deputies, I want to see a clock 30 seconds post your vote, press your button and have every decision of this States permanently recorded, have no more of Lester Queripel's interjections, sir may I have a recorded vote, and find that an *aux voix* vote is overturned when each Member is required to commit to an actual decision. This has happened more times than I can mention. I want to see an electronic voting system so every Member is always held accountable, everything is recorded, it is completely transparent for the public.

3985 Sir, there are many things that I think can be done with this Committee, through this Committee, to make this Assembly function far better, to change the relationship with the Civil Service, to facilitate the functions of the States.

3990 I hope that this Assembly will support me as an individual who is really passionate about this and wants to go through this process and bring back the ideas to the States as President of this Committee.

Thank you.

3995 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, we now go into up to 30 minutes of questions where the questions to the candidates relate to areas of policy included in the mandate of this Committee.

Who wishes to ask a question? Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

4000 Do the candidates believe that the present system of electing Jurats via the States of Election is still appropriate in the modern world? If not what would they suggest instead?

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4005 **Deputy Trott:** No I do not think it is, sir, is the short answer to that.

I am well aware, I mean Deputy Meerveld treated us to an analysis of the States' Assembly and Constitution Committee's handover report where most of the issues he talked about of course were fairly well developed, that includes the issues around the States of Election, and I look forward to receiving the detail in the days ahead.

4010 But clearly the States of Election is an example of where reform is necessary, quite what that reform will look like will of course not only depend on me or for that matter the other four Members of the Committee should I be successful, but importantly what this the States of Deliberation decides should be the best model for the States of Election moving forward. Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: In the interest of a much shorter debate which is something I would like to see I agree with Lyndon, Deputy Trott I think he is absolutely right it does need reform, I have not got any prejudgement on how it needs reforming but certainly I think the mechanism needs review. Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: On several occasions during States' debates this last eight and a half years I have heard Deputies make extremely disrespectful and insulting comments of a personal nature about their colleagues, the only Rule I can find in the Rule Book that seeks to address that is Rule 8(5). It states:

It shall be the duty of every Member to observe due decorum in a Meeting ...

Obviously that Rule is not the deterrent it is meant to be, it needs to be a lot more robust. If elected will you be seeking to strengthen that Rule in some way or perhaps introduce a new Rule that seeks to put a stop once and for all to such disrespectful and insulting comments being made during debates?

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Yes I have also witnessed some risqué remarks and I know on occasions the Bailiff has interjected on them.

I think it is absolute right that we behave in a well-mannered way and respectful way in this Chamber, and I would be happy to review the Rules if there is a need to tighten that up to create more discipline.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir, there is a fine dividing line between robust debate and the introduction of personalities. But I think it is true to say that I do not think we have crossed that Rubicon at any time during the last Assembly. We have got close to it but we have not crossed it. Why do I say that? Because the Presiding Officer has determined that that gauge has not been breached.

I do think though it is about the culture of this place and it is important that all Members treat not only their peers with courtesy but also other members of the public. That is why, sir, as part of the ongoing continuing professional development of States' Members I think that particular module, the module around engagement with our constituents is particularly important and it would be one of the areas that I would wish to see further development on during the course of this term.

The Bailiff: Deputy Murray.

Deputy Murray: Thank you, sir.

As a rookie I have come into obviously an Assembly that has been revised in 2016 and there seems to be from my point of view some mismatch between how some responsibilities have actually been delivered or been allocated to certain Committees. So I am keen to know whether the candidates have particular instances that they think could be rectified going forward in the role of SACC?

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4065 **Deputy Trott:** Yes, I stand by everything that I said at the start, this is our Committee the parliamentary Committee. It has no responsibility for the Civil Service and it is the least resourced entity of the States. It has currently 0.7 of one full-time equivalent. So unfortunately Deputy Meerveld's interpretation of the mandate was not I think entirely accurate.

4070 But there are a number, there are a number of examples of where the guidance from the States' Assembly and Constitution Committee can be of use, particularly should this Assembly decide on an analysis of the current machinery of Government. It was resisted last time round because we were only four years into a term by the end of this term we will have done eight years and it is some time around the middle of this term that a new review I think would be welcome and that is when issues such as those that Deputy Murray refers to, sir, would be addressed.

