



Access to Public Information Request

Date of receipt: 16 February 2021

Date of response: 22 March 2021

Access to Public Information request regarding the appointment of Non-States Members

Request:

In Q4 2020, the Scrutiny Management Committee and five of the principal States committees advertised for Non-States Members (Voting and Non-Voting).

We would be grateful for responses to the following questions **from each of those six committees**.

The intent of the request is to assist the committees by improving future external initiatives to encourage more members of the public to consider the role.

1. In Q4 2020 how many a) women and b) men made enquiries about the role of Non-States Member on your committee?
2. What written information e.g. job description, person specification, application form was supplied to potential candidates? Please provide copies, if possible.
3. How many a) women and b) men made an application to be considered for the role?
4. What was the selection process?
5. How many a) women b) men were shortlisted at each stage of the selection process?
6. If there was an interview (or interviews) as part of the selection process, who were the members of the interview panel?
7. If written information is not available (see Question 2), what criteria did decision makers use to evaluate candidates?

8. Which members of the Committee participated in the final choice of the successful candidate(s)? Were there any other participants in the decision?

9. If only one Non-States Member was appointed, why did the Committee decide not to appoint a second one?

Response:

1. In Q4 2020 how many a) women and b) men made enquiries about the role of Non-States Member on your committee?

	Women	Men
Committee for Economic Development	10	24
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	21	29
Committee for Employment & Social Security	12	19
Committee for Health & Social Care	10*	12*
Committee for Home Affairs	5	11
Scrutiny Management Committee	4	16

* These are the enquiries which resulted in further information being provided. Some more general enquiries were also received which did not progress further and therefore no record was retained.

2. What written information e.g. job description, person specification, application form was supplied to potential candidates? Please provide copies, if possible.

	Written information supplied to candidates in addition to media releases/adverts
Committee for Economic Development	<p>Prospective candidates were provided with an information document about the role of a Non-States Member in this Committee (Appendix 1).</p> <p>Prospective candidates were asked to provide a cover letter and CV and to explain how they felt they could contribute to the Committee's work, referring where relevant to their background, experience and particular areas of interest.</p> <p>The Committee expressed a particular interest in receiving applications from individuals with a finance sector background.</p>
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	<p>Prospective candidates were asked to provide a letter of application to explain how they felt they could contribute</p>

	<p>to the Committee’s work, referring where relevant to their background, experience and particular areas of interest.</p> <p>Prospective candidates were given the option of submitting a CV to supplement their application. The email sent to those who enquired is included in Appendix 2.</p>
Committee for Employment & Social Security	<p>Prospective candidates were advised to apply in writing, to explain how they felt they could contribute to the Committee's work, referring where relevant to their background, experience and particular areas of interest.</p> <p>Prospective candidates were directed to the Committee’s mandate on gov.gg and were invited to contact the Chief Secretary if they required any further information or had any questions.</p>
Committee for Health & Social Care	<p>Prospective candidates were directed to the Committee's mandate on gov.gg. Prospective candidates were asked to provide in writing a summary of what they felt they could contribute to the Committee's work, referring where relevant to their background, experience and any particular areas of interest.</p> <p>The initial media release noted that while there were no specific qualifications needed for the role, the Committee were looking for determined and passionate individuals with the ability to provide rigor and challenge while at the same time being supportive of Health and Social Care.</p>
Committee for Home Affairs	<p>Prospective candidates were advised to briefly write about what they felt they could contribute to the Committee’s work, referring where relevant to their background, experience and particular areas of interest. Individuals were invited to make contact if they had any additional questions.</p>
Scrutiny Management Committee	<p>Prospective candidates were provided with an information document about the role of a Non-States Member in this Committee, which included a list of skills required. This document is in Appendix 3.</p>

3. How many a) women and b) men made an application to be considered for the role?

	Women	Men
Committee for Economic Development	1	13
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	7	10

Committee for Employment & Social Security	6	8
Committee for Health & Social Care	4	10
Committee for Home Affairs	2	9
Scrutiny Management Committee	7	24

