

STATES OF DELIBERATION

28th January, 2015

Billet d'État No. II Article 1

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy D De G De Lisle
Seconded by: Deputy J A B Gollop

Public Service Department

Belle Greve Phase 4 – Proposed Outfalls Replacement

1. To delete all of the proposition after “opinion” and substitute:

“to direct the Public Services Department, in view of the cost difference of over 450% between the preliminary cost estimate of £4m included in the Treasury and Resources Department’s Capital Prioritisation report submitted in 2009 (for outfall refurbishment and upgrading), and the funding sought in that Report of £19.9m (for replacement of both the long sea outfall and the short sea outfall), to re-examine the relative feasibility, desirability, cost and other implications of:

- a) pursuing the outfalls replacement currently envisaged as Belle Greve Phase IV; or
- b) adopting an alternative policy involving sewage treatment (namely primary secondary and sludge treatment);

and to report to the States thereon by no later than their meeting in May 2015, in sufficient detail to enable the States to reach an informed decision about whether to adopt such an alternative policy or pursue such outfalls replacement.”

2. To rescind their Resolution of 1st August 2014 on Proposition 2 of Article XIII of Billet d’État XVI of 2014.

Explanatory Note

The key changes and developments to what was originally intended has led to the jump in cost from a £4m repair to £19.9m total replacement and extension with possible further escalation in cost given the undersea nature of the project with no change to daily effluent discharge of 16,000 tons of raw sewage and waste water directly into the sea at Belle Greve. This flouts the absolute minimum standards that the rest of Europe and the majority of the developed world adheres to. The states of Guernsey has twice before committed to sewage treatment, in 1997 and reaffirmed in 2009. The cost of carrying out construction works for sewage treatment were documented in the PSD Liquid Waste Strategy, Billet d’Etat Wednesday 25 January 2012. Total construction costs were given as £6.1m for primary treatment, £10.9m for secondary treatment and £3.4m for sludge handling. The 2012 resolution was to proceed with the design of a long sea outfall only.

The EU/UK Urban Waste Water Treatment (UWWT) Directive standards require secondary treatment for all sewage discharges to coastal waters >15,000 population equivalent (Belle Greve Bay is estimated to be 75,000 p.e.). In the early years of implementation of the Directive, the UK sought to make use of a potential derogation in the Directive to apply only primary treatment for outfalls in highly dispersive areas (High Natural Dispersion Areas).

However, this approach was dropped more than a decade ago and the UK applies secondary treatment to all coastal outfalls >15,000p.e. as per the requirements of the Directive. Simply replacing/extending the LSO would not be consistent with the requirements of the UWWT Directive.

Guernsey Water is currently in receipt of a proposal and quotation for a fully fabricated sewage treatment plant recycling system that was submitted on 22 September 2014. The alternative policy offers:

- (i) Primary & secondary treatment and sludge dewatering;
- (ii) Ultrafiltration for treatment suitable for discharge into any water course (realistically there is unlikely to be a need to treat beyond this standard);
- (iii) Reverse Osmosis for treatment to an elevated standard (essentially drinking water standard) so that the water is safe to reuse in any situation.

The price was USD19.63M (GBP13M) plus £5M for concrete and pipe work and operating costs of £800,000 to £1M per year, which offers the people of Guernsey a value for money alternative to the discharge of screened sewage to sea and a sustainable supply of high quality recycled water. Should Reverse Osmosis be deemed unnecessary, it could be eliminated from the scope for further savings.

Water conservation is the major theme on the Guernsey Water Website. A Waterwise survey was conducted in 2011 and water management plans for schools and business are heavily promoted. Fresh water is therefore regarded as an increasingly valuable commodity and any sustainable wastewater solution should offer Guernsey the value proposition of recycling all of its sewage into a safe and sustainable recycled water resource.