Thank you.

4075 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Meerveld.

4080 **Deputy Meerveld:** I will simply answer that yes there are misplaced or possibly confusing responsibilities of the States which need reviewing, but I am actually going to direct some of my answer to Deputy Trott's statement because he said that SACC does not control the Civil Service and he is absolutely right but it can control and influence, not control, influence and come up with ideas of how we can work more effectively

4085 For instance, we make decisions and then ... we are very good at making decisions or reasonably good, we are not very good on following up on them and making sure they get done. I would like to see every Resolution of this States every Committee's agenda for deliverables put up and published with a timeline for delivery with milestones attached to it so the public and Members can see whether or not a project has been delivered. For instance Environment & Infrastructure were supposed to develop an infrastructure plan in 2004 –

4090 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Meerveld, that is your minute, I am afraid.
Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, sir.

4095 In an alternative world I would quite like to be a TV star. Why is it that, unlike other parliaments and Assemblies including the States of Jersey, we are not broadcasting live our debates online so that you can see it in an audio visual way including what amounts to television clips?

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4100 **Deputy Meerveld:** I absolute agree with that. I would like to see this Assembly televised and it is not just because of Deputy Gollop's aspirations to be a movie star, it is also because of the changing times. We now live in a society where life is conducted on one of these, a mobile phone, and the new generation if we want to keep them engaged in politics a short YouTube clip is far more likely to have far further reach than a broadcast on a radio station. It is just an unfortunate
4105 fact of life, technology is moving on, society is moving on, and we need to keep pace with that and reach out and engage with the electorate in the ways that they are living.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4110 **Deputy Trott:** Yes, sir, I agree.

I think the time is now right to televise our proceedings, it has worked well in Jersey. My view is why should only Members of the Assembly be subjected to a speech lasting an hour and 22 minutes by Deputy Ferbrache, when others could enjoy the visual experience, as well as the audio experience, which was what happened last term. So I would televise the States.

4115 I think, though, there is an issue that one has to be aware of which is that if it is only an audio broadcast one's absence from this Assembly can largely go unnoticed unless there is a recorded vote called. However, if the Assembly is televised I think Members would need to spend in some cases a little bit more time in the Assembly than was necessarily the case during the last term.

Thank you, sir.

4120 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Sir, candidates, auto-enrolment and on-line voting. Would candidates embrace a digital democracy?

4125 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir.

4130 I think the success of the last election takes us I think inexorably towards that sort of momentum, or the momentum is certainly there. Whether the solution exists yet remains to be seen. I know that Deputy Inder has been quite a convincing proponent for this. So yes if a solution can be found.

I am involved with a number of businesses I am the Chairman of a number of businesses including one particularly successful Fin-tech company so I am aware of what can be done, where there is a will there is a way, and there are some extremely intelligent digital scientists out there, but I think it is the way forward yes, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Thank you.

4140 Absolutely. Again going back to my previous point about mobile phones, if we are going to carry on engaging with the electorate, I mean the massive increase in postal votes is an indication, but again we should be looking at people being able to vote on line.

4145 Auto enrolment would love to see it but of course we are going to have to have a look at making sure we are recording the stats and the addresses and details of all our population correctly first. But yes I would like to see auto-enrolment, I would like to see electronic voting, I would like to see an opt-out from receiving paper as well to reduce the environmental impact of the election.

There are a whole load of things that can be looked at but we have to keep on moving forward and engaging with the electorate and giving the public as much access to this room as possible.

4150 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, given both the candidates commitment to implement some sort of simultaneous electronic voting proposition and also television broadcasting and the lack of resources identified by Deputy Trott. To what extent, how far are the candidates prepared to go in the spirit of action this day of extracting resources from Policy & Resources or possibly through the Budget process this year in getting that job done as soon as possible?

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4160 **Deputy Meerveld:** Absolutely. At the end of the day everything we do here has a cost and that cost has to be paid at some stage if we want to progress things, and this is going to be one of the biggest issues going forward.