4. What was the selection process?

	Selection process
Committee for Economic Development	<p>The President, Vice-President and two senior officers received copies of the applications and independently prepared shortlists to identify their top 3-5 candidates.</p> <p>The shortlists were compared and the top three candidates were invited to an interview with the Committee.</p> <p>Two Non-States Members were appointed by the Committee.</p>
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	<p>The President and Vice-President, supported by the Committee Secretary, produced a provisional shortlist paying particular attention to experience in governance or representing employee groups, as highlighted in the media release seeking expressions of interest in this role.</p> <p>The process and outcome was then discussed with, and ratified by, the full Committee.</p>
Committee for Employment & Social Security	<p>The President and Vice-President considered all applications received and independently selected shortlists of six candidates. They then compared notes and agreed a short-list of six candidates which were circulated to, and subsequently endorsed by, the Committee.</p> <p>The six short-listed candidates were invited to attend an informal interview with the President, Vice-President and Committee Secretary. The discussion centred on a common set of questions. The Committee Secretary's role was principally to oversee proceedings.</p> <p>The President and Vice-President selected two candidates for endorsement by the whole Committee.</p>
Committee for Health & Social Care	<p>The full Committee were involved in the initial shortlisting, considering a summary of the information provided by the applicants.</p>

	<p>Shortlisted applicants were invited to interview, which were conducted by four Committee members.</p> <p>Following interview, two individuals have been invited to informally attend a series of Committee meetings as observers.</p> <p>This process was designed to recognise the importance of relationships and the complexity of the role and provide all parties with the opportunity to familiarise themselves with the Committee area and its working practices before making a formal commitment.</p> <p>This recruitment process has not yet concluded.</p>
Committee for Home Affairs	<p>The Committee considered a summary of the information provided by the applicants, before they undertook a shortlisting process.</p> <p>The President and Vice-President considered the full information provided by those individuals shortlisted prior to an interview taking place.</p> <p>One appointment was made, but one interview is still to take place.</p>
Scrutiny Management Committee	<p>All three elected Members were involved in shortlisting and then interviewing the selected candidates.</p>

5. How many a) women b) men were shortlisted at each stage of the selection process?

	Women	Men
Committee for Economic Development	0	3
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	1	2
Committee for Employment & Social Security	2	4
Committee for Health & Social Care	2	3
Committee for Home Affairs	1	2
Scrutiny Management Committee	2	6

6. If there was an interview (or interviews) as part of the selection process, who were the members of the interview panel?

	Members of interview panels
Committee for Economic Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Neil Inder, Committee President - Deputy Steve Falla, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Sasha Kazantseva-Miller, Committee Member - Deputy Nicholas Moakes, Committee Member - Deputy Simon Vermeulen, Committee Member
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Andrea Dudley-Owen, Committee President - Deputy Bob Murray, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Susan Aldwell, Committee Member - Deputy Andy Cameron, Committee Member - Deputy Sam Haskins, Committee Member <p>(Supported by the Committee Secretary)</p>
Committee for Employment & Social Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Peter Roffey, Committee President - Deputy Lindsay De Sausmarez, Committee Vice-President <p>(Supported by the Committee Secretary)</p>
Committee for Health & Social Care	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Al Brouard, Committee President - Deputy Tina Bury, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Aidan Matthews, Committee Member - Alderney Representative Alex Snowdon <p>(Deputy Marc Leadbeater had prior commitments which meant he was unable to participate in the panel) (Supported by the Committee Secretary)</p>
Committee for Home Affairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Rob Prow, Committee President - Deputy Simon Vermeulen, Committee Vice-President <p>(Supported by the Committee Secretary)**</p>
Scrutiny Management Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Yvonne Burford, Committee President - Deputy Simon Fairclough, Committee Vice-President - Deputy John Dyke, Committee Member <p>(Supported by Mr Mark Huntington, Principal Officer)</p>

**One interview is still to take place

7. If written information is not available (see Question 2), what criteria did decision makers use to evaluate candidates?

	Criteria to evaluate candidates
Committee for Economic Development	Candidates were evaluated according to their background, skills and experience and what they would bring to the Committee. The Committee had explicitly sought applications from individuals with a finance sector background.

	The three candidates that were interviewed were all asked a common set of questions by the Committee Members.
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	Candidates were evaluated according to their background, skills and experience and what they would bring to the Committee, however, the Committee paid particular attention to candidates' experience in governance or representing employee groups.
Committee for Employment & Social Security	Candidates were evaluated according to their background, skills and experience and what they would bring to the Committee.
Committee for Health & Social Care	<p>The interview process was used to explore key attributes with candidates namely their</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commitment and interest to devote the necessary time to prepare and to participate actively in the work of the Committee, providing particular expertise. This sought to understand the professional and personal experience the applicants wished to bring to the role and their understanding of the opportunities and challenges facing health and care services in the Bailiwick. • Independence and the confidence to ask questions or to query why a certain course of action is being recommended. This sought to understand any potential conflicts of interest, and their ability and confidence to objectively support the Committee and its work. • Clarity of thought and the ability to assess a situation quickly with an open mind. This sought to understand how the applicant may complement the work of the Committee, recognising the diverse and complex mandate. • The ability to listen as well and to influence and deal with all groups. This sought to understand how the individual would complement the team dynamic within the Committee and their ability to work with HSC's wide stakeholder groups.
Committee for Home Affairs	<p>Candidates were evaluated according to their background, skills and experience and what they would bring to the Committee.</p> <p>The full Committee considered a summary of the information provided by candidates to support the shortlisting process.</p> <p>The President and Vice-President considered the full information provided by those individuals shortlisted prior to an interview taking place.</p>

