



IV  
2014

# BILLET D'ÉTAT

WEDNESDAY 29th JANUARY 2014

1. Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department, p. 363
2. Housing Department- Election of a Member, p. 367

# BILLET D'ÉTAT

---

TO  
THE MEMBERS OF THE STATES  
OF THE ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

---

I hereby give notice pursuant to Rule (1)(4) of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation that the items contained in this Billet d'État which have been submitted for debate will be considered at the Meeting of the States of Deliberation already convened for **WEDNESDAY, the 29<sup>th</sup> JANUARY, 2014.**

R. J. McMAHON  
Deputy Bailiff and Deputy Presiding Officer

The Royal Court House  
Guernsey  
17<sup>th</sup> January 2014

**MOTION OF NO CONFIDENCE IN THE MINISTER AND MEMBERS OF  
THE HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT**

**TO THE POLICY COUNCIL**

**PURSUANT** to Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation (“the Rules of Procedure”), we the undersigned being members of the States of Deliberation

**STATE**

That this is a motion of no confidence for the purposes of Rule 18.

**BACKGROUND:**

1. In proposing Deputy Dorey, Deputy Fallaize said, “Deputy Dorey is an intelligent man with an analytical mind... The States need a Minister –because of HSSD’s significant budget challenges- who can plan and negotiate with T & R and has a very solid understanding of States budget processes.”

Deputy Dorey said, “I will do my utmost to work with the staff and new Board to maximise efficiency and to ensure that spending is kept under control, without affecting front line services. If this cannot be achieved, I will aim, with the help of T & R staff and the Board, to bring a report to this Assembly with a budgetary model that works for Health and Social Services.”

He said, “Staff recruitment is an area which has attracted much criticism. The policies must be reviewed, so that recruitment is done in a timely manner to minimise the use of locums.”

He said “I believe that I would bring a fresh approach to the role, characterised by energy, openness and willingness to listen. I have the ability to understand complex policy matters and strong mathematical skills and a full understanding of States accounts and budgets. I offer strong leadership and I want a board that can work together.”

2. At the October meeting of the States of Deliberation Deputy Dorey said, “The Department is spending all the money that was allocated. An annual sum of £328,000 was allocated as part of the States Vision Plan to set up and run the bowel screening services.
3. In the December meeting of the States of Deliberation Deputy Dorey said, “When the final business case was prepared for T & R, following the SSP, it had been revised to a single cohort of 60 year olds. This decision was taken in light of the

most up-to-date research and on the recommendation of senior professionals from HSSD and MSG.”

4. In March 2011 Billet IV the States resolved to adopt the six core principles of good governance.

Good governance was defined in the report as “the prerequisite for every public body to deliver sustainable, value for money and quality services in a transparent manner” and to ensure that bodies are “doing the right things, in the right way, for the right people, in a timely, inclusive, honest and accountable manner.”

Core Principle 1 was defined as:

“The overall function of government is to ensure that the organisation fulfils its primary purpose, achieves its intended outcomes for citizens and operates in an effective, efficient and ethical manner. For the States of Guernsey, this means that governance should work to secure high quality public services that meet the needs of Islanders but which also should represent value for money.”

## **GROUNDINGS**

Both of the statements made by Deputy Dorey referred to in the foregoing paragraphs numbered 2 and 3 were incorrect and seriously misled the Assembly.

Deputy Dorey consistently said that the money for Bowel Cancer Screening had been spent when a quick look at the outline financial case in the business plan would have shown that the money could not have been spent.

His leadership and ability to get the board to work together has been so ineffective that the most knowledgeable member of the board has resigned.

The failure to recruit nurses has meant that a ward remained closed with the loss of much private revenue until a few weeks ago.

Deputy Dorey has not got the budget under control and has not brought a report to the States.

Thus Deputy Dorey has seriously misled the States on two important issues and failed to fulfil promises that he made in order to secure election.

We the undersigned Members of the States of Deliberation are of the opinion the Minister and Members of HSSD have grossly mismanaged this issue by misleading the Assembly and not spending money allocated for Bowel Cancer Screening. They have also not fulfilled commitments to bring the budget under control or report to the Assembly.

We the undersigned consider that the actions of the board were not good governance and do not comply with Core Principle 1. We are of the opinion that the Minister and Members of HSSD must be accountable to the States for their actions

For the above reasons, we have no confidence that the Minister and members of HSSD can adequately discharge their mandate on behalf of the States.

The Minister and all members of the board were invited in writing on 30<sup>th</sup> December to tender their resignations from HSSD and by 8<sup>th</sup> January none of them had tendered his resignation.

## **MOTION**

**THESE PREMISES CONSIDERED** we request the Policy Council to lay a motion of no confidence before the States of Deliberation as soon as reasonably practicable requiring the immediate resignation of all the members of the Health and Social Services Department, including the Minister of that Department.

Signed at Guernsey, this 8th day of January 2014

M. P. J. Hadley  
R. A. Perrot  
D. de G. de Lisle  
L. C. Queripel  
B. J. E. Paint  
A. H. Adam  
J. A. B. Gollop

The States are asked to decide:-

I.- Whether, after consideration of the Motion of No Confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department dated 8<sup>th</sup> January, 2014, signed by Deputy M.P.J. Hadley and six other Members of the States, they are of the opinion:-

1. That pursuant to Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure, the States of Deliberation have no confidence in the Minister and Members of the Health and Social Services Department.
2. To elect:
  - (1) a sitting Member of the States as Minister of the Health and Social Services Department to complete the unexpired portion of the term of office of Deputy M. H. Dorey;
  - (2) four sitting Members of the States as members of the Health and Social Services Department to complete the unexpired portions of the terms of office of Deputies M. J. Storey; E. G. Bebb; B. L. Brehaut and S. A. James MBE

to serve until May 2016 in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.

**(NB Paragraph (5) of Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation provides:**

- (5) *Where a motion of no confidence in respect of a Department or Committee is approved by the States –*
  - (a) *all the members of that Department or Committee including the Minister or Chairman thereof shall thereupon be deemed to have tendered their resignations from such membership and those resignations shall be deemed to have been accepted by the States;*
  - (b) *the motion shall be deemed to include such propositions to the States as may be appropriate for the election at that meeting of new members of the Department or Committee and a Minister or Chairman thereof to complete the respective unexpired portions of the terms of office of the previous members and Minister or Chairman.)*

**HOUSING DEPARTMENT**

**NEW MEMBER**

The States are asked:-

II.- To elect a sitting Member of the States as a member of the Housing Department to complete the unexpired portion of the term of office of Deputy M. J. Storey, who has resigned as a member of that Department, namely to serve until May 2016, in accordance with Rule 7 of the Rules relating to the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.