4165 We have had constrained financial environment for the last four years, we are going into I believe a significant recessionary environment because of Covid, there are going to be significant negative impacts. I certainly will fight for the Budget to be able to achieve what I think needs doing.

But it will be a fight with other departments as well because it is competing demands but it comes down to the Assembly at the end of the day to decide what they want to prioritise.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott,

4170

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir, I will make a strong and evidence-based case to the Policy & Resources department for one reason and one reason alone. I want to *get things done*.

The Bailiff: Alderney Representative Roberts.

4175

Alderney Representative Roberts: Thank you, sir.

Constitutional changes Committee: there have been controversial suggestions that the Bailiff be replaced with a Speaker of the House to moderate the Assembly meetings. Will candidates really pursue this during this term – something so historical and treasured to many of us?

4180

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Sir, we currently have a simply outstanding Bailiff and Deputy Bailiff. I am advised that in the past that has not always been the case. The system that we have works, and as long as the extremely high standards that have been displayed and maintained by the current incumbents, I see absolutely no reason whatsoever to change.

4185

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: I agree with Deputy Trott. We are unusual as far as the division of powers is concerned by Government. Normally you have an executive, you have a legislature and you have a judiciary and there is every attempt to keep all three of those separated. To some extent or certainly sitting here today we have all three in the room, but as Deputy Trott just said, it works. I would not be looking to change anything as fundamental as that, unless there was a very good reason to look at it and I do not believe there is at this time.

4190

4195

The Bailiff: Is there any Member – ? Deputy Oliver.

Deputy Oliver: Thank you, sir.

When Deputy Trott mentioned the one hour 53, it is engrained on my life that speech, but would SACC be looking to limit the length of speeches?

4200

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: It is a ticklish issue. I mean Jersey have just made an attempt at this. I would say no, and the reason is, is sometimes you can address an issue with a short speech, I think my longest speech was just over 50 minutes. That was on education and I needed 50 minutes to make every point I wanted to make it was a subject I was incredibly passionate about and I needed that time to get that across. Do we have speeches that go on for too long and repetition etc.? We do. I think we should try and hopefully discipline Members to do shorter more concise speeches but I would not want to restrict people to speak on something they are truly passionate about and they believe they need more time to get all their points across.

4205

4210

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4215 **Deputy Trott:** Sir, almost certain to misquote Churchill I need the Chief Minister's intervention here, but didn't he say that it took him hours to prepare for a 15-minute speech but it was the other way round for a long one, just minutes to prepare for a long one.

I would limit the length of speeches. I think as we have witnessed today you can hear a great deal from a proposer in five minutes, not quite as much as I would have preferred you to have heard
4220 from Deputy Le Tocq, but you can hear a great deal nonetheless and you can certainly hear a great deal in 10 minutes. I notice that Deputy Meerveld took nearly 10 minutes. I was able to say to you what I wanted you to hear in four minutes and 14 seconds.

So if you put a bit of effort in to it speeches can be limited considerably. Aligned to that simultaneous electronic voting and the business of this Assembly would be concluded in probably
4225 a third less of the time, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Dudley-Owen.

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Thank you, sir.

4230 May I ask the candidates opinion on the provision of training for candidates coming in or new Deputies coming in to the Assembly? We have had some diamonds that might need polishing in the past and it would be good to see some support for a proper training programme in such things as public accounts and governance and leadership.

Thank you.

4235 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir, I particularly welcome this question. The majority of my qualifications are in governance, I think Members will know that I am involved usually at chairmanship level with a
4240 number of companies. One aspect of the Budget that I will never see reduced is the continuing professional development budget. It is absolutely fundamental.

We know that within the financial services and throughout our Island the most valuable resource that we have is the human resource. We need to develop those skills on an ongoing basis and particularly within this Assembly.

4245 There are so many skills that most of us do not have that can be easily taught if the budget exists to enable such provision. So I am absolutely 100% in favour of that and I appreciate the question.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4250 **Deputy Meerveld:** Yes, it is ironic that Deputy Trott defends the budget for professional development because for States' Deputies there is not one. We are effectively here an executive body or a body making policy decisions to run our Island and we ourselves are a human resource that needs to be developed. There should be a lot more training and induction for Members coming in.