Scrutiny Management Committee	<p>Candidates were evaluated according to the criteria listed in the information for applicants which included the commitment required and the following skills:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A commitment to gathering research and opinions on a specific topic from all identified stakeholders. - An interest in, or experience of, financial, legislative or related matters; - Being confident in asking challenging and considered questions at public hearings; - Being objective in your decision making; - Having the ability to effectively analyse evidence; - Not allowing personal agendas to deflect you from impartially considering a chosen subject area.
--------------------------------------	---

8. Which members of the Committee participated in the final choice of the successful candidate(s)? Were there any other participants in the decision?

	Members who participated in final candidate decision(s)
Committee for Economic Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Neil Inder, Committee President - Deputy Steve Falla, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Sasha Kazantseva-Miller, Committee Member - Deputy Nicholas Moakes, Committee Member - Deputy Simon Vermeulen, Committee Member
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Andrea Dudley-Owen, Committee President - Deputy Bob Murray, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Susan Aldwell, Committee Member - Deputy Andy Cameron, Committee Member - Deputy Sam Haskins, Committee Member <p>(The Committee Secretary was present throughout and advised the Committee, particularly on questions re conflicts of interest, but was not a participant in the decision-making)</p>
Committee for Employment & Social Security	<p>Following interviews conducted by the President and Vice-President they recommended the appointment of two candidates, subject to seeing a completed Declaration of Interest and Declaration of Unspent Criminal Convictions in respect of both candidates. The Committee endorsed their recommendation.</p>
Committee for Health & Social Care	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Al Brouard, Committee President - Deputy Tina Bury, Committee Vice-President - Deputy Aidan Matthews, Committee Member - Alderney Representative Alex Snowdon <p>(Deputy Marc Leadbeater was present for the discussion but did not participate as he was unable to attend the interviews)</p>

	(The Committee Secretary was present throughout but was not a participant in the decision-making)
Committee for Home Affairs	Following interviews conducted by the President and Vice-President they made recommendations to the Committee regarding appointments. Final decisions were made by the full Committee and were unanimous.
Scrutiny Management Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deputy Yvonne Burford, Committee President - Deputy Simon Fairclough, Committee Vice-President - Deputy John Dyke, Committee Member (The Principal Officer was present throughout but was not a participant in the decision-making).

9. If only one Non-States Member was appointed, why did the Committee decide not to appoint a second one?

	Reason for not appointing a second Non-States Member (where applicable)
Committee for Economic Development	Not applicable - Two Non-States Members were appointed.
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture	Of the three shortlisted applicants, one was appointed. After careful consideration following the informal interviews, the Committee concluded that neither of the other two shortlisted candidates were right for the role at this time, but has not ruled out revisiting the decision not to make a second appointment at a later date.
Committee for Employment & Social Security	Not applicable - Two Non-States Members were appointed.
Committee for Health & Social Care	The appointment process for Non-States Members within the Committee for Health & Social Care is not formally concluded at this stage. However, while the Committee was initially looking for a single Non-States member, given the calibre of applicants, two individuals have been attending Committees meetings informally and it is anticipated that formal offers will be made later this month.
Committee for Home Affairs	<p>The Committee for Home Affairs have yet to conclude the interview process.</p> <p>The Committee have noted that the Rules of Procedure do not require appointments to be made, either at the beginning of a political term or, if two appointments are made, they do not need to take place at the same time.</p> <p>In considering applications for non-voting Members the Committee acknowledged that at any point it may invite individuals to advise on aspects of its mandate where an</p>

	individual's expertise or experience might contribute to discussion. The Committee has recognised the benefits of pursuing this as an option in the future.
Scrutiny Management Committee	Not applicable - Two Non-States Members were appointed.



