

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

14th July, 2021

Proposition No. P.2021/69

Committee for Education, Sport & Culture

Secondary and Post-16 Education Reorganisation

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy M P Leadbeater

Seconded by: Deputy D de Lisle

1. For Proposition 2, substitute the following propositions:-

"2. To agree that –

(a) the three 11-16 schools will be located on the existing school sites at –

(i) Les Beaucamps,

(ii) St Sampson's, and

(iii) La Mare de Carteret in the existing school which will be expanded to accommodate six forms of entry, and

(b) the Sixth Form Centre will be located at Les Varendes.

2A. To note that the development and implementation of the above model is estimated to have a capital cost of £59m as set out in the table in the explanatory note; and with an ongoing revenue cost which will not, in the medium term, exceed the current revenue costs associated with these phases of education."

2. In Proposition 4, for "£54m" substitute "£83m"

Explanatory note

This amendment seeks to retain La Mare de Carteret as an 11 – 16 school. It would see the continued use of the existing building (including any essential remedial works) and expansion into a new separate building on the site to accommodate 2 additional forms of entry, with that expansion planned in such a way as to cater for further expansion, when funds allow, so that over time the existing school would be replaced with a new build(s) – a phased development.

This amendment also includes for a reduced tipping point of 26 across the 3 schools. Works will be required at Les Varendes Campus in order to consolidate the facilities used by the Sixth Form and, as per the Committee’s model, the swimming pool space would be repurposed to accommodate The Music Service, the Youth Commission and SHARE. The TGI will continue as planned.

Total Capital

	Min (£'000s)	Max (£'000s)	Policy Letter (£'000s)	
Construction	£35,7000	£42,100	£29,000	
Decant	£ -	£ -	£3,000	
Programme	£15,650	£15,650	£10,000	
Transport	£1,500	£1,500	£1,500	
SUBTOTAL	£52,850	£59,250	£43,500	
Optimism Bias (40%)	£21,140	£23,700	£10,875	See note on optimism bias below
TOTAL	£73,990	£82,950	£54,375	

Optimism Bias

The standard contingencies within the estimate mitigate the normal risks of pricing (variations in the estimate for building materials and labour due to inflation and supply issues) and design (e.g. practical reasons why the theoretical minimum space requirements cannot be achieved). However these contingencies do not effectively mitigate the broader risks inherent in the very high level assessment carried out to date. Optimism bias establishes a range for the capital costs which mitigates the risk of the assumptions made in these very high level estimates proving incorrect when more details are worked through. For example, the identification of ‘show stoppers’ which have a material impact on the feasibility of either the timeline or the high level design, and which may require a radically different approach.

This is the reason an optimism bias of 40% is applied to these high level estimates, compared to the optimism bias of 25% which has been applied to the Committee’s proposed model, which has been the subject of much more detailed evaluation.