4255 The fact is as a room, as a Government, we need to be representative of the community. I am a great believer we should have every skill set and every social class and every approach. Some of the people that come in here represents a group of people who do not have the breadth of computer skills, they have never been through a team building exercise, they have never had support and training for those areas. Now we cannot force people to take that training, but we should be making
4260 it available to them that if they want to have their skills improved to make them a more effective Member then we should be making it available. And –

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld, that is your minute, I am afraid.
Deputy de Sausmarez.

4265 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** Thank you, sir.

The last time I checked there was an anomaly in how in insurance and legal cover I think it was over GDPR relating to Deputies between whether they were doing Committee work or constituency work. Does this anomaly still exist and if so do they candidates think they can sort it out?

4270

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: I have absolutely no idea. It is not something I am aware of it is certainly something I will look into.

4275

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes it is something I need to take away as well and give some further consideration to, but it does give me an opportunity to say I have just thought of a Rule that we need to change and that is we have to have a mechanism in this Assembly for Members to be able to correct something that is said by a candidate that is not correct.

4280

A perfect example of that is that the Committee SACC was granted £55,000 for the express purpose of onboarding and specific training around the skills needed for new Members, and I fought hard for that around the Policy & Resources Committee table because I believe in it, I believe in it going forward as well.

4285

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Burford.

4290

Deputy Burford: Thank you, sir.

Do the candidates consider that SACC reviewing the election is akin to marking your own homework?

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4295

Deputy Trott: Yes, of course, SACC is not reviewing the election the Registrar General of Electors is and the independent scrutineers. It does fall to SACC to be the post-box for that, and it will be a matter for the Committee to determine to what extent it wishes to comment once it has received those reports.

4300

But SACC is the parliamentary Committee it is expressly mandated to run elections so I would argue that it would be negligent of them or it would be an abrogation of their duties of the mandate if we did not report back with comments and recommendations and modifications as needed.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4305

Deputy Meerveld: I would pass on those reports and when they are received in an unredacted unaltered form so that Members can see exactly what the independent bodies have ... the conclusions they have come to regarding the election, and then I see SACC's role as looking at that independent feedback from them but also the feedback from the public and from Members to come back to this Assembly with proposals on how we can do it better next time.

4310

The Bailiff: Is there any Member who has not asked a question who wishes to ask a question? Deputy Prow.

4315

Deputy Prow: Thank you, sir.

What is the opinion of the candidates of the adequacy and clarity surrounding the definition of special interest as it relates to the exclusion from Committee meetings? I believe it is Rule 49, sir.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4320

Deputy Meerveld: That is a very good question because I have been on the wrong side of that Rule myself. We have a mechanism in this Assembly where we can declare an interest but continue participating in the debate.

4325 At Committee level I was told I could not be involved, or see any of the paperwork, or vote, or even be involved in the discussion on the funding for the Colleges, because at that time I had two boys at Beechwood who might go to the College in the future, along with about 30% of the children who are privately educated in Guernsey.

4330 To me, that seems crazy. You are excluding people – sometimes ... I give an example: if you are a taxi driver and you were making a decision on public transport under Rule 59 you would not be allowed to participate in the discussion because you had a special interest. It is something that has been challenged it is definitely something that needs to be changed. We almost turn to the point of saying that anybody who has got any knowledge is excluded –

4335 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Meerveld, I am afraid that is your minute.
Deputy Trott, please.

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir.

4340 The special interest rules are there to protect Members and they are welcome in my view. But of course we all have a duty of care to each other, because occasionally we get near to the margins and things can fall through the cracks. A perfect example is my relationship with Guernsey Finance, I am the Chairman of Guernsey Finance our International Financial Services Promotional Agency I do the job *pro bono* I receive no fee for it but I am obliged under the existing Rules to play no part in the discussion around the Policy & Resources Committee table. I think that is an example where it would be better served if in the old days I had stayed within the room, but I trusted and
4345 throughout the term the judgement of my colleagues who felt that despite the fact I had no financial gain it was probably better if I was outside of the room. So it is ... I think it works reasonably well most of the time but there are I think a few tweaks around special interest that could be undertaken.
Sir, thank you.