Committee *for* Economic Development: Non-Voting Members

Thank you for your interest in becoming a non-voting member of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

What the role of non-voting member involves

In accordance with Rules 46 and 35 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees, if permitted by the terms of its constitution, any Committee may elect non-voting members, who shall not be sitting Members of the States, and whose appointments shall ordinarily expire at the same time as the terms of office of the sitting Members of the States. Such members shall have the same rights and duties as ordinary members (other than the right to vote, unless specifically provided with the right to vote in that Committee's constitution).

In terms of the time commitment, non-voting members are expected to attend the Committee's formal and informal meetings. Currently, the Committee for Economic Development's regular Committee meetings take place fortnightly, typically from 9.15am on a Thursday morning, each lasting up to approximately four hours. Due to clashes with States Meetings, the Committee's meetings will occasionally take place on a different day, often a Tuesday morning. Agenda packs for formal meetings can – and often do – run to in excess of 100 pages, so there is a sizeable reading commitment in advance of meeting participation.

Ad-hoc Committee meetings take place from time to time as workload dictates, and it is not uncommon for non-voting members to periodically be invited to attend presentations / workshops given by other committees on other significant pieces of policy work. Nonvoting members might also be asked to lead on a particular aspect of the Committee's mandate and this could lead to additional time commitments.

How to apply

To apply for a non-voting member position on the Committee for Economic Development, please write a letter of application and enclose a CV. Your application should set out what you could contribute to the Committee's work referring to your background, experience and particular areas of interest. The Committee is particularly keen to hear from applicants with experience from the finance sector. The deadline for applications is **5pm on Wednesday 18th November 2020** although the Committee maintains the right to extend the deadline.

Appendix 1 – Information provided by the Committee *for* Economic Development

Your application should be addressed to the President of the Committee for Economic Development and can be submitted either by email to Niki Cleal, Committee Secretary at niki.cleal@gov.gg or in hard copy. If sending in hard copy, the postal address is:

President
Committee *for* Economic Development
PO Box 451
Market Buildings
Fountain St
St Peter Port
Guernsey
GY1 3GX

Eligibility & declarations

There are a few things to note about the eligibility criteria. Non-voting members, like their elected counterparts, must:

- be ordinarily resident in Guernsey;
- not have received a criminal conviction resulting of a term of imprisonment of a period of six months or more within the last five years in Guernsey, Jersey, the UK or the Isle of Man;
- be inscribed on the Electoral Roll; and
- not be an employee of the States of Guernsey.

Along with a ‘declaration of unspent convictions’, it is necessary for non-voting members to make a ‘declaration of interests’ in respect of their (and their spouse/partner and minor children’s): employment/self-employment; directorships/partnerships/share-holdings; real property; and trusts.

Other information

The term of office can be brought to an end by the resignation of the non-voting member or by the Committee, but would otherwise run for the entire political term (in this case until April 2025). The Committee is proposing to informally propose an initial term of appointment for non-voting members of two years, which would be extendable to the end of the political term by mutual agreement. Remuneration for non-voting members is £2,154 per annum.

Further Information

There is information about on the Committee for Economic Development’ membership and mandate on gov.gg. [Click here](#)

Appendix 1 – Information provided by the Committee *for* Economic Development

If you have any questions that are not covered by the above, please contact Niki Cleal, Committee Secretary, by e-mail niki.cleal@gov.gg or telephone (07839) 700344.

Appendix 2 – Information provided by the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture

Thank you for your email and your interest in becoming a non-voting member of the Committee *for* Education, Sport and Culture.

How to apply

To apply for a non-voting member position on the Committee, please write a letter of application, which can be submitted either by email or in hard copy as you prefer. Please address it to The President, but send it care of me. If sending in hard copy, the address is:

The Office of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture
Sir Charles Frossard House
La Charotterie
St Peter Port
GY1 1FH

Your application should say what you feel you can contribute to the Committee's work, referring where relevant to your background, experience and particular areas of interest. You might want to submit a CV to supplement your written application. The deadline for applications is Monday, 16 November 2020 (although the Committee reserves the right to extend the application period).

Eligibility & declarations

There are a few things to note about the eligibility criteria. Non-voting members, like their elected counterparts, must:

- be ordinarily resident in Guernsey;
- not have received a criminal conviction resulting of a term of imprisonment of a period of six months or more within the last five years in Guernsey, Jersey, the UK or the Isle of Man;
- be inscribed on the Electoral Roll; and
- not be an employee of the States of Guernsey.