4350 **The Bailiff:** Is there any Member who has not asked a question before ...? I invite Deputy Queripel to put his question then. Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: One of the Rules that has consistently confused me to the point of my now being confused.com is Rule 26(7) which reads

Where a Proposition is rejected which had proposed that a particular action not be taken, such rejection is not a positive instruction for the action to be undertaken.

4355 Can the candidates enlighten me please and tell me what they think that Rule means? Are they aware of any other Rule that could be simplified and written in simple English?

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

4360 **Deputy Trott:** Well, I certainly think the Rules would benefit from being simplified, sir, and the use of simpler language incorporated. I think – I look to you – I think that Rule is about when a vote is tied and I think it is the requirement for a majority to make a change, so bringing a Proposition that directs change and it does not have a majority then I think that effectively means that the Proposition remains as is.

4365 But I may be wrong, I may be conflating the Rules, I did not read them in bed last night ahead of this session. If you elect me of course Deputy Queripel through you, sir, I shall read them and read them with great intensity.

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

4370 **Deputy Meerveld:** Yes I think Deputy Trott's interpretation is correct. Again I have not memorised all the Rules yet, I do obviously... I have read them but I will go back and look at that one with interest.

But I think there is a problem in the Assembly generally in that the Billets themselves and the language used in those is not approachable either. It is very much Civil Service legalise, and I think
4375 the Rules themselves are obviously done even more from a legal perspective and there will be a great service to be done not just for this Assembly but also for the public who take a specific interest in a Billet if we produce things in plain English in a more approachable way where everybody can understand them more easily.

4380 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

Do the candidates support the guillotine Rule which at times will deny people being able to speak in our parliament?

4385

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: It can be very harsh and I on at least one occasion evoked the guillotine motion and then retracted it because one Member wanted to speak, then about half a dozen got
4390 up to speak. So the guillotine motion is used obviously when a debate has been going on and there is a lot of repetition, tedious repetition, and we try to draw it to a close.

I think it is something that could be put to the Members whether that is something they would like to change going forward. But the idea of getting rid of the guillotine and then also talking about shortening speeches. Maybe if you are shortening speeches you can get rid of the guillotine, if you
4395 are not shortening speeches maybe you still need it.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes, sir.

4400 I did not personally propose any guillotine motions during the last term but I did in the one before. It is exactly as Deputy Meerveld describes it is a mechanism to bring to an end tedious repetition, and trust me Members it can be quite tedious in this Assembly on occasions and the levels or repetition can become occasionally overwhelming. But it is a luxury tool and it should be used sparingly.

4405 Interestingly during the last term I think it lost more times than it won, and there may be a lesson there, but it is a useful tool and I would retain it, sir.

The Bailiff: Does any Member who has not asked a question wish to pose a question before I call Deputy Gollop? No. Deputy Gollop then.

4410

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, Mr Bailiff, sir.

My question is: candidates have gone into improved training for Members but what about other improved facilities such as better working areas, places where we can break out, more office facilities, research facilities, secretarial assistance etc. – will candidates be at least looking into those
4415 ideas?

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Yes, I said in my opening remarks that I do think there is a dearth of provision for new Members. I am lucky, I can call on five or six personal assistants within my business interests and now that I now longer have any resource within the States I may need to.

But of course it is not just in that regard that we are unique, we do not have an Assembly of our own, here we are sharing the Royal Court. I did think until really quite recently that it was completely wrong that we shared the facilities with the Royal Court not least because of the separation of powers and the Royal Court and Assemblies should be identified separately. But clearly there is going to be a huge amount of demand on other infrastructure projects moving forward but one thing we can improve certainly is the provision of assistance to Members greater than that currently provided by the excellent States' Greffier –

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott, your minute is up.
I turn to Deputy Meerveld now.

Deputy Meerveld: It is a very good point and something I touched in my opening speech as well. There are many Members here I am sure who do not have five personal assistants they can call on to assist them.