Along with a 'declaration of unspent convictions', it is necessary for non-voting members to make a 'declaration of interests' in respect of their (and their spouse/partner and minor children's): employment/self-employment; directorships/partnerships/share-holdings; real property; and trusts.

What the role involves

In terms of the time commitment, non-voting members are expected to attend the Committee's formal and informal meetings. Currently, these are taking place weekly on a Thursday morning, each lasting up to approximately four hours. Due to clashes with States Meetings, the Committee's meetings will occasionally take place on a different day. This schedule *might* reduce to fortnightly meetings in the future, but this is by no means certain

at this stage. Agenda packs for formal meetings can – and often do – run to in excess of 100 pages, so there is a sizeable reading commitment in advance of meeting participation.

Ad-hoc Committee meetings take place from time to time as workload dictates, and it is not uncommon for non-voting members to periodically be invited to attend presentations / workshops given by other committees on other significant pieces of policy work. Non-voting members might also be asked to lead on a particular aspect of the Committee’s mandate, such as for example, the Arts, and this will lead to additional time commitments.

Other information

The term of office can be brought to an end by the resignation of the non-voting member or by the Committee, but would otherwise run for the entire political term (in this case until April 2025).

Remuneration for non-voting members is £2,154 p/a.

I’m not sure how much you already know about the Committee and its mandate, but there is information [here on the States of Guernsey website](#) that might be a good place to start your research ahead of submitting an application.

If you have questions that are not covered by the above, I’d be happy to have a chat with you if you would like to provide me with a contact number and an indication of when you might be free to take a call.



Information for prospective Non-States Members

The role of the Committee

The duty of the Committee is to lead and co-ordinate the scrutiny of committees of the States and those organisations which are in receipt of public funds, or which have been established by legislation, by reviewing legislation, policies, services and the use of resources.

The Scrutiny Management Committee will carry out the work of reviewing and scrutinising Principal Committees' policies and services and their management of resources.

The Committee will appoint a Legislation Review Panel to carry out the functions of legislative scrutiny recommending any changes to existing legislation and ensuring the new legislation meets the original policy intention.

The Committee is tasked with ensuring that proper financial scrutiny of States' spending takes place and that States' and non-States' bodies who receive public funding operate to the highest standards in financial matters. It acts as a safeguard to public money, investigating whether public funds have been applied for the purposes intended by the States and that value for money has been achieved.

The Committee will scrutinise policy letters and issue letters of comment where necessary, the Committee will also make recommendations aimed at making policy improvements. The Committee will also produce recommendations through its published Reports.

Constitution of the Committee

The Committee was constituted with effect from 1st May 2016.

Appendix 3 – Information provided by the Scrutiny Management Committee

The Committee will comprise three States Members (including the President & Vice President) and two Non-States Members.

The Committee is supported by a team of six members of staff including the Principal Officer.

The role of Non-States Members

The role of Non-States Members on the Scrutiny Management Committee is to bring impartial experience to contribute to making improvements within the States of Guernsey.

The two Non-States Members, work alongside the Committee's three States Members and are able to vote on Committee decisions. They will also undertake a role in:

- determining what issues the Committee wishes to examine;
- contributing on researching the topics under review;
- asking questions during internal or public hearings;
- contributing to any conclusions and recommendations within Committee reports.

Skills required

Non-States Members on the Scrutiny Management Committee are not required to have any formal qualifications to undertake this role. However, there are certain skills that would be beneficial:

- A commitment to gathering research and opinions on a specific topic from all identified stakeholders.
- An interest in, or experience of, financial, legislative or related matters;
- Being confident in asking challenging and considered questions at public hearings;
- Being objective in your decision making;
- Having the ability to effectively analyse evidence;
- Not allowing personal agendas to deflect you from impartially considering a chosen subject area.

Commitment required

It is likely that the Non-States Members of the Committee would need to dedicate approximately 20 half days a year for full Committee meetings. However it is possible that additional time may be required to include reading, undertaking personal research and any attending additional Panel meetings.

Remuneration

Appendix 3 – Information provided by the Scrutiny Management Committee

Non-States Members will be remunerated at a rate of £2000 per annum.

Committee meetings

It is likely that in normal circumstances Committee meetings will be held no more than twice a month, usually one week in advance of States of Deliberation meeting dates.

Contact Details:

Principal Officer: Mark Huntington

Scrutiny Officer: Julie Brown

Telephone: 01481 234171

E-mail: scrutiny@gov.gg

If you wish to meet with the Committee staff please make contact and we will arrange an appointment.