There is a need to have some resources. We are not talking about a personal assistant to book flights here, we are talking about somebody that helps you retrieve States' documents or information from the States archives which are often very hard to find in the normal searches in the States computer system.

There is a need possible just to have a desk somewhere that people can use, even if they are hot-desking and sharing with others. At the present moment from a businessman's perspective it is staggering that we are expected to run a country or even, if you look at it in corporate terms, a company with hundreds of millions of pounds turnover, 5,500 direct employees, 20-odd thousand, 63,000 people dependent on us and we are given no resources to do the job whatsoever. That does not make any sense to me at all that impacts on the efficiency of the Members –

The Bailiff: Deputy Meerveld, your minute is also up.
Anyone with a final question? No.

On that basis we will draw question time for these two candidates to a close, and similarly if you are minded to show your appreciation. *(Applause)*

Members of the States, we go to the vote for who is to be the next President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. There are two candidates, Deputy Trott proposed by Deputy le Tocq, seconded by Deputy Inder and Deputy Meerveld who is proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy Helyar.

You simply write the name of the candidate you prefer if you wish to vote for one of them on a sheet of paper which will then be collected by the Deputy Sheriffs.

Are there any more voting slips to be handed in?

Well, Members of the States, once again I will simply rise whilst the votes are being counted.

*The Assembly adjourned at 5.44 p.m.
and resumed its sitting at 5.51 p.m.*

**States' Assembly and Constitution Committee –
Deputy Carl Meerveld elected President**

4460 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for the President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee is as follows: Deputy Trott polled 13 votes, Deputy Meerveld polled 26 votes, and therefore I declare Deputy Meerveld elected as the President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. *(Applause)*

**Deferral of remaining business to Wednesday, 21st October 2020 –
Motion carried**

4465 **The Bailiff:** Now, Members of the States, it is gone half past five. What are we going to do about the three remaining presidential elections? Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: May I address you?

Sir, as you rightly pointed out the fault was mine, the Policy & Resources Committee has not met for example to bring a recommendation to the Assembly concerning the presidency of the Overseas Aid Commission.

4470 Equally under the Rules although others can nominate the Policy & Resources Committee should bring a recommendation for presidency of the STSB. Now we have not met we have not discussed that. We appreciate that is likely to be a contested election and may take some time.

4475 We would be asking because there is there could be two contested elections actually there will not be a bitter contest for the Transport Licensing Authority but you never know but there is certainly likely to be for the others.

4480 We at Policy & Resources would ask that we could meet in a considered manner to consider the two issues that we have addressed. We would otherwise have a meeting. We have got a meeting anyway tomorrow sometime, we would be asking, sir, the Assembly to give us the licence to adjourn until Wednesday so that we can discuss this matter tomorrow and we can come back in a considered fashion on Wednesday.

The Bailiff: Well, I think the motion in those circumstances, Members of the States, is that we defer all three items of business that we have not reached which are the three presidential elections to the start of the meeting on Wednesday.

4485 Deputy Oliver you are standing?

Deputy Oliver: Sir, STSB actually changed so it was no longer the President of P&R, it was actually anybody can stand for it, it is not just P&R that can choose for it.

4490 **The Bailiff:** That is right, Mr Comptroller, isn't it?

The Comptroller: Yes, sir, I think it is the President and then Members have an opportunity to nominate.

4495 **The Bailiff:** It does not matter at the moment, Members of the States.

It is probably too late in the day to try and conclude the entirety of the business for the meeting that has been convened for today.

So the option would be normally that we would adjourn this meeting to 9.30 a.m. tomorrow morning.

4500 The request from the President of the Policy & Resources Committee is that that Committee can meet as scheduled tomorrow and to discuss matters and therefore he is asking me to put to you

the motion which I am going to put to you which is that we defer all three items so that they are taken first on Wednesday morning and then we get into the business that is listed for the meeting on Wednesday which is the membership of the Committees etc.

4505 I am simply going to put that motion to you. Those in favour; those against.

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare that carried and therefore we will close today's meeting and defer those three items to 9.30 a.m. on Wednesday.

The Assembly adjourned at 5.56 p.m.